



**WEST WOOD**  
**SPICE**

BETTER OUTCOMES ► BETTER LIVES

# Volume 2

**CELCOR**

Organisational and Program Evaluation:  
Status of Evaluation Report Recommendations 2011

*15 November 2017*

# Table of Contents

---

Part A: Principal Recommendations .....3  
Part B: Financial Management Recommendations.....25

# Status of Evaluation Report Recommendations 2011

## Part A: Principal Recommendations

- 2.1.1 (a) Improving management skills and awareness of good management at all levels
- 2.1.1 (b) Improving strategic planning, program coordination and plan implementation
- 2.1.1 (c) Establishing standard and inclusive decision-making procedures
- 2.1.1 (d) Improving communication and cooperation throughout CELCOR
- 2.1.1 (e) Establishing consistent HR policies and practice
- 2.1.1 (f) Update the Staff Policy and Procedures Manual
- 2.1.2 (b) Vehicle management
- 2.1.3 NGOs and Alcohol
- 2.1.4 The role of the Board of Directors in implementation of the evaluation recommendations
- 2.2.1 (a) Strategic Planning
- 2.2.1 (b) Program Coordination
- 2.2.1 (b) What kind of community engagement?
- 2.2.1 (c) Effectiveness of CBOs as vehicles for change<sup>1</sup>
- 2.2.1 (e) Gender considerations in the CELCOR Program
- 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Enhancing program monitoring and evaluation
- 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Consultancy work by CELCOR staff
- 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Regional Offices
- 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Effective use of media
- 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Accepting and responding to requests for assistance
- 2.2.2 (a) Community Legal Education (CLE)
- 2.2.2 (b) Direct Legal Assistance (DLA)
- 2.2.2 (c) Policy Review and Law Reform (PRLR)
- 2.2.2 (d) Campaign, Advocacy and Networking (CAN)

---

<sup>1</sup> Note that the Evaluation report 2011 does not contain (d). For ease of comparison, this minor error has not been amended.

### 2.1.1 (a) Improving management skills and awareness of good management at all levels

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>1. The CELCOR Board should begin the process for recruiting a new ED as soon as practicable in order to allow time for at least two weeks overlap with the current ED and familiarisation with CELCOR's program and methods prior to the 2012 Strategic Planning workshop currently planned for February or March 2012.</p> <p>The 2012 Strategic Planning workshop is likely to be an important event in commencing the implementation of many of the evaluation recommendations. Thus, it is also recommended that if necessary, it is delayed until the new ED is appointed and available to attend.</p>	Implemented	Peter Bosip commenced as Executive Director in 2012.
<p>2. Clear criteria for a successful applicant should be agreed by the Board prior to the commencement of recruitment. To begin this process, we suggest consideration of the following requirements and qualities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ successful management experience within a successful organisation (attested by referees)</li> <li>▪ a "people-centred", transparent, mentoring, "listening" approach to management within ...</li> <li>▪ a person who will be resolute in upholding the organisation's values; insists on high (but achievable) standards; and is able to make clear decisions after appropriate consultation</li> <li>▪ commitment to CELCOR's vision and mission</li> <li>▪ demonstrable leadership qualities.</li> </ul>	Implemented	Peter Bosip was selected as Executive Director as part of a competitive process.

### 2.1.1 (a) Improving management skills and awareness of good management at all levels

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>3. We do not see a need to recommend changes to the macro structure of CELCOR at this stage. However, the new ED and staff should participate in a comprehensive review of the organisation’s structure; functions (including the four component programs and their interrelationships); internal management; and management training needs as soon as practicable. It may be most effective to incorporate this with a detailed review and assessment of the findings and recommendations of this evaluation. As both these processes are likely to affect the nature and outcomes of the strategic planning process it would be preferable if they occurred prior to this.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The evaluators were advised that this was undertaken as part of the strategic planning process in 2012.</p>
<p>4. Strengthening CELCOR’s organisational and program management capacity should involve managers or coordinators in a mix of formal training; mentoring and short-term placement in other organisations. It should be an iterative process, as far as practicable tailored for each manager’s needs, and not a “one-off”, one-size-fits-all approach.</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>	<p>Training is currently undertaken on an ad hoc basis including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ proposal writing</li> <li>▪ report writing</li> <li>▪ financial sustainability</li> <li>▪ financial management</li> <li>▪ monitoring and evaluation</li> <li>▪ facilitation.</li> </ul> <p>CELCOR has explained that this is done an ad hoc basis for funding reasons, with many donors not allowing CELCOR to include this cost in the budget.</p>

