

**EECMY-WBS-DASSC Terminal Evaluation of FGM
Elimination project**

**Conducted by Bale Zone Finance and Economic
Development Office**

Robe, December 2010

1. Introduction and Background

1.1. Introduction

Female Genital Mutilations, early marriage, and prejudice are harmful traditional practices which are widely practiced in Bale zone. Among these harmful traditional practices Female genital mutilation is the chronic problem in the area. Taking in to account this complication the Ethiopia Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus Wabe Batu Synod Development and social service commission has launched a pilot project founded by Norwegian Lutheran Mission is known as Sinana Female Genital Mutilation elimination project. This non governmental organization works in Bale zone, in sinana district, in two kebeles namely in Hisu and obora on harmful traditional practice such as female genital mutilation (FGM) which are practiced widely in the area.

Female Genital Mutilations affect the project area (Hisu and obora) population during deliveries outside health institutions, and in view of high prevalence of HIV/AIDS for a long period of time. These harmful traditional practices are highly linked with religion which is passed from generation to generations.

After Ethiopia Evangelical church Mekane Yesus and social service commission founded by Norwegian Lutheran mission intervened in the area through continuous capacity building by training of various community groups like religious leaders, women, and students and men and experiences sharing programs Female genital mutilations are eliminated from the community.

A deeper interaction with the community creates a peaceful mind and can be a source of innovation ideas, and creates an atmosphere where the people learn from primary sources of information, about harmful traditional practices. The peasant association youth are not fortunate for this.

After a long period of capacity building works or training the project area (Hisu and obora) community by itself drafted rules and regulations to punish members of households in the kebeles which took place in these harmful traditional practices activities.

Additionally to stop Female genital mutilation practice in the area the project established anti Female genital mutilations committees in the peasant association and Anti Female genital mutilations clubs in the school

1.2. Objectives of the project

The over all objective of the project is to contribute toward eliminating harm full traditional practice, with in the project areas: specifically,

- To enhance the awareness of the community to reject female genital mutilation
- To enhance the capacity of district stake holders to work against female genital mutilation and other harm full traditional practices,
- To strengthen women's capacity to be organized, lobby and advocate their rights

1.3. Objective of evaluation

The evaluation is mainly intended to assess the performance against the agreed plan and other procedural and technical issues of the project and provide the out come of the evaluation to the relevant government bodies and to the implementing agency Ethiopia Evangelical church mekane yesus and Norwegian Lutheran mission to fill their information gap.

Generally, the objective can be summarized as follows:

- ✓ To see whether the project has realized its goal and objective asset,
- ✓ To assess the project specific achievement against plan,
- ✓ To look into the proper utilizations of the project resources in the course of the project implementation,
- ✓ To assess the benefit laid down by the project and the extent of this benefit extension to the target beneficiaries,
- ✓ To examine the direct and indirect impact of the project pertaining to the natural environment and the community needs.
- ✓ Determine the effectiveness of the project and draw important lessons to be used when designing a similar project for implementation.
- ✓ Offer ideas and recommendations on how to plan for future activities and help other groups working in the same area through dissemination of the evaluation report.

1.4. Purpose of Evaluation

The terminal evaluation is mainly intended to assess the progress of the project and its achievement and the impact generated due to this project intervention and to provide the outcome of the evaluation to the government organization and the implementing agency.

1.5. Methodology of the evaluation

In effort to collect the necessary data and information for the purpose of this evaluation, the evaluation team has used the following methods:

- ✓ Hold discussion with the project management and staffs at the project site(Robe project office)
- ✓ Reviewed the project document as well as periodical reports of the project,
- ✓ Holding discussion with the project beneficiaries especially on in different schools and the surrounding community and interviewed some of them on individual basis,
- ✓ Conduct discussion with the concerned zone and district line department.

1.6. Duration of the Evaluation

The evaluation activity was conducted for three days on the field and three days were devoted to produce the first draft of the evaluation report commencing as of 31December 2009.

1.7. A-team of expert drawn from the signatory officee like Zone, district line offices, implementing agency and representative of the community have participated in conducting the evaluation exercise.

