

Stromme Foundation

Mid-Term Evaluation of Partners in the Implementation of
Community Based Education Intervention (CBEI)

Final Draft Report

September 2006

Table of contents

1. INTRODUCTION	5
1.1 Background	5
1.2 Evaluation Focus.....	7
1.3 Methodology Used	8
2. KEY FINDINGS	9
2.1 Institutional capacity	9
2.2 level of involvement of the different stake holders	9
2.3 Local Resource Mobilization.....	10
2.4 Quality of CBEI projects undertaken	11
2.5 Project design Issues	12
2.6 Linkages with local government contexts and priorities.....	12
2.7 CBEI SWOT.....	13
3. IMPACT CREATED BY IMPLEMENTATION OF CBEI	16
3.1 Impact Created by Rwanda Partners	16
3.2 Impact Created by Uganda Partners	18
3.3 Impact created by Tanzania Partners.....	24
3.4 Good practices.....	26
4. KEY EMERGING ISSUES.....	33
4.1 Country Offices or increasing regional office staff	33
4.2 Project Design	33
4.3 Local Resource Mobilisation	33
4.4 Choice and Retaining of Partners.....	34
5. RANKING OF PARTNERS	41
5.1 Overview	41
5.2 Basis for ranking.....	41
5.3 Ranking /partner scores.....	42
6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS.....	44
7. APPENDICES	46

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACORD	Agency for Cooperation and Research in Development
AEE	African Evangelistic Enterprises
AICT	African Inland Church, Tanzania
AMU	Association Mwana Ukundwa
ASOFERWA	Association De Solidarite Des Famme Rwandaise
CaR	Children at Risk
CBEI	Community Based Education Intervention
CHH	Child Headed Households
ECAM	Education For Children Advocacy Ministries
EFA	Education For All
EM-AC	Emergency Action
HIV/AIDS	Human Immune Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
FGDs	Focus Group Discussions
KAD	Kampala Diocese
KAMAMMA	Karangai, Maweni, Msitu, wa Mbogo, Majimoto and Marurani
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
OCODE	Organisation for Community Development
PTAs	Parent And Teachers Association

SF	Stromme Foundation
SMCs	School Management Committees
SWOT	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities And Threats
TAHEA	Tanzania Association of Home Economics
TERUDO	Teso Rural Development Organization
UWCM	Uganda Women Concern Ministries
VT	Vision Terudo
WAD	West Ankole Diocese

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

This Report presents findings of the Stromme Foundation supported Community Based Education Intervention (CBEI) evaluation implemented by partner NGOs in Uganda, Rwanda, and Tanzania. The evaluation was conducted during the months of June and July 2006 by Winsor Consult. In Rwanda, the partners evaluated include; African Evangelistic Enterprises (AEE), Education for Children Advocacy Ministries (ECAM), Association De Solidarite Des Famme Rwandaise (ASOFERWA), and Association Mwana Ukundwa (AMU). In Uganda; Vision TERUDO (VT), Uganda Women Concern Ministries (UWCM), Kampala Diocese (KAD), West Ankole Diocese (WAD) and Emergency action (EM-AC) were evaluated. The Tanzania partners included, Tanzania Association of Home Economics (TAHEA), Agency for Cooperation and Research in Development (ACORD), Karangai, Maweni, Msitu, wa Mbogo, Majimoto and Marurani (KAMAMA), Organisation for Community Development (OCODE) and African Inland Church, Tanzania (AICT). In each of the three countries, Community Based Education Intervention (CBEI) essentially aims at strengthening Primary Education with strong emphasis put on the effective participation of stakeholders right from the project identification stage through Preliminary Participatory Studies (PPS) to implementation, through local resource mobilization. CBEI also fits well in country education contexts, policies, and targets for primary education as well as Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The paradigmatic shift to CBEI resulted from a number of assessments commissioned by Stromme Foundation between 2001-2002, that reviewed the various Children at Risk (CaR) intervention modalities. These among others included; Child Sponsorship, Children's Homes, etc. A major external evaluation of three Stromme Foundation partners implementing a mixture of different Children at Risk Interventions¹ that was conducted in November 2002, recommended, *inter alia*, that Participatory Preliminary Studies (PPS) be undertaken by partners before commencement of any education interventions. All education partners supported by Stromme Foundation therefore adopted a new approach that ensured effective community (teachers, children, parents, local leaders, and other community groupings) participation (through PPS) in project identification and implementation. The major tenets underpinning Community Based Education Intervention as an approach are;

1. Strong Community participation in project identification through Participatory Preliminary Studies
2. Local Resource Mobilization (both cash and in-kind depending on the community context)
3. The entire school community benefits from the intervention undertaken
4. The holistic building of a child intellectually, socially, morally, physically, and politically

¹ AEE of Rwanda implemented Child Headed family project, the Diocese of Kigezi implemented Vocation Training and AMU of Rwanda pursued Community Based Intervention projects whose major strength rested on community participation.

1.2 EVALUATION FOCUS

The Study focused on the nature of CBEI projects undertaken by partners. The key areas of emphasis were:

- Understanding the impact created by these projects including; enrolment of children in implementing schools, retention of children in schools, numbers of girls attending and completing primary school and number of children completing primary school.
- Assessing the performance of the different partners using a scale that ranged from A to E
- Assessing the strength of Community Based Education Intervention
- Assessing the level of involvement of the different stake holders e.g. local government leaders, the general local community in the different CBEI's and the impact by these projects
- Identifying the general impact of CBEI on children at risk
- Identifying elements which can strengthen CBEI
- Assessing the current staff capacities, numbers, quality etc in each project and staff needs for successful implementation of CBEI
- Assessing the role and facilitation of CBEI's and suggesting recommendations for the future
- Assessing the quality of CBEI projects, such as the quality of structures built, quality of training provided and any other interventions supported under the CBEI.
- Based on the field findings and observations, document 'best practices' recommended for implementing CBEI.
- Assessing the local mobilization possibilities /potential, challenges and successes in local mobilization activities undertaken.

1.3 METHODOLOGY USED

Overview

The review involved consultations with all implementing partners in the three countries and this was done through a consultative process that involved in-depth discussions with partners, local government administration structures, and School Management Committees (SMCs). Also consulted were; Parents and Teachers Associations (PTAs), Senior Women Teachers (SWT), school children and the general beneficiary communities at project level. All participating schools were the central focus of all these consultations. During the consultations, participants were encouraged to express their views and concerns openly. The specific methodological tools and techniques used are summarised below;

Documentation Review

Documents obtained from SF, and implementing partners were reviewed not only to enable the consultant gain an insight into the task but also to provide an understanding of the implementation of the different CBEI projects in each country. The key documents reviewed were Participatory Preliminary Study (PPS), audit reports, progress reports, annual reports, work plans and school records.

Focus Group Discussion (FGDs)

The consultant conducted a number of FGDs with parents and teachers with the overall purpose of gaining in-depth understanding of the impact created by CBEI projects implemented in their community.

Key Informative Interviews (KII)

The consultant held key informative interviews with partner's staff, teachers, local leaders and local government leadership.

2. KEY FINDINGS

2.1 INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

In assessing the institutional capacity of the CBEI implementing partners, the consultants focused on the current staff capacities, numbers, quality, equipments, and the general operation /working environment in each project area as well as staff needs for successful implementation of CBEI.

In terms of staffing capacities, the consultant learnt that staffing capacities for the majority of the partners were sufficient except ECAM and KAD. For ECAM the entire CBEI implementation mainly relied on the executive director and the outsourcing of English facilitators. A similar situation existed in KAD where only one person was in charge of all activities relating to CBEI which made it difficult to effectively monitor and supervise the projects. This in some instances resulted into poor quality work, as is the case with the renovation work done at Mulago St.Martin Primary School.

In terms of equipment the review noted that all partners had reasonably adequate office infrastructure such as computers, and operational space. The major challenge for majority of partners was transport. The big organizations such as ACORD of Tanzania benefits from the organizational vehicles obtained from other donors. Other organizations such as AEE of Rwanda reported that is even when an organization has a vehicle for CBEI, it is difficult to manage it with the vote provided for administration. The extreme cases of transport challenges were found in ECAM of Rwanda and EM-AC in Uganda. While EM-AC of Uganda uses an old motorcycle for much of her fieldwork activities, ECAM in Rwanda does not have any means and instead relies on hiring from the market and this was found uneconomical and unsustainable.

2.2 LEVEL OF INVOLVEMENT OF THE DIFFERENT STAKE HOLDERS

As an intervention approach CBEI relies on the active involvement of stakeholders, right from project identification to implementation. Discussions with partners revealed that at project identification through PPS many stakeholders such as parents, teachers, local government leaders, confirm their readiness to support the priority interventions

identified. This enables the partner in conjunction with the local resource mobilization task force to follow-up these commitments. All partners confirmed that the sensitization and mobilization activities (through community meetings) undertaken at the start of CBEI projects instill among communities a sense of responsibility (among the various stakeholders) for continued and sustained support to the projects undertaken.

