

How can the Civil Service in Montenegro become a more attractive work place for young people?

Difi report 2011:6
ISSN 1890-6583

Preface

The DSSR project is a bilateral project between Montenegro and Norway. The DSSR project is managed by the Norwegian Ministry of Defence with a project cooperation staff in Montenegro. The project covers several topics, one of which is Human Resources Management which includes both project activities in the Ministry of Defence in Montenegro and activities in cooperation with the Human Resources Management Authority (HRMA). This survey is one element of these cooperation activities between the DSSR project, HRMA and the Norwegian counterpart Difi (The Norwegian Agency for Public Management and eGovernment).

This study has been implemented by the HRMA in cooperation with the DSSR-project. The survey has been prepared and carried out in cooperation with Ivica Ivanovic, DSSR, Jadranka Djurkovic, HRMA, and Ingrid Kvåle, Difi, who is responsible for the report.

We thank all the respondents who kindly took time to answer the questionnaire.

Oslo, 28th of April 2011

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be 'Mrs. A. Helv', is located below the date. The signature is cursive and somewhat stylized.

Table of contents

Preface	1
1 Summary	1
2 Introduction	2
2.1 Background and objectives	2
2.2 Methods	3
2.2.1 Employee survey	3
2.2.2 The selection of respondents	4
2.2.3 Strengths and weaknesses in the survey	4
2.2.4 Presentation and interpretation of the figures	4
3 The respondents in the survey	5
4 Working conditions and the content of the work	6
4.1 General observations and interpretations regarding the working conditions and the content of the work	6
4.2 Review of individual questions regarding the working conditions and the content of the work	7
5 Competence and career development	8
5.1 General observations and interpretations regarding competence and career development	8
5.2 Review of individual questions regarding competence and career development	9
6 Performance appraisal	12
6.1 General observations and interpretations regarding performance appraisal	12
6.2 Review of individual questions regarding performance appraisal	13
7 Leadership	14
7.1 General observations and interpretations regarding leadership	14
7.2 Review of individual questions regarding leadership	14
8 The workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness	16
8.1 General observations and interpretations of the workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness	16
8.2 Review of individual questions regarding the workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness	16
9 Motivation and future working life perspectives	17
9.1 General observations and interpretations on motivation and future working life perspectives	17
9.2 Review of individual questions on motivation and future working life perspectives	18
10 Recommendations	21
11 Appendix	23
11.1 Training	23

1 Summary

This employee survey covers questions within the following areas: working conditions and the content of the work, competence – and career development, performance appraisal, leadership, atmosphere, ethics and employer reputation, motivation and future working life perspectives.

The total impression of the content of the work is relatively good, and the respondents particularly appreciate the variation of the work tasks. The respondents experience a fairly good atmosphere in their workplaces, and they are also quite proud of it, particularly in the ministries.

On the other hand, the respondents do not experience sufficient challenges and opportunities to use their professional independence in their work. Nor do they find the job descriptions very clear. A clear understanding of the content and the responsibilities of the work can be a necessary prerequisite to handling more challenges, to exercising professional independence and to taking more responsibility for the quality and the results of the work.

The general motivation of the employees is rather low, and this is an important element for improvement in the professionalization process of the civil service. The respondents' experiences of the leadership performance of their line managers are generally fairly good, but there are of course individual variations. There is a need for greater emphasis on better leadership in the case of motivation, and for more systematic and constructive feedback on the work. There is also a need to strengthen the two-way dialogue in the organization, and to ensure a better flow of information, and more employee involvement and delegation of authority.

There are two particularly worrying results in this survey:

- The respondents are highly dissatisfied with the promotion practices, and they **do not have the impression that the best qualified persons are promoted in the public administration.**
- The respondents experience a lack of active work on ethical performance and anti-corruption.

The study offers the following recommendations for the professionalization and the development of the civil service:

- **Introduction of merit-based recruitment and promotion.**
- **Involvement of the employees and delegation of authority.**
- **Efforts to strengthen ethical behavior must involve all employees.**
- **Training is needed for the professionalization of the civil service.**
- **Increased efforts on job descriptions and HR planning is needed**

An open dialogue on the employer policy and the professionalization of the civil service should be handled with the broad involvement of the employees and their representatives.

2 Introduction

The intention of this study is to bring young employees' own voices, their working life experiences and expectations into the discussion of the measures required for ministries and state authorities to be able to attract, recruit, motivate, develop and retain well-educated young people who will deliver high performance and good results. Just as important as being able to attract, recruit and retain the best qualified persons is to fully exploit their competencies and to stimulate the potential of each employee throughout his/her career.

The survey has a focus on the subjective experiences and opinions of young employees. In this study we have not posed any questions to either their older colleagues, or their managers or the representatives of human resources management. This study is not, therefore, an overall analysis of the employer policy and the needs of workplace development in the Montenegrin civil service. The intention of this study is rather to stimulate democratic dialogue as a development strategy, and to present the perspectives and ideas of young employees as an input to open dialogues within ministries and state authorities for improvements and workplace development activities.

Furthermore, this study may perhaps stimulate an open dialogue and give some input when it comes to the *implementation* of the new civil service law, and to the development of the employer and personnel policies that will be necessary for the professionalization of the civil service in Montenegro.

This report presents the results of the employee survey with interpretations and recommendations. The six chapters (Chapters 4 to 9) presenting the main topics of the survey have the same structure; first we present some general observations and interpretations of the results, and then we present the results for each question.

2.1 Background and objectives

The Montenegrin Government is strongly committed to continuing the public administration reform efforts. One of the elements of the reform agenda is the preparation of a **new Law on Civil Servants and State Employees** aiming at establishing a professional, accountable and merit-based civil service, with civil servants acting with responsibility, impartiality and integrity.

About one third of the Montenegrin civil servants are young people, below 35 years of age. A key challenge for the Montenegrin government is to retain this group of employees and to be able to attract new young, competent people. Although the state may not be able to compete with the private sector when it comes to wages, the governments' skills as an employer can be of key importance for its ability to make the public administration an attractive workplace.