## 2.1.1 (b) Improving strategic planning, program coordination and plan implementation

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>5. CELCOR's next Strategic Plan (for the period starting in 2012) needs to be of a form and with content that can provide guidance for decision-making about what the organisation will do at any time; why (for what purpose, especially with respect to CELCOR's vision, mission and overall goals); with whom; and where in PNG. A decision to undertake activities that fall outside the ambit of the Strategic Plan should only occur after due consultation and consideration by the Management Team of the strategic, program, staffing and budgetary impacts of the activity.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Strategic Plan 2012-14 contains a number of structural and content elements that can help guide decisions including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ area of expertise</li> <li>▪ target provinces (9 out of 22)</li> <li>▪ criteria for clients (10)</li> <li>▪ exit strategies (11)</li> <li>▪ goals and expected impacts (6 each)</li> <li>▪ strategies (3)</li> <li>▪ objectives and outcomes covering the strategies (38)</li> </ul>
<p>6. The best Strategic Planning outcomes are likely to be obtained if the process is facilitated by a person from outside CELCOR with good strategic planning expertise and good facilitation skills.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The evaluators have been advised CELCOR regularly uses an external facilitator.</p>
<p>7. The resulting plan should be formally reviewed each year in a facilitated process involving the staff and Board and revised as necessary. This is probably most effectively done in the Annual Planning Workshop prior to the development of the Annual Plan for the coming year. A corollary to this is that each year's Annual Plan should be closely linked to the Strategic Plan but incorporating a greater level of detail – that is, describing what will actually be done in order to advance the implementation of CELCOR's strategies (set out in the Strategic Plan) for achieving its objectives and mission.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The evaluators have been advised CELCOR conducts an annual reflection day offsite where an Operational Plan is developed - for example, this was held at the Bluff Inn in 2016.</p>

### 2.1.1 (c) Establishing standard and inclusive decision-making procedures

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>8. The Management Team should be formally constituted as the main decision-making body within CELCOR (apart from some specific decision-making powers that, for clear organisational reasons, need to be retained by the ED) and should meet at a fixed time at least every two weeks, but more frequently when circumstances make this necessary. The meetings should be held as scheduled as long as a quorum is present. A quorum should be at least half of the members. All decisions should be minuted including brief notes of arguments for and against each decision and details of who is responsible for taking action on the decision. Minutes should be circulated to staff (except for items that may be unsuitable for general circulation e.g. were they include matters of a personal or private nature).</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 states:</p> <p><i>“Management Team meetings will be conducted every 2 weeks on the Friday preceding the staff meeting. Any urgent matters arising will result in emergency meetings being held.</i></p> <p><i>The Management Team comprises of the Executive Director, Principal Lawyer, Manager Legal Education &amp; Advocacy and Manager Finance &amp; Administration.</i></p> <p><i>CELCOR Inc. believes in a "bottom-up" approach to planning and decision-making and open communication between staff members. Also, staff should feel empowered to participate in the affairs of the organization. CELCOR Inc. encourages and supports honesty and seeks input from everyone whenever important organizational decisions must be made. To ensure effective communication and decision-making, CELCOR Inc. facilitates staff for discussion.”</i></p> <p>A review of 10 Management Team Meeting Minutes held between June 2014 and June 2017 shows that decisions are made in accordance with the Manual. Meeting are not held every two weeks but are held regularly.</p>

### 2.1.1 (d) Improving communication and cooperation throughout CELCOR

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>9. Staff meetings should be held at a fixed time each month (for example, 9am on the first Tuesday of each month). The main content of the meetings will be a report or presentation by each section (including a report on any completed patrols) followed by questions and discussion. The agenda should also include a brief review of progress in implementation of the Annual Work Plan and a short time for discussion of internal administrative issues. Important items of discussion and any decisions should be minuted and circulated to staff.</p>	<p>Implemented.</p>	<p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 states (at 7.2 and 7.3):</p> <p><b>“Purpose of staff meetings</b></p> <p><i>The purpose of staff meetings is to:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <i>discuss CELCOR Inc. business and project plans</i></li> <li>▪ <i>set work objectives and travel timetables</i></li> <li>▪ <i>work out internal office problems</i></li> </ul> <p><i>A staff meeting is the forum where all staff come together, raise concerns, discuss issues and keep each other abreast of CELCOR Inc. activities. Staff meetings are a time for team building and an opportunity for people to share their experiences. Whenever possible, these meetings will be a venue for staff professional development and a place to learn about the issues facing the country.</i></p> <p><b>Frequency</b></p> <p><i>Staff meetings shall be convened on the Monday of the week leading to the CELCOR pay week after every two weeks, this shall be arranged so that as many staff as possible can attend. Such meetings will be held at the scheduled time, regardless of the absence of members of the Management Team.</i></p> <p><i>Program meetings will be held once every two weeks also however they must be convened on alternating weeks to the staff meeting (i.e. they must not be held on the same date and or in the same week as the staff meeting).”</i></p> <p>A review of 18 Staff Meeting Minutes held between March 2014 and September 2017 shows that decisions are made in accordance with the Manual. Meetings are usually held following Management Team Meetings - for example, later that week.</p>