In each of the three countries the evaluation team learnt that local governments have been very supportive of the interventions undertaken by Stromme Foundation partners. One of the key reasons for this overwhelming support by the local leadership is the approach pursued at project identification stage (the PPS) that attracts a wide community spectrum.

"We have on several occasions even gone as far as providing venues for community meetings at no cost at least whenever we are contacted by AEE" said the executive secretary of Kanombe sector.

The involvement of traditional and religious leaders among some partners such as UWCM, and WAD, also significantly contributed to the success of CBEI projects undertaken.

2.3 LOCAL RESOURCE MOBILIZATION

The policy on local resource mobilization has been positively embraced by all partners in the three countries. All partners confirm that right from the PPS, stakeholders are informed of the advantages of community contribution such as creation of sense of project ownership and sustainability. In each of the CBEI projects visited communities contribute both in-kind and cash contributions. Due to the adequate sensitization made by partners and the formation of local resource mobilization task forces, there are no major challenges (apart from the process being slow) expressed on raising local resources.

In Tanzania, the culture of community *harrambe* (community self help) embedded in the historical Ujama Villages makes it easier for partners to raise community contributions on all CBEI projects. For example in Kahama Primary school supported by ACORD, communities contributed up

to the tune of 100 desks. In some instances communities raise much more than they are expected. The evaluation team noted that in some CBEI projects local contributions were up to 18% as was the case with OCODE in Tanzania. At one time in WAD communities were able to contribute as much as 50% as local resource mobilization.

The evaluation team however noted that communities in urban areas such as those in Kampala and Dar-es-salaam preferred cash contributions as opposed to their counterparts in rural settings that find it easy to contribute sand, labour, bricks and other forms of in-kind contribution. It was also noted that where in-kind contributions are involved majority of partners found difficulties to quantify the percentage contributions.

While communities have been positive on local resource mobilization they should be informed in time of the standard percentage they are expected to contribute and this should be respected for every project undertaken. It is for example likely to ignite community concerns and problems when communities in the same region though with different partners but the same donor find themselves having to raise different percentages. This case was noted with partners in Rwanda. Likewise there were communities under the same partner but whose percentages were not uniform. Such practice should as much as possible be discouraged.

2.4 QUALITY OF CBEI PROJECTS UNDERTAKEN

For all those projects where partners had close supervision the quality of CBEI projects was satisfactory. Some of the major glaring cases where partners neglected their supervision role and resulted into poor quality projects include the AICT (Tanzania) Nyakato "A" primary school toilet construction that failed to conform to conventional standards of VIP latrine construction, and the KAD toilet rehabilitation works. In all these instances there was no value for money exhibited. Considering that the majority of partners are now implementing more infrastructural projects such as classroom construction, Stromme Foundation should consider making arrangements for "value for money audits" on a regular basis and where a partner consistently exhibits poor standards further steps should be taken. In addition, partners must ensure that national construction standards are followed. For example partners constructing classrooms in Uganda must follow the Government of Uganda School facilitation Grants (SFG) for latrine/toilet construction for urban and rural areas.

On the quality of training conducted, the evaluation team reviewed some of the training reports and found the quality satisfactory although there was no evidence of standardised training materials institutionally agreed upon by Stromme Foundation. While it may be argued that in most cases the training conducted was tailor made to fit the local context, the need for standard training materials such as those used in training School management Committees, (with minor adjustments to fit local contexts) remains prime. Partners in undertaking such interventions in Uganda are can make use of the District Education Offices for further guidance on this. In Rwanda and Tanzania, partners can liase with the respective ministries of education for they should be able to make some value addition to their intervention. It is therefore important that in the subsequent interventions Stromme Foundation follows up this matter.

2.5 PROJECT DESIGN ISSUES

The evaluation team noted that on the majority of CBEI projects undertaken there was a consistent lack of clear and measurable process (input and output indicators,) and impact/ outcome indicators. During interviews with partners the consultant noted that often time the staff confused impact evaluation with monitoring (the "constant checking"). With the exception of TAHEA in Tanzania other partners never adequately mapped out process and impact indicators of their interventions. This should have been done through the adoption of Logical Frameworks. For subsequent interventions it is important that partners be required to adequately make arrangements at design stage for measuring process and impact indicators before they are given funds to commence implementation. Partners should also be required to satisfactorily report on impact indicators during their progress/quarterly reports.

2.6 LINKAGES WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT CONTEXTS AND PRIORITIES

The evaluation team noted that all partners made effort to link their interventional efforts to local government contexts and priorities. There was evidence of effective collaboration with education sectors at local government level. For example UWCM related all its interventions to the education aspirations pursued by Sironko and Mbale Districts.

2.7 CBEI SWOT

In this section the review makes an assessment of the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats (SWOT) of the Community Based Education Intervention project as identified during the course of the evaluation. The SWOT presented does not present a partner specific situation as these have been presented in the country specific reports, but instead issues that cut across all partners in the three countries.

Table 1: CBEI SWOT

Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community enthusiasm and participation at all levels of project implementation. • Majority of partners have dedicated and committed staff even where numbers are small • The design of the CBEI project survives greatly on community involvement, which is a cardinal ingredient for sustainability. • CBEI Interventions are a reflection of the priority needs of the beneficiary communities. • Existence of Community-led mobilization and supervision structures that ensure quality issues. • Projects implemented under CBEI are a reflection of the priority needs of the beneficiary communities. • Existence of self motivated 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inadequate capacity on the part of some of the partners resulting from lack/poor means of transport. • Lack of a concrete harmonized impact tracking mechanism for all partners. • Irregular monitoring and supervision of project progress especially by the partners who are closer to the beneficiary communities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong support from local and national leadership. • The CBEI interventions are largely in line with government policy of ensuring Education For All (EFA). • The willingness and readiness of the communities to make both cash and in kind contribution for the CBEI implementation. • All teachers in Rwanda-Kigali are very anxious to master the English language 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Majority of the communities within the project areas are poverty stricken which partly impacts on the project success. • Some communities are less interested in the education of their children. • New interventions within the same project

<p>volunteers willing to work with partners at all times.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prompt and timely disbursement of funds from the donor to the partners. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project is highly inclusive 	<p>area that do not require community contribution</p>
---	--	---	--

From the above SWOT the evaluation team notes that CBEI offers opportunities for Sustainability of the interventions due to the strong community participation in project identification and implementation exhibited. In addition CEBI is cost effective (local resource mobilisation) and encourages Lesson learning. It is also possible that CBEI lays a firm platform for enhancing synergies and partnerships (from the poverty eradication point of view at community level) between Education and Micro-finance pursued by Stromme Foundation as an institution.

3. IMPACT CREATED BY IMPLEMENTATION OF CBEI

For purposes of ensuring clarity the impact created by CBEI is presented by country. A list of investments by country and partner is also shown in Appendix 1.

3.1 IMPACT CREATED BY RWANDA PARTNERS

Communication in English

During the review for Rwanda partners the team noted that some of the teachers trained in English Language were able to confidently construct English sentences. The extent of proficiency largely depends on the duration of the training, and the teacher's commitment as well as their background knowledge of the English language.

"Many of those who had basic knowledge of English before they attended the English language training program organized by AMU benefited much more than us who joined and were virtually starting from zero" Reported one of the teachers from Gitega Primary School

Reduced staffing burden and costs

Efforts to train teachers in English language for Rwanda partners have alleviated the problem of schools having to employ extra teachers purposefully for the teaching of English language in the schools. This has also offset the burden of parents and children having to pay extra fees for payment of special teachers for teaching English. To the teachers, they can handle their English class lessons in absence of the regular English teachers. Secondly they have become more marketable even outside classroom environment especially as the demand for English in Rwanda is increasing day by day.

Improved literacy skills

Interventions by partners in Rwanda especially in the area of supply of more desks have resulted in the improvement of pupils' handwriting, smartness, and cleanliness.

Improved school sanitation and pupil-stance ratio

The construction of new toilet facilities in some schools like Ntwali in Rwanda, has improved the school sanitation situation. The Pupil-Stance ratio in Ntwali primary school improved from 86 to 60 pupils per stance. This improvement in school sanitation is expected to further result in a decrease in absenteeism and improved retention of the girl child who is the most vulnerable to poor school sanitation and hygiene, and hence improved performance.

Improved pupil classroom ratio and learning environment

In schools supported by AMU in Rwanda, teachers reported that construction of new classrooms has on average improved the Pupil-Classroom ratio from 60 to 40 children per class. This has created a better atmosphere for teaching and learning environment.