How to make the public service an attractive workplace for young competent people?

This study aims to provide essential documentation on

- young employees' actual experience with the state as an employer and the public administration as a workplace
- expectations and ambitions for future working life and the probability that young employees will remain in the public administration
- measures that are required for state institutions to be able to recruit, motivate and retain young people

2.2 Methods

2.2.1 Employee survey

The employee survey is intended to give a picture of the employees' subjective opinions on various aspects of their work situation and job satisfaction. The topics are chosen on the basis of general knowledge of factors which influence job satisfaction, motivation and the performance of the job. The design of the questionnaire has been built on experience with this type of employee survey in the Norwegian civil service, on the information given in former studies in the DSSR project, and on input from HRMA and the DSSR project.

The chosen topics are defined through a set of indicators mainly regarding:

- working conditions and the content of the work
- competence and career development
- performance appraisal
- leadership
- the workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer reputation
- motivation and future working life perspectives

The method of using employee surveys to explore job satisfaction might also create some intervention effects in a development and change process. Certain issues are put on the agenda through the survey, and responding to the questionnaire may create consciousness of and focus on these issues. This might modify the mindset of the respondents concerning the work environment and organization¹. Experience also shows that these surveys often create spoken and unspoken expectations on the follow-up and further development actions. It is therefore important to use this survey openly in the context of the development and implementation of the new Law on Civil Service and State Employees, and the professionalization of the civil service.

The study consists of three main elements:

- 1) In-depth interviews with 10 persons from the target group. The interviews were semi-structured, performed with open-ended questions based on the same topics which were prepared for the survey. The intention was to check the relevance of the topics.
- 2) Web-based, structured survey. The survey has been carried out with an on-line tool sent directly to the respondents' mail- addresses. The tool was operated by Difi. The respondents are **anonymous**. The protection

¹ Lindstrom, K., Dallner, M., Elo, A-L., Gamberale, F., Knardahl, S., Skogstad, A., & Ørhede, E (Eds): Review of Psychological and Social Factors at Work and Suggestions for the General Nordic Questionnaire (QPS Nordic). Nordic Council of Ministers, Copenhagen. Nord 1997:15.

of individual information is ensured and the responses cannot be individually identified. The survey was carried out in November/December 2010.

- 3) Report. The analysis and the draft of the report have been presented to the HRMA for discussion and comments. The report is intended to be widely distributed in the Montenegrin civil service.

General information about the survey was given by the HRMA to the ministries and state authorities before the survey was carried out.

2.2.2 The selection of respondents

The target group for this survey is young civil servants in the Montenegrin civil service. HRMA has identified and provided the e-mail addresses of civil servants below 40 years of age who are currently working in the public administration. The selection has been made in order to get a balanced representation of ministries and state authorities, gender and age. The survey was sent to just over 300 civil servants. Because of some technical problems which led to the rejection of some e-mails in the receiving mail system (see 1.3.3), a few more respondents were added. The final number of respondents who received the questionnaire is 297. The response rate is 48 per cent.

2.2.3 Strengths and weaknesses in the survey

The survey met technical problems in reaching some of the respondents on their mail addresses. Technical experts in Norway assumed this was because of fire walls or spam filters within the various institutions. That means that some of the respondents in the original list of respondents did not receive the survey, and as a result the number of respondents is a little lower than originally planned for.

A possible weakness of the study is that there has not been a systematic, random selection from the target group population. In addition, the response rate is 48 per cent. This would be a low response rate for scientific purposes, but it is fully acceptable for this type of study. The survey is anonymous, and we do not know anything about the characteristics of those who have chosen to answer the questionnaire and those who have not answered. As a result, we cannot guarantee the representativeness of the respondents versus the population of the target group.

The main strength of this survey is the fact that so many young civil servants have been given the opportunity to give their experiences and opinions on essential working life issues in the civil service. Regardless of whether they are representative of the target group, they represent themselves – 143 young civil servants – and they have been given a voice through this survey in the dialogue on the development of the Montenegrin civil service.

2.2.4 Presentation and interpretation of the figures

The closed questions with scale-based answers have been posed in a consistent and positive manner, for example “I have interesting work tasks”. That means that a high score always means positive results and vice versa. The respondents have been asked to respond on a scale from 1 to 6, where 1 is least satisfied and 6 is most satisfied, or 1 is totally disagree and 6 is totally/fully agree.

The results are presented with an average score for each question. The results are also presented as a dichotomy: Scale 1-3 are degrees of dissatisfaction and scale 4-6 are degrees of satisfaction. To give more information on the degrees of satisfaction/dissatisfaction, the analysis is also based on the distribution of the respondents throughout the whole response scale.

In addition we have made cross-tabulations on workplace (ministry/state authority), age, gender and position. These will be commented upon only when the differences are sufficient to provide extra information.

3 The respondents in the survey

The information in this survey is based on the answers of 143 young civil servants in Montenegro. The first 9 questions covered various characteristics of the respondents. Based on this information we can describe the respondent group as follows:

58 per cent of the respondents work in ministries and 42 per cent in other state authorities. Most of them, 70 per cent, have been working 1-3 years in their workplaces, and nearly one third have been working there for more than four years.

The respondents are between twenty and forty years old. Most of them are aged between 25-35 (76 per cent), and nearly half of the respondents are between 25 and 30 years old. Only 7 respondents are between 36 and 40 years of age.

There is a clear overweight of women among the respondents, 75 per cent of the respondents are women. Most of the respondents do not have children. Only 26 persons in the survey are parents.

Just over half of the respondents have permanent positions, 56 per cent. The remainder work on contract (44 per cent).

The respondents are well educated and have a university education. Most of the respondents have completed a 3-4 year degree course at university or college (74 per cent), 16 per cent (23 respondents) have a master's degree, and three persons have a PhD.

