



DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF CONGO

External Evaluation Report

ACAD'S PROJECT FOR HEALTH AND EDUCATION SERVICES IMPROVEMENT (IHE): *EDUCATION PART*

PROJECT FUNDED BY: PYM

EVALUATED TIME: 2015- 2016

By AUBIN ZAHIGA and BILUBI ULENGABO Méschac

April 2017

0. GENERAL INTRODUCTION

01. Summary

The 5th CELPA's schools coordinators, teachings advisors, primary schools directors as well as secondary school principals that we met, expressed a feeling of gratitude for the different training sessions that ACAD organized. The beneficiaries have appropriated themselves with the achievements of the project.

The project's expected outcome for the 3 years have been met, which are:

Outcome 1. The management and administration training, carried out at 100%, i.e. 6 training courses per year, remains 6 training courses for the last year 2017 outstanding in funding.

Sub-result: Improved knowledge in the management and administration of schools: the level of knowledge increased from 28% to 61% on average in management and administration.

Outcome 2: Improved coordination and monitoring of CELPA schools:

- Sub-result 1: 3 meetings of the national education committee (national coordination, regional and staff) were planned and two are done, achieved 100% for the first two years. There is one meeting for the current year.

- Outcome 2: 36 follow-up visits for three years by the coordination and 155 schools were visited. There has been an increase in the number of schools visited with fewer visits outside South Kivu.

- Outcome 3: New monitoring tool developed and approved within CELPA schools, reached at 100%

The conduct of a baseline study to describe the quantity and quality of CELPA schools is 100% complete.

Qualitatively we can report observed changes from a pedagogical point of view, on the human, financial, material and technical resources management within schools that have been trained by ACAD; for example:

Heads of institutions changed behavior after training through the introduction of new management documents; good ranking of financial records, development of a participatory school budget with parent committees and school management committee;

The achievements of the trainings also made it possible to strengthen the bonds of collaboration between the school, the parents and the teachers. They also helped school principals clean up their school environments. Thus, a quality monitoring tool was set up and explained, and in full use. 84% of schools in South Kivu reported to the coordination.

A principal of a Kamituga primary school moved his child from the school where he works and enrolled him in a school whose principal was trained, the same with the deputy education director in the Mwenga area who took out his two children from an official school under his supervision and had them enrolled at Katunga Primary School; which is a school of the 5th CELPA whose school principal was trained by this project;

After training by the project, the supervisor of the ECP / CELPA FIZI made restitution sessions to the teachers and principals of the other primary schools (EP Lumona, EP KATANGA, EP.MALINDE and EP.PAMBE), while in Baraka city, other principals come to get updated at the UMOJA Primary school, in relation to the training provided achievement.

02. Background / Background

The Christian Action for Aid and Development is an association initiated by the Community of the Free Pentecost Churches in Africa (CELPA in acronym) in order to support the diaconal work and to allow it to operate with more performance and integrity.

ACAD has implemented a project in 2015 in the Democratic Republic of Congo entitled "**Improvement of health and education services (IHE)**". This project concerns in particular the **CELPA** health and education institutions. It is funded by Norwegian donors through **PYM** and **DIGNI**.

03. Synthesis of the Evaluation Conclusions

The various training sessions facilitated by ACAD for the school principals have produced considerable changes, namely:

- Effective management of human resources;
- Transparency in finance;
- Good technical management;
- In-service training for teachers through pedagogical exchange forums while the child rights and protection and the enhancement of the school environment have improved learning conditions within the 5th CELPA schools.

04. Summary of Recommendations

- Provide ACAD with funds to build and rehabilitate school and health facilities;
- Provide ACAD with the means to continue with the training of those who are not yet trained among heads of institutions, and also to train teachers and principals on other themes.