"Before the implementation of CBEI, teaching in most of our classrooms was very difficult. One classroom for example would be shared by at least two classes. That is, you would sometimes have two classes; say primary 1 & 2 studying from the same class at the same time. This situation no longer exists since each class has its own classroom." **Said the head teacher of Bwirankoori primary school in Rwanda**

Improved image of partners within the public domain

The review further noted that the interventions that have been undertaken by the partners within their different project areas have raised the image and name of the various partners and are highly regarded especially within the primary education circles and the Local Government structures. The reputation for partners such as AEE in Rwanda is very good especially in Kanombe district where CBEI is being implemented.

3.2 IMPACT CREATED BY UGANDA PARTNERS

Increased enrolment

During the review for partners in Uganda it was noted that school enrolment has increased resulting from the improved school performance and support in form of infrastructure and facilities, as parents prefer to bring their children to schools with better facilities and good performance. For example in one school Malowobi P/S in Gulu northern Uganda, school enrolment increased from 534 in 2004, to 639 in 2005 indicating an increase of 20%. While in the same school enrolment increased from 635 in the year 2005 to 882 in the year 2006 indicating an increase of 38%.

" When EM-AC took Desks to schools in the name of girl orphans, parents realized that if they send their girls to school, then all their children would be assisted, it would not only be the girl child to benefit, it would be all; the 'drum' went louder in the name of the girls" noted the chairman LC111, Pabbo sub county.

A similar situation was also echoed in WAD in Uganda. The head teacher pointed out that since the introduction of CBEI, the enrolment for his school has gradually improved to the extent that he feels that he should have his school up graded to a grade 1 primary school. Below are the examples of the school enrolment for Birimbi primary school.

Table 2: School Enrolment for Birimbi Model Primary School for the Years 2003 - 2006 (WAD in Uganda)

2003				2004				2005				2006			
Class	M	F	T												
P7	27	28	55	P7	26	42	68	P7	34	45	79	P7	42	43	76
P6	38	47	85	P6	40	47	87	P6	54	54	108	P6	43	79	122
P5	47	44	91	P5	63	54	117	P5	46	62	108	P5	62	55	117
P4	62	46	109	P4	57	78	135	P4	54	48	102	P4	76	77	153
P3	44	56	100	P3	61	54	115	P3	60	66	126	P3	75	91	166
P2	49	29	78	P2	51	52	103	P2	77	88	165	P2	88	85	173
P1	89	84	173	P1	95	83	178	P1	111	79	189	P1	82	75	157
Total	356	334	690	Total	393	410	803	Total	436	441	877	Total	468	496	964

The table above reveals that in only one year 2003 - 2004 the school enrolment increased from 690 - 803 which is 16.3%, while in the year 2004 - 2005 the enrolment increased from 803 - 877 which is 8.58% and for the years 2005 - 2006 the school enrolment increased from 877 - 964 which is 9.9%. The entire trend above is attributed to the impact of Community Based Education Intervention.

Rejuvenated the social networks and responsibilities.

During consultations with partners like VT in Uganda, it was noted that the neglected orphans who once given supplies like goats, domestic items and planting materials like groundnut seeds now became a darling to the care givers as they are recognized as useful members of the community.

Promotion of girl's education

Information from EM-AC in Uganda revealed that more girls are now attracted to join and remain in education. For example in Agole primary school, the number of girls increased from 413 in 2005 to 521 in 2006, which is 26%. This has been achieved through the supply of the sanitary kits and provision for a changing room for the girls. Emphasis on girl child education as a strategy adopted by EM-AC in Uganda has also resulted into increased school enrolment for the girl children in a number of schools. Before CBEI the number of girls was usually far less than that of then boys in many school. For example records from the head teacher's office of Labala primary school reveal that the number of girls in 2001 in

was 116 while the boys was 291. During the time of the review the team found out that the number of girls is currently 314 while that of the boys is 275.

Skills development and orientation of children to vocational and technical skills

Procurement of tailoring machines and undertaking of carpentry and joinery by UWCM in Uganda was undertaken as one way of equipping the orphans with vocational skills. Consequently the consultant learnt that these had gone a long way in orienting children to these studies. Some had therefore opted to continue with vocational studies. In schools such as Bumusamali in eastern Uganda, school children had helped in furniture repairs thus saving the school management of the would be repair costs.

Reduced irregularity and late coming at school by both teachers and pupils of Agole and Mulukakise P/S for VT in Uganda.

Discussions with parents supported by VT revealed that the implementation of CBEI has greatly reduced the irregularity and late coming of both teachers and school children at schools. This was partly as a result of the staff quarters that were constructed in order to house the teachers at site. It was pointed out that before the intervention the teachers on average taught 4 lessons per day out of the mandatory 8 due to late coming. Coincidentally because the teachers came late resulting from traveling long distances, children followed suit well knowing the usual time of arrival of their teachers. This was usually past 9.00am, while departure would normally be by 3.00pm.

Improved academic performance and excellence

A visit to Bumusamali primary school for UWCM in Uganda provided evidence of improved academic performance. The school was noted for having been the best in Sironko district for the year 2005 with 06 first grades out of 87 pupils. 64 pupils passed in division 2, 13 in division 3, 03 in division 4, and 1 in division U. Management of the school was aiming at sustaining that leading position in the district and later in the entire Bugisu region. Plans were under way to make it a model school in the district. An interaction with all the school stakeholders revealed that all these achievements had been due to the CBEI. In WAD for example

Kitagata central school was one of the poorest performing schools in the diocese. After the introduction of CBEI, in the diocese, the school's performance has consistently improved every after one other year. Details of the performance of Kitagata Central PLE Results for the last five years are indicated here below:

Table 3: PLE Results for Kitagata Primary School in WAD

Year	Total No of Candidates	Div 1	Div 2	Div 3	Div 4	Div U	Div X
2001	45	08	21	11	02	02	10
2002	76	05	53	13	02	01	02
2003	74	19	30	16	07	00	02
2004	92	22	52	14	02	00	02
2005	106	03	83	14	02	01	03

Initiation of extending learning periods and the boarding section

In schools where interventions by UWCM in Uganda had been effective, there was evidence of extended learning hours/periods. Where they did not exist, plans were underway to have them. For example whereas at Bumamali a boarding section with an enrolment of 200 pupils had taken off, in Khamoto primary school plans were in advanced stages to have a boarding section. The day of the consultant's visit coincided with a parents' planning meeting for the introduction of a boarding section in the school. Parents feel that their children stand to learn better when they get more time at school. (Especially those in upper primary.)

"Given the fact that our school has been one of the lucky one to get the kind of support from UWCM, we now feel that we must work hard to ensure that the support received is reciprocated by our commitment to see to it that our children get the best out of the entire intervention. We are encouraging all our parents with pupils at least in primary seven to have their children in the boarding section." Chairman School Management Committee Bumamali primary school.

Provision and adoption of school uniform for school supported by EM-AC Uganda

CBEI was noted to have created impact in the area of encouraging parents to buy uniforms for their children. The implementation of CBEI by EM-AC in Uganda initially focused on sensitization and awareness rising. The major targets here were the parents and guardians. Before CBEI, these had stuck to the view that since Universal Primary Education (UPE) had introduced free education, it was a responsibility of government to provide all children necessities including uniform. But because the training emphasized on the parent/guardian responsibility in the education of children, parents realized the need to provide school uniform. Today over 80% of the school children supported by EM-AC Uganda put on uniforms as opposed to the situation before that stood at 20%.

Provision of midday meals

In some cases the implementation of CBEI by EM-AC in Uganda had directly enabled the accessibility to midday meals to children at risk. This was through the provision of seeds like groundnuts. Partners like EM-AC in Uganda encouraged parents and guardians to make humble cash contributions especially in the conflict areas of Uganda. In other cases, parents were motivated to initiate mid day meals provision now that costs of running the schools had been supplemented by support from CBEI. For instance when CBEI took to classroom and staff house construction, the attendant effects of extended hours of study implied provision of meals to school children. To this, parents/guardians easily complied since it was cheaper, than undertaking construction work to which CBEI had made a tremendous contribution.

Attracting other donors and development partners such as UNICEF

In areas where EM-AC is operating, CBEI approach has been hailed as the best way of reaching out to the needy and children at risk in difficult areas². The beneficiary communities, development partners and donors bear testimony of this. Consequently EM-AC in northern Uganda has signed a Memorandum of Understanding with GoU-UNICEF-CP to

² The girl child is emphasized

implement activities as a partner. This has resulted from experience and capacities built while working with the respective Local Governments.

Promotion and protection of children rights; health, education, clothing and feeding.

