

The Schools in the Rainforest



**A mid-term evaluation of
The intercultural education project (PEI) among
the Yanomami**

**Prepared By
Eva Marion Johannessen**

For CCPY/OD/Rainforest Foundation Norway (RFN)

Oslo, June 2001

CONTENTS

<u>Map</u>	4
<u>Preface</u>	5
1. Introduction	6
2. Methodology	8
3. Background	11
3.1 <i>The History and Origin of the PEI</i>	11
The Watoriki theri and Davi Kopenawa	11
Getting Back on Top	12
4. Main Findings	14
4.1 <i>The development of the PEI</i>	14
Solidarity in Literacy training	14
An emerging team of literate Yanomami	15
Obstacles and driving forces in the development of the PEI	15
Reflections on the general objective of the PEI	16
4.2 <i>Changes in the Yanomami culture</i>	18
The influence of Schooling	18
The Universality of the Yanomami school	18
The introduction of money and salaries	19
Visits and exchanges	20
4.3 <i>The school and the community</i>	21
Female students and teachers	24
4.4 <i>The role and function of the CCPY teachers/advisers</i>	25
4.5 <i>Pedagogical aspects of the PEI</i>	28
A pro Yanomami linguistic policy	28
Bilinguism and literacy training	30
Consolidating the written Language	31
Towards an intercultural and bi/multilingual curriculum	34
Between the norm and the usage	35
The bilingual capacity of some	38
Didactic Material	39
Learning climate and teaching methods	42
4.6 <i>Teacher Training</i>	46
4.7 <i>Supervision and follow up of the Yanomami teachers</i>	47
5. <u>Reflections on how the project has succeeded in reaching the specific objectives and Goals</u>	49
6. <u>Management, Partnerships and Cooperation</u>	53
7. <u>Sustainability of the PEI</u>	57
8. <u>Summary</u>	59

9. Suggestions and Recommendations 62

Literature 65

Attachments 66

PREFACE

On behalf of the evaluation team I would like to thank all who have contributed to this evaluation, particularly the CCPY team of teachers/advisers, Simone Cassia, Lidia Montanha Castro, Clenir Louceiro, Luiza Camara Bezerra, Luis Fernando Pereira, Edvaldo Macuxi, as well as the Yanomami leader Davi Kopenawa, and Yanomami teachers and health agents. Special thanks to Lidia and Simone who guided us safely through the paths in the rainforest.

But above all, our thanks go to the regional coordinator of the PEI, Marcos W. Oliveira, for his helpful and kind attitude and efficient assistance before, under and after the fieldwork.

The dedication, enthusiasm and stamina all of you demonstrate are outstanding. The experience in the field has made a great impression on us all, which we will never forget.

Eva Marion Johannessen

1 INTRODUCTION

This is an evaluation of the PEI, Program de Educaçao Intercultural, developed by the Pro-Yanomami Commission in Brazil (CCPY). The project has received financial support from Norway through the NGOs OD (Operasjon Dagsverk) and RFN. As this is a mid-term review, it focuses mainly on the period from 1998 (when the external financing started) till (the end of) 2000. The project will receive funds from Norway until 2003.

CCPY is a non-governmental organization that was founded in 1978 with the original intention of launching a national and international campaign to defend the territories where the Yanomami (Y) lived. This claim was recognized by the Brazilian government in 1992 as “The Yanomami Indigenous Territory” (Terra Indígena Yanomami) (see map p. 4). Apart from the need to oversee that the territory’s frontiers are being respected, CCPY initiated a health project and the education project PEI, among others. The Norwegian financial support to the education project comprises three Yanomami regions: Demini, Toototobi and Parawau (see enclosed map).

The Yanomami have lived for thousands of years in the rainforest partly in the northern part of Brazil, partly in the southern part of Venezuela. Today there are totally around 20.000 Yanomami, half of which are located in Venezuela, living in about 350 villages in an area, which is twice the size of Portugal. The Yanomami live in places that are accessible by air only. Thus they have managed to maintain their “primitive” culture due to their isolation. However, they have also been in sporadic contact with the whites, through brutal encounters in the 70ies and 80ies. When it was discovered that the Yanomami territory was rich in minerals, it was invaded by gold-diggers (garimpeiros). This invasion had disastrous effects on the Yanomami as they died of common illnesses like measles, influenza and malaria, and as a result their number was reduced by 15% in 1987-89. (RFN 1997).

RFN appointed Eva Marion Johannessen as their evaluator and Knut Olav Krohn Lakså from Operation Day’s Work (OD), and CCPY appointed Nietta Lindenberg Monte, and Enilton André da Silva. The team represents two different cultures, Norway and Brazil, and has had to reconcile differences and overcome cultural and linguistic difficulties, as two of the members do not have Portuguese as their mother tongue. **Eva Marion Johannessen** (EMJ) is an educational psychologist and has been working at a Teacher Training Institute and at the University of Oslo, Institute for Special Education, for many years. She has vast experience from evaluations of education projects in various countries in Southern- and East Africa. **Nietta Lindenberg Monte** (NLM) is an expert on indigenous education and linguistics and has experience as an evaluator of other programs on indigenous education. For many years she has been working as a teacher trainer in a sister-organization to CCPY, the NGO the Pro-Indian Commission in Acre (a Comissão Pró-Índio do Acre, CPI/Ac). **Knut Olav Krohn Lakså** (KOL) is an anthropology student. He was the president of OD at the time when RFN won the OD’97 campaign and has visited the project several times. **Enilton André da Silva** (EAS) is a teacher and former director of an indigenous school, and the coordinator of the OPIR (Organizaçao dos professores indígenas de Roraima), the Organization for indigenous teachers in Roraima, which is one of the states where the PEI is carried out. Thus the team has been able to draw upon their diversified experience comparing the PEI with other education programs across cultures.

The evaluation had a dual purpose: to give feedback and qualified assistance to the CCPY regarding the pedagogical components of the program, particularly the curriculum that they are about to prepare. As Nietta Lindenberg Monte has through her long experience with similar work been able to assist them in this direction during the fieldwork period. She says in her report that she “em muitos momentos optei por realizar uma “avaliacao assessorante” e uma “assessoria avaliante”. The other purpose was to look at the project’s results so far from an “outsider’s” perspective according to the general objective of the evaluation which says: “To evaluate the 5 years of the PEI with a view to constructing a critical analysis that can highlight positive and negative aspects and from them make suggestions that can raise it to maximum capacity. The programme has sent in its requests and reports to RFN every year since 1998, the first year that financing from the OD began. The requests state the objectives to be achieved in each year, specifying the expected results and the planned activities. The evaluation should also measure the degree to which these annual objectives and results have been achieved”. (see TOR enclosed). Due to the composition of the team, we believe that we have been able to cover the dual purpose.

Nietta Lindenberg Monte and Eva Marion Johannessen have been the main evaluators and EMJ is responsible for the final report. The final version is based on the individual reports from the members of the team (available upon requests from the authors, cf. Literature).

In the final report I have structured the contents according to the points mentioned in the TOR, but they are found under different headings. A few other topics have been added. According to the TOR it was not expected to give equal emphasis to all the points mentioned. The main focus is on the pedagogical aspects. Due to the short period in the field it has not been possible to cover all aspects related to Management and Partnership.

The report includes a short Introduction to the project and the evaluation team, the Methodology used, Background, Main findings, Reflections on the objectives, Management, partnerships and cooperation, Sustainability, Summary and Recommendations. The summary and the recommendations may serve as a **short version** of the report. Throughout the report and in the final conclusions reference is made to the project’s efficiency, effectiveness, impact, relevance and sustainability (though at times different terms have been used) as indicated in the TOR.

The cooperation between the RFN and OD has not been covered..

It should be kept in mind that this is not an anthropological study. It is a short-time assessment based on a brief visit to a foreign culture, which is not known by many, and we are not able to understand the deeper meaning of the cultural pattern we have observed. However, it is reason to underline that although the Yanomami culture is unique, they also have things in common with other cultures. NLM draws comparisons between her experience with education projects in other Indian tribes and I make comparisons with patterns that I have observed in other countries.

It was decided by RFN that the final report could be presented in Portuguese and English (two of the individual reports are in Portuguese). The team agreed upon some of the main conclusions before we left Boa Vista but not on all that are presented here. It has been a difficult task to finalize the report and coordinate the different perspectives with the rest of the team in Brazil. Although I have chosen to quote from the individual reports and identify the authors, I am responsible for the final version. My co-evaluators do not necessarily subscribe to all my points of view.

2 METHODOLOGY

The terms of reference (TOR) were prepared by RFN, CCPY and the evaluators.

The team decided to focus on the following five points:

- the project's origin, development and relation with the community
- Pedagogical aspects
- training of the Yanomami teachers
- the coordination and administration of the project
- partnerships

The team's interpretation of the TOR is attached to NLM's individual report.

The CCPY wanted to give priority to the pedagogical aspects.

The team has used the following methods of evaluation:

- document analysis: review of field reports and annual reports, other relevant documents
- observation in the classrooms and in the communities
- review of the didactic material produced and in use
- interviews/conversations with the coordinators and consultants from the CCPY team, students, members of the community, resource persons and partners

The team prepared the fieldwork in Sao Paulo and Boa Vista before the departure to the Indian communities. A frame of reference based on TOR and guidelines for observation were prepared.

The fieldwork in the Indian communities lasted 12 days, from May 8 until May 20. The days before and after the fieldwork (May 4–8 and May 20–22) were spent in Boa Vista reviewing documents, interviewing and summing up the work. On May 4 we attended a seminar “Ensino Superior, conquistando espaço na formacao do professor indígena” in Canauani, right outside of Boa Vista.

The teachers' reports from the field as well as the annual reports have been a supplement to the fieldwork as they are rich in details.

The classroom observations and observations in the communities were made possible during the field visits. The three regions that receive Norwegian financial support were visited. The team divided in two groups: Nieta Lindenberg Monte and Knut O.K. Lakså went to Demini where they stayed for 6 days. The project started in Demini already in 1995 and is well developed in many aspects. Several of the Yanomami teachers and the inhabitants speak Portuguese. Demini has 115 inhabitants and one school (43 students). The other part of the team, Enilton A. da Silva and Eva M. Johannessen went to Parawau, the most recent community where the project has been introduced. They stayed there for 6 days. Parawau has 207 inhabitants and 9 communities (64 students). We visited the school located in the maloka¹ and the school in the center (posto) for the Yanomami teachers and advanced students. The distance from the center to the settlements varies from 2 – 3 hours' walk to 2 days. We visited the community Uxiximapiu, a two and a half hours' walk from the center.

¹ Maloka is the communal house where the Yanomami live, cf. the photograph on the front page

Finally the team met again in Toototobi where the education activities started in 1998. Toototobi has 308 inhabitants divided into seven settlements (85 students). The team divided into the same two groups who altogether visited Okarasipi, Koyopi, Apiahi ki, Kokoiu, Piau that were located 2-5 hours walk from the center.

The way the field visits were planned allowed concentration in one region combined with visits to other places and schools that were different in location and in terms of the project's development. The hiking in the rainforest gave us the opportunity to know more about the CCPY teachers' work conditions and the life of the Yanomami in their settlements.

As we shall see later, the observation guide that was prepared was in many ways not suited for the schools we visited. The guide has been used in various contexts in Africa, and part of it also in Brazil in another Indian culture, but it did not quite fit in here. However, it made it possible to draw comparisons between the Yanomami schools and other schools.

Some of the interviews/conversations took place in Boa Vista. We interviewed key persons in the CCPY organization as well as partners from the health organization among the Yanomami, URIHI and two educators, Maria Edna de Brito and Adriana Maria Huber who are involved in the Catholic church's education project (Diocese de Roraima). Maria Edna de Brito was the first teacher in the CCPY education pilot project in Demini from 95-97. We had frequent formal and informal talks with the CCPY team and with the Yanomami teachers. At the end of each field visit, we gathered the Yanomami teachers for a feedback session.

Unfortunately, we were not able to meet with local politicians in Boa Vista and neither with the education authorities at the state level. Eva Marion Johannessen had a meeting with Jean Paraizo Alves; Gestor governmental in the office for General coordination of the support to indigenous schools (Coordenação geral de apoio as escolas indígenas) in the Ministry of Education (MEC) and with Fernando Bittencourt at the CCPY office in Brasilia.

The team consisting of NLM and KOL. recorded their interviews on audiotape, while the other half of the team videotaped samples of the teaching and the life in the villages.

The review of the didactic material took place mostly in the field. Our ability to judge the contents and quality of the material produced was limited since it was written in the Yanomami language. We have however, been able to observe some of the material in use. Our access to translation was limited, and therefore it has not been possible to make a thorough evaluation of the quality of teaching and the contents of the lessons.

We have followed the CCPY teachers' teaching of the Yanomami teachers (in Parawau) and their monitoring of them in Parawau and Toototobi. Furthermore we have discussed the training aspects with the coordinator and CCPY teachers, studied the drafted pedagogical plan (curriculum), as well as reports on previous training sessions.