### 2.1.1 (e) Establishing consistent HR policies and practice

10. In order to become strong and remain viable, CELCOR is at a stage where it needs to address its Human Resource Management responsibilities. We recommend that this takes the form of:

- A review of staffing needs in relation to the new Strategic Plan and proposed programs for the organisation starting in 2012
- The responsibility for staffing and HRM matters to be delegated to an appropriate staff member (probably in the F&A section, however this is a decision for the incoming ED) who should receive training in basic HR management principles and practice
- The implementation of basic HRM procedures ( at least job descriptions, contracts and possibly an effective grievance procedure in which staff can have confidence) for all staff as soon as practicable in 2012
- Research and gradual development of an appropriate feedback and appraisal process for CELCOR sections and staff. This does not necessarily imply an individual “performance appraisal” process which may well be considered impractical or inappropriate. There are also peer and group based methods that may be more suitable for providing constructive, systematic appraisal. The important issue is that staff are able to get constructive, reasonably objective feedback about their role in and contribution to the organisation
- An induction and mentoring process for interns and new staff is developed and implemented as soon as practicable.

Partially implemented

The Executive Director is responsible for all staffing responsibilities such as recruitment.

Other staff assist with administrative responsibilities in relation to staffing, such as payroll.

Appraisals are undertaken by the immediate supervisor.

The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 sets out (at 1) staff hiring procedures including appointment on merit, a contract, clear job description, probation period and the need for a proper orientation.

Provisions for performance reviews or appraisals are also set out in the Manual (at 3). This provides for 6 month reviews and written annual reviews.

However, a number of staff indicated that they had only had an appraisal at the end of their probation period and/or had not had their employment confirmed well after the statutory period. Members of the Board also expressed their concern that practices and procedures are applied uniformly.

## 2.1.1 (f) Update the Staff Policy and Procedures Manual

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>11. The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual should be reviewed in order to reflect changes to CELCOR's procedures and practices as a result of the implementation of recommendations arising from this evaluation. In particular, statements related to "Core Values and Principles" should be written in more practical and realistic terms. Organisational decision-making procedures adopted following this evaluation should be incorporated into the Manual.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 is in its 5th edition. It's Vision and Mission and Core Values have remained the same since 2012 and are as follows:</p> <p><b>"Vision</b></p> <p><i>PNG communities living in harmony with environment and culture in a just, holistic and sustainable way.</i></p> <p><b>Mission Statement</b></p> <p><i>CELCOR is dedicated to promoting and defending environmental and customary rights in PNG, through law and advocacy to ensure sustainable resource use and management for the benefit of the present and future generations.</i></p> <p><i>* Simplified version of the mission statement</i></p> <p><i>CELCOR will use law and advocacy to promote and defend environmental and customary rights in PNG.</i></p> <p><b>Core Values</b></p> <p><i>CELCOR has five Core Values and Principles that guides its work:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <i>We believe in transparency and a participatory and collaborative approach at all levels of interaction</i></li> <li>▪ <i>We are committed in striving for excellence</i></li> <li>▪ <i>We believe in being accountable to all stakeholders and exercise professionalism, commitment, integrity and honesty at all times</i></li> <li>▪ <i>We believe in equality by demonstrating sensitivity and respect in all facets</i></li> <li>▪ <i>We believe in fairness, justice, accountability and transparency in all our work."</i></li> </ul>

## 2.1.2 (b) Vehicle management

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>12. An effective system of vehicle management and allocation (with appropriate checks and balances) should be designed and committed to by all staff and managed by the F&amp;A section. The initial system should be trialled for six months then reviewed and revised as necessary.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 States:</p> <p><b><i>“Personal Use of CELCOR Inc. Vehicle</i></b></p> <p><i>Personal use of the CELCOR Inc. vehicle is only allowed in exceptional cases, as approved by the Management Team. Should the Management Team authorize personal use, costs are the cost of fuel. The person using the vehicle must record the number of kilometers used and the petrol contribution in the Vehicle Log Book.</i></p> <p><i>Staff are required to refill the vehicle upon return of the vehicle.”</i></p> <p>It is clear to the evaluators that a clear policy is in place and is followed closely. The use of the vehicle log book has stopped and needs to be restarted.</p>