Only a few respondents have studied abroad (outside the former Yugoslavia); 88 per cent have not studied abroad. Nonetheless, 16 respondents have studied abroad, 6 of whom have a short experience of less than 3 months, and 5 have completed more than 4 years of studies abroad.

When it comes to international work experience, nearly one fifth of the respondents have some sort of international experience. The majority (15 respondents) have worked for an international project/international organization in Montenegro. Six respondents have less than one year of international work experience abroad and three respondents have spent more than one year abroad.

4 Working conditions and the content of the work

4.1 General observations and interpretations regarding the working conditions and the content of the work

The content of the work

The total impression of the content of the work is relatively good, and this is encouraging, although there is clearly room for improvements.

The respondents are relatively well satisfied with their work tasks, and they particularly appreciate the variation of the work tasks. They also have fairly interesting work tasks, even though few are fully satisfied. On average the respondents in the ministries are more satisfied with their work tasks than in the state authorities.

Challenges

A large proportion of the respondents think they can cope with more challenges in their work. This factor is of potential importance for the employers since their staff seem to have many resources that can be exploited in a more challenging way.

Interesting and challenging work tasks are important to stimulate workplace learning. Also here there is a potential for improvement in the organization of work tasks to provide the employees with continuous development from the very start of their career.

Working conditions that entail interesting and challenging work tasks might be important competitive assets of the civil service, as we find in other countries².

Professional independence

The opportunities of employees to exercise their professional independence in the work seem to be far too few. Close to half of the respondents indicate that they have only limited or no such opportunities. This factor has to be *seriously considered both by employers and employees*. It is important not only to be able to recruit highly competent people but even more important to actually use their competencies, their professional independence and integrity to carry out tasks with high quality and to secure impartiality in the decisions.

This factor should be more closely examined within the civil service, and both the reasons why and the ideas for improvement should be thoroughly discussed throughout the civil service.

Job descriptions

² The Norwegian Employee Survey 2010 for the Norwegian civil service shows that interesting, meaningful and challenging work tasks are the main strengths and competitive assets of the working conditions in the civil service. Difi-rapport 2010:5. Medarbeiderundersøkelse i staten 2010.

The job descriptions are not experienced as very clear. Nearly half of the respondents experience their job descriptions as rather unclear. This indicates a need for many state authorities to work more systematically on their job descriptions and in particular to describe the roles of the positions, the general tasks or functions and the delegation of responsibilities related to these. A common understanding of the content and the responsibilities of the work might be a prerequisite to handling more challenges, to using one's professional independence and to taking more responsibility as a whole for the quality and the results of the work. And therefore it is also a necessary instrument in the professionalization of the civil service.

The weakness of the system of job descriptions also indicates the need to strengthen HR-planning so as to be more specific in the planning of human resources and the priorities of the work tasks.

4.2 Review of individual questions regarding the working conditions and the content of the work

In the following, we examine the individual questions in the survey on working conditions and the content of the work.

Survey question: I have interesting work tasks

A clear majority (72 per cent) indicate that they have fairly interesting work tasks. The average score is 4.1. Only a few respondents give a top score, but even fewer give the lowest score. The oldest respondents are marginally the most satisfied, and in the ministries they are also more satisfied than in the state authorities.

Survey question: I have varied work tasks

A clear majority (81 per cent) report that they have varied work tasks. The average score is 4.4. The oldest are the most positive, and the employees in the ministries also experience more variation in their work tasks than the respondents in the state authorities.

Survey question: I have sufficient challenges in my work

A majority (65 per cent) indicate that to some extent they have sufficient challenges in their work. A minority of 35 per cent say they have not. The average score is 4.0. Arguably, a large share of the work force think they can cope with more challenges in their work, since only 15 per cent give the highest score.

Survey question: My job description is clear

Although a small majority (59 per cent) find that their job description is quite clear, 42 per cent do not. The average score is 3.8. More employees on contract experience the job description as clear than employees in permanent positions.

Survey question: I have good opportunities to use my professional independence in my work

A small majority (56 per cent) indicate that to some extent they have opportunities to exercise their professional independence. However, a

significant minority (43 per cent) say that they have only limited or no such opportunities. Some 27 per cent could be said to be satisfied or fully satisfied with the current state of affairs, *i.e.* they give the highest or second highest score. Conversely, 24 per cent choose the two lowest scores. The rest are quite evenly distributed in the middle of the scale. The oldest are the most satisfied. The average score is 3.7.

Survey question: As a whole I am very satisfied with the content of my work

A clear majority (71 per cent) indicate a certain degree of satisfaction with the content of their work. The average score is 4.1. Very few respondents are very dissatisfied (score 1). 40 per cent are satisfied and very satisfied (score 5 and 6), but nearly half of the respondents are partly satisfied/dissatisfied (score 3 and 4). Women and the oldest group are marginally the most satisfied.

The question opens up for the respondents' general view of the workplace, and the specific elements for development will be presented in more detail in other parts of the survey.

5 Competence and career development

5.1 General observations and interpretations regarding competence and career development

One of the most worrying results in this survey is within the field of career development and promotion. The respondents are highly dissatisfied with promotion practices, and they **do not have the impression that the best qualified persons are promoted in the public administration.**

There is an obvious need to introduce the merit principle in recruitment and promotion processes. A successful implementation of the new Law on Civil Servants and State Employees will make an important change in these practices, strengthening the merit principle and improving the mechanisms for career development. The responses in this survey indicate that the young generation of civil servants welcomes such a change.

Competence development

According to these respondents, there is a great need for training in the Montenegrin civil service. The respondents are fairly well satisfied with the opportunities for training that they already have, but they define the needs for attending training activities as very high. There seems to be great motivation for training, and that is an important asset for the development and professionalization of the civil service.