Here under is the list of the team

1. Mr. Mesfin Bekele.....Zonal FEDo (team leader)
2. Ms.Muslima Mohammed.....Zonal WCAO office.
3. Mr.Zerfu BarisoEECMYWBS(Implementing Agency),Program Manager
4. Mr. Belay Guluma EECMYWBS (Implementing Agency),Project coordinator
5. Mr. Abdul kadir HasenElders from the community
6. .Ms. Ganzabee Wakejira..... youth from the community

2. Physical Activities

From mid 2006- mid 2009, 257 religious leaders, 1213 men & women and 502 students had been oriented and aware on harmful traditional practices especially on Female genital mutilations with respect to bible & Koran women & children rights & Ethiopian law. In the three year's program, the participants of the training have had good awareness about the problems of FGM, and the need for the elimination of these practices. In addition to, these, the programmed participants have got very good opportunities to be familiar with the negative impact of FGM and the way of transferring knowledge from the elders to the young generation. The evaluation team also witnessed the deeper knowledge of the community on harmful traditional practices during the evaluation.

About 145 and 230 members of the community were trained on Gender equality and HIV/AIDS respectively during the project life span.

About 17 anti Female genital mutilations committees in the two peasant associations & 3 anti Female genital mutilations clubs in three schools were established to eliminate this harmful practice & the members decided to work hard in collaboration with concerned government staffs (woreda police, court, women and children affairs and health office) and other social groups.

To stop Female genital mutilations the communities prepared and agreed a rule in the presence of court, health, woreda women affairs they endorsed efforts against Female genital mutilations expressing the following stand points;

1. Practitioners of FGM should be punished 1000 ETB and kept in jail for 5 years;
2. Families or any relatives who make arrangement for the act should be punished 500 ETB or put in jail for 5 months;
3. The one who gives support for the act should be punished 300 ETB or jailed for 3 months;
4. In the process of eliminating FGM government courts should take appropriate and timely measures which become exemplary for others not to do the crime again.
5. We stand on the side of government and the project to eliminate FGM including other HTPs.

About 248 Government staff members drawn from district /woreda Health, women & children affairs, police courts, education, and influential persons have got training on Female genital mutilations to enhance the awareness of the general community on the public meeting on the negative impact of these practices.

40,340 the general community of the two PAs aware and got a good knowledge about Female genital mutilations at market , weeding , Idir, school, public meeting , public associations, church mosques, clinics and other suitable places by preparing & distributing teaching materials like posters, audiovisual aids & films.

Experience sharing tour take place with Rayitu community development, M/ Welabu community development, Kokosa social health project ,Goro Lutheran mission and Ginir,Rayitu and Sawena sexual reproductive health project representative of 105 communities on Female genital mutilations activates with regards to their areas to eliminate this harmful traditional practices.

Major Activities		Planned	Achieve ment	Accomplish ment %
Capacity Building				
Community training on FGM				
Religious leader training	Person	80	257	321
Women training	“	400	649	143
Men training	“	400	564	141
Students training	“	500	502	100.4
Community training on Gender equality		-	145	-
Community training on HIV/AIDS		-	230	-
Government staff training				
Woreda women ‘s affairs training	“	20	41	185
Woreda Health staffs training	“	18	17	94.4
Woreda education Staffs training	“	130	121	85
Woreda police and court staffs training	“	15	24	153
Influential persons of Zone and Woreda	“	-	45	-
Project staffs training	session	12	12	100
Awareness raising education for the general community in the two PAs	person	37,875	40,340	107

3. Financial and input utilization

Project Budget

The total amount of project budget planned for the first phase (2006 – 2009) of the project life time was Eth Birr 900,000. But as per the project terminal report, the project has made use of Eth.Birr 1,180,286 birr which accounts to 131 to or

280,286 birr above the plan which are proposed on the agreement document. Generally, the evaluation team commented that the over all financial utilization & management needs professional approach that promote proper revising of financial plan with signatures offices. See details in the next table.