### 2.1.3 NGOs and Alcohol

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>13. In order to protect the reputation of the organisation and the quality of its work, CELCOR should adopt a policy of zero tolerance of alcohol misuse by any staff while engaged in CELCOR work or while representing the organisation or its partners at workshops, conferences or meetings. Breaching the policy would mean dismissal from the organisation. "Alcohol misuse" is deemed to be that which leads to behaviour that is disrespectful of staff of CELCOR or other organisations or that otherwise brings CELCOR into disrepute.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>Key excerpts from the Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 include:</p> <p><i>"Staff members are expected to serve as an example of moderation in this regard. In addition, work performance and credibility can be severely affected by alcohol or drug misuse. Excessive drinking or smoking spak brus (marijuana) which results in inappropriate behaviour, creates a negative image for the staff member or CELCOR Inc., and leads to an inability to work effectively or credibly which are grounds for dismissal.</i></p> <p><i>Staff must not, in any circumstances, drive the CELCOR Inc. vehicle if they have consumed alcohol. This is a serious offense and staff will be disciplined according to CELCOR Inc. disciplinary procedure (See section 9). Drunken persons, including drunken relatives of staff members although not drinking in the vehicle, are not permitted to travel in the CELCOR Inc. vehicle."</i></p> <p>Alcohol does not appear to be a problem at all, and many staff emphasised this.</p>
<p>14. The Board of Directors should be responsible for implementing the policy and investigating any reported breaches brought to the attention of the Board by CELCOR staff members or staff of partner organisations.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 states (at 9.1(a)(ix)(2)-(4):</p> <p><i>"The Chairman of the Board will be notified of the matter. If found not guilty, the staff member will be entitled to pay from the date of suspension. The Executive Director or the Executive Committee of the Board, who will make a decision at the end of the investigation, will carefully consider this information.</i></p> <p><i>The results of the investigation will be written down and this written report will be given to the staff member and discussed with him or her. This report will be placed on the staff members' personal file.</i></p> <p><i>The decision of the Executive Director or the Committee is final."</i></p>

<p>15. The CELCOR staff manual should be amended to include a specific and separate section on the expectations and responsibilities of staff with respect to alcohol and the fact that dismissal from CELCIOR is the consequence for not conforming.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 deals with this issue (at 9)(ix) - namely:  <i>“staff or their families being drunk or under the influence of smoking spak-brus or other drugs at work or on work premises or in the CELCOR Inc. owned vehicle.”</i>  The Manual then sets out the applicable procedures.</p>
---	--------------------	---

### 2.1.4 The role of the Board of Directors in implementation of the evaluation recommendations

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>16. The Board of Directors should: in conjunction with CELCOR staff, review and revise where necessary, the evaluation recommendations; appoint a sub-committee to oversight implementation of the final recommendations; regularly monitor implementation at subsequent Board meetings; and participate in implementation review workshops at approximately six and 12 months after the recommendations are finalised.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Executive Director has advised that he has reported to the Board on the recommendations over the years. However, the current Chair (who commenced in 2015) is unaware of the 2011 Evaluation.</p>

### 2.2.1 (a) Strategic Planning

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>Implementation of recommendations 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 above should also ensure a more strategic approach to program implementation in general accord with suggestions in this section.</p>	<p>As above</p>	

### 2.2.1 (b) Program Coordination

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>17. In recognition of the effects of changes proposed for CELCOR's organisation and program, the role and resources of the current program coordination unit should be expanded so that it can, in addition to its existing tasks, oversee the implementation and monitoring of the strategic and annual plans and ensure that the outcomes of CELCOR's work are progressively assessed.</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>	<p>Funding has not made it possible to have a separate program coordination unit. Rather, CELCOR seeks to follow what has been recommended under the current program to ensure planned activities are implemented in a timely basis as well as achieving the expected annual outcomes per.</p> <p>At present, a dedicated unit is not as urgent given the lack of multiple funders over the past few years; however, its absence does place pressure on other staff.</p>

### 2.2.1 (b) What kind of community engagement?

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>18. All CELCOR field staff – that is, <u>any</u> staff required to participate in campaign, legal, education or other activities with communities – (but, if possible, all CELCOR staff) should be provided with training in effective community processes by BRG or another organisation or people with equivalent skills and understanding of the processes involved.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>The CLE Coordinator has advised that this option was explored with BRG; however, it was not subsequently followed up. She believes that the issue of training is still relevant, the opportunity is still there and it is still worth exploring.</p>