It turned out that it was not possible to conduct a traditional interview with the Yanomami teachers by asking questions and reflecting upon theoretical issues. The mode of interchange by asking questions is not common in this culture. As one of the CCPY teachers said: This is a culture of speeches not questions and answers. I felt this as a limitation not allowing us to

get insight into how the teachers reflected (cf. reflection-in-action, Schön²) upon their role and tasks. In stead it was easier to converse with the teachers when they related to concrete and practical matters, like showing didactic material in use, the teachers' diaries, drawings regarding their perceptions of the school and the teaching. This method was used during the feedback sessions with the Yanomami teachers in Demini, Parawau and Toototobi.

It was also difficult to conduct interviews in groups or individually with the female students (in Parawau) since they were shy and not familiar with this type of conversations with strangers. Direct contact with students was limited since few of them speak Portuguese.

Are our observations from the classroom and the Indian communities trustworthy or biased? It is not possible to get a complete picture of the teaching, the schools and the community in 12 days. The observations may be biased not covering the average school day and the interaction between teachers-students and the community members may have been influenced by our presence. However, observations in the field have been compared with information in reports, documents and conversations with teachers, enabling us to draw comparisons between various sources of information. The evaluation team had the advantage of comparing what we observed with our varied experience from other school projects.

One issue that we have sought to find an answer to is whether the teaching and the schools changed considerably during our visits. It is reason to believe that there is less regularity in frequency of lessons and attendance of students when the CCPY team and we are not there according to the reports from the field. (will be further discussed under the heading The school and the community).

Our presence has influenced the teaching, but not to the extent of changing it completely, particularly not since we spent several days and hours in the classrooms in Parawau and Demini. Our main impressions of the teaching are confirmed by information in the field reports.

² Donald Schön. 1990: Educating the reflective practitioner. .

3 BACKGROUND

3.1 The history and origin of PEI

Os Watoriki theri and Davi Kopenawa

NLM presents the history and origin of PEI as follows in her individual report:

The PEI an indigenist educational action on the intercultural frontiers between the Yanomami and the international and Brazilian national societies- had its Genesis in the recent trajectory of the Watoriki theri, the people of the Mountains of the High Winds. The first and foremost region of the widespread Yanomami lands in terms of the sequence and relevance of the project, the place is a species of birthplace for the PEI.

*Safely installed in a fortress among the mountains lives its best known representative. Davi Kopenawa has his headquarters in the great community roundhouse of the Watoriki theri from whence surges, like a high wind, the force for the genesis, expansion and consolidation of a new cultural construction - **the Yanomami School**. Through it the formational process of young representatives is being developed on several problematical intercultural fronts which have always been identified in the institutional objectives and in the representation of the Yanomami, with the area of health and more recently, basic education.*

Today, white doctors, nurses and teachers seem to be wiser than the Yanomami in white culture but when the Yanomami learn Portuguese too and acquire knowledge of white culture they will be just as strong as any nurse, teacher or doctor. It's like that (...) (Davi Kopenawa, 1995)

But it is also true that the Yanomami School and the educational program that informs it formed themselves around the political discourse of the struggle for rights and for the management and control of the land, under which banners the institutional action of the CCPY has affirmed itself:

There in the city, the people saying that they will invade, make a road, make a city. Well then, I think, we think and we trust the work of the CCPY, we know their very courageous work. Everybody knows and the Yanomami are content: let our Yanomami land stay separate, CCPY wanted to demarcate our land for the people to live in, to hunt in, to work in well the, the CCPY worked for that, they did not run away afraid of Jaguars, they remained right on top of the snake because the enemy wanted to swallow up our land, but the CCPY kept on top of them: nobody could steal it, nobody could swallow up the Yanomami land, because they are an ancient folk, they are people, a people so we made it..... (Davi, 1995)

There in the village of Davi Kopenawa in the light of his charisma and of the affinity which he has with the Nape of the CCPY and its various allies and financiers, a more detailed representation of Yanomami School Education begins to be formed by themselves for others (or by themselves by means of others).

It first appears as an emergency social action for intercultural co-operation among allies on the tense frontier with the " enemy" in the last 30 years.

The construction of the Perimetral Norte (Northern Perimetral Highway) in the seventies led to a trail of death, which wiped out entire communities. The survivors of four villages in the upper Catrimani, blighted by an epidemic that killed half their inhabitants managed to get back on top and reorganized themselves to establish the headquarters of Davi Kopenawa (...)

August 87, goldminers invade the entire area, the worst ever malaria epidemic. The survivors were obliged to displace themselves in an involuntary manner (...) social disintegration beginning with the destruction of the fields and the game fleeing from the noise of the planes. Around 1,500 Yanomami died during the first two years of the goldrush..... (Ramos, 1996).

The PEI has anchored its political line in the thinking of Davi Kopenawa and in his power to demand, stimulate and interact verbally with the CCPY and its allied agencies on the one hand and on the other hand with the other groups of the Yanomami complex. The post at Demini has thus become a secure place for the indigenist action of intervention of the CCPY, having reunited some of the groups of survivors of the Yanomami group, coming from Mapulaú and from the Upper Lobo D"Almada River. In this locality in this fortress in the forest surrounded by a fantastic geography of ever-present high and low rocky mountains a pilot experiment took shelter. From there interesting historical perspectives of the observation of History of the moment as well as the development of recent History have emerged leading to the origin of the project of the Watoriki Yanomami in relation to the School.

Ever since 1984, the CCPY encouraged Davi to initiate an educational programme by means of which he could transmit his knowledge of the Yanomami way of life to the non Yanomami world, expounding on the problems of his people to those who form public opinion, in meetings, conferences..... these experiences led to a great manifestation of the need to initiate a process of formal education in those regions where the CCPY was active in administering health assistance(CCPY, 1998:5).

“Getting Back on Top”

Now we have got through because we had the support of yourselves of the CCPY and of other organisations who also gave support. Now we are stronger because we have a better understanding of the white man’s mind (...) (Davi Kopenawa, 1995)

The PEI comes into being as a mission to support initially the Watoriki theri so that it would be possible to begin to “Get back on top” flying in the face of the current of historical process. Thus they promoted, together with the CCPY and its allies, a kind of Rescue operation to conserve and or preserve the forest, their URIHI, from which has resulted the construction of the Yanomami Territory and the “vital energy” that comes in the form of ethnic identity. In other words, the PEI structures itself as an intervention in the extremely difficult conditions of a crisis context to “save” the Yanomami, “these survivors”.

In spite of the Yanomami Indigenous Area’s having been demarcated, the strategy of the CCPY continues to be one of a constant vigilance over the area, which is a constant target for goldminers. Over the years it has placed great emphasis on the life of these indigenous people through a health programme.... to give them the means of facing up to the new reality, two years ago the implanting of a Pilot Educational Project was begun in the Demini region which as well as teaching to read and write, was designed to form health agents and monitors for the education process among the indigenous people themselves (CCPY, 1998)

And it has done this by strategically setting up a “pilot” programme involving the consolidation of alliances with Davi’s extensive family, the Watikiri theri, inhabitants of the region of the Demini post, in an attempt to overcome the impact of spiritual and economic fronts and their desolating “greenhouse effect”. An education based on the

defence of the demarcated territory as a basis for identity to be constructed as a “Yanomami Complex” in the dialogue of resistance with the whites who present themselves.

I need Yanomami energy, I don't want to catch the white man's energy, because white man's energy is something else: he doesn't want to sleep around the fire any more, doesn't want to walk in the forest (...) our way of life cannot die, it is going to go on

Those monkeys out there, the offspring of the monkey cannot come out of the mountains angrily wanting to become a Yanomami. He comes here, he is knowledge, he has knowledge. He knows and he can learn our language but afterwards he goes back to look after his mother and father. So that is how we are deciding (Davi, 1995).

4 MAIN FINDING

4.1 The development of PEI

Solidarity in Literacy Training

NLM says the following regarding the development of PEI:

The school at Demini, in the six years since the preliminary actions were taken and at the present moment of the PEI, continues to be outstanding in the great community roundhouse wherein circulates and reproduces itself a part of the Yanomami society, the Watokiri theri. It's historical prerogative as a radiating centre with the force of the high winds whence emanate the new schools energised by the force of the teachers and multipliers and the team of advisers of the CCPY, seems entirely evident.

In the beginning the CCPY started the work in Demini, when it got bigger it continued the work, supplied transportation, a salary, and started in Toototobi too...(Lourenço, Toototobi, 2001)

We went to Demini. First we studied. We learned to read syllables and words, consonants, phrases we studied the first time. We came back here again to Toototobi. We put in three teachers...we asked for notebooks...(Geraldo, Toototobi,2001)

The expansion of the PEI into other regions has had as its strategy the organised dispatching of multipliers, youngsters who have qualified in Demini to act in other communities of the Yanomami complex which today has become part of a macro educational action which reaches East and West.

This expanded action seems to be the great novelty of the programme in the eyes of the advisers and a strong political line of "Solidarity in Literacy Training" has been incorporated by the Yanomami. In this way they further the continuance of the teaching of Literacy in new communities.

Today, Davi is an enthusiastic thinker on this expansion of solidarity among brothers. He makes a positive reflection this radiation, its repercussion and the reproduction intended by the PEI and envisions a future that leads to the dreamed of image of "political and educational autonomy":

In the future, the school will continue and they, the Yanomami are going to keep it functioning. That is how we are thinking and talking. The Yanomami teachers and the CCPY will make up an ABC manual for the teacher. When the teachers have learned enough, we ourselves will make the Yanomami ABC manual for them to carry on speaking our language, for them not to forget our language (Davi, Demini, 2001)

He considers necessary an educational action encompassing the other areas of the greater Yanomami Territory: an expansion understood to be a way of creating the inter-cultural links of a Yanomami macro identity of solidarity parting from the centre of Watori by means of a strategic occupation and maintenance of the demarcated territory as well as the defence of the forest:

Defend the land, the forest so as not to let it be destroyed. I have never studied but I have learned how to defend. I have learned how to speak and I am learning still. I

learned how to speak to defend the forest: the URIHI is yours too and it is ours too. We are guarding this. We have everything here in this land. So your part is out there. This part here belongs to the Indian. So it must be respected. You can't just cut trees, can't destroy, no !

Who looks after things when we are asleep? It is Nature who takes care. It isn't the Government or even FUNAI.

We sleep and rest but she is keeping watch. The jaguar doesn't come here to catch us and no evil spirit either.....so we are protected.....each ones world is different . you have to respect.....(Davi Kopenawa, 2001

An Emerging Team of Literate Yanomami

Presently there are more than three dozen youngsters in activity in the field accompanied by their advisers and formed in the PEI courses and or in others offered by the URIHI. These young people are grouped into three separate professional categories

1. *The teachers, the most permanent category of professional training offered by the PEI, they operate in the communities of Parawau , Toototobi and DEMINI gradually substituting the CCPY advisers. They receive a salary of less than one minimum salary and it is calculated in relation to variation in the number of classes in the month.*
2. *The multipliers are young literacy trainers who work with people in more distant regions and are put at their disposal for lack of literate personnel in those other areas. They go to instruct their distant kinsmen. They maintain informal contractual links therefor, not with their own home communities but with other communities and villages. They are being paid by the URIHI, a few by the CCPY.*
3. *The Microscope technicians are mostly former teachers trained in the initial phases of the PEI. Subsequently they were attracted to work as health professionals for the URIHI being trained under a more technical curriculum linked to the collection and reading of slides and the writing of reports for the "active seeking" process of health control. They are employees of the URIHI and receive a minimum salary*

Thus the original family of teachers from Demini is presently spread out through several professional categories each with its own particular formational process and salary. They migrated to the prestigious profession of Microscope technician or the equally attractive function of Multiplier in other schools(with more attractive salaries paid by the URIHI)

Obstacles and driving forces in the development of PEI

Since the initiation in Demini in 1995, the project has gone through various phases (which can be verified by studying the annual reports) according to experience made in the field. The three major recurrent obstacles from 1998 until today are climatic changes, a high turnover among the CCPY teachers/advisers, lack of knowledge of each other's language and Brazil's political/economical situation. Due to climatic changes affecting the harvest and the access to water, the project has at times had to redirect its attention from the pedagogical part to the critical living conditions of the Yanomami. The high turnover of the teachers/advisers in the CCPY team is due to illnesses caused by the climate, or their lack of adaptation to the culture. The communication between the Portuguese speaking CCPY teachers/advisers and most of the Yanomami who only speak their maternal language has been a third obstacle. Furthermore devaluation of the Brazilian currency and the government and state policy on indigenous matters have had repercussions on the project.