I. PRESENTATION OF THE EVALUATED PROJECT

1.1 The context of the project

The CELPA as a provider of education runs more than 1 000 nursery, primary and secondary schools. The church has three universities, namely the UEA Bukavu, the ULPGL Goma and the ISTM Kinshasa. These structures are headed by the coordination offices at CELPA headquarters. Health and education coordination constitutes an open link for CELPA towards partners such as the government and other NGOs. These coordination offices are in partnership with ACAD during the projects implementation.

Despite the large numbers of CELPA schools throughout the DR Congo, there are strong divergences between the ecclesiastical regions both in terms of the quality of education and also in terms of the number of education institutions. In practice, the

number of school facilities varies according to the number of local churches, given that all dynamic pastors use to initiate schools near their churches. The difference in terms of the quality often varies from urban to rural areas. Most of the ecclesiastical regions in the city (RESKIE, RECN AND RECO) had at least one facility in each sector (health and education) that is to serve as a model for both education and health.

Most of the CELPA Schools, especially in rural areas, are in lack of infrastructures, have not appropriate equipment, lack qualified staff and have poor hygiene conditions. While the government has improved the curriculum for elementary and secondary school; this change has not been properly implemented in CELPA schools. Most teachers have not received up-to-date training, except for a small number in the city. Some new textbooks have been printed, but they are not available for most schools.

The governments of the Great Lakes region countries have developed a strategy to accelerate progress towards the MDGs, for which the education sector is necessary for global development. As regards performance based on the funding system, the region highlighted both the relevance of the quality services and that of quality assurance. As with the Government of Congo and its partners, CELPA, ACAD and other NGOs, the quality of service provided in education is currently presented in the Interim Education Plan. This policy document considers improving the accessibility, the quality and the competence of the management of educational institutions as a priority action. In the education sector, quality applies to immediate and future performance of learners. On the immediate level, this means brilliant pupils / students at institutional or national exams, while in the future it means finalists in society displaying good behavior that adds value to society.

1.2. Objectives in the education component of the project:

Overall objective of the project: Improving the quality of service in CELPA schools.

Specific objectives:

- Improve the management and administration of all CELPA schools

- Improve monitoring and supervision of the schools coordination.

1.3. Strategy and approaches

This project has mainly used as a strategy, capacity building of educational actors, and strengthening of the national coordination of CELPA schools: this support is intended to improve school monitoring and to restore a close relationship between the school coordination and the education institutions based in the regions.

The training organized by the project focused on a single theme: Management and school administration training.

1.4. Local collaboration partners

The co-ordination office of the protestant 5th CELPA conventional schools, the education inspectors, the teaching advisers, and the school institutions principal.

1.5. Status of the evaluated project

This project's external evaluation intervenes during the third year of its implementation that started in 2015. Most of activities were carried out as planned. No delay in the implementation has been observed in regard to the planning and there were no impediments to the forecast. This is confirmed by the results obtained and by the project staff as well as by the beneficiaries who testified that ACAD staff is punctual in its planning and programming. The remaining activities are those planned for 2017. This project initiated by ACAD with the financing of PYM brought a kind of revolution in the schools of CELPA. A positive revolution that is noticed both by change in the behavior of beneficiaries and by the improvement of school infrastructure. The beneficiaries have owned the project achievements.

Qualitative data

School leaders changed behavior after training through the introduction of new management documents, initiation of the School /IGA (in these schools, teachers no

longer contract external debts), the close collaboration between committee of parents (COPA) and school, strengthening class visits by school principals, changing patterns of punishment (away from corporal punishment), involvement of children in decision-making on all matters affecting them, involvement of teachers in decision-making. Now the toilets are disinfected with ashes, papers and other waste are incinerated to make the school clean; and increases in class visits and educational meetings by heads of establishments.

1.6 Introduction of ACAD:

The Christian Action for Aid and Development (ACAD) was created on January 31, 2014 and is an organization resulting from a long pre-project process that consisted mainly of dialogue sessions between CELPA and PYM. The latter consisted on learning lessons from the crisis of cooperation between the two due to mismanagement of funds previously done by the leaders of CELPA.