<p>19. In order to maximise community mobilisation and partner organisation capacity development, whenever possible CELCOR should seek to work with communities in conjunction with other community development organisations. This should be a consideration in strategic planning and annual work planning.</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>	<p>The evaluators have been advised that CELCOR was doing this in partnership with PNG Ecoforestry Forum (PNGEFF) from 2012 to 2016, with funding reasons preventing its continuation beyond this point. The CLE Coordinator believes that this is still relevant, the opportunity is still open and it remains worth exploring. CELCOR also does this indirectly, through strengthening networks.</p>
---	------------------------------	--

### 2.2.1 (c) Effectiveness of CBOs as vehicles for change

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>20. CELCOR should reduce emphasis on establishing and working with CBOs <u>unless</u> there are clearly assessable indicators of its likely success e.g. an existing successful organisation; respected, popular, competent and committed leaders; or both. Instead, CELCOR should focus on working with existing village structures and leaders using skilled community processes that constantly emphasise the need for community self-reliance. This will demand skills from staff developed, in part, during their community development training.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>CELCOR has advised that it has reduced its emphasis on working directly with CBOs.</p>
<p>21. As part of (or prior to) the 2012 strategic planning process it will be useful for CELCOR to review current relationships with its communities and CBOs (roles, level of activity, strengths, weaknesses, etc) as these may be affected by 2012 planning decisions.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>The CLE Coordinator has indicated that this could be reviewed as part of the strategic planning process in 2018.</p>

## 2.2.1 (e) Gender considerations in the CELCOR Program

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>22. CELCOR should provide gender training for <u>all</u> staff. Ideally:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Initial training should be conducted in two parts with several weeks in between to allow time for reflection and initial work on applying gender considerations within the program and the organisation</li> <li>▪ The training should be conducted before the 2012 Strategic Planning Workshop but, if this proves logistically difficult the Strategic Plan should be formally revised by staff using a “gender lens” following the training</li> <li>▪ The training should be conducted by an experienced Papua New Guinean gender training expert with intimate knowledge of local gender issues</li> <li>▪ A follow-up workshop to support the integration of new understandings and practices into CELCOR’s work should be conducted approximately six months after the training and then every 12 months (preferably shortly before the annual strategic plan review and work planning workshop)</li> </ul>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p>	<p>CELCOR has not provided gender training. In 2011, there was a clear need for such training. Views on this today range from it not being a priority to “it wouldn’t hurt”. CELCOR has good representation of women on staff in key positions, although currently representation is low on the Board.</p> <p>The Constitution provides (at 16.3):</p> <p>The office bearers and ordinary members, should at least be a fair representation of the four regions of Papua New Guinea, and have professional qualification in at least one of the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. a member of certified practicing accountants</li> <li>b. a member of the PNG Law Society</li> <li>c. CBO representative or a female</li> <li>d. Environmental NGO representative</li> <li>e. Individuals or organisations that are financial members of CELCOR.</li> </ol> <p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 states (at 9.3B[2]):</p> <p><b>“Sexual Harassment</b></p> <p><i>Sexual harassment is any kind of sexual conduct that is unwelcome and uninvited. Behavior may vary from the extreme case where rape occurs through sexual innuendo.</i></p> <p><i>Sexual harassment includes:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <i>calling out or making offensive comments</i></li> <li>▪ <i>telling dirty jokes to someone who finds them offensive</i></li> <li>▪ <i>saying things about sex or talking with double meanings</i></li> <li>▪ <i>continually asking someone about their private life or sexual activities</i></li> <li>▪ <i>suggesting something indecent or “sexy” about a person’s appearance</i></li> <li>▪ <i>continuing to ask someone for a date when they have made it clear that they’re not interested</i></li> </ul>



- *saying things that make a woman feel small or making belittling comments based on sex- role stereotyping: "you wouldn't be able to do it - you're only a woman, secretary , etc."*
- *making offensive hand or body gestures at someone*
- *staring or leering*
- *touching, pinching, patting or fondling*
- *brushing up against someone's body unnecessarily*
- *invading "personal space", that is, deliberately standing much closer to a person than they are comfortable with*
- *whistling at a person*
- *kissing or embracing someone against their will*
- *requesting sexual favors in exchange for a job, or to keep a job, or to get better working conditions.*

*All sexual harassment regardless of the gender of the parties has the same detrimental effect and must be taken seriously.*

Attendees at CLE and other workshops are predominantly men (about 80%). This is despite CELCOR asking CBOs to encourage women to participate as well as the workshops usually being run by women.

It is recommended that gender training opportunities for Board and staff be actively pursued.