The survey presents a comprehensive list of training needs mentioned by the respondents (Chapter 5.5 and the Appendix). The most important training needs are within the fields of foreign languages, international relations/EU and the EU integration process and computer skills. Furthermore, civil servants need more

competencies within the fields of management systems, human resource management, modern work organization approaches such as project management, team work, creativity processes, implementation of reforms and personal and interpersonal skills included the focus on motivation.

There is a strong international orientation in the respondents' work approach. Knowledge of English is necessary in most of the jobs. Moreover, international relations, particularly EU-relations, are obviously relevant aspects of task solving. In addition, respondents also have the impression that a future membership in the EU might benefit their career. The clearly expressed need for training within international competency areas is closely combined with both task solving demands and motivational factors (Chapter 9.6). Systematic competence building within international competencies might result in a strong win – win situation for individual motivation and personal development, as well as the development of a number of the public authorities' critical competencies.

The training needs mentioned by the respondents are focused on both general competencies independent of sector or institution, and more sector-specific and workplace-oriented competencies. This indicates the need for both the overall training strategy for the civil service managed by the HRMA, and competence strategies and activities within the ministries and state authorities which will take care of the workplace-based competency development. These efforts should support quality, efficiency and the ability to handle change within the organization.

Both the overall strategy for competence building in the civil service and the in-house training strategies will have to take into account the expressed training needs of civil servants. Even though the focus of this survey is on young civil servants, the reform processes strengthen the need for continuous competency development and a focus on lifelong learning.

5.2 Review of individual questions regarding competence and career development

In the following, we examine the individual questions in the survey regarding competence and career development.

Survey question: I have good opportunities to develop my competencies in my workplace

A clear majority (74 per cent) are relatively well satisfied with the opportunities for developing their competencies. The average score is 4.2. The youngest respondents between 20 to 25 years of age are the most satisfied, and the oldest are the least satisfied.

Survey question: I experience that a knowledge of English is crucial in my work

An overwhelming majority, 81 per cent, experience English language as crucial in the work. Nearly half of the respondents, 47 per cent, have given this statement the very highest score. Very few respondents, 5 per cent, do not

experience the need for English in their work at all (score 1). The average score is 4.8. In the ministries this is experienced as more important than in the state authorities, and the younger respondents express more need of English than the oldest respondents.

The open question on training needs confirms this experience since the training need expressed by most respondents is for foreign languages, mainly English. Therefore great efforts should be directed at providing English language training in the Montenegrin civil service.

Survey question: I need to attend training activities for my personal and professional development

Nearly all the respondents, 95 per cent, indicate the need to attend training activities for their personal and professional development. And as many as 58 per cent strongly indicate the need for training (score 6). There are very few respondents who do not express a need to attend training activities at all, 2 per cent. The average score is 5.3.

The oldest respondents (36 – 40 years) have a slightly lower average score than their younger colleagues while the respondents on contract have a slightly higher score than those in permanent positions, and women have a slightly higher score than men.

Survey question: Types of training activities needed

This is an open question in the survey, and even if there is a great variety in the responses, a number of key topics and training needs dominate. In addition to the topics related to training needs, there are also comments on the approach and methods of training such as “I fear that most of the training sessions are of a more formal character and we usually only hear the results obtained, what has been done and organized. At these training sessions we acquire very few skills applicable in our work”. Furthermore, these training sessions “are not carried out on the basis of interests and needs”. This is not at all an overall criticism of the training activities, but can serve as a reminder of the importance of analyzing the training needs and choosing the right training methods to adequately meet the motivation for training among civil servants.

The following presents the main topics of training needs (complete list in the Appendix):

- Foreign languages, primarily English.
- International competencies and international relations, particularly the EU and various aspects of the European integration processes. Respondents also emphasize a broad approach to international competence development such as participation in seminars and conferences abroad, study visits and participation in training activities organized by international organizations.
- Computer skills, for example software courses, programming and design
- Communication skills, both for internal and external purposes, for example presentation techniques, negotiation skills, media strategies and creating better communication between civil servants.

- Management systems and skills, for example various planning processes (budget and strategic planning), Total Quality Management, public procurement.
- Human Resource Management, for example a system based on criteria of fair selection
- Work organization and processes such as project management, team work, creative problem solving,
- General organization of the state administration – basic training
- Job technical and methodological skills such as writing project reports, estimations, projections
- Development processes and training needs supporting the implementation of sector reforms, for example the reform of the security sector, experiences in the field of parliamentary control over the defence and security sector.
- Personal and interpersonal skills such as anti-harassment procedures and stress handling.

Survey question: I have good opportunities to make a career in the public administration

A majority of the respondents, 63 per cent, indicate that to some extent they have opportunities to make a career in the public sector. But a large minority, 37 per cent, indicate the lack of career opportunities. The average score is 3.8. The scores are spread over the whole scale with most of the respondents in the middle; 50 per cent give the middle scores 3 and 4.

The respondents on contract have a more optimistic approach to this than those in permanent positions. The first career goal for the former might be to have a permanent position. This question is also closely connected to the next question.

Survey question: I have the impression that the best qualified persons are promoted in the public administration

A majority of the respondents, 61 per cent, do not have the impression that the best qualified persons are promoted in the civil service. This question received an extremely negative response with an average score of 2.9. Very few respondents are fully convinced that the best qualified persons are promoted in the public administration; only 6 per cent give this question the top score (6). On the contrary, as many as 24 per cent, have no confidence at all in promotion practices based on qualifications, and they give the very lowest score (1). There is a slight distinction between the employees in permanent positions and on contract, where the permanent employees are a little more negative than the employees on contract. The respondents are slightly more negative outside the ministries, and this is particularly the case in the oldest age group.

Survey question: In my opinion the future membership of the EU might benefit my career

A very clear majority of the respondents, 76 per cent, have the opinion that a future membership of the EU might to some extent benefit their career. The average score is 4.4. One third of the respondents have the opinion that this might be very important for their career, and they give this question a top score.