As revealed by the communities consulted in northern Uganda, it was learnt that the implementation of CBEI by EM-AC had encouraged a holistic approach in addressing children rights. This was achieved through practical provision of the required items and sensitization of communities. In some cases the girl child /orphan as the most vulnerable was jealously protected³

Advocacy for political positions

CBEI was noted to have acted as a stepping-stone to some political leaders, who had been actively involved in the program,

‘‘ Thank you for partnering with us CBEI is one of the factors that assisted me to sail through’’, remarked the chairman LC111 -Bungokho sub county, Mr. Washaki Ahmed

Ahmed attributed his success in the recent elections to the CBEI activities in his sub county over the past two years.

Improvement in other sectors-a case of backward and forward linkages

A visit to Bungokho community in Eastern Uganda revealed that on learning that one of the schools in the Sub county was to benefit from CBEI; the Sub county leadership undertook to improve on the community access road infrastructure with the aim of enabling the transportation of construction materials. It was further pointed out that this later favored transportation of agriculture produce including maize, sorghum and millet. Parents who interacted with the consultant argued that it was the CBEI that had enabled all this to occur.

³ Refer to a case of teachers who were canned for sexually harassing the girl child in Pabbo Sub county Gulu District

3.3 IMPACT CREATED BY TANZANIA PARTNERS

Overview

Projects undertaken reflect community prioritized needs (e.g electricity extension in Kisesa primary school- AICT) and this is largely due to the participatory and consultative approach used in project design through the initial PPS. Projects undertaken demonstrate varied innovations (Pre-primary for TAHEA, Girl child for ACORD, bicycles for local resource mobilization team -AICT).

Increased girl child enrolment

Information from AICT in Tanzania revealed that more girls are now attracted to join and remain in education. In schools such as Ilungu primary school records reveal that the number of girls was 406 while that of the boys was 363, indicating a deference of 43 pupils.

Table 4: Number of pupils supported by AICT in the CBEI schools

Schools	Girls	Boys	Total
Nyakato	1928	1937	3,865
Kishili	624	610	1,234
Kisabo	302	307	609
Ilungu	406	363	769
Kisase	468	448	916
Busweru	894	937	1,831
Total	4622	4602	9,224

Integration of CBEI projects in Local Government Plans

Some of the CBEI projects implemented in Tanzania have been integrated by the local government development framework. For example Acord is working very closely with community development department of Mwanza and , OCODE working with education department in Dar-es-salaam.

Strong Community Buy ins

Communities have strongly embraced CBEI approach to education support. In Mwanza communities are urging other NGOs in the area to use a

similar approach. CBEI has a strong community 'buy -ins'. "- We planned together and when we fail we shall fail together and then review" as mentioned by one TAHEA supported schools.

In addition CBEI has promoted community ownership of facilities (case in point is when one head teacher of Kirabera primary school (TAHEA) diverted bricks meant for a classroom block for construction of a teachers house. Communities forced him to return the bricks and threatened to have him demoted or expelled from the school).

"There were some people who were found uprooting trees to plant them in their homes. Parents followed them up and brought back these trees"

Profile raising of some NGOS

CBEI has raised the profile of some partners (at local community level, as well as National Level)- OCODE in Dar, KAMAMMA in Arusha)- the benefits of this include strong networks and partnerships at all levels e.g fundraising, exploration of intervention linkages etc.

Related interventions started in communities

Related interventions started in communities as confirmed by testimonies from community members and local leadership of the plans to start community reception centers for children before they join pre-primary.

Improved Learning

Improved learning and teaching environment (testimonies from teachers and children-children in the supported schools can now sit on desks, and concentrate during class lessons)

3.4 GOOD PRACTICES

In this section good practices demonstrated by different partners in the implementation of the CBEI are identified and documented. This enhances learning and strengthens the overall project interventions.

Good Practices Demonstrated by Rwanda and Tanzania Partners

- **Conducting initial Needs Assessment Surveys**

The evaluation team noted that all partners in Rwanda and Tanzania were implementing projects that had been identified and prioritized by the beneficiary communities. These included parents of the various project schools, teachers, head teachers, school children, and community leaders at various levels. This practice cultivates interest and participation of all parties initially consulted and strengthens ownership and sustainability of the interventions.

"It has not been very difficult to mobilize the parents for participating in the various CBEI project activities mainly because we do remember very well that this was part of our commitment we made during those days when we were being consulted before the actual beginning of the project"
Said Mr. Katalikaawe R the vice chairman of the CBEI local committee of Kyabandara Primary School

- **The creation of local CBEI Committees/task force**

All schools for partners visited in Kigali had put in place local CBEI committees that are mandated with the overall supervision of the projects being implemented in the schools. Whereas all community members had the responsibility of supervising the implementation of projects, the CBEI Committees were particularly over and above charged with the responsibility of making strict supervision and regularly report back to the rest of the community members on the progress of the interventions. This practice was found to be good as it ensures quality controls for the projects being implemented. In Tanzania all schools had strong local resource mobilisation task forces that supervised construction activities as well as raising local contributions.

- **Use of own local resource persons**

During consultations with community members for Umoja Primary School in Arusha (KAMAMA) and those of Kivugiza primary school in Kigali (ASOFERWA), it was reported that some of the persons used in the construction of the toilet are parents in the school. The communities were able to identify some of their colleagues with technical competences in construction work and these were contracted to do the work at relatively cheaper cost but with good quality. The team noted that this was a good practice as it is cost effective. In addition, the person involved in working on something where he has an interest for delivering the best quality results, will always ensure that he produces what will not bring down his good reputation.

"Some of us are working not because we expect to be paid any money, but mainly because we value so much the benefit of this work in as far as our children are concerned. In fact it is also our interest to be counted in future as part of the CBEI project." Said the chairman of the parents' committee for Intwali Primary School

- **Clearly spelling out of roles and responsibilities to all CBEI stakeholders from the onset and inception of the project.**

The review also noted that during the inception of the CBEI project, all the partners in Rwanda organized sensitization meetings and workshops. It was from these workshops that participants identified and assigned roles to various stakeholders. Partners would then play a follow up, support supervision and monitoring role to the fulfillment of agreed actions and responsibilities. This is a good practice for it served to reduce incidences of role confusion and conflict that would arise to the detriment of the success of the project. This further ensured quality and timely implementation of projects.

- **Community participation through local resource mobilization**

Partners such as AICT in Tanzania expressed great appreciation to the efforts and commitment demonstrated by the community to the appeals for community contribution towards the implementation of CBEI. The

table below presents a significant improvement in community contribution year after year.

Table 5: Total Budget IACT for the last four years

Year	SF	Local contribution	Total
2003	26,470,304.00	685,000.00	27,251,525.00
2004	27,913,417.00	5,397,150.00	33,310,567.00
2005	35,301,865.00	8,447,900.00	43,069,584.00
2006	35,035,714.00	8,758,929.00	43,794,643.00

Good Practices as Demonstrated by Uganda Partners

- **Involvement of all Stakeholders**

The review team noted that in many cases where the implementation of CBEI was successful was mainly a result of the mobilisation strategy that seeks to involve all stakeholders. It was for example noted that the support elicited from the involvement of the Local Government leaders by WAD in Uganda in the implementation of CBEI was very important. The chairman LC111 Pabbo asserted,

“When EM-AC involved us, we were more of a voice of EM-AC in Pabbo Sub County two years ago. Two years down the road, the flame is still burning.”

- **Use of PWDS**

The review team noted that VT had taken initiative to make use of People With Disabilities (PWDs) in community facilitation activities. This was noted to be a good practice for it enabled pupils to understand that even PWDs who would otherwise miss the opportunity to participate and benefit from the implementation of CBEI were also part of the project support. They further understood that PWDs can be useful people in the society and being disabled does not mean inability. There were some PWDs with tailoring skills who EM-AC asked on a voluntary basis to teach pupils these skills.

- **Playing of mentoring role by partners to other stakeholders.**

Some partners have gone a step ahead to play a mentoring role to district stakeholders. One district staff in Gulu was assigned to work with EM-AC in order to get acquainted with the CBEI approach to work. This is a good practice for it ensures sustainability and continuity of initiated interventions if seen impacting on the lives of the intended beneficiary.

- **Local contribution, Motivation and promotion of the spirit of volunteerism -volunteer staff at Sub county level**

The use of community contribution in the implemented projects was discovered to have been one of the good practices. Community contribution took the form of cash, materials, and labor to the extent of some community members sub county level offering to be volunteers in the implementation of CBEI. A case in point was when one volunteer staff was posted at Pabbo Sub county headquarters. This is a good practice for it intensifies the notion of project ownership and sustainability. In some cases Individuals made personal contributions in cash and kind. This was very common with political leaders. -MPs, LC5 and LC3 Chairpersons especially with partners such as EM-AC in Gulu and WAD in western Uganda.