The PEI has been guided mostly by practical experience made in the field and not by pedagogical theory and principles.³ In the 1998 yearly report and appendix no reference is made to the pedagogy, education principles and methods of literacy they intended to follow. The education project has mainly been seen as a means of creating a link between the Yanomami and the larger society within which they live, enabling them to defend their rights and their territory. This is viewed as crucial in order to preserve their culture (cf. the annual report 1998, p. 3). It follows that anthropological and linguistic considerations have been of main concern: how to open up for new cultural and linguistic inputs without decomposing and invading the Yanomami culture. Throughout the project the anthropological advisory has been stable while the pedagogical advisories have been sporadic (cf. Annual reports).

Reflections on the general objective of the PEI

This part is based on an analysis of reports and documents, which have regularly been sent to RFN and OD.

Since the beginning, the general objective of the education program was formulated as follows:

Support the Yanomami in the preservation of their autonomous life in their traditional territories. The intention of the program is to offer help and means to implement an educational policy that values the Yanomami culture” (annual report 1998).

The introduction of schooling is seen as a vehicle to preserve the culture and their traditional way of life provided that it values the Yanomami culture. The role of the PEI and thereby the team of CCPY teachers is seen as that of offering “support” in this direction not to be the providers of a standard education policy.

When I first read the objective, I had many questions. To what extent is it possible to preserve their traditional culture when new elements are introduced and they become more exposed to the external society? Which other extraneous factors from the surrounding society have already had an influence on their culture and how do these factors interplay? Which cultural elements do the Yanomami want to preserve and which do they want to change? Are there different points of view/discussions among various groups within the Yanomami tribe as to the acceptance of changes in their culture? Some of these questions will be discussed in the report.

Since schooling is a new concept in the Yanomami culture an education policy adapted to the Yanomami had to be developed. To develop a new policy means not only to find ways of teaching and preparing didactic material, but also to develop the political contents of the material. Although the project had been going on for two years as a pilot project in 1998, no reference is made in the annual report and the annex that year to experience made as to the contents of the subjects and pedagogical methods and if they had served the general objective. But “define the contents of the subjects to be considered during the year” is presented as a goal for 1999.

In an evaluation of the project based on his experience in 1998 in the district of Parawau made by the only CCPY teacher there at that time, Moises Ramalho has some interesting reflections

³ Apparently a plan which describes the main pedagogical principles and methods of alphabetization was developed by the first teacher in Demini – Maria Edna de Brito – but this plan has been difficult to get hold of

on the notion of schooling among the Yanomami and suggestions as to future actions. His concern is that the school does not function when the COPY teacher is not present one reason being that the Yanomami do not see the social meaning of the school. It is only a place where you learn to write and read in order to become a health agent or a microscope technician. The social importance of being a health agent, and the fact that they get a salary, gives social prestige. The Yanomami still consider the health issues very important, and it is apparently easier to promote the idea of schooling related to education of health agents than schooling to become a teacher.

Furthermore he complains that there are no clear objectives, neither a program nor a timetable for the training of the teachers.

He raises the issue regarding preparation of the contents of the subjects, which “has to be started as quickly as possible”. There was still no progress in introducing science, history, geography, citizenship, and technology. The political role of the school is to serve as a link between the two societies. Literacy is not an end in itself, it is a means to acquire knowledge about geography, history and science, which will make the Yanomami capable of understanding their own as well as the larger society and enabling them to promote their own case. In this context it is important to consider the contents of the subjects. It is fundamental in developing an education policy, which is based on the Yanomami experience. This is the school’s political function. (Letter to the coordinator of CCPY 30. -1.99 and field reports from Parawau 1998).

The education policy has gradually been developed according to experience made, but it is still reason to rethink how to reach the school’s political function.

KOL elaborates further on this aspect in his report:

(...) Why (do) the Yanomamies consider education as important? (no one considers it as unimportant). Is it because they want to defend the forest from destruction? Is it because they want to defend their culture and way of living? Is it because they want to satisfy the “brancos” and the chiefs in the community? Is it because they want to earn money and be able to buy new things? Or is it simply out of curiosity of learning new things?

During my interviews different persons reflected all of these points of views. Few of my informants had a conscious idea about the political macro-implications of education. Most of them only related the necessity of education to direct transactions with the whites. This is what Anselmo Yanomami, a microscope technician from Demini, said regarding the importance of education:

- We need school to learn things. We learn the names of animals, trees, plants and other things. It is important to learn Portuguese so we can go to the city. And we need to know mathematics in order to understand money, so the whites cannot trick us.

And this is what Rogel Yanomami from Toototobi had to say about mathematics:

- I want to learn mathematics because I want to learn money. I want to earn more. I like money, but I need mathematics to understand.

The political macro-perspectives of the education, which are highly debated by NGOs, indigenous leaders (Davi, among others) and other “brancos”, are in very few cases the view of the Yanomamies. The general opinion is that Portuguese and mathematics are important instruments in order not to be tricked in direct transactions by the whites. There is also a general view that written language is important so that they do not forget old stories and the names of things (plants, animals, etc.).

But the fact remains that a more general perspective on the political aspects of education such as defending their territory and the objective of the school, are shared by few. The school is the arena where such debates and perspectives ought to be shared (...).

4.2 Changes in the Yanomami culture

Previous contacts with the larger society through encounters with “garimpeiros” have set its marks on the Yanomami culture and all the three regions have had contact with schools run by missionaries (cf. Bruce Albert 1977). The main contact the Yanomami (in Demini, Toototobi and Parawau) have with people from the larger society today comes from non-indigenous health agents engaged in the URIHI program and CCPY teachers. In addition their own Yanomami health agents and teachers travel frequently to other places. The Yanomami culture has undergone a change over time due to this influence, although to a lesser degree than other Indian tribes in Brazil.

The influence of schooling

The notion of schooling and teachers is new to the Y. community, at least as a school that takes place within their own community. Their contact with schooling previously has been through the missionaries.

Apart from the introduction of a new profession, that of a teacher, which receives a regular remuneration for his/her work, the school has and will continue to have a large impact on the community in several respects. It introduces new criteria according to which the community members will be classified: those who are literate and those who are not. This also opens up for new careers like becoming health agents or teachers, and as well other professions. The traditional way of teaching and learning through the apprenticeship model (modeling and observing) is replaced by an emphasis on verbal and written mediation⁴ by a teacher who is younger of age than his parents. The elder generation is surpassed in this respect by the younger. When the literate community members learn Portuguese, they will no longer depend on the white or Yanomami teachers in their search for new knowledge, but the whole world will be available to them through access to books and internet.

The universality of the Yanomami school

Today there are some Yanomami who are literate and speak Portuguese who still live in the traditional way in the communities. They represent a link with the external world. The ways they act as models in the communities have a decisive influence on the community members' perceptions of the larger society. As NLM says in her report regarding this issue:

From the point of view of the PEI, CCPY, the discussion within Demini on the new strategy for amplifying and extending the Yanomami schools guided by the Patas of the Watori, is quite interesting and politically relevant. It ensures what we could call the sustainability of

⁴ An analysis of different ways of teaching/learning that are culturally bound is found in Johannessen: Memo on Mediated Learning Experience (cf. Literature)

the educational program of the CCPY as desired in one of its main objectives ever since 1995 (this is not exactly the financial sustainability referred to in the TOR but rather political sustainability). In its statement to the evaluating team, the CCPY through its coordinator, expressed great satisfaction with the possibility of putting these political decisions on the prospects of the PEI on the round table of the school and its community in education. Thus the direction of the PEI seems to be meeting the formation of a complex Yanomami school world aimed at in the institutional plan of the CCPY ever since it was first traced out:

Year –3- opening of a school in Balawau and the maintenance of Demini and Toototobi (...) year 4- *open a school in Ericó and eventually in another area should there be a demand in the future...(CCPY 1996) (.....)*

However, Davi and the other pata have examined the risk of exhausting their own community of the concentrated force of these “multipliers” who should be allowed to go out of their home circle but who should also come back into it. In other words, their journeys should not mean a loss for the fortress represented by this army of youngsters undergoing training. Presently in Demini there are 8 youths; teachers, multipliers and microscope technicians. To this number can be added the work done at Toototobi with the training of a further 17 people – 9 teachers, 3 microscope technicians, and 5 multipliers and further expanded in Parawau with 9 teachers (including the only woman teacher) and 3 microscope technicians which means a group of 34 young people undergoing professional training in the region through the mediation of the human and financial resources of the PEI (and of the URIHI).

On the other hand, the expansion of the programme called for by other regions- Toototobi, Parawau, Surucucu, Hakoma, Loko, Parafuri and Homoxi- seems to indicate the inflated role of the school and of writing in the new Yanomami collective social imagination, at one and the same time, a source of social resistance and of social change in the difficult intercultural conditions and relations.

The introduction of money and salaries

The health agents and the teachers receive a regular salary, which has only recently been introduced to the teachers (cf. annual report 2000). The introduction of a teacher salary seemed inevitable as the Y. health agents (microscope technicians) already had the same arrangement.

The following from KOL’s report explains more about the introduction of money and its effect on the communities:

- The others that don’t receive any money say to me: ”I want as well. I want to receive money!” But there are no fights. I buy things for the others; hammocks, knives and cooking pots. I help them. I lend them things, and exchange things with them. But I am the only one. The other microscope technicians don’t.

Rogel Yanomami, Toototobi

There are not many of the Yanomamies in the area where CCPY works who receive a salary. Davi receives salary from FUNAI, the microscope technicians from URIHI and the teachers from CCPY (URIHI has hired some teachers as well, but that is in other areas). The salary of the microscope technicians is not very big, only a minimum salary (around 90\$ per month). The teachers are earning even less (maximum 60\$ per month, although their system of payment per hour of work makes it vary). There are 18

teachers and 8 microscope technicians that receive salary in Toototobi, Balawau and Demini. CCPY has been very careful of introducing money to the Yanomamies, and only felt forced to do so because URIHI did. It was introduced because several of the teachers quit in order to become microscope technicians - a job much more lucrative as far as money is concerned. It is still a bit of a problem that URIHI “steals” some of the brightest heads from CCPY because of the money. Several Yanomamies left their positions as teachers to become microscope technicians, even after salary was introduced. I believe them not only to be tempted by the money, but also by the fascination of new techniques and technology. This is a bit of a weakness in the program, and URIHI and CCPY should try to cooperate more closely concerning the future careers of the Yanomami intellectuals.

In some cases the teachers and microscope technicians pay others to work on their field, since they do not have sufficient time themselves. Some uses the things they buy in the city to carry out “trocas” (exchange) with the others. In this way the others in the village are sharing the money and the things bought as well, and everyone benefits.

The introduction of money has led to envy in the communities. Excerpts from an interview KOL made with Anselmo in Demini further demonstrate this:

But don't the microscope technicians and the teachers buy some things to the others?

No, no! This is exactly what I am talking about! I have one pot they bought for me - but it is only a small one. The microscope technicians say that it is only their money. They have lots of money, but don't want to help us others. They only buy things for themselves, for their houses only. They buy nothing to us others. Do you want a dog in the house? Only for themselves! Nothing for me! They buy pants, pots, nice shoes, etc., etc. They do nothing to help us others. I want the things they have as well!

But Davi buys things for the others, right?

Yes, but he is the only one. And maybe one day he will get ill and he will die. And then... finished! No more things for us. Nothing! I am very sad because of money.

But why won't the teachers and the microscope technicians help the others? I don't know. They only buy things for themselves. Do they help? (....)

There are many new things and technologies that have been introduced to the Yanomamies during a short period of time. And like every other person, the Yanomamies too are fascinated by all this new stuff. Seeing whites in the field having nice clothes, knives, biscuits, hammocks, shoes, radios, etc., etc., creates new desires among them. And new desires create new needs. But how to get all these things is a difficult task for most of the Yanomamies. Either they can do a “troca” with some of the whites, which many do and which also is a traditional element of the Yanomami culture. Another option is to hang around the health post begging things from the whites. This leaves the staff of both CCPY and URIHI with a great deal of responsibility. What things are good and what things are not, to introduce into their society? And how is it possible to prevent a development of an even more dependency of the whites?

Visits and exchanges

NLM says the following in her report regarding this topic:

The act of expanding and universalising the Yanomami School implicit in the present development of the PEI appears to be part of a political strategy undertaken by Davi and leaders like Toto (of the Apiaraiki). Through it they reflect their own educational experiences in their personal journeys and wanderings through which they have confirmed themselves as leaders and which are appropriate to the dynamics of spatial

occupation of the Yanomami: for example, Davi was born in another region, the upper Toototobi and only became established in the Demini area after several removals due to the death of a part of his family from a violent epidemic brought on by the missionary front. Davi is an advocate of the formative aspect these journeys can have in the construction of the young representatives of the Watori.