Only 5 per cent have the opinion that it will not benefit their career at all (lowest score). We find slightly higher expectations as to a positive influence on their career in the ministries than in the state authorities, but no significant differences in position and gender. The greatest differences are within the age groups, where the group with highest positive expectations for their career is the 31-35 age group, and the group with lowest expectations are employees between 36-40 years old.

6 Performance appraisal

6.1 General observations and interpretations regarding performance appraisal

Performance appraisal is not a common leadership tool or practice in the Montenegrin civil service. Nonetheless, 40 per cent of the respondents have experienced performance appraisal one or several times. Those respondents who have experienced performance appraisal seem to experience this as useful for them. Half of the respondents are very satisfied, and find this very useful, giving it a top score. And the main impression is that the respondents do to a large extent agree with the feedback they get in the performance appraisal.

The respondents have a clear impression that the quality of their own personal work performance is satisfactory. This is a subjective statement, and this self-assessment is not connected to any sort of feed-back, corrections or second opinions in this survey. In any case, this question in the survey gives no answer to the real quality of the work, but other studies point out that the performance appraisals are merely formal³ and that there is a practice of using mainly the highest score (95 per cent) when conducting the performance appraisal in the Montenegrin civil service⁴. When viewed in connection with the question on constructive feedback (Chapter 7.4), it appears that the employees do not get enough serious feedback on their work to adjust their self- assessment, and to know what and how to improve their performance, if this is applicable.

There is a need for a more open approach to the feedback and assessments of performance and results. Performance management is more than an annual performance review. It is also about building a culture in which performance management is viewed as an ongoing, collaborative process between managers and employees. If the feedback and performance appraisal are to be more realistic, this should be followed up by individual development plans. A relevant and realistic performance appraisal can be more motivating when the assessments and the feedback are connected to individual development perspectives and activities. Performance appraisal which is not accepted, or

³ Attracting and Retaining the Best People in Public Service. UNDP/BRC project 2009. Author Ivan Koprivic.

⁴ Data collected by the HRMA 2010.

where the follow-up is lacking, might be more de-motivating than having no performance appraisal at all.⁵

6.2 Review of individual questions regarding performance appraisal

In the following, we examine the individual questions in the survey regarding performance appraisal.

Survey question: Do you have any experience with performance appraisal?

More than half of the respondents do not have any experience with performance appraisal, 59 per cent. 21 per cent have experienced a performance appraisal process once, and 20 per cent several times.

Survey question: How were the results of performance appraisal presented to you?

This question, and the two following ones, is posed only to *those who have experience with performance appraisal*.

A little less than one third, 28 per cent, received the results only in writing. Nearly one third, 32 per cent, received the results only in dialogue, and a little more than one third, 35 per cent, had the results presented both in writing and in dialogue. There are only very few respondents, 5 per cent, who did not receive the results at all.

Survey question: I experience the performance appraisal as useful

A very clear majority, 80 per cent, experience the performance appraisal as useful for them. Half of the respondents find this very useful and give a top score. The average score is 4.7. The youngest respondents and women experience this as slightly more positive than the other groups.

Survey question: I mainly agree with the feedback in the performance appraisal

The main impression is that the respondents agree to a large extent with the feedback they get in the performance appraisal. 87 per cent agree to some extent with the feedback. As many as 46 per cent of these fully agree with the feedback, and give a top score. 13 per cent of the respondents do not agree with the feedback.

Survey question: My work performance has high quality

Almost all respondents (95 per cent) tend to agree with the statement that their performance has high quality. The average score is 5.0. More than two thirds of the respondents are satisfied and very satisfied (scores 5 and 6) with their own work performance. Hardly any are very dissatisfied with their own work performance. This question has one of the highest scores in the survey. Women

⁵ The Norwegian Employee Survey 2010 shows that the job satisfaction is higher among those who have experienced a performance appraisal dialogue than those who have not. But it also shows that those who have experienced performance appraisal dialogue WITHOUT follow-up have a lower job satisfaction than those who have had no performance appraisal dialogue at all.

are slightly more satisfied than men, employees in the ministries are slightly more satisfied than employees in the state authorities and the oldest employees are slightly more satisfied with their own performance than the other age groups.

7 Leadership

7.1 General observations and interpretations regarding leadership

The respondents' experiences with the leadership of the line manager are generally fairly good, but there are of course individual variations. There is a need for greater emphasis on leadership in respect of motivation and more systematic and constructive feedback on the work. The needs for leadership development in these fields are underlined by observations on the practice of performance appraisal and the fact that the general motivation of the employees is rather low (Chapter 9.5). The responses show that there are great individual variations, probably both in leadership performance and certainly in the assessment of leadership by the employees.

Leadership is an important factor in the professionalization of the civil service. It is essential in the organization of work tasks, and when giving sufficient challenges and development opportunities to the employees. Delegating responsibilities and listening to the ideas of young, competent civil servants is a simple and cheap approach to using their competencies, engagement and innovative abilities. There is still potential for greater use of this approach and increased exchange of dialogue (two-way communication) in everyday working life.

When it comes to involvement in decisions made by the top management regarding the respondents' field of work, there is a fairly low degree of involvement. The overall impression is that these young employees can add more value to the organization through involvement and clear responsibility. This is a field for further exploration and discussion. There should be an open dialogue on how, how much and under what conditions the employees should be involved, what benefits this would give to the decision processes, to the sense of responsibility of each employee and also to the personal involvement in the development of his/her field of work. And one of the questions might also be "What are the greatest hindrances to a development in this field"?

7.2 Review of individual questions regarding leadership

In the following, we examine the individual questions in the survey regarding leadership.

Survey question: My line manager communicates clear expectations regarding the quality of my work

There is a clear majority of 78 per cent who experience that their line manager to some extent communicates clear expectations regarding the quality of their work. The average score is 4.5. One third of these are very satisfied (top score), and very few are very dissatisfied. The oldest respondents are the most satisfied, and that is the only relevant distinction in the respondent group.