### 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Enhancing program monitoring and evaluation

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>23. CELCOR, with donor support, should consider obtaining professional advice (possibly a series of short-term inputs over 12 months) to strengthen its monitoring and evaluation capacity and program design capability.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Executive Director has advised that at least three members of staff undertook training in monitoring and evaluation in 2015. The present evaluation represents a clear commitment in this regard.</p>

## 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Consultancy work by CELCOR staff

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>24. A detailed cost/benefit analysis should be conducted of CELCOR's consultancy work and its future prospects in order to assess whether, on balance, it is an effective means of enhancing the extent and effectiveness of the organisation's activities.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>It is understood that no cost/benefit analysis has been undertaken. It is also clear that the practice of doing consultancy work continues.</p> <p>The Staff Policy and Procedure Manual 2017 states (at 2.10):</p> <p><b><i>“Consultancy Services</i></b></p> <p><i>Individual staff members may not enter into Consultancy Agreements with any individual or organization, on certain issues or areas of work that requires the expertise of CELCOR Inc. and its staff.</i></p> <p><i>Any request for consultancy shall be scrutinized and must be agreed upon by the Management Team of CELCOR Inc. prior to any undertaking by staff with consideration to the Consultancy and legal Services Policy.</i></p> <p><i>After the Management Team has given its approval, non-legal staff must ensure that the relevant documents are perused by the legal staff member(s) before being signed.</i></p> <p><i>Any work provided under this clause shall strictly be by timesheets and set at an hourly rate per week as set by CELCOR Inc. and individual staff involved. This should take into account factors including the type of work required, issue(s) involved and the priority tasks of the individual staff in relation to CELCOR Inc. work programs.”</i></p>

### 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Regional Offices

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>25. The Madang office should be closed as soon as current commitments allow and staff relocated to Port Moresby (if able to do so). Instead, resources should be directed to improving the quality and extent of collaboration with like-minded organisations and, when program activities require greater presence in a particular region or district, the use of extended and multiple field trips or the establishment of a temporary field office or other comparable strategies should be considered.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Madang office was closed before 2012.</p>

### 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Effective use of media

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>26. With assistance from suitable experts, CELCOR should review, and revise where necessary, all aspects of its current approach to dissemination of information and messages and the various media and techniques that it uses. The review should result in new strategies as well as procedures and guidelines to facilitate timely and responsive “media” action whenever opportunities are available. The value of the CELCOR website as a media tool should also be assessed and, if judged to be an important vehicle, the necessary commitments (of training and resources) should be made to ensure its regular updating.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>This is ongoing. CELCOR is currently engaging a communications consultant (after a previous consultant didn’t work out). It’s media approach can be summarised as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ CELCOR does media releases, radio and TV (e.g. Radio NZ International, Radio Australia Pacific Beat) e.g. 23 October 2017</li> <li>▪ All media is done through the Executive Director</li> <li>▪ CELCOR has an active Facebook site where information is shared</li> <li>▪ The CELCOR website is not functioning and there is currently no budget to make it so.</li> </ul>

### 2.2.1 (f) Other program management issues – Accepting and responding to requests for assistance

Recommendation	Status	Notes
<p>27. To build CELCOR’s reputation as a reliable and responsive organisation; to provide timely feedback to potential clients; and to assist in maintaining the integrity of CELCOR’s strategic and annual work planning, a standard procedure should be developed for assessing and responding to all incoming requests for assistance. The procedure should be conducted by the Management Team; regularly enacted; and based on an agreed set of criteria for selecting those requests for which CELCOR will provide support.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>CELCOR has a procedure for dealing with requests for assistance.</p> <p>For CLE, requests for assistance are considered, dealt with and prioritised at the annual reflection day. Clients are advised of this at the time the request is made.</p> <p>For legal cases, the criteria are set out in the Manual (at 15):</p> <p><i>“As a public interest law firm, and provides supports to rural communities, here are the criteria that the legal section shall use in selecting cases:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. <i>Type of cases:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <i>environmental damage</i></li> <li>▪ <i>land rights</i></li> <li>▪ <i>climate justice</i></li> <li>▪ <i>threats to population</i></li> </ul> </li> <li>b. <i>Time limitation as required by statute</i></li> <li>c. <i>Merits of the case (rate or chance of case being successful)</i></li> <li>d. <i>Availability of funds.”</i></li> </ul>

### 2.2.2 (a) Community Legal Education (CLE)

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>28. Following the forthcoming 2012 strategic planning process the CLE program should be revised to ensure that its focus and plans are properly integrated with CELCOR’s agreed strategic direction and priorities and that the content of its ‘learning and mobilising opportunities’ for communities is able to meet the needs of CELCOR’s overall program.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The CLE program was revised as part of the strategic planning process in 2012.</p>