- **Team work, Effective and continuous mobilization and Commissioning of facilities**

For majority of partners in Uganda, communities worked together in form of communal work. In case of meetings, different means of communication were used. These were use of letters, radio announcements, use of church and Local Council leaders. On the actual day of an activity (meeting, communal work) drums are sounded. This was one of the practices that were particularly used by partners such as EM-AC and UWCM in Uganda. The consultant notes this as a good practice as it encourages a high level participation and turn up of community members during the implementation of activities.

- **Provision of lunch for school children**

The practice as demonstrated by EM-AC in Uganda was noted as a good practice for it encourages and created a good learning environment as

well as improving on their health. In addition the practice has reduced on the level of absenteeism and while improving on the level of concentration in class. This practice has been timely especially given the fact that majority of the children living in camps cannot even afford the bear minimum for their survival at their homes. However for purposes of sustainability, it is preferred that partners do their best to encourage parents and guardians to be the ones to meet the need for the lunch of their children.

"Before the introduction of the provision of the midday meals the situation was very bad especially during the afternoon classes. We would probably teach for the sake of it but majority of our children would not benefit, not forgetting that some of them cannot afford the standard meal at home." Said one of the teachers in Agole primary school

- **Net working and joint monitoring of activities (District and Donors)**

There is very good networking mechanisms between partners and local government authorities as has demonstrated by partners such as WAD, EM-AC, and UWCM in Uganda. This is another good practice in the CBEI project. It encouraged effective interventions and addressing the real needs of the CAR. It also reduced the chances of duplication of services hence saving the badly needed resources and improving on equity. Communities were also saved from experiencing donor fatigue in form of workshops, meetings etc, because communities also need some time to do other activities like farming and business for their own personal survival.

- **Use and empowerment of the senior women teacher- Counseling rooms for girl children -offices for the senior women teacher**

Partners in Uganda such as EM-AC, UWCM and WAD were very keen to ensuring that the role of senior women teachers is upheld. As a result communities and schools, highly recognized and upheld this due to the central role they play in the shaping, counseling and guidance of the girl child, who are in most cases experiencing challenges of growth like the on set of menstrual period for the first time in their lives. EM-AC and UWCM had established counseling rooms that ensured secrecy and cultivated confidence within the growing girls. The consultant notes this

to be good practices, learning from the challenges in other communities and schools that had not yet made good use of the senior women teacher.

- **Spiritual counseling –use of pastors and Jesus' life as role models**

The involvement of key church leaders such as Pastors, Priests and Lay Readers as resource persons in counseling greatly improves the general conduct and behavior of majority of the pupils. This is one of the practices that were cherished by partners such as WAD in Uganda pursued to see to it that the moral standards and discipline in the schools does not deteriorate into unmanageable levels like the cases in some of the schools outside the CBEI project. This practice is good as it further consolidates the efforts being undertaken by the teachers and parents in the efforts to improve on the morals of young children. In addition majority of school children have great respect to such and are usually bound to take their word more seriously.

- **Public rebuke and punishment of girl child sexual offenders**

In Pabbo Sub County of northern Uganda, 2 male teachers were found guilty of sexually abusing the girl child. EM-AC in conjunction with the Sub county Local Government leadership and the respective senior women teachers vehemently reprimanded them. The culprits were paraded before the general public, caned severely and banished from the sub county community. This was a good practice for it served as a deterring measure not only to the victim but also to other potential offenders.

*"That incident has since then helped us all in this sub county. Since then we have not had any reports of child abuse and we are sure that a sense of responsible behaviors not only among the teachers but also with in the community circles"*Reported the sub county chief of Pabbo sub-county in Gulu District

- **Engraving of CBEI investments–prestige and identification**

All partners in Uganda made sure that all physical items such as desks that were procured and supplied to the beneficiary schools and communities are clearly engraved with inscription indicating the source of support and the beneficiary community. This was consistently observed by UWCM and VT in eastern Uganda as well as EM-AC in northern Uganda. Partners like WAD who was not able to engrave these particulars on such

items at least tried to write on them using very strong indelible ink. The consultant notes that this is a good practice for it ensures accountability and promotes ownership of investments. The likely confusion that might arise from the practice of double physical accountability are avoided.

- **Participatory Preliminary Studies (PPS)**

The review learnt that before the implementation of CBEI project was undertaken, it was a fundamental requirement for all partners in Uganda as well as other countries to conduct a PPS, and these became the benchmark for the specific interventions in each of the schools under the CBEI project would be undertaken. It was also noted that these Participatory Preliminary Studies are all-inclusive and involve consultations with all stakeholders in the implementation of the CBEI. This practice was found to be good as beneficiaries feel are empowered to make their own decisions and priorities, as they feel best suited to them.

4. KEY EMERGING ISSUES

4.1 COUNTRY OFFICES OR INCREASING REGIONAL OFFICE STAFF

The progress that has been registered so far in the implementation of the CBEI within the East African region presents itself with other challenges. Some of the quality assurance challenges as those noted in AICT, KAD, ASOFERWA could not have arisen if there was continued SF presence in the field. The establishment of country officer once undertaken as an option should be accompanied with clear terms of reference for supervising partners as well raising funds at national level. Stromme should review its position on country offices and / or should consider increasing its present staff at the regional office. For example it is appropriate to have an assistant to the present education officer. Some partners also raised prolonged delays before the regional office feeds them back on critical issues. In some instances feedback comes when it is too late to implement the activity.

4.2 PROJECT DESIGN

The nature of project designs currently followed by all the partners in the region presents a very serious challenge relating to monitoring of quality gains and control as well as mapping out the impact created. Whereas the use of the Participatory Preliminary Studies alone is good for purposes of assessing the current needs it is inadequate to track progress of the interventions and the extent to which such intervention creating the desired impact. It is preferred that all partners are required to design log frame matrixes and these should be the bench marks for supervision as well as preparing monitoring and evaluation plans (A sample has been provided in **Appendix 2**). These log frames should be approved before release of implementation funds.

4.3 LOCAL RESOURCE MOBILISATION

The mobilisation of local resources remains a key ingredient in the implementation of CBEI. And whereas 20% has been agreed upon community contribution at the donor level, the review found out that the practice was not uniform. It is important that Stromme Foundation and

partners work hand in hand to realise a uniform minimum percentage required from the beneficiary communities for CBEI projects.

4.4 CHOICE AND RETAINING OF PARTNERS

In this world of competitive service delivery, it is important that the selection and retention of Stromme Foundation partners is based on strict agreed standards to avoid taking on and continuing with partners that do not measure to the required standard. There is no value addition in retaining a partner for one project after the other as long as that partner is not performing to the satisfaction of the donor and other stakeholders.

RANKING OF SCHOOLS

Whereas the review considered ranking of the partners' performance as the most important part of the assessment, the team further considered the assessment of individual schools as equally important. The ranking of schools is based on the overall response of the community, school management, the pupils, local leaders, and all other stakeholders within the school environment to the demands of the CBEI project implementation.

Table 6: Grading of Schools for Uganda Partners

Partner	School	Grading /Ranking	Remarks
WAD	Masheruka P/S	A	The involvement of the school community and all other stakeholders in the planning, resource mobilisation, and project implementation processes of CBEI is commendable.
	Kyabandara P/S	A	The review noted that there is high-level commitment emanating from the school leadership. As a result this is able to trickle down to other stakeholders, which has enhanced the success of CBEI in the school.
	Kati P/S	B	The school community is rather poor, which affects the pace of resource mobilisation. Nevertheless, there is great interest in ensuring that the project is successful.
	Birimbi P/S	B	There is evidence of community participation, although there is need for improved supervision and monitoring.
	Kyeizoba P/S	C	Community participation is reported to be limited which further negatively impacts on effective resource mobilisation.
	Kasaana P/S	C	The school administration is rather weak. This is further aggravated by lack of committed community leaders to support the project implementation.

	Kitagata P/S	C	There is lack of strong commitment on both the school administration and the community to ensure project success. This can be improved through increased community sensitisation.
V T	Angole P/S.	C	Community interest and involvement in the CBEI project is still very minimal. More sensitisation is required.
	Kapir P/S.	A	The school community is very enthusiastic and have all demonstrated great commitment to make CBEI a success
	Morukakise P/S.	B	The success so far registered is attributed to improved transparency resulting from creation of a new task force whose major responsibility is to fore see the resource mobilisation process
EM - AC	Agole P/S	A	The involvement of all stakeholders in the implementation of the project has been the secret of CBEI success in the school
	PabboP/S	A	There is evidence of strong and good working relation ship between the local leaders, community and the school management.
	Otongo P/S	B	Through the support elicited from the local leadership, communities have demonstrated commitment and readiness to support the CBEI project.
	Olya P/S	A	The success of CBEI in the school is visible and is mainly a result of collaboration the partner and the sub county leadership.
	Okidi P/S	B	Communities have demonstrated support for the project but are still incapacitated mainly because of the poverty situation in the region resulting from the insecurity that has prevailed for over 20 years.
	Bibia P/S	B	While majority of the community members are poverty stricken, they have registered success largely because of team work.
UWCM	Busumali P/S	A	The intervention has been well received by the majority of the communities. They particularly appreciated the issue of helping children at risk.