On the first day of our stay in the community school in Demini we observed a meeting of men in the School for youths and adults. The morning bubbled over with reflections on the continuing of the "Literacy Training in Solidarity" with the loaning of multiplying teachers from Demini to other regions. They also thought through carefully the quality of the cultural exposure and immersion of these youths in other regions, vulnerable as they are to some of the most dangerous aspects of inter-ethnic contact in the Amazon: that which rules military policy on frontier regions. We have as an example the report of the experiences of some of these youths with the military camps in Catrimani and Surucucu. They describe scenes from Hell, memories of the contact relations witnessed by these multipliers: their Yanomami kin were seen eating leftovers from the camps and sniffing aviation gasoline in a junkie session with an air of the post modernist decadence of the world's larger cities. Stories in different versions are told and retold by those who return this saga of solidarity in the teaching of Literacy. The group of pata united under Davi's baton agreed on a plan for the rotation of teachers and multipliers. They want to be sure that these youngsters, temporary visitors to other regions can permanently recharge their educational and multiplying energies forces with their own Watokiri kin but at the same time forge links of solidarity, co-operation and hegemony with their more distant Yanomami kin unassisted by the agents of contact. This expansion of solidarity of the Yanomami community in the direction of other allies has also come to be formulated in the perspective the CCPY has of it as a mechanism of exchange, visits in chain by means of exposing members of the Yanomami community to outside journeys and to visitors within their communities.

For years the Watoriki have been receiving visits from the world at large (...) and a lot of the understanding they have of the world has come about through these visits and the conversations they give rise to.....they contribute to the project insofar as they represent experiences of subjects that have been or will be dealt with in the school..Geography, history- to have contact with Japanese, Norwegians, perceive their physical and linguistic characteristics; (...) the economy, to receive Norwegian adolescents that finance the PEI; the indigenous organisation To hear the reports of A Krenak, etc.

Also, receiving visits from other Yanomami who bring with them other references on schools like the FUNAI school and its harsh teacher.....the missionary and his bible study.....these different experiences help the Yanomami to create an educational model which will be more adequate to them have several points of reference...(Marcos Wesley, 1995)

4.3 The school and the community

The Y. school is part of the maloka, the traditional communal house of the Yanomami. It is not separated by walls from the rest of the community. The daily activities of the families take place side by side with the school activities. The school in Demini is being described by NLM in her report:

The school in Demini just like some of the other malocas visited during the period of the field work of the evaluation process is integrated with the internal structure of the community round house divided into family sectors and has its objects and furniture marking off a specific area in the domestic life of the Yanomami. There are tables blackboards and posters with letters, syllables, drawings and numbers.....The boards, the posters, tables and

benches, in their vertical and horizontal positions cut across the internal view and architecture of the roundhouse and its internal or central patio forming a kind of a half wall that opens on and closes the Yanomami scene.

In these schools within the community house neither the older people nor the very young take part even though they may be present, as they are the proper place for adults and young men and women, boys and girls who stand out as the new learners of writing. Ever since the PEI began, the school situated within the community building has been a symbolic reconstruction of Yanomami education especially in view of the intentions and concepts of the advisers. A school that is integrated into the Yanomami culture and Language, a point for reflection for continuing and mirroring the social life and routine which is, shall we say "mimicked" in the curriculum.

The words of Marcos and Lidia at the beginning of the PEI are witness to this concept of the community house- school:

During our walk, we began to see far off, the community roundhouse of the Watoriki theri and once again we were impressed by its great size. Little by little we could define the details of that house in front of us, round as if it were a single great room. We went back to our former reflection and we perceived that the Yanomami educational project could be just like one of these houses like a huge single room where the different understandings are socialised and interwoven among the dwellers (Marcos and Lída, 1997)

The location of the school is being discussed among the Yanomami. From the beginning, the PEI has included in its debate a conflict of concepts with two tendencies, one in favour of and the other against, the separation of the architecture of the school from that of the maloca, one proposed by the Yanomami and another denied by the PEI. Davi and some of the pata have been the spokesmen for a line of progressive formalising of the Yanomami School as an independent institution separated from the daily social round. This view does not yet predominate and has not yet been put into effect except in one or two of the malocas involved in the project. It has to face up to the understanding and opinions of the advisers and CCPY members who foresee in this separation, a rupturing of the educational concept whereby the maloca and the school form an inseparable whole.

In traditional pedagogical terms one might say that there is a lot of disturbance at times in the schools located within the maloka, which affects the students' concentration.

The Y. school in the communal house is a functional part of the Y. life. There are no strict rules as to when the lesson starts; it is around 8. Most of the students arrive at that time, but some come later, but this is not more disturbing than the natural surrounding disturbance. Some of the girls/women bring their small babies. It would not have been possible for them to attend without this arrangement. Amazingly it does not seem to affect their concentration, because they are used to carrying their babies in all the other daily activities and the surroundings accept it. The other members of the community may attend the lesson as passive or active participants. The school day is not divided into 45 minutes' units separated by 10 minutes breaks. The lesson, which starts at 8, may go on until noon or 1 o'clock without interruption. No one seems to be bothered. They take individual breaks, leaving the classroom for shorter periods, or the students relax by paying less attention to the schoolwork at times. No one insists on having breaks, on the contrary they insist on continuing. Regular breaks would have been disturbing. Although most of the students are eager to come to school, some do not come everyday and at certain periods, the school is closed, due to other more important activities like harvesting, fishing, hunting, encounters with visitors, parties and festivals. The most amazing feature of the Y. classroom – compared with classrooms in ordinary schools in other places – is the eagerness and dedication of the students and their teachers, and

how they manage to concentrate despite the disturbing factors. It is in sharp contrast to many schools in other parts of the world, which have strict rules as to when the school starts, and rigorous rules regarding discipline, breaks and holidays. Most of the students are longing for the breaks and the holidays and many students have a short concentration span.

The Y. school has the characteristics of what is called *non-formal education*, education that takes place outside of the ordinary school system and which is adapted to the local context. An issue in non-formal education in Africa is how to develop local curricula and locally based didactic material. The school should be adapted to the community and not the other way around. The Yanomami School has succeeded and serves as an example in this respect. The school is not seen as separate from other activities, and when there are no strict rules, there is no need to observe that they are adhered to. The concepts of discipline, concentration and relaxation have a different meaning in this context.

One might say that the idea of a school without such rules is unrealistic and romantic and that it hampers serious learning because the learning does not take place on a regular, steady basis. Some of the reports (cf. Parawau in 1998) present worries that the literacy program will suffer because many schools stop functioning when the CCPY teachers do not supervise them.

It is true that the school in some communities does not function regularly at times. An estimate from Toototobi last year (report 4/2000) shows that the eight teachers there taught 23% of the days in August and September. There are huge differences between them, some taught 66% and others only one day over the two months' period. In Parawau this year, we were told that three of the Y. teachers taught around 30 days over a 90 days' period, which was considered satisfactory (according to Luis in Parawau). The differences between the communities in this respect should be further investigated. It is a danger when a school and community are small and the schooling is irregular with long breaks that the literacy effect will fade out. Some schools may need more assistance from the outside. But it is also important to think through the Yanomami school calendar as part of a curricular and social/political discussion of the school in general so as to legitimate this erratic frequency and not reprimand it in the name of a calendar excessively similar to that of Nape

Davi Kopenawa has this to say to us about the socially balanced distribution of school time and time for village life:

During the day the women work in the school. Afterwards they may help the family, help their mothers, no ? That's normal, no problem. But morning and afternoon i the school upsets things. They are studying normally then they stop. They go and do something else, go fishing, hunting, grate manioc so as to eat. Nobody is going to kill himself with work so as to be able to give classes... nobody is doing that. The work is different to work in the city (Davi Kopenawa, 2001)

If a set of school rules is imposed on the community, it will not necessarily guarantee better results. New conflicts between the school and the community may arise. At this stage of the project, the Y. school does not unduly intervene or stop the community's ordinary life rhythm, it seems to be an integral part of it and schoolwork is not a duty but a pleasure. When the school becomes more formal and under state control, the situation will change.

Female students and teachers

In all the schools visited the number of female students is lower than the number of male students. And all of the Y. teachers, except one, are male. CCPY has emphasized that the school is open to everybody irrespective of gender, age and social status. There are indications in the CCPY teachers' reports from the field that the women's participation is dependent on their husband's attitude to schooling. An interested husband may encourage his wife to attend and vice versa. There are also examples of clever women who for various reasons leave the school:

In Apia hi ki there are two male teachers who do not do their job satisfactorily. But there is a group of four literate women who have a better literacy level than the teachers. At the moment these women do not participate in the class and this represents a reduction of 50% among the literate." (report 3/2000, Toototobi).

The life and role of a woman in the Y. society is defined according to gender as in many other societies. The roles of a man and a woman are strictly complementary. Her role is that of a wife and not the least, a mother.

Most girls marry early, already at the age of the first menstruation, at age 12 and many get their first child shortly after. It is not uncommon that marriages are arranged when the girl is still a small child, and the future husband has to pay a bride's price. This links the future husband in law to the girl's family long before the marriage is consummated and obligations are formed between the families.

Her role as a mother is indisputable. The babies are never separated from their mothers. Her domain is the private sphere, and not the official room.⁵ In the school (in Parawau and Kokoiu) we noticed that the girls are very shy to raise their voice. In several respects the way the girl is brought up and the gender pattern seem to be similar to other societies (cf. for instance Ethiopia, Angola and Mozambique). On the other hand, this does not mean that the Y. woman is totally submissive and powerless.

An example of the Yanomami women's many faces is the young girl of 12, named Lena, who is the only female teacher in the Y. society. The immediate reason was that the former male teacher did not do his job properly, and the community therefore asked Lena to replace him. Lena is obviously a very intelligent and serious girl. She comes from a family where two of her sisters are literate and her father is a microscope technician. This means she has the strong support from her father. The two CCPY teachers, Simone and Luis, also stand firmly by her side and support her position. Simone is an important female model to her. It is quite impressive to find a girl of such a young age taking the position as a teacher. She is married to a man who is far older than she is, and her husband did not approve of her working as a teacher. Lena still insisted, and as a result, they separated for a while. Today the husband accepts that she is a teacher, apparently because of the salary she gets.

Being determined and serious is not a guarantee that she will be able to continue as a teacher. First of all, because the teachers have to travel to other places for meetings and training purposes. Husbands and families are reluctant to let a woman travel on her own due to rapes and sexual abuse. The other obstacle arises when Lena gets her first child. It is difficult to travel with children and will the husband and family accept it?

⁵ KOL reflects more about gender differences in his individual report

Another obstacle is the common attitude in the communities that being a teacher is a male and not a female profession. In one case in a community in Toototobi the school did not function because of lack of teacher. Therefore two literate women were appointed by the community to take part in the first meeting of teachers in 1998, but they did not manage to take the role as teachers because of the negative attitude in the community. The community would not accept that women held such an important position.

As mentioned the girl student is afraid to talk in the presence of boys and men in the classroom. But their lack of participation and shyness to expose their knowledge, do not always correspond with their actual academic level, which in many cases is better than the men (confirmed by field reports). Several of the women I have observed are very conscientious and manage to concentrate even though they bring their babies to the class. Some of the best female students in Parawau told us that they wanted to become teachers, even though they were mothers.

CCPY's position is not to intrude into the cultural pattern between men and women in the Y. society, which is in line with the objective of letting the Yanomami decide their own education policy. On the other hand they need to continue their work of encouraging and supporting the active participation of the girls in the classroom and make the boys accept and respect their female colleagues. There are several examples in the field reports that the CCPY teachers are well aware of the fact that some girls are clever and thus better qualified academically to teach than some of the male teachers. It is of importance that the girls and women get the chance to become literate and take the position as teachers, if they so wish. This depends on the role models they have and on the support they get from their husbands, fathers, brothers and others. As more people become literate, more members of the younger generation of women will also want to study and become literate. Consequently some will be eligible as teachers if the communities appoint them. As there is an increasing demand for more schools in several communities, sooner or later their communities will appoint girls/women as teachers. This means that the CCPY has to consider how to support the female teachers and to provide the facilities they need in order to travel safely on their own and even bring their babies to meetings and training courses.

4.4 The role and function of the CCPY teachers/advisers

From the beginning, the recruitment of white Brazilian teachers has been a cornerstone in the project (called the "assessores", in the following called the CCPY team of teachers/advisers). The term "assessor" means adviser or aide. The role and tasks of the advisers was not discussed in the 1998 report. But the intention in 98 was that the group of advisers should consist of

- the coordinator
- the teachers
- anthropological adviser
- education adviser
- linguistic adviser

An adviser or consultant is a person whose expertise is sought in specific matters, for instance anthropology, education, and linguistics. This definition applies to the anthropological, education and linguistic expertise. When it comes to the group of teachers recruited, they

were not experts on education, but had a diverse background (journalism, biology, theology, anthropology, and teacher training to mention a few). None had a degree in education. As to the qualifications of teachers, it is important to remember that teacher training in Brazil starts after primary school at age 14 and lasts four years, while in Norway the students who enter the four years' teacher training institute have the same academic qualifications as students at the University even when they teach in primary school.⁶ It is therefore a bit confusing to a Norwegian reader that the term "assessor" was used to define the role of the non-indigenous teachers. They were not experts in terms of education, literacy methods and pedagogical methods. Most of them started without any knowledge of the Yanomami culture. It is therefore reason to believe that the term "adviser" was used to emphasize their role as aides or helpers in the project, that is, to underscore that the objective of the project is to support the Yanomami in their efforts to develop their own education project through the assistance of others. In reality the CCPY teachers acted in the beginning and still do today in Parawau, not as advisers or helpers but as teachers (or both at the same time) (M. Troncarelli has made the same observation in her report 2001).