Survey question: My line manager motivates me to do a good job

A majority of the respondents, 65 per cent, indicate that the line manager to some extent motivates them to do a good job. One third are dissatisfied with the experience of this aspect of leadership performance. The average score is 4.0. The oldest respondents express the most positive experiences.

Survey question: My line manager gives constructive feedback on my work

A clear majority of the respondents, 71 per cent, indicate that they are satisfied to some extent with the constructive feedback from their line manager. The average score is 4.2. The responses are spread over the whole scale, so there are vast differences in how this is experienced. Also here the oldest respondents are marginally the most positive.

Survey question: My line manager pays attention to my ideas

A clear majority of the respondents, 80 per cent, are quite satisfied with the way their line managers pay attention to their ideas. The average score is 4.5. About a quarter of the respondents, 27 per cent, are fully satisfied as regards this.

Survey question: My line manager respects my professionalism and knowledge

An overwhelming majority of the respondents, 84 per cent, are to a large extent satisfied with how the line manager respects their professionalism and knowledge. The average score is 4.6. The oldest and the youngest are the most satisfied.

Survey question: I am sufficiently involved in top-management decisions regarding my field of work

A majority of the respondents, 63 per cent, are to some extent satisfied regarding this issue. About 40 per cent give the middle scores, and the average score is only 3.9. The response to this question shows only partial satisfaction as regards this issue. Less than one fifth, 18 per cent, indicate that they are sufficiently involved in top management's decisions regarding their field of work. The responses are widely spread over the whole scale, so there are great variations in the individual experience.

8 The workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness

8.1 General observations and interpretations of the workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness

The employees experience and think of their workplace in a fairly positive way. They feel that there is quite a good atmosphere and they are relatively proud of their workplace, particularly in the ministries. But even so, less than half of the respondents would definitely recommend their workplace to other young people. It is vital that this is taken into account when it comes to the ability of the civil service to attract young, highly competent persons, since the employees themselves are the most important ambassadors for the workplace.

The most worrying aspect is the lack of active work on ethical performance and anti-corruption. The responses point out the necessity to make a plan for broad involvement of the employees in ethical performance and anti-corruption work in the Montenegrin civil service. Central training activities will not be sufficient; there should be plans and activities in this field in every institution and department.

8.2 Review of individual questions regarding the workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness

In the following, we examine individual questions in the survey regarding the workplace' atmosphere, ethics and employer attractiveness.

Survey question: I experience a good atmosphere in my workplace

A very clear majority, 75 per cent, experience a fairly good atmosphere in their workplace. The average score is 4.4. Nearly one third of the respondents, 30 per cent, give the highest ranking to the atmosphere in their workplace.

Also here there is of course some dissatisfaction, but all in all this is a good platform for further development of other fields of the organization and the personnel policy.

Survey question: I am proud of my workplace

A clear majority, 72 per cent, are to some extent proud of their workplace. The average score is 4.2. Of these, 42 per cent give the middle scores, 3 and 4. Respondents in the ministries are a little more proud of their workplace than in other public authorities. This is an average, so there can of course be great differences between the various government agencies.

Pride in this context is often connected to job satisfaction, motivation and the workplace's reputation. This therefore indicates the overall impression of the employer policy and the attractiveness as an employer.

Survey question: In my workplace high ethical performance and anti-corruption has been discussed in staff meetings and/or collegiums

Ethical performance and anti-corruption has to a very low degree been discussed in staff meetings or collegiums. Only 32 per cent are aware of such discussions. 20 per cent give a negative response to this question, meaning there have not been such discussions in the workplace. Nearly half of the respondents, 48 per cent, do not know whether there have been such discussions in their workplace.

Survey question: I would recommend other young people to apply for work in my state authority/ministry

A clear majority, 71 per cent, would in some ways recommend the workplace to other young people. The average score is 4.1. But even so, less than half of the respondents, 44 per cent, would definitely recommend their workplace to other young people (score 5 and 6). 40 per cent of the respondents give the middle scores, 3 and 4, meaning that they are rather dubious or only slightly positive in this matter.

9 Motivation and future working life perspectives

9.1 General observations and interpretations on motivation and future working life perspectives

People mainly expect that they will be working in the public administration for the next five years, but only 25 per cent clearly do not wish to apply for another job in the near future. Of course, their expectations of what will happen include their judgments of the realities of the labour market in times of financial crisis, in addition to their personal wishes and career ambitions. Less than one third of the respondents, 28 per cent, want another job outside the ministries/state authorities, and among these a position in an international organization is the most popular. The reasons why they would like to have another job are mainly to achieve higher wages. But there are also reasons which derive from the working conditions such as new challenges and work tasks, more independence and responsibility in the work.

These aspects can be seen as offering positive potential for the development of the employer policy and practice in the civil service.

Mobility between different workplaces and sectors gives an individual opportunity for learning, new challenges and career development. Mobility might also be seen as offering a potential for the transfer of knowledge and skills between organizations. As such, a certain level of mobility opens for a dynamic development of the workplaces. Often some turnover in the workplace can be good for the dynamic development and the recruitment of new competencies in line with development and change processes. On the other hand, high turn-over can entail brain drain and loss of critical competencies. It

is important that state employers have an active employer policy and instruments to retain critical competencies, to stimulate career development within the civil service based on performance and results, and to continuously develop the competencies needed to deliver high quality results.

Motivation

The responses to this survey indicate a problem of too weak or limited motivation among the respondents.

Motivation is a multi-faceted concept, and as a concept it is composed of both inner and outer motivational factors. Inner motivation deals with psychological aspects, and the motivation is connected to the satisfaction of the performance of the task in itself. Intrinsic incentives in a working life context include not only having interesting and meaningful work tasks and sufficient challenges but also the sense of mastering the work, personal development and feeling affiliation to the goals of the institution. Outer motivation is connected to an achievement outside the activity itself such as receiving a reward or good appraisal, better salary, bonuses according to performance, welfare, social status. Both intrinsic and extrinsic incentives are important in keeping up motivation over time.