Financial report of EECMY – DASSC project (2006 – 2009)

No	List of Activities	Unit	Budget	Actual Expenditure	%
1	Capacity Building				
1.1	Community training on FGM				
1.1.1	Religious leader training	Birr	20,000	35,388	177
1.1.2	Women training	"	75,000	87,243	116.3
1.1.3	Men training	"	75,000	80,168.8	107
1.1.4	Students training	"	10000	10,582	106
1.2.	Community training on Gender equality		20,000	19,940	-
1.3.	Community training on HIV/AIDS		30,000	33,411	-
1.2.	Government staff training		0	0	
1.2.1	Woreda women 's affairs training	"	4,000	8,174.9	204.4
1.2.2	Woreda Health staffs training	"	8,000	3,621.1	45.3
1.2.3.	Woreda education Staffs training	"	11,000	26,612	242
1.2.4	Woreda police and court staffs training	"	5,000	6,388.5	128
1.2.5	Influential persons of Zone and Woreda	"	0	4,077.3	-
1.3.	Project staffs training	"	24,000	38,096.35	159
	Sub total		282,000	353,702.95	
2	personnel				
2.1	Salary	"	273,600	321,455	118
2.2	Fringe benefits		0	0	
2.2.1	Provident fund /10%/	"	27,360	29,691	109
2.2.2	Medical benefit /3% and 6 %/	"	16,416	6904.20	42
2.2.3	Severance payment /10%/	"	29624	0	-
	Sub total		347,000	358,050.2	
3.	Transport and capital investment			-	
3.1	Purchase of motorbikes	birr	80,000	59,998	75
3.2.	Purchase of mules/horses	"	10,000	6,221	62
3.3.	Purchase copier machine	"	6,000	11,500	191
	Sub total		96,000	77,719	
4	Other costs	"			
4.1	Office rent	"	18,000	21,000	167
4.2	Renting resident house	"	15,000	14,279	95
4.3	Fuel, oil and spare parts	"	45,000	45,944	102.1
4.4	Office supply /including furniture	"	60,000	65,815	110
4.5	Monitoring WBS review	"	30,000	300,000	100
4.6	Travel allowance	"	0	19,089	-
4.7	Auditing	"	12,000	12000	100
4.8	Administration charge	"	30,000	30000	100
4.9	Miscellaneous	"	15,000	24,616.78	164.11
	Sub total		225,000	190,743.78	
5	Final evaluation	"	78,500	71,749.15	47
	Grand Total	"	900,000	1,180,286.41	117

4. Project Benefit, Impact and sustainability

4.1 Project Benefit

This project has specific benefit on the behavioral change and the beneficiary communities include;

- Religious leaders in the two Peasant Associations thought their followers and eliminated the act of Female genital mutilations and continue to convince people in the neighboring PAs and woredas about the negative impacts of Female genital mutilations,
- People in the Peasant Associations understood the impacts of Female genital mutilations and reject the act,
- Children in the Peasant Associations clearly understood the bad effects of Female genital mutilations and criticized and refused to be victimized and worked in collaboration with project staff members.
- The former practitioners of Female genital mutilations in the Peasant Associations stopped practicing Female genital mutilations and told others not to do the act again

4. 2 Project Impact

The participant of training when they return to their families & PAs they are expected to establish anti Female genital mutilations committee & clubs. By now more that 17 & 3 committee & clubs are organized to work with police, court & women and children affairs office. By know the Female genital mutilations committee of two Pas have started sharing their good experience on Female genital mutilations among them selves with out intervention of Ethiopia Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus Wabe Batu Synod Development and social service commission.

The anti Female genital mutilations committee & clubs members have showed high leadership quality in mobilizing the community to ward harmful traditional practice and inter generational transfer of ecological knowledge

The participant of experience sharing tours members developed their knowledge of HTPs and exchanged their Female genital mutilations elimination purpose each others.

Students and religious leadless follow up and criticize the parishioners not to circumcise their daughters.

4.3 Project sustainability

The project was primarily aims for the community to eliminate and to know about the problem of harmful traditional practices especially Female genital mutilations in the Hisu and obora and neighboring peasant associations.