It has proven difficult to recruit non-indigenous teachers. Dedication and personal qualifications are important criteria to become a CCPY teacher apart from formal qualifications. The few of the CCPY teachers, who have stayed on since the project was initiated, have become experts in literacy training among the Yanomami.

When we study the reports and documentation from the project, it is obvious that the CCPY team of teachers/advisers has had a considerable influence on the direction of the project. As previously mentioned the project's pedagogical part seems to have been guided mostly by experience gained by the CCPY team.. Through their first hand knowledge of the field, they have developed insight into which paths that were possible to follow and for what reasons. Examples are the components of the program that have received most attention, production of didactic material and literacy training for those who want. These two lines of action come as a results of experience gained, namely that production of didactic material is a way of communicating with the Y. teachers and involve them actively in the education process. Literacy for an elite is difficult to practice when there are so many in the communities who want to learn how to read and write. This experience has molded the project into a direction, which most probably is in line with the wishes of the Yanomami.

On the other hand it is obvious to this evaluator that the project has lacked a regular advisory on education and literacy training, the need of which is mentioned in many reports. This will be further discussed later. As a consequence, the way from literacy training to mastering a second language and thereby being able to represent the Yanomami and defend their rights is very long. And this part of the general and specific objectives has so far not received much attention (specific objectives and aims will be discussed under a separate heading). That the majority of the community members become literate is seen as a first step in order to reach the next.

There were actually two options in terms of how to do literacy training in 98 in line with the objectives. Either to train Yanomami teachers who already were advanced students (in Demini) and let them travel to other villages to teach, or to use non-indigenous teachers. If the

⁶ NLM adds that " in Brazil, those teachers who teach at primary levels 1 to 4 may have only had middle school education (non graduate). BUT FROM THE 1st year of secondary school on they are required to have a degree(as in Norway)"

first option had been chosen, the non-indigenous teachers would truly have had to act as advisers and teacher trainers, not dealing directly with the students. The reason why the second option was chosen is not spelled out in the available documentation. If the first option had been chosen, some of the obstacles related to language, rejection of Y. teachers, and difficulties between the Y. in accepting that the CCPY teachers gradually changed their role from being teachers to becoming advisers could have been avoided.

The dual purpose in the specific objectives: training the many and/or the few have so far not been possible to fulfill.⁷ The reason is probably that the tasks involved in training the many, like production of didactic material, training of teachers, follow up of the teachers have taken most of the team's time, not allowing them to train an advanced group separately. Besides it has proven difficult to separate an advanced group from the less advanced, since many of the less advanced also want to participate at a higher level and it is difficult to reject them (according to experience made in Parawau).

Another main obstacle in using non-indigenous teachers as helpers has been the fact that they did not master the Yanomami language. Many of the CCPY teachers feel that this restricts their teaching and interaction with the students (cf. field reports), even though they have managed to a certain degree.

A consequence of the reliance of an "expert" team of non-indigenous teachers is that in some places, the Yanomami prefer to be taught by a white teacher than by a Yanomami. They think the CCPY teacher knows more and has more to offer than their own teachers, as the CCPY teachers in Parawau told us. This may be due to the fact that the level of the Yanomami teacher is still very low and/or that they have become dependent on the CCPY teacher in order to develop new material and increase their level.

On the other hand, the role of the CCPY teachers has definitely had many positive effects on the project as it represents the strongest link to the Yanomami culture. It is without doubt that the overall guiding principle of the CCPY team of teachers has been to be sensitive to the Yanomami culture and not impose an education policy and school model from the larger society on the Indians. The process of working closely with the Yanomami teachers for instance in the production of didactic material and encouraging their ideas and activity takes time, but is most probably the only viable solution. The question is rather whether they have taken a too protective attitude towards the preservation of the Yanomami culture and found the right balance between opening up for the influence from the larger society and at the same time respecting the Yanomami culture.

The CCPY teachers/advisers have a heavy workload, which represent not only immense pedagogical and cultural challenges, but is also demanding on a personal and practical level. They travel long distances on foot irrespective of draught or floods, live separated from their family and friends and work 24 hours a day. The CCPY teacher is a model to the Y. teachers and the role is not restricted to how they behave in the classroom. They act as mediators, helpers and are an important link to the larger society. Not all have succeeded and some have left, but the stamina and dedication of those who stay on are impressive by any standard. One example, which illustrates their work conditions, is told in a field report from Toottoobi (no. 1/2000, Lidia).

⁷ By this I mean that there has been a lack of specific professional training

On June 8, Ludian and I went to Apia hi ki for a short 2 days' visit. Ludian was going to close his activities in that community. We took advantage of the boat that was used by the health agents and climbed into it. When we were close to the community something unexpected happened, since the boat was very heavy and the river very full and with strong currents. In a curve the motor resisted the pressure and fell into the water. We immediately tried to save the motor, but could not find it because the currents in the river were so strong. After several attempts without success, we gave upon and continued on foot, we found a path that the Y. use when they go fishing.

Another example of their dedication - described by NLM in her report - is their steady effort to learn the Yanomami language, which is exceptional compared to other NGOs.

4.5 Pedagogical aspects of the PEI

A pro-Yanomami linguistic policy

NLM present the following analysis of this aspect in her individual report:

After six years of educational work it was important that the evaluation should analyse the direction in which a linguistic policy is being constituted in relation to intercultural communication between Yanomami e non Yanomami (and that includes the advisers of the CCPY, URIHI and others).

On the one hand, the whole set of members of the CCPY and presently the new members related to the PEI are responsible for maintaining a focus in communication and in teaching predominantly and often exclusively, on the mother language. The texts used didactically which serve as class plans for the PEI advisers and as study objects for the Yanomami, were produced so as to overcome the monolingualism of the adviser and permit the basis of learning to be in the mother tongue.

In this sense, the programme had to face up to and take in not only the Yanomami language but a part of the Linguistic set known as Yanomami languages. Successive teams of the PEI located at the Demini Post since 1995 have begun to study Yanomami or Oriental Yanomami and as a consequence of the programme and its geopolitical expansion they have gradually passed over into using Yanomami or Occidental Yanomami (Xamatari) so as to make communication viable within the relations established by the team with the entire Yanomami complex.

Such languages or dialects act in two ways, on the social-linguistic aspect and on the pedagogical aspect. They are the objects of study in reflective and metareflective exercises directed at orthographical and grammatical analysis. They are also used to communicate within the school and outside of it whether orally or in writing. In the latter case it is very impressive to see the efforts made by the team and its anthropological consultant Bruce Albert, to produce material in the mother tongue ever since 1996 for the contents of the courses in their twin levels of pre and post literacy thus permitting the transmission, acquisition and production in the mother language of the knowledge and topics selected so far to compose the school curriculum. I will dedicate a section of the present work to a more profound analysis of this effort on the part of the PEI.

The producing of literacy training cards was conceived as being a dialogical process between the Yanomami and the non Yanomami advisers in which the anthropologist acted as an interface for translation/negotiation on a linguistic and cultural plain (Bruce Albert, 1997)

By means of these cards, the CCPY adviser supports his verbal actions in teaching in the Yanomami school which is almost always rendered possible through the mechanism of translations made by the better prepared “student-informers” which are carried out before classes:

I have tried to work with texts written by the students themselves in an effort to promote discussion of subject matter and orthographic form (Simone, 1999)

The mental operations involved in written language and the initial logical operations of mathematics, historical and geographical registers made in the mother tongue are an interesting example of an educational proposal for monolingual people in this country following a line of teaching in the indigenous language. This is an educational scheme for intercultural situations that in the present day are fairly unusual and whose potential for being sustainable in the medium term is precarious.

It can be safely stated that there are few non governmental lay organisations in this country who find themselves at this moment, when indigenous education is being taken on officially, developing actions alternative to those of the State. And among these, there are even fewer who can count on a team with teachers and advisers that dominate the languages spoken by the so called “target public”- indigenous teachers, health agents, agroforestry agents (a recent professional category that sprang into being in Acre), and new students in the preparatory courses.

As almost all these educational programmes are characterised by the bilingual and often multilingual nature of the groups of students, the greater part of the educational agencies in Brazil today cannot manage to follow the objective of dominating the languages to the extent that the PEI and CCPY can and do.

In this sense, the PEI team with its method of immersion in the villages/schools for the greater part of the year and in its struggle with linguistic content so as to learn the indigenous language comes close to the situation of those agencies that work permanently in the field for reasons of religious faith or for academic reasons: the missionaries of several creeds and a few rare researchers carrying out studies on language.

As a result of the PEI’s curricular and methodological choices in relation to written Yanomami, all the innumerable didactic materials and the written production related to the project are in LY, whether in Yanomami or increasingly, in Xamatari, a language which has already entered into the communication repertory of the team members. Only a few of the books produced have been bilingual and up until now, not one has been exclusively in Portuguese.

The institutional policy of inciting the use and development of the language in the Yanomami school (and outside of it) and the efforts of the team in encouraging the updating of the languages under study, seek to take into account the new subject matter in the curriculum with the creation of a specific lexicon. They give impulse to a series of neologisms, some by means of loaned terms from the Portuguese and their Yanomisation and others through analogical and metaphorical mechanisms to face up to the repertoire related to mathematical and geographical knowledge as well as that of science and technology.

As regards Neologisms, there is an express concern amongst the team about the risk of the introduction of Portuguese words into the Yanomami language through loan mechanisms. Now I do not envision, from the social-linguistic point of view, any ways of the PEI’s consciously controlling the words and expressions incorporated into the repertoire of individual bilingual speakers. It is also now necessary to examine together with the new learners and even with the older pata, the problems of the processes of intercultural communication and the consequences from the linguistic and cultural

points of view. In other words, it is necessary to discuss the linguistic policies that will be adopted from now on by the School and by the Yanomami, in relation to the simultaneous presence of the languages, identifying and reflecting on the updating mechanisms that the Yanomami language can potentially develop as it experiences the increasing bilingualism of its speakers.

Bilingualism and Literacy Training

There is an increasing feeling of dissatisfaction among some of the CCPY team members and among the Yanomami in general as regards the quality of bilingualism offered by the PEI so far in the face of the challenge involved in the teaching and learning of the Portuguese language. This last is represented as being essential to the quality of contact with the Nape and shows the priority given to it by the Yanomami (as they join the chorus of all the other indigenous groups in the country) as a form of strengthening the discourse that claims the school as a place for learning the Portuguese language (even though it be under the aegis of an ethno-linguistic loyalty to their own language and culture).

That is why, in the statements of leaders, teachers and microscope technicians, an intense list of learning expectations focussed on the second language, was produced as a recurring discourse during the stage of the Yanomami's evaluation of the PEI as they expressed their educational demands.

I want to learn more Portuguese

I want to converse with the whites

That is why I want to learn more Portuguese

That is why I want to learn more geography

That is why I want to learn about the Map of the world

That is why I want to learn computers, make letters and books

That is why I want to learn more Portuguese, Mathematics,

Division and Multiplication (Prof. Dario, 13/ 5/2001)

There is a certain formulated discourse on the school and their learning expectations, which seems to demonstrate a common feeling about the school among the Yanomami. Portuguese predominates as an object of present and future interest. On the other hand, there is the detail of the importance of the Yanomami language itself (the counterpoint of the interest in the "language of the other" which appears as a kind of ethno-linguistic loyalty. The use of sentences side by side with opposite sentiments characterises this construction which has recourse to valuing the writing of their own language at the same time is allied to an opting for a functional bilingualism with a view to intercultural communication without damaging the Yanomami linguistic identity.

This is always adopted when the discussion turns on the practical demand for Portuguese and mathematics, the basis of intercultural functionality and subject matter in any indigenous school curriculum.

That is to say, the Yanomami school, represented in its initial form by its spokesman Davi, should dedicate itself to writing (in the mother tongue) and to mathematics in its first moment and as an initial priority and in second place or in the following instance (the present moment?) it should face up to the teaching of instrumental Portuguese related to a contact context.

A Portuguese that should be controlled in its expansion and have its value reduced to that of an instrumental political modality for conversing with "the whites", thus transforming the power relations presently imbued in it, asymmetrical and passive (look and request) to amore symmetrical and active stance of being equal to the whites. In this sense to become a teacher is

to become capable of teaching your kinsfolk whether near or far, forms of cultural exchange that are not reduced to mere paternalism or protectionism nor to the hostile genocide with which they have been (and continue to be) contacted.