	Khamoto P/S	C	The communities prefer to keep their children at home mainly to involve them in rice-growing season. There is need to intensify community sensitisation and mobilisation to help them realise the value of education.
	Nabiwutulu P/S	C	Inefficient school management problems have negatively impacted the performance of the CBEI project in the school. There is need to strengthen the collaboration and networking between the partner and district education department as a way of improving the current situation.
KAD	Makerere COU P/S	B	The school management has worked hard to elicit the interest and support of the community.
	St. Martin Mulago P/S	C	There is a rift between the local area leadership and the school administration. This is further aggravated by the inadequate supervision by the partner.
	Bukasa P/S	C	The school has a challenge relating to mismanagement. This affected the mobilisation of the community and other stakeholders.

Table 7: Grading of Schools for Rwanda Partners

PARTNER	SCHOOL	SCORE	REMARKS
ECAM	EPA	B	Construction work for the school water tank and renovation of the school toilet is commendable. It is evidence of community interest and commitment.
	Gitega	B	The teachers trained in English language demonstrated improved competence at least in the handling of the subject in class.
	Biryogo	B	The school management and the teachers have demonstrated a positive response towards the English language-training program. Over 15 teachers for the lower primary have participated in the training.
AEE	Nonko	A	The progress of work at the school as noted by the review team revealed that there is adequate mobilization and support from the community and other stakeholders in the implementation of the CBEI projects.

	Rubirizi	A	The implementation of CBEI has progressed well and received great support from the local leaders especially in form of community mobilization that has accelerated implementation.
ASOFERW A	Intwali	A	The school has demonstrated a high level of cooperation with parents in the implementation of the CBEI
	Kivugiza	A	The school has put in place a CBEI local resource mobilization committee that works hand in hand with the school management and other stakeholders. This partnership has been the hallmark of CBEI success in the school
	Rugalama	C	This school is characterized by signs of conflict and disharmony between parents and management. There is no visible working relationship between the school and other stake holders which breeds tension and undermines the success of the implementation of CBEI project implementation.
AMU	Gikondo	A	The foundation body of the school is very committed and sets the example by taking the lead in all matters concerning the project.
	Karugira	A	The quality of the investments especially the construction of the classrooms is of very good.
	Nyarurama	B	The school management works very closely with the rest of the other stakeholders, such as the local government leaders and these have given the school tremendous support
	Mburabutuuro	B	The success of this school is largely due to the effective mobilization undertaken by the CBEI local resource mobilization committee
	Bwirankori	A	Parents have established strong collaboration with the school. Management and the local leadership which has contributed to effective implementation of the CBEI project

Table 8: Grading of Schools for Tanzania Partners

Tanzania	OCODE	Temeke P/S	A	The school community is actively involved in resource mobilisation, project planning and implementation.
		Mbagala P/S	B	The head teacher, staff and the pupils are very active.
		Kizinga P/S	B	School management co-operates well with parents and other stakeholders in the implementation of CBEI.
		Madenge P/S	C	The school administration is not transparent enough. This constrains resource mobilisation
		Muongano	C	While the school is performing well in the primary leaving examinations it is rocked with lack of transparency.
	ACORD	Nyamudoke P/S	A	High committed dedicated school community ease the process of resource mobilisation.
		Nyamhongoro P/S	B	Commitment of local leaders and parents' community continue to be an asset.
		Kahama P/S	C	The school is disadvantaged by the location. It is deep in the poor rural area. Poor management issues also account to its relatively bad performance.
		Lukobe P/S	C	Lack of support from local leaders and community ignorance of the value of development initiatives through NGO support.
		Nsumba P/S	D	Alcoholism among teachers remains a challenge in this school. Also the school has been separated from the old school.
	KAMAMMA	Umoja P/S	A	The community is highly committed towards the development of their school.
		Nganana P/S	B	There is little community participation because most parents are employed in the flower gardens.
		Maweni P/S	C	There is a joint participation by all partners.

AICT	Nyakato Primary Schools	B	A very health working relationship among the different stakeholders.
	Bushelu P/S	D	There is a power wangle in the community over who should do what. This has resulted into school management problems.
	Kistuli P/S	B	The community received the project with a lot of hope. There is good collaboration between the school and there parents.
	Kisesa P/S	B	There is a wide division among the stakeholders with each party having diverging interests in so far as implementation of CBEI is concerned.
	Kisabo P/S	D	The cooperation between the various school administrators is very poor thus inadequate local resource mobilisation.
	Ilungu P/S	D	The school administration is week. AICT has not sensitised the different stakeholders.
TAHEA	Masemele P/S	A	The community has taken up the project as their own. They participate in the project design, implementation and monitoring.
	Igogwe P/S	B	There is great community participation especially from the local leadership.
	Kilabela P/S	B	The community realises the work done by the project and is willing to whatever possible to further development.
	Fumagila P/S	A	The school community is very enthusiastic and have demonstrated great commitment to make CBEI a success
	Nyamwilolelwa P/S	A	The adequate sensitisation made by TAHEA enhanced community participation.

5. RANKING OF PARTNERS

5.1 OVERVIEW

As part of the Terms of Reference the Consultant was required to rank partners using a scale of A-E. Partners have therefore been ranked on the basis of the existing capacities/ resources. The table below shows the criteria used.

5.2 BASIS FOR RANKING

Table 9: Basis for Ranking of partners

Rank/score	Basis
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Remarkable impact created-more girls enrolled and retained at school and general improvements noted.2. Partner has been innovative and has minimised weakness and built on the strengths3. High level of stakeholders involvement including all leaders from village to district as well as national leaders4. Partner adequately documents project progress and impact.5. Partner has adequate staffing and there is evidence of quality delivery of services.6. Achievements/investments visible and of good quality.7. Use of existing social and political networks8. Recommendable output with minimal resources9. Partner with more good practices observed10. Has minimised challenges of resources mobilisation and registered tremendous success.

5.3 RANKING /PARTNER SCORES

Table 10: Partner scores

Partner(s)	Score	Remarks
AMU	A	Partner satisfactorily used the working and collaboration systems in place for maximum gains and output. Has made the project a concern of all stakeholders, and pays attention to details of quality and standard work especially construction works.
ECAM	C	Partner has inadequate staffing, strives to achieve maximum output with minimal resources. Partner has been innovative, minimised weakness and built on the strengths
ASOFERWA	B	Partner has minimised challenges of resources mobilisation, well equipped but need to pay adequate attention to strict supervision and monitoring of interventions
AEE	A	Partner networks and collaborates very well with stakeholders and there is evidence of high quality services delivery
WAD	A	Partner exploits the working and collaboration systems in place for minimum gains and outputs. He has made the project a concern for all.
KAD	D	Partner pays less attention to project details regarding collaboration, networking and implementation of activities with measurable impact/ outputs
VT	C	Partner is well equipped but too preoccupied by a wider area of interventions and perhaps more other donors.
EM-AC	A	The partner strives to achieve a maximum output with minimum resources.
UWCM	A	Partner networks and collaborates very well with stakeholders and pays attention to details of quantity and standard work especially construction work.
TAHEA	A	Partner interventions are visible and of good quality. Uses existing social and political networks. Partner has demonstrated capacity to adequately document CBEI project progress.

ACORD	A	Partner is very committed to supervision of CBEI projects and had adequately documented project progress. Partner also pays close attention to project technical detail
AICT	D	Partner failed to adequately supervise CBEI projects. The institutional weaknesses rocked all CBEI projects pursued. The partner require an urgent organisational assessment and an orientation of its staff who are essentially new into CBEI
KAMAMA	B	Partner has minimised challenges of resources mobilisation, well equipped but needs to pay adequate attention to strict supervision and monitoring of interventions.
OCODE	B	Partner has inadequate staffing, strives to achieve maximum output with minimal resources. Partner shall require to adequately track progress and impact created by CBEI

By and large, majority of partners in the three countries have made substantial progress in the implementation of CBEI. The consultant strongly believes that with improved supervision and monitoring by all stakeholders, donors and partners inclusive, CBEI shall register even greater success. It is important that monitoring of project implementation is closely pegged to a detailed clear and measurable process (input and output indicators,) and impact/ outcome indicators.