This creation was consecrated by the notification of the PYM-CELPA pre-Project Coordinator Prof. ABEKYAMWALE EBUELA ABI, who was commissioned by the Board of CELPA to organize the setting up of a diaconal autonomous structure. With him were associated Martine Zagabe MUGOLI, Dr. ISOKELO MUNYUKU and INGRID Orthus as a working group.

ACAD has its own by-laws and an internal regulations reference document devoting its management autonomy to specific management tools, and functional bodies which are: The Assembly (AG), The Board, the Ethics committee and the Executive Secretariat. Two internal and external financial audits have successfully sanctioned the evaluated project. The Christian Action for Aid and Development (ACAD acronym) operates under the authorization *"Acknowledgment of receipt No. F.92 / 22.210" and the certificate of registration for NGO / ASBL in the health sector No. MS 1255 / DSSP / 30/051 dated 11 April 2014.*

II. PRESENTATION OF THE EVALUATION:

2.1. Context of the Evaluation:

- Two years after the implementation of this 3-year project begun, the need to evaluate the achievements in order to project on the future imposes this external evaluation, which constitutes a first reflection on its results.

- This evaluation takes place in a national political context characterized by a transition of political power, a period between the resignation of a prime minister with his entire government and the establishment of a new government, during which political negotiations are under way to form a government of broad national unity and consensus resulting from agreements between the political parties of the opposition, those in power and also the civil society. On the economic front, the context is characterized by a monetary devaluation, which takes place after more than five years of both macroeconomic and market stability.

- In the social sphere, the population is confronted with chronic poverty, which is at the root of poverty among families, hence malnutrition and its consequences on health, especially among the most vulnerable. As if this situation is not enough, the latter is aggravated by the phenomenon of large families, because not only is the birth rate high, but also the African solidarity imposes on families to welcome relatives, especially middle-class families are overburdened by visitors and other family members for temporary or permanent social assistance.

2.2 Objectives of the Evaluation

2.2.1. Overall Objective of the Evaluation

Evaluate whether the project in progress leads to the achievement of results in line with the plan.

2.2.2. Specific objectives of the Evaluation:

In order to improve the implementation of the project and its impact, this external evaluation had the objective to document both the results and changes made by this project and make recommendations for future development.

The specific objectives are described below:

- Document the achievement of the results
- Describe how the project activities were implemented and their relevance to the achievement of project objectives;
- Determine the main results and impact of this project in Phase 1;
- Assess the profitability of activities;
- Assess strengths and weaknesses, particularly with regard to the sustainability of the project;
- Provide recommendations for the development of future projects.

2.3 Evaluation Methodology

This external evaluation was carried out by two external consultants using participatory methods. It focused on three stages: the preparatory stage for the ACAD office, the collection of qualitative and quantitative data on the ground, and then the analysis of the data collected and the return of the provisional results to be followed by the preparation of the final report.

➤ At the ACAD Office:

The evaluation team conducted the following:

- 1- Exchanges with members of the ACAD project staff for a shared understanding of the evaluation references terms and for the harmonization of views;
- 2- Development of evaluation tools and their sharing with the project managers (Evaluation questionnaire, various data collection and analysis tables, internal and external analysis (SWOT analysis))

- 3- The bibliographic or documentary review: it focused on data collection and on the use of project documents: project documents, implementation reports, annual reports, monitoring reports, activities reports and other useful documents that have been provided by the ACAD team.
- 4- The preparation of the tables of comparison of the predicted and realized indicators which made it possible to obtain the quantitative evaluation data according to the criteria proposed in the terms of reference. This exercise also enabled the evaluators to better understand the project and the process of its implementation, to assess the level of the achievement of both the indicators and the objectives of the project.