Six years later in the course of the evaluation, Davi expresses himself once more on the Yanomami School without modifying to any great extent his original line:

I love my language. It is very important to me and to the others. That is why we need to have a school here. I thought of a school for my people. They only stay speaking Portuguese and Portuguese is not ours. Who knows where this language came from! Learning things that don't matter.....To teach the Yanomami children our language is more important remain, to continue to be spoken, continue to work, continue to walk and to use, to continue to teacher child his own language. It is not just speaking but writing it on paper.

(....) After learning writing the Yanomami is then starting to write Portuguese. This portage, it's just to learn a little...it's not to be using it exclusively, a Yanomami who learns, it's to defend his community. To talk to you, talk to the whites..... It's the first time we are altering things in the school...(Davi, 2001)

From now on, the definition of the bilingual curriculum must be the priority of the PEI clearly and definitively marking out L1 and L2 as subject matters (study languages) and means of communication (vehicle languages) starting from a social/functional methodological perspective for example.

Setting aside its caution as regards functional bilingual capacity the PEI should propitiate in a more systematic way the progressive enablement of some representatives of the Yanomami (not all we should say in passing) in the social use of the Portuguese language. It is through this that they will be able to gain access to the Political, scientific and cultural subject matter that interests them. These last cannot be translated forever by the CCPY team as they have been up until now.

The CCPY does not seem to have a vocation to turn itself into a Portuguese/Yanomami translation agency. Apart from reducing the Yanomami to mere readers and writers of Yanomami, this mechanism if it were to be followed through, would require an entire team to be available for such a task. During the days I spent in the field, I witnessed the efforts of the team helped by some youngsters with a better developed bilingual capacity to translate several texts to be included in the oncoming training course. One of the themes was the Brazilian Constitution.

Consolidating the written language

The production of written texts is an outstanding positive result of the project. The problem is if the written language is of any social use in the culture. If not, it will be a formal exercise that will fade out.

It has been a moving experience watching how the Yanomami who have recently conquered a written language cherish and value it. They take great pleasure and pride in writing, and not in any kind of casual writing, but they strive to improve their handwriting. Compared to other students and classes I have seen in other countries, the handwriting of the literate Yanomami is clear and beautiful. This is one of the reasons copying does not bore them.

One proof of the social value of writing is the letters that are produced. The students are constantly busy writing letters to friends and relatives in other Yanomami communities. This activity was particularly obvious when we came as visitors, since we were supposed to carry the letters to neighbouring communities. And there was no hesitancy in answering the mail;

the very same moment they received a letter they started to write an answer. The writer would sit on his own writing his small secretes or surrounded by colleagues and friends who took actively part in the process. The regional co-ordinator Marcos and the other CCPY teachers receive many letters. According to the information we got, the letters may be of a simple social kind with greetings and information, but they may also complain about teachers or teaching, demand more teaching in specific subject, ask for services or gifts. NLM gives some examples of the contents of letters written:

The child has a cold. Come over and bring medicine with you. (Letter to a nursing assistant)(Marcos W, 1998)

Are you in good health? We are still healthy. We are not sick. We are impoverished. There is no tobacco. Give us some tobacco. (Letter to Bruce Albert)(Marcos idem)

Letters may also inform about conflicts. We witnessed an example of this in Parawau regarding a conflict, which arouse between members of two communities. A visitor who came to the community in the Parawau Centre provoked the community because of his rude behaviour. Information about the episode was sent by letter, to which an answer was sent by another member of that community defending the person in question.

One of the CCPY teachers gave another example of the use of written messages in a community. A student wrote on the blackboard in the evening that he wanted to learn more mathematics. It was obviously meant as a message to the CCPY teacher who was able to incorporate his wish in the teaching. We have also observed how elderly people come to the younger and ask them to write letters for them.

This shows that the introduction of written language is not only a means to strengthen the Y. culture in the sense that it is now possible for them to write their own history, but it has also a social function because it strengthens the internal communication between the various communities. It is moving to see how certain members of the community through the written language seem to gain new prestige and self-confidence. It is already possible to observe rudiments of coming poets and writers, for instance the teacher Ivan in Uxixi, who spent a lot of time writing long reflections and speeches just for the sheer pleasure of writing.

The CCPY teachers have found varies ways of encouraging the written language. NLM elaborates on this in her report:

The PEI has also been able to diversify the use of writing and its function not only in the school but socially, by incentivating the production and the reading of a newsheet in each of the languages. In the year 2000, twenty (20) numbers were written by advisers, teachers and students entirely in the Xamatari and Yanomami languages and published by the Mini-printer of the CCPY: according to the co-ordination of the PEI, these materials “were of great importance to transmitting information and help in forming the Yanomami schools” (CCPY, 2000).

The newspaper is a novelty as a means of communication and registration and indeed there was a lot of effort put into its elaboration on the part of the community and they worried about sending it to each community that spoke the same language and that had someone doing literacy training (Lidia, 2000)

In the schools that were visited however, these objects were not on view or to be found as they probably end up in each students green folder after they have been consumed,

together with the student's other school material, safe from the action little flying and gnawing animals that infest some of the community roundhouses.

The construction of some structures or wooden panels apart from those already existing, would be highly recommendable so as to permit a more permanent reading of these texts and the use of them by teachers and students in their daily routine, thus going beyond the old syllable tables and drawings already opaque and faded by the action of time.

On the other hand, through the stimulus of the programme, a new line of text production connected with the school has been faced up to in a systematic and intensive way, by the Yanomami teachers ever since the beginning of the year 2000: all of the teachers have been writing up their class diaries right after class as well as the attendance of their students (a habit among indigenous teachers in Brazil that has been cultivated ever since the 1990 project in Acre and spread throughout most of the alternative education projects in the country). These texts, as part of their ethnographic nature, possess a certain value for their authors and readers serving a function for those who write and for those who read these delightful documents of the indigenous school. They are an attempt to register the daily events of the classes and most of them are in the mother tongue wherein the subject matter, the activities carried out, the number and the names of students in attendance and through which a certain narrative style comes to light which already appears to be part of the Yanomami school's history.

I want to teach writings about the crab to my students. The writings about the crab are what I want to teach. That is how I am thinking. After I have written the text about the crab I am going to explain it and I am going to teach it. The students will copy it in their notebooks. This is the text about the crab (Keni, Okarasipi, 2000)

Today I taught once more. 5 people studied. Today I taught again strongly. Although I had a toothache I taught and for this reason I am happy. Because I am making the others become intelligent (Kirão, Kioobi 2001)

It is also true that the majority of the team of advisers even though not fully dominating the spoken language make their communication with the Yanomami in the school viable through writing. This mediation has been considered as a safe bridge to guarantee communicability in the indigenous language and to assure the teaching/learning process of certain subject matters and procedures.

Due to my inexperience and lack of knowledge of the language I used only the teaching material and the mathematics cards produced in the area, the mimeograph and posters. (Marcos, 1998)

But at the same time, six years later, some of the aspects of this formulation of bilingualism instrumental in intercultural contact are maintained and remain unaltered.

In spite of the many hours of courses offered in the Portuguese language since 1999 by the adviser Clenir, the Yanomami teachers and students have not obtained significant results through the curricular activities of the PEI whether in oral communication in problematical intercultural situations or in obtaining access to professional knowledge or to knowledge of general interest. (Among this knowledge in the Yanomami representation that related to written Portuguese is highlighted as a bridge to understanding items that they put a high value on such as western medicine, and dental health or the operation of the powerful machines of contact such as the car, the radio and the computer).

In their appeals they continue to call on their allies for a more varied and diffuse curriculum based on written language through which they think to improve themselves as individuals and as a people. Thus the PEI should rethink its strategy in the teaching of the Portuguese language: relativize in the schools and with the Yanomami, the inflated value put on the written word in this initial phase, leaving aside the excessive emphasis on the conventions of written language and strengthening the capacity for oral communication in a second language without which the effort towards bilingualism will be frustrated.

On the other hand, it is well known the potential the written language has as a source of literary and aesthetic expression, as an instrument for researching and diffusing the complex Yanomami universe guarded in the memories of the old men. It permits it to be systemised in the form of written documents (bilingual) for future generations of Yanomami and to be divulged for the education of the Nape.

Also well known is the potential of the written word in first and second languages for promoting access to scientific and cultural information of the surrounding society. None of these lines of social and schooling construction of the written word has been faced up to in a systematic way by the PEI together with the teachers and students because the programme up to this point has been concentrated on the aspect of literacy training

The necessity for a curricular scheme that involves the elaboration and oral and written divulging of subject matters that are of interest, the diversification of the texts produced in the school and outside of it among these, the teaching material, has been identified as top priority by the team. The progressive assistance that the PEI should begin to receive from Brazilian consultants for the studying of the curriculum will certainly support the development of new forms of textuality (not merely didactic) in Portuguese language and indigenous language for the Yanomami School.

Towards an Intercultural Bi/multilingual Curriculum

There is a strong desire among the Yanomami teachers and others to learn Portuguese. This was expressed several times during the feedback sessions we held with the teachers in Demini, Parawau and Toototobi. NLM treats the teaching of a second language thoroughly in her report:

On the board at Demini there were questions written in the two languages, on one side in Portuguese and on the other in Yanomami:

Witipei the há esikoraha wama ki pihí xaari prarioma tha?

Witi theha esikoraha wamaki pihio kōo tha?

Winaha kaho wamaki pihí kuu tha esikora yanomae aha

Some of the answers in Portuguese have been copied here; the team translated others in Yanomami language. They show on the one hand the Yanomami's awareness of the potential repertory of school knowledge and on the other, the force of Portuguese in the context of a progressive bilingualism:

I don't know how to write Portuguese,

I want to learn Portuguese to be able to converse with the whites

That's why I want to learn more Portuguese, geography, the map of the world

Computers too to make letters and Yanomami books

I want to learn division and multiplication (Eudes, 2001)

I want to learn more Portuguese

I want to learn to speak on the radio

I want to learn money

I want to learn the map, medicine (....) (Dario, Demini, 2001)

New elements have been joined to the original discourse on the school by the present generation of young teachers at Demini and Toototobi; they maintain the strong emphasis on the Yanomami language, a sign of their ethno-linguistic loyalty, but they begin to present a voluptuous vision of the school and its curriculum revealing an explosive curiosity about the Nape world.

This discourse is marked by great expectations in relation to the development of the intercultural curriculum. The express an insistent demand for "more Portuguese" and for a series of complex subject matters related to health and other areas not yet solidly expressed

(as for example contacts in English with visiting foreigners), which could be indicative of certain facts: the programme has not offered the Yanomami in a decisive way, an effective policy for the teaching of a second language, whether in an oral or graphic mode. In spite of the number of Portuguese courses given from 1999 until today by one of the advisers, all other school actions are in the indigenous language. Observation of the poor capacity for communicating of the greater part of the Yanomami teachers, particularly the younger and least travelled ones (to courses, other villages etc.,) indicates the practice of setting up the curriculum in the indigenous language, first language of the Yanomami student and second language of the CCPY teacher/adviser.

The effect of the CCPY team's having chosen this procedure has caused up to now an appreciable increase in the bilingual capacity of the CCPY team but has maintained the monolingualism in Yanomami of the majority of the students and even of the majority of the teachers whose abilities in oral language are still incipient. These last not only demonstrate a low passive ability (understanding and reading) but furthermore, a low active ability (speaking and writing). The grasp they have of the Portuguese language seems rather to be associated with journeys they have made to Boa Vista and to exchanges with the Nape (members of the CCPY and URIHI, visitors, miners, pilots, missionaries, etc.,) that is to say intercultural exchanges outside the school ambit, than to be related to teaching/learning activities in Portuguese language up to the moment restricted to a single adviser in the curriculum for the training of teachers and of communication within the school.

This tendency, in spite of being set out as a problem in the present evaluation, when we think of the design of the functional bilingualism which the project pursues as one of its objectives, has had quite positive effects from the point of view of an education that reinforces the mother language and the tasks that are related to it. But at the same time, the co-ordinators of the PEI itself have come up with doubts as they seek to develop the curriculum, as to the potential sustainability of this proposal in the medium term:

We could have worked a little more on the Portuguese but there are many people with a very good ability in written Yanomami and we are approaching the subject matter in Yanomami.....we get a bit worried, are we going to approach the subject of geography already in Portuguese? Something that hasn't yet been worked on in Yanomami is going to be worked on in Portuguese! The intention is to work on everything in the Yanomami language first, essentially in the first language. The project has as a prerogative the presentation of subject matter in the first language. A thought that comes up now.... must everything be in the language? As long as it can be assured that it will be dealt with in the language, this could be before or in parallel.....were it to be afterwards wouldn't there be the risk of picking up the theme only in Portuguese (Marcos, 2001)

Between the Norm and the Usage

On the part of the team, the precaution evinced as regards the displacement and silencing of the Yanomami language in the school in the face of the well known prestige and social utility of the Portuguese on the one hand, and the lack of knowledge of social/communicative and functional methodologies for the teaching of a second language on the other, lead to the curriculum of the project in that part related to languages to be taught, to a kind of orthographic formalism in the teaching of both first and second languages.