6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The review team noted that monitoring by both the project implementers (partners) and community project structures in all the three countries implementing CBEI requires further strengthening. Cases of poor quality facilities e.g toilet construction that does not follow the current technical and engineering standards/ designs was noted) in Rugalama primary school. Value for money is lost, community morale and enthusiasm is curtailed, and project funds-both donors and community is wasted.
2. The review also recommends that project design for all projects undertaken by all partners should provide clear and measurable process (input and output indicators,) and impact/ outcome indicators. It is good practice to progressively measure the impact of project interventions at the start implementation. In addition this mid-term evaluation also recommends that partners be required to report on impact indicators during their progress/quarterly reports.
3. It is also recommended that in order to strengthen Community Based Education Intervention conducting feedback surveys at some regular intervals will be important. These will help both partners and community monitoring and supervision committees to measure impact and eventually inform the design and implementation processes. Results of community feedback /user surveys should then be shared with SF during progress reporting.
4. In order to strengthen CBEI, sustained local resource mobilization (in kind and financial) should be considered as the cornerstone for successful implementation and sustainability of CBEI. However when in kind contributions are made, they should be adequately valued and quickly shared with the beneficiary communities to avoid un necessary suspicions.
5. All partners implementing the training of teachers in English language must ensure that the approach to the training effectively caters for all the four major skills of language acquisition i.e. speaking, listening, reading, and writing. This can be achieved partly through the approach of using audio-visual teaching/learning

materials as well as the provision of other instructional materials like textbooks.

6. Partners involved in construction activities should conform to country construction standards. It was learnt that where as the donor had supported communities to undertake construction works including classrooms, staff houses and latrines, there were no efforts made to quality assurance and to ensure that country standards are followed.
7. Evidence for children's routine counseling and guidance on physical growth challenges and life skills, should be demonstrated in all projects. In addition the challenges facing the privacy of the girl child while at school should be urgently addressed. This is more critical in schools where the toilet facilities are inadequate and in some case there is no separate provision for the girl child.
8. Mentoring and guiding communities to make informed decision-making during PPS should be emphasized. Some of the projects undertaken by some partners did not reflect realistic community needs as is the case for AICT when painting of classrooms at Busweru primary school was undertaken spending about 900,000/= TC, yet the school has a crumbling classroom and poor latrine structure for boys.

7. APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1: LIST OF CBEI INVESTMENTS BY PARTNER AND COUNTRY

A-1 Construction and rehabilitation works done

Country	Partner	Works category						Remarks
		Classrooms	Latrines	Staff houses	Library	Offices	Renovations	
Uganda	VT	2	N/A	2	1	N/A	12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The staff houses are planned for 3 teachers one of which has stalled for a year at Angole p/s. ▪ Library had reached beam level ▪ Renovated 2 classrooms in Angole P/S, 3 children's' houses in Angole, 4 in Morukakise P/S and 3 in Kapir P/S

Country	Partner	Works category						Remarks
		Classrooms	Latrines	Staff houses	Library	Offices	Renovations	
	UWCM	2	1	2	N/A	1	5 Classes and a store floored and shut.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The 2 staff houses housing 8 teachers. Shutters included metallic windows and doors at Khamotu pls.
	EM-AC	N/A	2	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only toilets were prioritised during PPS
	KAD	N/A	2	N/A	N/A	N/A	4 classrooms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construction work involved renovation of 4 classrooms, construction of one kitchen, and one ten-stance toilet.
	WAD	N/A	3	N/A	N/A	3	57	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Three offices for a head teacher, deputy and bursar were constructed at one school. WAD constructed three girls' washrooms in three schools.

Country	Partner	Works category						Remarks
		Classrooms	Latrines	Staff houses	Library	Offices	Renovations	
Rwanda	AEE	N/A	3	N/A	N/A	N/A	22	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Renovation of classes involved flooring of classrooms, construction of a classroom veranda, fixing of new metallic doors and glass windows on classrooms
	ECAM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One sixteen -stance school toilet was renovated
	ASOFERWA	N/A	1	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The partner concentrated on trainings and supply of furniture
	AMU	14	1	N/A	N/A	1	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> AMU is hailed for the quality classroom construction and renovation.
Tanzania	TEHEA	8	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TEHEA's activities are mainly focused on construction

Country	Partner	Works category						Remarks
		Classrooms	Latrines	Staff houses	Library	Offices	Renovations	
	AIC	15	2	2	N/A	N/A	26	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Good staff houses and classrooms were constructed
	ACORD	8	1	Not planned	N/A	N/A	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activities not done were not planned for in the PPS
	KAMAMA	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activities not done were not planned for in the PPS
	OCODE	Not planned for	Not planned for	Not planned for	Not planned for	3	19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OCODE rehabilitated 2 school stores

Note: The consultant appreciated the selection of construction activities pursued by the implementing partners. Considering that enrolments are increasing in all CBEI schools construction of more classrooms, renovation of existing ones, and teachers houses should be pursued.

A-2 Furniture Supplied by different partners per country

Country	Partner	No. Tables	No. Chairs	No of desks	Remarks
Rwanda	AEE	11	N/A	120	1 big table and 10 benches were provided to an adult centre
	ECAM	Not planned for	Not planned for	Not planned for	ECAM activities focussed on training mainly in English language
	ASOFERWA	N/A	N/A	732	The furniture was of good quality.
	AMU	14	14	384	Good quality furniture and durable
Uganda	WAD	21	20	175	These table and chairs were provided to Kyeizoba and tables to Kati primary school
	EM - AC	Not planned for	Not planned for	Not planned for	Activities not done were not prioritised by the PPS

	V T	Not planned for	Not planned for	75	The quality of desks was good
	UWCM	15	30	150	The quality was good
	KAD	Not planned for	Not planned for	Not planned for	According the PPS these activities were not planned
Tanzania	AIC	2	11	279	The quality was good
	ACORD	N/A	N/A	570	The quality was good
	TAHEA	Not yet planned for	Not yet planned for	Not yet planned for	Resources were directed towards the highest ranked items
	KAMAMMA	N/A	N/A	120	Good quality furniture
	OCODE	96 for teachers	96 for teachers	380	The furniture is satisfactory

A-3 Water tanks Supplied/Constructed by different partners per country

Country	Partner	No of water tanks
Rwanda	AEE	Not planned for
	ECAM	1
	ASOFERWA	Not planned for
	AMU	Not planned for
Uganda	WAD	2 (One in Birimbi and the other in Kyabandaara P/S)
	EM - AC	Not planned for
	UWCM	Not planned for
	KAD	1
Tanzania	AIC	
	ACORD	2
	TAHEA	Not yet planned for
	KAMAMMA	2
	OCODE	Drilled a water well at Muungano P/S

A-4. Other materials supplied by each partner per country

Country	Partner	Scholastic Material	Other materials supplied
Uganda	WAD	1. Scholastic materials and money for buying papers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Supplied a type writer to Kyabandara primary school
	VISION TERUDO	1. Helped the school acquire a library	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Six sets of oxen, one to Kapir P/S, two to Morukikase and three to Angole P/S ▪ Established 3 school life projects in her three schools
	EM - AC	1. Helped partnering schools with scholastic material including pens, pencils, mathematical sets and PLE past papers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Supplied partner schools with sports items

	UWAC	Not Planned for in the PPS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Two blocks making machines were handed over to two different schools.
	KAD	Scripture books	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Fenced the school
Rwanda	AEE	Scholastic materials such as maps, text books, and compasses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • These were provided to Rubiriizi and Nonko primary school
	ECAM	N/A	N/A
	ASOFERWA	N/A	N/A
	AMU	Scholastic materials	N/A
Tanzania	AIC	Over 1800 text books	School management was appreciative
	ACORD	1006 Text books supplementary leaflets	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Industrial material for construction and rehabilitation of intrastate
	TAHEA	Not planned for	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Bricks and stones
	KAMAMMA	The partner is putting a lot of emphasis on teachers' houses.	Not planned

	ACODE	Provide stationary for remedial classes for primary seven pupils	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ 10 football, 20 bips, 1 volley ball, 5 pairs of jerseys, 2 whistles, 2 stop watches, 1 volley ball net, 2 goal keepers gloves and 1 foot ball pump.
--	-------	--	---

A-5 Trainings activities conducted by different partners and country

Country	Partner	Type of training
Rwanda	AEE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Resource mobilisation ▪ Children rights ▪ Training of teachers in English language ▪ Mobilised prostitutes to give up the trade
	ECAM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Resource mobilisation ▪ Training of teachers in English Language
	ASOFERWA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of teachers in English Language, HIV/AIDS, and children's rights ▪ Resource mobilisation ▪ Training of teachers from each of the schools supported in Counselling and guidance
	AMU	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of teachers in English Language ▪ Resource mobilisation ▪ Trained teachers in computer skills
Uganda	WAD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of SMCs and CBEI committees in resource mobilisation ▪ Trained teachers in scriptures