➤ **Field data collection:**

It began with the literature review and continued in the field. This stage began with the working session with the RESKIE members in Bukavu on the OD project; The field trip to Kaziba and to Kakwende were related to the health and education project. Work continued in Kamituga where three working sessions were held with RESKO members on the three project streams. In Kindu the working sessions were held with the OD and IHE projects seminar participants, and also few interviews with targeted, most important and influential stakeholders have been conducted: the Provincial Health Division, the Medical Coordinators and the Protestant Schools of the ECC Maniema network which manages the schools of the CELPA since the outbreak of the internal crisis. In both Baraka and Kindu, sessions of the focus groups were held with participants in the OD and IHE projects seminars. Everywhere on the ground, the tools for collecting the designed data were used and some illustrative images of the collected data were shot: the evaluation questionnaire, the SWOT analysis and the interview guide were used as data collection tools.

➤ **Analysis of data, return of provisional results and production of final report:**

The data collected were then analyzed in the synthesis tools (tables, report template) and the provisional results were restituted, which made it possible to complete the data, amend them and harmonize the views. At the end the final report was produced and delivered to ACAD according both to the terms of reference and to the evaluation contract.

2.4 Expected Evaluation Outcomes

The expected results of this evaluation as expressed in the terms of reference accordingly both to its specific objectives and to the evaluation questions were:

1. Assess how and to what extent the objectives of the project have been achieved so far, to identify the results of the project and the constraints or obstacles encountered.
2. Assess the extent to which project strategies have been relevant both to the achievement of the objectives and to sustainability, to what extent project strategies / activities have been efficient.
3. Determine the strengths and weaknesses of the project, identifying activities that should be given priority. And since it consists in trainings, we identified the needs of the participants in terms of training.
4. Formulate recommendations for a future education project.

2.5. Encountered constraints and difficulties:

- The multiplicity of versions of the project's logical frameworks did not facilitate the documentary analysis.
- However, collected and analyzed data made it possible to obtain the necessary information, particularly through the literature review.
- Projects use two languages whose translation is likely to create confusion and nuances that are fundamentally detrimental to the accurate understanding of certain information;

III. RESULTS APPRAISAL:

A series of seminars organized in the CELPA regions on school management and administration have been so appreciated by the evaluation we conducted:

3.1. Relevance of the project

This project has been relevant by below observed facts:

- The training on the School management and administration has met the expectations and needs of school leaders. Before the training, some principals could not keep the financial records; such as, the cash book, the check-in voucher, the checkout voucher, the account form, but today they do it correctly.
- At the administrative level, some principals confirmed that they did not know how to develop an activities plan before training, but today everything has changed positively;
- From a pedagogical point of view, all school principals said that they were not informing before the follow up class rooms visits, now they do. There has been an increase in teachers' meetings for common pedagogical share and the number of lesson observation sheets has increased from principals;
- Improved sanitation and hygiene in schools through school brigades;
- Revitalization and involvement of parents' committees and the same for school management committees.
- There were documents delivered by ACAD after training that the participants did not have in their respective schools:
 - Framework Law, so as to equip the participants with the new official perspectives of education in the DRC
 - The management of a school
 - The management agreement
 - Books

- Training modules
- At the end of the training the participants were able to:
 - Prepare budget estimates, with explained and commented outlines
 - Put in place a school brigade (students' council)
 - Good keeping of the school pedagogical and administrative documents, especially for the new school principals;
 - Resume of consciousness awakening of former principals

Principals acknowledge that the training they received enabled to meet their expectations in regard to:

Financial management: they had no knowledge of the keywords or concepts and the cash book. They did not know how to classify supporting documents. -Each member of the management committee has known his role. Elaborating participatory school budget.

Pedagogical management: Develop the action plan for the school principal. Teachers have learned how to develop a course's forecast. They also learned that each teacher must make 2 lesson preparations: one for the direction and another one for the teacher. The organization of teachers' pedagogical sessions per education degree. The disciplining procedures. Lessons follow-up procedures: it is necessary to consult the forecasts of the subjects and the schedule of the courses and how to visit more times new teachers.