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>29. Implementation of the CLE program should be redesigned (in conjunction with appropriate advice from experienced organisations and practitioners) to ensure more comprehensive and effective delivery of 'learning and mobilising opportunities' for communities, CBOs or umbrella groups, e.g. through the use of a series of connected activities conducted over several months.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>This did not occur due to the fact the CELCOR moved away from working with CBOs.</p>
<p>30. CLE activities should only be facilitated by staff experienced in community and adult education and difficult technical material should not be presented to inappropriate audiences or at inappropriate times e.g. during community-wide workshops.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The current CLE coordinator has nine years on-the-job experience in CLE, although she does not have formal training qualifications.</p> <p>The Toolkit is user friendly and interactive.</p>
<p>31. The training skills and resources of CLE team could benefit from reviewing the kinds of innovative teaching materials produced by, for example, the organisation 'Little Fish' (the content of their best known resource, 'The Moni Stori', itself may be of limited value to the CLE program but it is an example of an approach suitable for use with village communities).</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>The Toolkit is user friendly and interactive.</p>
<p>32. The CLE team should be augmented by an additional staff member and, when available, a suitable intern.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>Funds have not been available for additional staff.</p>

### 2.2.2 (b) Direct Legal Assistance (DLA)

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>33. To remain viable in litigation work, CELCOR's DLA Office has to be resourced and managed so that it can function as effectively and professionally as a private law firm engaged in environmental law. If this level of functioning cannot be established within about six months and maintained, litigation work should be briefed out to private law firms while CELCOR retains the solicitor's (case preparation) role.</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>	<p>CELCOR now has a Principal Lawyer and another lawyer focusing on policy and law reform work. This capacity is complemented by consultancy support in country from Ms Daisy Culligan and from EDO NSW in Australia.</p>
<p>34. Cases to be investigated and potentially litigated should be selected by the Senior Lawyer in consultation with the Management Team. Criteria for selecting cases should include, at least: the strategic requirements of CELCOR and the wider environment movement in PNG; the implications of the case for each of CELCOR's program components; the nature and circumstances of the case and the communities involved; and the capacity of the DLA team to proceed with the case at the time.</p>	<p>Implemented</p>	<p>For legal cases, the criteria are set out in the Manual (at 15):</p> <p><i>"As a public interest law firm, and provides supports to rural communities, here are the criteria that the legal section shall use in selecting cases:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. <i>Type of cases</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <i>environmental damage</i></li> <li>▪ <i>land rights</i></li> <li>▪ <i>climate justice</i></li> <li>▪ <i>threats to population</i></li> </ul> </li> <li>b. <i>Time limitation as required by statute</i></li> <li>c. <i>Merits of the case (rate or chance of case being successful)</i></li> <li>d. <i>Availability of funds."</i></li> </ol>

<p>35. The eventual merger of ELC and CELCOR has the potential to result in a stronger, better focused and more efficient NGO environmental law and litigation capability. Apart from informal discussions however, it is likely to be counter-productive to embark on such a process before both organisations are stronger and better managed than at present. It is recommended that, at a suitable time within approximately the next 12 months, all aspects of the feasibility of and possible process for such a merger be explored through a joint-consultancy reporting to the Boards of both organisations.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>ELC closed in or around 2012.</p>
--	------------------------	--------------------------------------

### 2.2.2 (c) Policy Review and Law Reform (PRLR)

Recommendations	Status	Notes
<p>36. The role of the PRLR function and the most effective way to make use of its experienced staff should be reviewed early in the tenure of the new ED and preferably in conjunction with the strategic planning deliberations in 2012.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>Limited funding has not allowed for implementation of this recommendation. A Policy Lawyer has recently been engaged.</p>
<p>37. A general review of support staff functions and capacity in relation to program needs throughout CELCOR should also be undertaken and additional administrative support provided if necessary.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>Limited funding has not allowed for implementation of this recommendation.</p>
<p>38. Consideration should be given to transferring responsibility for the Marine Protected Areas project to the CAN section, with policy and legal review services provided by the PRLR section when required.</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>	<p>Limited funding has not allowed for implementation of this recommendation.</p>

### 2.2.2 (d) Campaign, Advocacy and Networking (CAN)

Recommendation	Status	Notes
39. The CAN component program should be reviewed following the appointment of the new ED (and probably as part of the 2012 strategic planning process). The review should include the desired role for CAN in pursuing the vision, mission and goals of CELCOR; establishing realistic limits and priorities for the content of the program; and the structure and staffing of the section.	Implemented	Since 2011, there have been limited changes to the CAN program due to funding constraints. The Climate Change and Land Advocacy Officer currently does most of the CAN activities.