Within its memory contained in the field reports, the PEI presents an irregular linguistic approach with some moments where Portuguese is taught with view to communication and expression followed by moments where great emphasis is placed on a more technical approach. For lack of a more systematic curricular orientation for the teaching of mother tongues and non mother tongues in the area of potential or actual bilingualism, those educational activities more

creative and productive in the learning process of a language have been alternated with more formal and grammatical ones insufficient for the social or academic utility in the school of this much desired second language which in the case of the Yanomami is practically a foreign language. This hesitation can be summed up as being part of a methodological conflict between two currents expressed in the proposal to

Unite the theoretical/structural aspects of the language to a praxis related to the social/cultural questions that involve them (Clenir, report on the I Portuguese Course Português in B V, elementary level, 1999)

We taught the names of the parts of the body. Why, because, when, who and how; the use of the full stop and the dash(...) we let the class go on 100% in Portuguese inspired in second language teaching methods.

As this was activity that was very pleasing we sought other songs that could be worked on in class. As we had come unprepared we only found two suitable melodies among the few tapes available. We believe that this kind of activity could continue to take place in the teaching of Portuguese language. For this reason it is necessary to have a good set of music so the Yanomami can choose those they want to study (Marcos, 1998)

Punctuation symbols were introduced and worked on exhaustively. This proved very tiring as it was difficult to arrive at a consensus due to the admixture of dialects (Luis Fernando, 1999)

The degree of literacy is defined according to a set of criteria, which categorises the students into four different levels “pre-syllabic, syllabic, syllabic-literate and literate”. This classification is an inheritance from the constructivist theory of Emília Ferreiro that was adopted in the country. I feel that such a method of evaluating PEI students is not very productive for the work of evaluation to be carried out by the Yanomami teacher and is more of an obstacle than a support to the development of the students’ writing.

It seems to be a very technical way of defining literacy, which at least requires excellent knowledge and training to recognise the criteria. If the intention were that the Y. teachers should be able to use these criteria, they would need thorough training. As is said in the 1999 report, the CCPY teachers’ experience is that the criteria are not exact and require interpretation. An example from Parawau mentioned in annual report 99 shows that the criteria have been applied differently from one teacher to another, as the number of literate in Parawau in 1998 was considered too high by other teachers.

As is indicated in the 1999 report the team uses their own definition of literacy in addition to the above-mentioned, saying that “in addition we consider a person literate when he/she is able to express clearly an idea in writing and when s/he is able to understand clearly another person’s writing”.

This illustrates that the development of a definition based on their own experience of the social use of literacy is more useful than a technical definition. We suggest you carry on with this definition as a main guideline.

NLM says the following about teaching the second language, Portuguese:

The focus on promoting literacy in the Yanomami language had its solid basis in writing the mother tongue which of course, the Yanomami students fully dominate orally. This methodology was

transferred to the teaching of the Portuguese language with its unknown meanings and forms and the pedagogical efforts were concentrated mainly on technical and grammatical questions which seems to have led to the two results just mentioned: little relevance and productivity in the learning of oral Portuguese and a very limited social utility for written Yanomami (even more so for written Portuguese).

Many of the written reports are witness to the emphasis placed on a line of teaching the Portuguese and Yanomami languages that highlights writing to the detriment of its social utility in the several social/communicative situations that require it. This grammatical or meta-reflective tendency in the studying of a language can be observed in the reflections and reports on the language classes made by all of the advisers in the different villages where schools have been set up:

Subject matter studied: alphabet, words from A to Z, join words to images, syllables, til, cedilha, new words, identify syllables, interrogative pronouns, adjectives, translation LY/L, new vocabulary, spelling, nouns, personal pronouns, phrases with the verb “to be”, definite article, gender, colours, hours and the calendar, production of a text in Yanomami on sight, spelling difficulties with p/b, t/d, x/ch, the verbs to walk, to like, to want, parts of the human body, questions and answers, the plural, useful phrases, consonantal shock, Qua, que, Qui.....ga, ge, gi.....pronunciation, spelling, possessive pronoun, panel (Clenir, Demini, 2000)

Yanomami alphabet- vowels and consonants- joining and separating syllables, punctuation in phrases, capital letters, til and addition

As for the group in literacy training, I was left owing it the newspaper we had planned to put together put which did not come about.....other activities interfered and people were unavailable for writing articlesone other subject we studied was the clock as they had requested. I left only the last part of the class time for showing them how we calculate.... (Simone, Parawau 1999)

Exercises such as copying and memorising vowels.....working on identifying them in the words listed in the literacy charts (Luís Fernando,Parawau 1999)

M, the most advanced student, studied hard the separation of syllables, vowels and consonants and read a lot..(Eliane, Parawau, 2000)

In this way the still timid initiatives in the use of written language in a more functional view of school learning and of intercultural communication, seem to be more restricted to marginal actions considered to be “real classes”.

In the two days when no classes were held, each one dedicated himself to producing letters in his own way even without fully knowing how to write. Afterwards they came with the letters they had prepared and each one read out loud showing that those scrawls had a meaning. (Marcos, 1998)

Because of the lack of infrastructure for holding classes we did not carry on to long or delve in too deeply. With neither board nor notebooks I worked on reading and interpreting using newspapers and the texts in the literacy training charts. The students worked on letters to be sent to the Patape during the assembly (Luis Fernando, 1999).

The focus on the technical aspects in the literacy training is also mentioned by Maria Troncarelli (2001). As she says the technical approach does not stimulate the students' creativity to learn. The choice of literacy methods in the PEI is not explicitly discussed in the reports. In one case "the whole word method" is mentioned as an alternative (Ramalho, M. Relatorio da terceira etapa do projeto de educacao na regio do Riahikatiope u 1998). Examples of this method and how it can be used in indigenous education are given by Maria Cristina Troncarelli (op.cit.) It is particularly relevant since it is based on the oral and not on the written language. I have seen the method practised in several classrooms like this: The children/pupils are encouraged to tell a story to the teacher. As they talk, she writes the story

on the blackboard, and afterwards she starts underlining some of the main words. After some time the children/pupils will recognise the words, even if they do not know all the letters in the word. The advantage of this method is that it puts meaning over technical mastery. The students become motivated when they immediately see the connection between the oral story and the written words. And when they are able to identify the words, their feeling of competency increases. First of all it is important to encourage free and creative writing, Gradually they learn how to write correctly. It is possible to combine various methods and to use this together with others. A teacher who does not master the language of instruction well will have great difficulties using this method, which is the case in the PEI.

It is hard to tell whether the introduction of alternative methods in literacy training would have improved the results to a considerable degree. The great advantage of the program is that the students are extremely motivated irrespective of the methodology used. But if it is considered to include younger children below age 10 into the program, it is an occasion to try out new methods. At least the efficiency of the existing methods needs to be discussed.

The Bilingual Capacity of Some

NLM writes about this topic as follows:

This entire process of choosing curricula related to the teaching of language in the Yanomami indigenous school has, as has already been mentioned, brought about special results in the linguistic competence of the advisers, teachers and especially the students. If it is true that the advisers have considerably increased their bilingual capability, the same cannot yet be said of the Yanomami teachers and students. What kind of mechanism has led to these results and what are the educational and linguistic consequences of the adopted mechanisms? The Portuguese language, apart from having been explored as to its composition, letters and syllables has more recently been the object of lexical exercises and writing activities. The basis is in vocabulary related to animals, plants etc., and in small phrases of little use or meaning for purposes of social communication, modelled for written language and supported by a Yanomami translation.

Thus, the mechanism of translation seems to have been a constant element in the attempts at intercultural Portuguese/Yanomai communication, a procedure that when used exclusively may be an obstruction and not a support to the learning of a second language.

Translation was the mechanism to attain bilingual capacity used in the missionary period of school education but contemporarily it has been undergoing a rethinking process. Translation may be proposed as one of a variety of the several micro-capabilities of a bilingual person and may be developed for certain purposes but it cannot be the only method used to study a language (or rather two languages).

In this sense I will take the risk of concluding that the curriculum that has been operated up until now in the educational action of the PEI with the permanent use of translation as a crutch, has been more effective in teaching the advisers of the CCPY a shall we say, second language, the Yanomami language in its oral and written forms, than in teaching the second language Portuguese, to the Yanomami teachers.

Not knowing the language was the greatest difficulty I had. The fact that the students were already literate meant that I could not work on reading and writing at the very basic level of words and phrases whereby I could slowly get to learn the language. I

tried to work with texts that they themselves had written trying to conduct a discussion on the contents and the spelling (...) (Simone, 1999))

These apparently inverted consequences of the curriculum seem to stem from the lack of an ordered and systematic proposal for intercultural communication in the school and in the training courses based on Portuguese. As a result of this lack an interesting phenomenon has shown up according to a personal declaration made by adviser Lídia C. during the evaluation process: the appearance of a “third Language”. This third language, between Portuguese and Yanomami although unintended by the PEI is close to “Goldminer portuguese/Yanomami”. This oral Portuguese has a vocabulary and grammatical structure close to that dialect to which some of those Yanomami are exposed who live on the frontiers of intercultural relations, and springs from a regional Portuguese spoken by non Yanomami with little formal schooling with whom they have been in intermittent or permanent contact.

It is true to say that during the period I was in the field, I did not see any goldminer acting as an informal Portuguese teacher of this particular variety of the Portuguese language (which is of a low quality by the normal cultural standards adopted in schools, and viewed as a lowly dialect). On the other hand I was able to observe the presence of employees of the URIHI and of the CCPY in the field even though they undergo rotation and they are a source of informal learning of the language for the Yanomami: it is estimated that some two hundred such people have been circulating in the area since 1999. They are responsible for many aspects of subject matter and above all of transmitting values and attitudes that are not exclusive to the ambits of linguistics or of the school. Such intercultural relations which are proper to the coexistence with the Yanomami of the employees contracted by both the NGOs are routine in the lives of the members of the two entities, in the Posts and in the villages and they have been producing a less explicit curriculum or rather a more veiled one than the school offers the Yanomami. (See Partnerships and co-operation).

Didactic material

The intention of didactic material is to facilitate the learning process through concretisation and contextualization of the concepts and/or manipulation of objects.

The production of didactic material has been a characteristic of the project since the beginning and has resulted in several booklets, exercise books and games. The production of local didactic material serves important functions:

- ensures that the knowledge produced and transmitted is locally bound and relevant to the learners
- stimulates the local teachers creativity and pedagogical methods
- activates the learners and thereby stimulates the learning process
- makes the learning enjoyable and fun
- stimulates other senses than the cognitive
- serves as a way of documenting the development of the project
- facilitates the communication between the Y. teachers and the CCPY teachers
- teaches the Y. teachers how to make the material themselves
- involves learning by doing which is a recognised principle in education

Since the booklets are written in the local language, we have not been able to judge the quality according to pedagogical standards.

The CCPY teachers first produced the didactic material, but gradually the Y. teachers have also started to make their own material. It may be objected that the production of the material is time consuming and costly and that the teachers should spend their time on other activities.

On the other hand the cultural and pedagogical insight gained through this activity may feed into the elaboration of a pedagogical plan and the definition of the contents in other subjects.

A suggestion is to take production of didactic material in subjects like history, geography and indigenous rights and even in Portuguese as the starting point for defining the subjects. There already exists didactic material developed in literacy training that may serve the development of other subjects.

As to the costs, the development of local didactic material is less costly than providing pre-made textbooks and didactic material. It is however, reason to consider the sustainability of the local production of the material since it is dependent on paper, copying machines and other factors that are not naturally available in the communities. Some cannot be provided locally and has to be sustained from the outside but it should be encouraged to make more use of material that is based on objects that are available locally, for instance material that can be used in mathematics to ensure the understanding of basic concepts (stones, leaves, seeds etc) and material relevant in geography, history and other subjects.

It might also be considered to make a basic textbook for the students, and a manual for the teachers based on the material already produced. After so many years of producing material, it is time to go through the material critically and pick out the best, which deserve a longer life. It may help the students to study on their own and the Y. teachers to exercise their function when the CCPY teachers are not present.

NML says the following in her report about “the teaching material like home made books”

Within its literacy training actions based on the mother tongue, the programme has incorporated an important pedagogical and institutional activity: producing Yanomami books for the Yanomami school (for the moment we have only the first “Words Written to Make us Well” which was also designed to be read by other groups) and although it was not foreseen in any of the original objectives, this mechanism has shown itself to be indispensable as much for the pedagogical and linguistic training of the advisers as for circulating within the school as written material in the mother language.

Usually produced in a homemade way using the printer of the CCPY office and laptop computers that the team use during their stays at the posts, these booklets are still very simple and in good editorial taste and they have an excellent cost/benefit ratio. The advisers prepare the final artwork and the eventual cost is quite small when compared to other material that has been produced by similar projects in this country. They constitute a small home-made production as part of a publishing policy for didactic and paradidactic material to attend the school curriculum and which has recently widened its scope to include the preparation of newsheets in general with satisfactory results.