Some persons tend to focus more on inner motivational factors (intrinsic incentives), and others will focus on outer motivational factors (extrinsic incentives). However, the motivation of the employees is always important for making an extra effort in the work situation, for delivering good results and for enjoying working life. So improving motivation should be a key development topic for both employers and employees.

Here the respondents focus on both intrinsic and extrinsic incentives, even though there is one answer that is given far more often than all the others, namely higher salaries. In times of financial crisis this might not be easy to accomplish, so fortunately respondents have many ideas on other measures to be taken which might improve their motivation.

Many of their ideas and perspectives actually imply developing a modern work organization with challenging work tasks, with more openness and creativity, and with more responsibility and professional independence. Furthermore, they focus on personal and professional development and training, particularly within the field of internationalization, a transparent career system, better leadership performance and a number of welfare aspects. All these aspects show that there might be a win-win situation in actively involving young, competent employees in the dialogue on employer policies in the civil service, in the implementation of the civil service reforms and the professionalization of the civil service.

9.2 Review of individual questions on motivation and future working life perspectives

In the following, we examine the individual questions in the survey on motivation and future working life perspectives.

Survey question: I expect to be working in the public administration for the next 5 years

A clear majority, 70 per cent of the respondents, expect that they may be working in the public administration for the next 5 years, and one third of the respondents feel quite sure of this. Nevertheless, nearly one third have some expectations of getting another job within the next five years. The oldest group of respondents expect to be working in the public administration to a larger extent than the younger, and women are slightly more certain of this than men.

Survey question: Do you wish to apply for another job in the near future? If yes, where?

25 per cent of the respondents clearly want to continue in their job. In addition one third of the respondents answer that they do not know.

43 per cent of the respondents wish to apply for another job. Of these, 15 per cent want to pursue a career in the civil service and would like to have another position in their workplace or another state authority/ ministry.

Altogether 28 per cent wish to apply for a job outside the civil service. The most popular aim is to acquire a position in an international organization, and 18 per cent of the respondents express such preferences. 10 per cent would like to have another job in the private sector or another area.

Survey question: What are the main reasons why you wish another job (if yes on previous question)?

Among those who wish to have another job, the overwhelming reason is the desire for higher wages (56 per cent). 17 per cent wish to acquire international experience. All in all, 26 per cent of the reasons given derive from the various aspects of the work conditions such as new challenges (12 per cent), other work tasks, more independence and responsibility in the work. Achieving a higher position has almost no importance as the main factor for wanting another job. The primary reasons seem to be connected to wages, job content and working conditions. So when 15 per cent on the previous question would like to have another job within the public sector, the perspectives of career development seem to be closely connected to higher wages and job content.

Survey question: I am very motivated in my work

A small majority (54 per cent) indicate they have a certain degree of motivation. However, a significant minority (47 per cent) say they have not. The general motivation is concentrated around the middle scores, which shows only a partial level of motivation. The average score is 3.5. The respondents on contract and the very youngest group aged from 20-25 years are slightly more motivated than those in permanent positions. Men are more motivated than women, and employees in the ministries are more motivated than employees in the state authorities.

Survey question: In your opinion, what will motivate you even more in your job performance?

This is the second open question in the survey. Also here there is a great variety of answers. The respondents themselves are concerned about both the intrinsic incentives (meaningful job, interesting work tasks, sufficient challenges, personal development) and extrinsic incentives (salary, bonuses, welfare). However, one answer is given far more often than the others, namely higher salaries. Even so, there is a wide range of motivational factors which are important to these young employees. Here we present the suggestions in order of what is mentioned most often:

- Higher salary
 - Even the most motivated, who express great interest and satisfaction with their jobs, seem to add “but it would be good if I could have a higher salary”.
 - Bonuses and days off as recognition of good performance
- Career opportunities
 - More transparent system of promotion. “Career opportunities based on qualifications, and regardless of political affiliation”. “Promotion and remuneration based on achieved results”. “Reduction of nepotism and employment on that basis”.
 - Permanent position
- International experience
 - Training and seminars abroad, professional education
 - Study visits and greater opportunities for travelling
- Training
 - Greater opportunity for professional development
- Better working conditions
 - Independence in work performance. More challenges, new responsibilities, more freedom for creativity
 - Better organization of work, distribution of work tasks
 - Mutual respect for and appreciation of co-workers regardless of age
 - Teamwork
 - Improvement in communication
 - Organizing meeting points for all the colleagues to improve cooperation and efficiency in the institution
- Leadership performance
 - Feedback on my work performance by the boss
 - Work assessment on a monthly or annual basis
 - “A better flow of information from all civil servants to the head of the state body and other senior officials as well”.
 - Appreciation and recognition of good performance. Sanctioning of bad performance
 - “Doing your own thinking” without being punished
- Social benefits
 - Health insurance, loans, free transport, solving the housing problems
- Working hours
 - More flexibility in working hours, particularly for families with children
 - Working hours from 7am to 3pm or from 8am to 4pm

10 Recommendations

This study points out some interesting facts and perspectives from young civil servants which should be brought into the further discussion of the professionalization of the Montenegrin civil service. Perspectives and ideas presented in the report could be the starting point of open dialogues within ministries and state authorities for improvement and development activities. In change management it is important to be aware of what works fairly well, because this should be strengthened and built upon in the development process. And it is also wise to adopt ideas for even small improvements in the workplace and in the state employer policy. Further development of the civil service should build upon the experiences of a good atmosphere in the workplace. This is a good platform for open dialogues and offers great potential for handling the challenges of change.