## Status of Evaluation Report Recommendations 2011

### Part B: Financial Management Recommendations<sup>2</sup>

Recommendation <sup>3</sup>	Status	Notes
1. CELCOR should have the new Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) to manage their operational and assets.	Implemented	
2. All the cheque should not be Pre-Signed since the bank signatories should also checking all the documents before it signed.	Implemented	The Finance and Administration Manager has advised that the procedure is that documents are compiled and invoices are pre-approved.  Only the Executive Director, Chairperson and Treasurer are authorised to sign cheques (see Appendix A: Schedule of Financial Delegations in the Financial Management Policy).
3. CELCOR should produce monthly Financial Report and submitted it to the Executive Director so he can see and control the total operation/activity and budget.	Implemented	The Finance and Administration Manager indicated that this was his first action upon arrival at CELCOR.
4. The Accountant should posting/input the entire approved budget to the systems for the new contracts, so they can produce Financial Report at anytime.	Implemented	A new chart of accounts has been put into Peachtree.
5. Both Accountant and the Finance Officer have no experience in NGO sector before. However, they are have a good understanding in preparing financial reports and manage the accounts. That's why there is a need for them to have a training program on Finance and Accounting and also donor reporting for NGOs.	Implemented	The current Accountant has experience but the current Finance and Administration Officer does not.  The Finance and Administration Officer is assigned to payroll and payments only.  The Financial Management Policy states (at p 4):  <i>"The Board will ensure all staff who have financial responsibilities are adequately trained to undertake their role."</i>

<sup>2</sup> These recommendations were taken from Annex 9: CELCOR Financial Management Assessment to the Evaluation Report 2011.

<sup>3</sup> These recommendations contain a number of grammatical and/or typographical errors which have been retained here.

6. The Finance and Accountant should prepare the bank reconciliation by monthly to have proper control on cash on bank and records in CELCOR's account bookkeeping.	Implemented	The Financial Procedures Manual states (at p 8) that reconciliations are to be done monthly and within the first 10 days of the end of each month. Responsibility for this rests with the Accountant. Detailed procedures for bank reconciliation are set out in the Financial Procedures Manual (at pp 9-10). Appendix E of the Financial Procedures Manual provides an example of a Bank Reconciliation Report.
7. CELCOR should minimized the ad hoc activities that is not planned on the original budget but if that activities is urgent and should be done immediately, it should be inform to ICCO to get approval.	Implemented	CELCORs activities are approved under the budget each year. CELCOR no longer receives funding from ICCO.
8. CELCOR has have their own regulation, that the Payment Request form should be submitted to Finance and Accounting within is 2 (two) weeks before the time of collecting the cheque and get all the necessary formal approval. However, such regulation still needs to be stricken as there still lot of staff didn't follow that regulation. CELCOR should follow their own regulation.	Implemented	The Finance and Administration Manager has advised that a pre-invoice is prepared for the Executive Director to raise payments.
9. The monthly bank statement should be kept by Accountant as the purpose of control the cash on bank and also for preparation for bank reconciliation.	Implemented	The Financial Procedures Manual (at p 4) gives responsibility to the Accountant for creating and maintaining records, including for bank statements.
10. CELCOR should have the procurement policy in their SOP to get the fair price and good quality within the budget.	Implemented	<p>The Financial Management Policy (at p 5) sets out the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ the circumstances where quotes are and are not required (such as where goods and services are from specialist sources or preferred suppliers)</li> <li>▪ how many quotes are required (depending on cost)</li> <li>▪ the procedures in place where no quotes are obtained (the Chair must approve).</li> </ul> <p>Contracts and accounts with suppliers are also to be reviewed every two years (at p 6).</p>

<p>11. CELCOR should have their back up data regularly to avoid missing data due to error and system failure. Such back up should be placed in CELCOR premises and outside CELCOR's premises to avoid fire or flood.</p>	<p>Implemented.</p>	<p>Financial data is being backed up every day by the Finance and Administration Manager (on a USB stick); however, the server remains a problem.</p>
<p>12. Finance and Accounting should seek preference vendor list that allowed CELCOR to have credit facilities and could paid by bank transfer to avoid using cash or cheque.</p>	<p>Implemented.</p>	<p>The only credit facilities are with DHL.</p>
<p>13. The Finance and Accounting staff should explore more on the using of the Peach Tree Accounting Systems, as there still lot of menu that could be used to produce the financial report.</p>	<p>Implemented.</p>	<p>Peachtree software is being used.</p>