Accordingly a prior attention was given to religious leaders, women, and students and men in creating awareness about harmful traditional practices and thus propagates the knowledge and behavioral change in their families and to the community at large for sustainable elimination of harmful traditional practices.

Quite considerable religious leaders, women and men who have participated in the training have been established anti Female genital mutilations committee in the peasant association and students and teach established Anti Female genital mutilations clubs in the school to eliminate harmful traditional practices in the peasant association.

5. Level of Collaboration

The evaluation team has tried to see the work relations between all partners at various levels including district and zone .Bale zone women and children affairs office vice head, district women and children affairs office head and other woredas sectors office representative have witnessed as the collaboration with Ethiopia Evangelical church mekane yesus and social service commission and Norwegian Lutheran mission has been as one of government line office than an NGO organization. The planning and implementation of Ethiopia Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus Wabe Batu Synod Development and social service commission with relevant government line offices was one of the secret behind its success. Moreover, timely and consistent reporting system at all levels reveals the transparency and accountability of the organization.

Involvement of beneficiary community in all kebele the project develops sense of ownership. Ethiopia Evangelical church mekane yesus and social service commission and Norwegian Lutheran mission in collaboration with concerned government offices made an effort to enhance community participation in elimination of Female genital mutilations practices.

Project organization and Management

At the top level the program coordinator administer the program. At the project site the project management was recruited a training facilitator, two community organizers and 4 field assistant have run the overall the project activities.

Project fixed assets

Concerning fixed asset the project has office furniture and field related equipments. The list of these materials is annexed to this report.

6. Conclusion and Recommendation

6.1. Conclusion

Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus, Development & Social Services Commission and Norwegian Lutheran Mission project entails innovative approach to experiential learning about harmful traditional practice. Especially the Muslim and Christians religious leaders take Koran and the Bible to convince and teach their followers on Female Genital Mutilations.

As awareness raising education on Female genital mutilations had been took place Ethiopia Evangelical church mekane yesus and social service commission and Norwegian Lutheran mission incorporated the following key elements; useful and harmful traditional practice, negative impact of Female genital mutilations, Ethiopian law regarding Female genital mutilations and harmful traditional practices, health rights of women and children through brain storming, debating, group work, question and answers.

During the project life time 1972 community members (religious leaders, men, women and student) and 249 government staff (woreda health, Women and children affairs, police, court, and influential persons) participated on training of Female genital mutilations.

The overall intervention was found promising to eliminate harmful traditional practices and to follow up parishioners not to circumcise daughters.

Moreover establishment and strengthening of anti Female genital mutilations committee and clubs in the peasant association and school respectively realized the efforts of Ethiopia Evangelical church mekane yesus and social service commission and Norwegian Lutheran mission to eliminate Female genital mutilations practices from the communities.

6.2. Recommendation and the way forward (FGM)

The evaluation team suggests the following recommendations on issues that need rectifications;

- ✓ Though the participants and the targeted Peasant Association PA communities have been fully oriented and developed the knowledge of harmful traditional practices, it is equally effective if the project incorporate the neighborhood PA communities, because the project only cover two peasant associations from the total of 20 PAs of the District.
- ✓ As observed by the team even though financial audit was not reported annually, the over all utilization and management lacks technical proficiency in handling and reporting. Therefore, the issue needs serious consideration by Ethiopia Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus / DASSC and Norwegian Lutheran Mission.
- ✓ As far as possible the organization should not have the basic understanding of regional NGO's guideline. Fore instance, the quarter report format is not the regional NGO's guideline format rather the donor's format.
- ✓ The effort made by Ethiopia Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus /DASSC and Norwegian Lutheran Mission focus on eliminating harmful traditional practices, especially Female Genital Mutilations was very encouraging. But members of the peasant association were very shocked because the neighbors hood community behaviors was not changed rather it is as the formers.
- ✓ During field visit the team observed that the project office couldn't accommodate all facilities of the project and cannot attract competent professionals at the project site. Thus the organization ought to seek means by witch the office condition will be improved for sustainable service.