	EM - AC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of SMCs and CBEI committees in resource mobilisation ▪ Training of teachers in Counselling and guidance skills
	UWCM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of SMCs and CBEI committees in resource mobilisation ▪ Training of teachers from each of the schools supported in Counselling and guidance ▪ Training of SMCs and CBEI committees financial management and community based monitoring and evaluation
	KAD	No training was conducted.
	VT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of SMCs and CBEI committees in resource mobilisation ▪ A total of three teachers have received support for training for upgrading to diploma level ▪ Training of schools children in vocational works
Tanzania	AIC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 9 teachers were trained and sat for "O" level National Examinations ▪ 115 pupils, 52 parents were trained in reproductive health education ▪ 2 sensitisation meetings on gender equality and advocacy

	ACORD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Sensitized PTAs on resource mobilisation ▪ Trained local structures on resource mobilisation, HIV /AIDS gender and environment
	TAHEA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of SMCs and CBEI committees in resource mobilisation ▪ Trained local structures on resource mobilization, HIV /AIDS gender and environment
	KAMAMMA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Sensitized PTAs on resource mobilization, project planning and evaluation
	OCODE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Trained eight female teachers in guidance and counselling ▪ Trained five school committees and teachers in school financial management ▪ Trained 17 volunteers on their roles and responsibilities ▪ Trained 2 staff in computer and accounting packages ▪ Trained 17 task force members

A-6 Trends in CBEI school enrolment in Uganda

Country	Partner	School Enrolment Over a Period Of 3 Years					Remarks
		School	2003	2004	2005	2006	
Uganda	VT	Kapir	250	267	342	437	Data presented here reveal that Mulakakise P/S recorded the highest percentage increase of up to 40% from the year 2003 to 2004, while the lowest was 2.8% for Kapir P/S in 2006
		Angole	456	653	754	832	
		Murukakise	420	589	732	936	
	UWCM	Bumusamali	342	589	643	867	Busamali P/S recorded the highest percentage increase of 94% from 2003 to 2005 while the lowest was 6% by Khamot from 2004 to 2005
		Nabiwutulu	135	246	478	673	
		Khamotu	623	714	756	811	
	EM-AC	Agole	257	973	1203	1529	Labara P/S recorded the highest percentage increase of 35% from the year 2004 to 2005 for schools supported by EM-AC, while Malowobi recorded the lowest percentage increase of 13 % from 2003 to 2004.
		Labara	296	335	453	589	
		Malowobi	345	534	639	882	
	KAD	Bukasa	334	376	368	356	St. Martine Makerere P/ had the highest percentage school enrolment increment of 25% from 2003 to 2004.
		Makerere c/u	442	523	612	710	
		St. Martin	478	597	684	785	
	WAD	Kyeizooba PS	338	424	537	609	For schools under WAD Kasaana P/S

Country	Partner	School Enrolment Over a Period Of 3 Years					Remarks
		School	2003	2004	2005	2006	
		Kitagata PS	830	733	699	643	registered the Highest school enrolment increment of 37% from 2004-2005 in Birambi primary school.
		Kyabandaala PS	702	591	617	649	
		Kati	859	825	628	642	
		Kasaana PS	702	641	401	406	
		Birimbi PS	690	803	877	964	
		Masheruka PS	711	824	903	987	

APPENDIX 2: SAMPLE LOGICAL FRAMEWORK MATRIX FOR AN ORPHANS AND VULNERABLE CHILDREN (OVCs) INTERVENTION

GOAL	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS (OVIS)	RESPONSIBLE PERSON	MEANS OF VERIFICATION (MOV)	CRITICAL ASSUMPTIONS
<p>Ensure development and realization of rights of orphans and other vulnerable children in(Name Of The Organization) by 2011.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 35% of guardians/ parents aware of children's rights. • 40% of OVCs aware of their rights. • 100% leaders (community and church leaders) aware of children's rights in the targeted areas • 10% Reduction in cases of child abuse 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphan support manager • Child sponsorship manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attendance lists • Field reports • Survey reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funds will be available • Staff are committed to ensuring that objectives are achieved
<p>Specific objectives</p>				

<p>i) To improve access to primary and secondary education to 3370 OVCs in 20 parishes by 2011</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 35% Improvement in OVCs school enrollment. • 40% Increase in the number of OVCs attending school • 25% Improvement in completion rates of OVCs at institutional level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphan support manager • Child sponsorship manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School registers • Field reports • Academic certificates • Beneficiary profile • 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources are mobilized • Staff are committed to meeting their schedules
<p>ii) To increase awareness of children's rights among the OVCs, their guardians/parents, and community leaders in 20 parishes by 2011</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 35% Increase in the number of guardians/parents aware of children's rights. • 40% Improvement in the number of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan support manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attendance lists • Field reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources are mobilized • Community leaders, parents and guardians available for awareness workshops

	<p>OVCs aware of their rights.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 100 community leaders and church leaders aware of children's rights. • 10 % Reduction in cases of child abuse 			
<p>iii) To support 1920 Orphans in Income Generating Activities (IGAs) in 20 parishes by 2011</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1920 orphans with IGAs by the end of 2011 • 40% increase in the number of orphans with qualitative change by 2011 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphan support manager • Agricultural Officer 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Field reports. • List of beneficiaries. • Beneficiary profile 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources are available • There is economic stability in the country
<p>iv) To promote networks with intervening agencies in education and children's rights issues by 2011.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15 intervening agencies having functional networks regarding OVCs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphan support manager • Child sponsorship 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Manuals gathered • Workshop reports • Minutes of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources are available • Intervening agencies are willing to

	programmes		meetings held	cooperate
v) Develop and strengthen orphan counseling services by 2011	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 100% Orphans counseled by 2011 • 100 %referrals made. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphan support manager • Counselor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphans register on counseling 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources are available • Counselors are available and committed
Outputs				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 100 OVCs completing with skills • 50 OVCs who have received employment • 3370 OVCs sensitized about children's rights • 100 community leaders and church leaders sensitized about children's rights. • 1920 orphans involved in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 25% Improvement in OVCs completion rates • 30% Improvement in OVCs employment • 40% Improvement in the number of OVCs aware of their rights • 25% Reduction in cases of child abuse 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan support manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • List of beneficiari es • Field reports • School registers • Academic certificate s • Cash receipts • Delivery notes • Annual school 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OVCs are interested and actively participate in the project • Community leaders are willing to support the project

<p>livestock projects</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1750 children who have received scholarships. • 2750 OVC's with scholastic materials. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 40% improvement in the number of orphans with reported qualitative change. • 50% Improvement in the number of children who have received scholastic materials 		<p>reports</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financial reports 	
<p>Inputs</p>				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quantity of stationery (how many reams?) needed • 3 Motor cycles • 1 Vehicles 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quantity of stationery procured (how many?) • 3 Motorcycles bought 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Orphan support manager • Child sponsorship manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cash receipts • Delivery notes • Field reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funds are available •

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Office equipment (be specific) • Orphans with livestock Number of orphans? • Quantity of feeds (volume?) • 4 staff members • Responsibility allowances • Facilitation allowance • 20 manuals procured 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 vehicle bought • 1920 Orphans with IGAs • equipment bought 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Payment vouchers • Lists of beneficiaries duly signed • Financial reports 	
Activities				
<p>Objective I)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procuring and distributing scholastic materials to 2750 beneficiaries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quantity of scholastic materials procured and distributed • 2750 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan support manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lists of beneficiaries • Attendance lists duly signed • Field 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funds are available • Resources are well utilised • Staff are committed and deliver on

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Objective ii) • Sensitizing OVCs about their rights • Sensitizing and training 100 community leaders about children's rights • Securing manuals (how many?). • Identifying of beneficiaries • Organizing the OVCs Diocesan day <p>Objective iii)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training of orphans and their guardians on sustainable agriculture • Procuring and 	<p>sensitized on children's rights</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 100 community and church leaders sensitized on children's rights • 25% Reduction in cases of child abuse <p>4 times celebration of the OVCs days</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1920 orphans with IGAs • 3840 orphans and their guardians trained 	<p>support manager</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan support manager 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resources are readily available • Agencies are willing to cooperate
--	---	--	--	--

<p>distributing of livestock</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procuring and distributing feeds • Monitoring and evaluation of activities • Exposure/exchange visits <p>Objective iv)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Networking with intervening agencies • Attending workshops and seminars • Making referrals • Attending meetings <p>Objective v)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carrying out counseling • Carrying out 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 30% Improvement in the number of orphans in sustainable livelihoods • 1000 livestock procured • 28800 bags of feeds procured • 900 field visits made • 40 exchange visits made • 15 agencies cooperating with the OVCs desk • 30 workshops and seminars attended 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan support manager • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan support manager • Child sponsorship manager • Orphan 		
--	--	---	--	--

<p>voluntary testing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Making referrals 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 40 OVCs referred to other agencies • 50 meetings attended <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1000 children counseled, tested, receiving medicines • 20 Number of referrals made <p>...counseled</p> <p>.....tested</p> <p>.....referred</p>	<p>support manager</p>		
---	---	------------------------	--	--