In the recommendations we will focus on a few major aspects that are important for the professionalization and the development of the civil service:

- **Introduction of merit-based recruitment and promotion.**
The recruitment and promotion system and practices should be based on qualifications. The system should be sufficiently transparent and predictable to create confidence among the general public and civil servants. There is a need to emphasize the importance of a systematic *implementation process* of the new Law on Civil Servants and State Employees in order to make the merit principle work.
- **Involvement of the employees and delegation of authority.**
Decision-making in the Montenegrin system of government is strictly centralized. Inside ministries and state institutions, decision-making should be delegated from the minister or the director to leading staff members. Leadership should be developed in order to take advantage of the engagement and willingness of young civil servants to take responsibility, to approach new challenges and to use their professional independence to improve the performance and results in the civil service. A better flow of information from civil servants to top management should also be further developed as well as improved two-way communication in everyday working life.
- **Efforts to strengthen ethical behavior must involve all employees.**
Efforts to strengthen ethical behavior and anti-corruption work must be put on the agenda in all institutions and departments. A major programme should be developed for implementation in all the ministries and state authorities, involving all employees at all levels.
- **Training is needed for the professionalization of the civil service.**
There is a great need for training activities and a willingness to take part in these. It is important that the training activities also correspond to the needs for competence development experienced among the employees. First and foremost young people are eager to expand their qualifications within foreign languages and international relations, particularly the EU and the EU integration process, and computer skills. Training activities

must be planned in line with the qualifications necessary for the civil service, the skills needed to manage the change processes, and the need for the professional and personal development of civil servants.

- **Increased efforts on job descriptions and HR planning is needed**
Increased efforts should be made to prepare relevant and clear job descriptions. The HRMA must take the lead, but also the state authorities should establish and develop the HR capacity to strengthen the HR planning and to be prepared for implementing procedures and processes following a new Law on Civil Servants and State Employees.

An active employer policy is needed to professionalize the civil service. Higher salary is the most important factor for improving the motivation of young civil servants. However, this might not be easy to grant in times of international financial crisis. The study offers ideas and instruments for an overall employer policy that entails acting in new ways, not necessarily in more expensive ways. A lot of the ideas and perspectives of young employees actually imply developing a modern work organization with challenging work tasks, with more openness and creativity, and with more responsibility and professional independence. Furthermore, they focus on personal and professional development, transparent career system, better leadership performance and some welfare aspects.

An open dialogue on employer policy and the professionalization of the civil service should be handled with the broad involvement of the employees and their representatives.

11 Appendix

11.1 Training

The main topics of training needs as described by the respondents in the survey are presented in the following (chapter 3.5):

- First and foremost there is a need for training in foreign languages, preferably English, but both French and German are mentioned. Some respondents also emphasize the need for foreign language training abroad.
- Just as important are the various training needs related to international relations, and particularly to the EU and various aspects of the European integration:
 - EU integration, the EU pre-accession funds, the exchange of experiences with similar bodies in the EU, formal correspondence with the EU, EU law, structure of the EU and the process of adopting EU legislation, lobbying in the EU, the negotiation process for accession to the EU, financial management of EU funds
 - Diplomatic Academy, international law, seminars on current issues, NATO, seminars abroad, training to work on international projects, study visits with interactive participation, participation in conferences abroad, participation in training activities organized by international organizations, Diplomatic and Corporate Protocol and Communication, international financial organizations and their donor activities,
- Computer skills are also widely mentioned as training needs. Some examples:
 - Various software courses, All Microsoft training, Excel etc., virtualization, advanced IT courses, programming and design courses (Oracle, Adobe Photoshop, Illustrator etc)
- Communication skills are often mentioned, including various aspects such as:
 - Presentation techniques and skills, negotiation skills
 - The impact of media in creating public opinion, communication models in public relations
 - Creating better communication between civil servants
- Management systems and skills
 - Budget planning, Total Quality Management training
 - Strategic planning
 - Public procurement. Public dept management
 - Procedure of the state audit, working with SAP
- Human Resource Management
 - System based on criteria of fair selection
- Knowledge of and skills in various work relations and task organization such as:
 - Project management, team work
 - General organization of the state administration – basic training

- Time management
- Raising the creativity level in state bodies
- Job technical, analytical and methodological skills such as:
 - writing project reports, writing IPA reports
 - methodology within the proper subjects
 - estimations, projections
- Particular skills in accordance with the respondents' own work tasks and task solving, and also in implementing new reforms. These are more likely to be dealt with within the state authority and ministry or the sector:
 - The reform of the security sector, experiences in the field of parliamentary control over the defense and security sector
- Personal and interpersonal skills
 - Stress handling, anti-mobbing, interpersonal relations, motivation

Referanseark for Difi

Tittel på rapport:	How can the Civil Service in Montenegro become a more attractive work place for young people?
DIFIs rapportnummer:	2011:6 ISSN 1890-6583
Forfatter(e):	Ingrid Kvåle, Difi
Evt. eksterne samarbeidspartnere:	Jadranka Djurkovic, HRMA Montenegro and Ivica Ivanovic, DSSR-project.
Prosjektnummer:	
Prosjektnavn:	Etablering av forsvarsdepartement i Montenegro.
Prosjektleder:	Svein Eriksen
Prosjektansvarlig avdeling:	Avdeling for forvaltningskunnskap og organisering
Oppdragsgiver(e):	
Resymé/omtale:	<p>This employee survey covers questions within the following areas: working conditions and the content of the work, competence – and career development, performance appraisal, leadership performance, atmosphere, ethics and employer reputation, motivation and future working life perspectives.</p> <p>The study offers the following recommendations for the professionalization and the development of the civil service:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Introduction of merit-based recruitment and promotion.• Involvement of the employees and delegation of authority.• Efforts to strengthen ethical behavior must involve all employees.• Training is needed for the professionalization of the civil service.• Increased efforts on job descriptions and HR planning is needed
Emneord:	Employee survey, Montenegro, civil service, merit principle, professionalization of civil service, employer policy
Totalt antall sider til trykking:	32
Dato for utgivelse:	02.05.2011
Utgiver:	DIFI Postboks 8115 Dep 0032 OSLO www.difi.no