3.2. Effectiveness of the project in meeting the objectives

Qualitative effectiveness

- There has been a change in behavior after training:

- Introduction of new lines in the preparation of the budget
 - The introduction of new management documents
 - The close collaboration between parents' committee (COPA) and school
 - Strengthening of class visits by school principals
 - The change in the methods of punishment; by punishing the pupils the teachers takes into account the do no harm principle in educating
 - The involvement of children in decision-making on all that concerns them.
 - The involvement of teachers in all decision-making through teacher representatives.
- Toilets are now disinfected by ashes in schools where principals got trained
 - Paper and other waste is incinerated to make the school clean
 - Increase in the number of classroom visits and teacher meetings by the Heads of School.

Quantitative Efficiency:

- Outcome 1. The training on school management and administration, carried out at 100%, i.e. 6 training courses per year, it remains 6 training courses for the last year which is 2017 that is under way.
- Sub-result: improved knowledge in the management and administration of schools: the level of knowledge increased from 28% to 61% on average in management and administration.
- Outcome 2: Improved coordination and monitoring of CELPA schools:
 - -Sub result 1: 3 meetings of the national education committee (national coordination, regional and staff) were planned and two are done, 100% achieved for the first two years. There is one meeting for the current year.

- -Sub outcome 2: 36 follow-up visits for three years by the coordination and 155 schools were visited. There has been an increase in the number of schools visited with fewer visits outside South Kivu.
- -Sub outcome 3: New monitoring tool developed and approved within CELPA schools, reached 100%
- Outcome 3. The conduct of a baseline study to describe the number and quality of CELPA schools is 100% complete.

3.3. Efficiency of the project in relation to resources

- ✓ The different provided trainings in regard to the management of material, financial, technical and human resources responded to an increased need that the schools principals had.
- ✓ The trainers were up to their task because they were well selected
- ✓ From a material point of view, the participants acknowledge that they have received various documents: The memoranda of understanding law, the management of a school, the management agreement, the chalk, the books, the sanitized school modules

3.4. Sustainability

The already mentioned project achievements reassure on the sustainability of this project even after the financing; in particular knowledge and experience, modules, changed day-to-day practices, protocols, received documents, knowledge of management models, income-generating activities, experience and skills acquired in training, the collaboration between the school and Parents' Committee, as well as the Management Committee and local authorities. Good governance of the school based on participatory management and the classification of documents.

3.5. Adequacy of the project

The schools principals confirmed that the project is adapted to the context of their environments and meets their expectations but it should be noted that the seminars alone are not enough to achieve the quality of education due to the environmental barriers observed in particular buildings without echo control and others. In addition the level of knowledge gained in remote areas may justify a possibility either to increase the length of the seminar or possibly to resume the seminar for a better result. Anyhow, there have been considerable changes in the principals' day-to-day practice after the training. We can cite the increase of observation lessons conducted by the principals, the holding of the educational share units scrupulously respected by educational stages and per week, the creation of activities of school self-financing, the participative management of the school that takes into account advice and consideration of the parents, teachers and students committees, etc.

3.6. Impacts of the project

Some principals of the CEPAC / Walungu schools that have not received these different training courses come to be resourced from those who have been trained through a restitution session.

Some other principals from other religious denominations of the ECC participated in the training; Including :

CEBECA, 34th CADAF, AOG, and the provincial office staff of the ECP.

The supervisor of the ECP / 5th CELPA FIZI axis made the restitution of the subjects learned during the training in different schools namely: EP. Lumona, EP. Katanga, EP. Malinde, and EP. Pambe. The other schools' principals came back to the UMOJA primary school principal (for the restitution of the training subject). The schools of the 26th CEMLC have photocopied the training modules. In Fizi, the Sayuni school principal has already begun to train the other principals of local Fizi center area.

3.7. Project viability:

A viable project is one that continues to provide benefits to beneficiaries for a fairly long period of time after the completion of most donor assistance. In this logic, the sustainability factors selected for the project are:

Political support: The provincial education divisions, community co-ordination of CELPA and the Church of Christ in Congo (ECC) in the provinces are sufficiently involved in the project to the extent that they can continue to support certain services beyond PYM financing.

Appropriate technologies: The technologies applied by the project can and should continue to operate in the structures of the participants in the long term even after the end of the funding.

Institutional and Management Capacity: ACAD is still a young organization whose responsible leaders have considerable experience in management, and transparency in management according to the participants' testimonies. This capacity has been proven by funding obtained by ACAD alongside that of PYM, notably from MONUSCO, UNICEF, etc.

Economic and financial viability: The accumulated benefits of the project are intellectually and technically superior to the costs and the project represents a viable long-term investment by virtue of its achievements. However, because ACAD's self-financing capacity is too low at present, it does not guarantee the financial viability of the project in the very long term and the training seminars might not continue after the project funding is finished.

3.8. Cross-cutting theme: Gender mainstreaming

During the training, it is clear that the message of gender promotion went shared in regard to female candidates' recruitment among school principals, and classes' supervisors as well when it comes to the presence of girls / women which is required in the students' government and in the parents' committees. We noted that:

- ✓ There are at least two women on the parents' committee and two girls out of five members in the school brigade per school, representing 40% representativeness.

- ✓ In regard to the female teachers: they are given rights for the maternity leave
- ✓ Female classroom pupil heads

IV. INTERNAL PROJECT ANALYSIS:

4.1. Project strengths

1. With regards to the CELPA conflict, this project has contributed to unify some bias in the church
2. Transparency in financial management
3. Rigor in the workplace
4. Training by the provincial division of education, therefore by specialists
5. Non-discrimination of religious denominations, of state and private structures.
6. Respect of national education policy for the institutions and structures;
7. Invitation of distant people to training,
8. Increased knowledge
9. Earned trust and confidence of the population by ACAD and CELPA
10. Acceptance of non-invited participants
11. Involvement of all stakeholders: MINISANTE, DPS, Maniema ECC Medical works Coordination, ECC member and non-member communities, state health facilities, university professors; diversity of participants.
12. The seminars did honor the 5th CELPA in particular and the ECC in general which no longer organized these kinds of activities in Maniema;
13. Good organization of the seminar
14. The trainers were very competent.
15. The topics were very rich and abundant.

16. The ACAD project had avail means for its policy
17. Themes and modules are appropriate to the on-ground reality on the ground.
18. Strong mobilization capacity towards rural people
19. The training has led to changes in behavior, for example a participative elaboration of schools budgets and revitalization of parents' committees and management committees of the schools
20. School principals have changed their attitude and approach in the follow-up of the teachers

4.2 Project weaknesses

- Some trainings did not have modules and training certificates
- Some participants from far away have had an insufficient transport reimbursement in comparison to others
- Not sufficient follow-up after training provided to school principals through the supervision of the School Coordination. The Bukavu office has not reached other ecclesiastical regions with monitoring and quality monitoring.
- The achievements of seminars (theoretical training without the continuous support of inputs or teaching materials) have been partially applied according to the resources available in each school.

V. EXTERNAL ANALYSIS

5.1. Project Opportunities

- Good collaboration with CELPA coordination;
- Safety in intervention sites;
- Availability of premises for seminars;

- Availability of participants;
- The real need to learn.

5.2. Constraints or Obstacles of the project:

- The crisis or divisions within the church as some guests to the seminars were threatened for coming although their report relieved the tension from the Pastors.
- The schools coordination which should assist in supervision and follow-up is not sufficiently supported and has never had transportation means, especially the regional sub-offices.
- Some schools do not have adequate infrastructure to transmit quality education.

VI. CONCLUSION OF RECOMMENDATIONS

- Provide funds for ACAD to build and rehabilitate school infrastructure;
- Provide ACAD with the means to continue with the training of heads of school institutions who are not yet trained, and to train teachers and heads of institutions in other themes
- Strengthen the follow-up after the training so as to reach more schools situated far from Bukavu headquarters and assure both the implementation and sustainability of the acquired knowledge;
- Improve the electronic archiving of project documents to avoid multiple versions of documents.