But on the other hand, these results are insufficient to continuously supply the school and its students always avid for reading and literature and this means constant work for the busy PEI personnel. A list of books for the year 2000 has more than a dozen titles and a large number of newsheets in two languages increasingly attributed to the authorship of Yanomami teachers. These are cited as the authors even though the task on the team during the time it is at the office. And even though the team still has a prominent role as co-author and organiser, the material begins to be attributed to the Yanomami schools authorship and in this case is the fruit of the pedagogical orientation that accompanies the new teachers or of the presence of the advisers in the posts and in the training courses...These homemade books are linked to the curriculum of the preliminary phase of literacy training.

They only give support to the new teachers in their work for a short period. On other days when there are no charts to be worked on the teachers follow a disciplined routine of classes with a well defined and repetitive structure based on the model of writing on the board and in the notebooks as has been described in a previous section.

These products are schoolbooks for teaching purposes and for this reason do not constitute cultural works; one about adding another on subtraction another more recent one dedicated to the decimal system..... a book on vowels, another on consonants Texts for reading, newspapers, an attempt at a Portuguese teaching aid that has just come out. It is thought to bring out soon material on geography which has been gaining space in the curriculum, other material on history etc. and the potential cultural creation and expression begins to be delineated.

Writing this material has been part of the action of “linguistic research”; a self-teaching tool of the advisers and creator of conditions for the actions of the CCPY teachers together with the Yanomami carried out in their mother tongue. To be able to give classes, the CCPY teacher (some of whom are still active in the classroom) needs the support that these homely booklets offer. It is a well-conceived strategy and with really practical results for the routine construction of the school curriculum of the Yanomami school under the aegis of the adviser. It involves the study and planning of a set of texts and exercises for non speakers (who have been turned into the teachers of an unknown language) so that they can face up to their Yanomami class.

Let us remember how difficult the working conditions are when both the teacher and his students are monolingual in their native tongues or have a very low bilingual capacity. Without this support mechanism in the others written language the interlocution in the school would depend on the oral fluency of the advisers which is non existent especially when they are just beginning their fieldwork.

It seems to be generally agreed that a start should be made on selecting materials already in existence and of good quality in Portuguese, whether it be for the training of beginners in reading and on themes that the Yanomami school intends to deal with (rights, land, health etc.) or whether in cultural production of Yanomami books with research to be undertaken among those who “know but cannot write” and those who can “write but do not know” (Albert, 1997), opening up in both cases, fields of knowledge considered to be relevant for diffusion among the students of all the schools (nape and indigenous).

In this sense it would be wise to listen to the voice of Davi once more:

We are thinking of making a Yanomami booklet with the Yanomami’s own story, knowledge, and wisdom, that’s what we are going to do. The youngsters, from now on, they are really going to need this. We are going to sit down and tell them that the community is going to write History for the benefit of their future. So as not to let them forget, for them to continue to speak the language. Our language is very rich, it cannot be allowed to be forgotten(.....) We have to make Yanomami teaching books for the Nape to learn from our knowledge, for them to respect it more, to get to know our wisdom, what is nature, where the forest is born, the seeds, how to plant the seeds, how it plants itself in order to be born (Davi, 2001)

A two way education that feeds the nape schools with information on the Yanomami, as Davi wishes and in which the written Yanomami can go beyond the barriers of the teaching text (which concentrates on reading and writing techniques and on mathematical operations) and becomes the expression and communication near and far of what and where they, the Yanomami, are today or were formerly or in ancient times.

Learning climate and teaching methods

By learning climate is meant the physical, social, psychological and pedagogical conditions for learning, some of which will be considered in the following.

As is previously mentioned a blackboard marks the school's space in the communal house, table and benches for the students and by drawings, information, charts, phrases, alphabet that clearly indicate the place where teaching and learning takes place. Under the circumstances, the physical space is appealing and communicates that the learning is taken seriously. The students have notebooks and pencils and didactic material is provided.

Here follow some of my classroom observations (taking the guide of observation previously mentioned as a starting point) regarding learning climate and teaching methods:

The relationship between the teachers and the students is friendly and helpful. The teachers are not authoritarian, but act more as facilitators, assisting them in solving the exercises written on the blackboard. The Y. teachers do not have the habit of giving introductory orientations to the students or explaining the tasks. They often start the teaching by writing on the blackboard or distributing exercise papers. They usually divide their time between writing on the blackboard and assisting individual students. (The teachers need to find a right balance between orienting, explaining to the group and assisting individual students). They may also use didactic material by introducing games (bingo). I have not seen that the Y. teachers encourage students to help each other, but they do it on their own initiative. Younger students may help older. Some ask others for help, at other times, students take the initiative to help without having been asked.

In most cases girls and boys sit separately. The girls may help each other.

I have not observed that the teacher disciplines the students harshly if there is noise or lack of concentration. Latecomers are accepted without any questions. Neither does the teacher praise the students when they succeed. It seems as if the categories of discipline and praise are interrelated. A rigorous discipline is not relevant in this context and neither is praise. The children know when they have succeeded. In many North American and European schools praising is actively used to enhance the child's self-esteem, it is mediated verbally. Here it is mediated in other ways.

Despite of noise in the surroundings, at times boring teaching methods, no orientation from the teacher and no praise, the students are highly concentrated most of the time dedicated and interested. They concentrate extremely well taken the long hours without breaks into consideration. Even after school and in the evening some come to the school area and start writing on the blackboard, or in their notebooks. One evening in Kokoi u we lit the candles and immediately several students came and wanted to solve the exercises in mathematics that I wrote on the blackboard. The female students are just as interested as the boys. Many sit in their hammocks reading or writing after the school day is over. The lust for learning is great. This is related to a good learning climate, which above all depends on the relationship between the teacher and the students. The learning climate is relaxed, the students and teachers enjoy what they are doing.

There is no particular attention paid to students who are slow or do not manage. They have tried to divide the classes according to the students' level. The teachers' way of helping is often to give the right answer not to encourage the students to find the answer on their own.

Individual students are rarely called to the blackboard or asked individually. They are asked to read aloud what the teacher has written on the blackboard. In one case in mathematics I observed that the teacher (Lena) asked individual students.

The teachers may use some of the booklets made (didactic material) when they write on the blackboard, but many don't (confirmed in field reports, Toototobi Lidia Castro relatorio no. 4 2000).

There may be a lot of movement when they do the exercises, students move around and help each other. The teacher does not sum up the lesson in the end, making it clear what the right and wrong answers are.

Some of the younger students (below age 10) are extremely rapid learners. In a class of younger learners in Koikoi u that started in April many of them already knew how to write simple words.

The students produce lots of exercises, drawings and texts. Some of the texts are self-produced others are copied from the blackboard.

NLM has made the following observations of the learning climate and teaching methods: *Up to now the real (and veiled) curriculum, the fruit of demonstrative teaching and learning practices offered to the Yanomami by the advisers has resulted in social communication and interacting models and standards that are relevant to the understanding of the famous "Indigenous Pedagogy". I will comment briefly on some perceived aspects of the pedagogy established by the Yanomami in their inter-relationship with their advisers and with their students by means of non verbal communication (voice tone, gestures, body movements, etc.,) and verbal (the use of Yanomami and Portuguese). The pedagogical proposal of the PEI has sought to put a high value on the adequate socialising of Yanomami cultural and cognitive schema which are still uncommon in the schools of the nape*

It is through the teams reports and from observation of the teachers' performances during the field work period that it has been possible to identify certain patterns of communication among the students and between them and the object of study mediated by the ever patient Yanomami (or nape) teacher. This pattern seems to characterise an intimate and tranquil sociability within the school, which facilitates and supports the construction of knowledge. It could be said that teaching takes place on a one to one level with the teacher at the side of each individual student and with small doses of collective activity and general explanation of the subject.

This tendency has also been observed in the great majority of indigenous schools that have been analysed in this country wherein there is a low presence of State influence and an absence of formal models or a specific didactic line. Each student conducts his own struggle to learn in his own rhythm and within his field of interest and the teacher acts as a companion of individual knowledge largely respecting the effort being made by each one of the students, helping them when called on so that they can learn together with others (the teacher and his more knowledgeable colleagues) that which he is unable to "think correctly" or to discover on his own. (Those who are familiar with Vigotsky's Proximal development theory will know that this idea makes a lot of sense for the learning process of anyone who is learning to write).

"Teacher A accompanies his pupils and explains to him side by side.." (Lidia, Toototobi, 2000)

The Watori distribute themselves around the benches and tables according to their affinity with one another or to absence of the same, and not because they are going to undertake the same task (...) when there were separate groups, people were near to one another because of common interest or similar rhythms (Lidia and Marcos, Demini, 1998)

The use of the board was also important for the students to participate more actively/ we did exercises and called the students one by one/ as they like to help and be helped, being exposed in this way did not make them feel uncomfortable at any time (Marcos e Lidia, 1999)

It is also through the reports that we can discover the pedagogical formulations the Yanomami teachers make in relation to their work. Giving priority to one to one and side by side attention, the teachers make their choices and decisions on procedures for teaching written Yanomami more efficient in promoting “correct thinking”.

“This is what I do when I teach children who do not think right: I explain it right next to the students who cannot think right”. (Diary of teacher Keni, in Lídia, Toototobi, 2000)

“21 days were sufficient to be able to accompany each student individually and evaluate what degree of literacy they had acquired... (Luis Fernando, 2000)

For those who do not know how to read and write, I am teaching the names of the animals. Afterwards I will teach them phrases. They have learned a little of these small things. But he (the teacher) is not in a hurry, oh no. He is going to wait for them to learn to transform this into big writing (Diary of teacher Keni, Okarasipi, 2001)

In this way too, the international standards considered by the advisers and Yanomami as adequate or not for the school, enter in harmony or conflict in this present phase of the PEI, with the running of classes that are increasingly in the hands of the teachers especially when these last (Yanomami) start to reinvent and reproduce teaching/learning schemes that they have learned from the advisers.

Their methods directly mirror those of the nape teachers however with some alterations. They based themselves on the elaboration of small texts that were written on the board. They worked on reading together and individually, copying and identifying words and letters (Luís Fernando, 2000)

In general both the advisers and the Yanomami teachers put priority on strategies related to the reproduction of models for reading and writing exercises further prioritising cognitive challenges related verbal operations based on the model and using the techniques of dictation or of copying. There are also moments when more creative techniques are used such as dramatising, games and drawing.

Dictation is a good example of an activity in which a student can be the agent of the process. We wrote words and phrases on strips of paper and put the strips in a calabash bowl. Each student took out a strip without looking and afterwards read it out loud for the other students to write down in their notebooks. Then he chose someone to go to the board and write the word or the phrase as he dictated it and we all corrected it. (Simone, Toototobi, 1999)

Teacher L used the strategy of copying and reading for texts and a game of “life or death” for teaching Capital and small letters (Lídia, Toototobi, 2000)

Work was begun on improving writing..... Using texts produced in the centres, the students copied in their notebooks and afterwards read them out loud several times until they were able to dramatise a single text.... (Elaine, Parawau, 2000)

In teacher A’s class, drawing was a subject and not a teaching strategy. Other strategies were copying and reading texts (Lidia, Toototobi,2000)

The notebook was also made use of for the spatial organisation and storing of information to be consulted at a later date..... We have a good stock of drawings for illustrating teaching material. All material destined to be used by the Yanomami is illustrated by them.

These almost ritualised procedures for running a Yanomami class constitute a well marked structure of previously determined tasks and their sequel: the teacher writes on the board, the student copies, the teacher reads out loud followed in chorus by the students, the student then writes out some task derived from the activity and draws.

This sequence was observed by the evaluating team in all of the villages and it may be the now natural main performance of the school (and not only among the Yanomami). If it is true to say that oral societies use operations in which there is repetition of the structures found in texts (even though they be creative repetitions), imitation of sounds, demonstrations of activities, and that these are culturally familiar modes of learning, the literacy training methods used by the PEI (and many other programmes in the country) end up reinforcing tendency to convergence of this model.

Presently the team recognises this tendency and is seeking to overcome it by diversifying the methodologies of literacy training. Many courses are being held to discuss the fundamentals and the methods used in Brazilian schools

Some of the teaching methods are participatory and creative, others are more traditional. The production and use of didactic material, games and play makes the classroom full of activity, and allows the teachers/students to take actively part in the learning process (participatory methods) which is believed to enhance the learning process. Learning is an active process involving manipulating objects, discovering, physical activity.

However the use of these methods go hand in hand with opposite teaching methods like copying and repeating in unison without checking that the students understand. In one class where I observed from 8.00 in the morning till one in the afternoon, the Y. teacher spent most of the time writing texts on the blackboard while the students copied. There were no differentiated methods, like giving those who finished first new exercises, but in stead they had to wait until the last student had finished.

Extensive copying is a common method in countries where the pupils do not have textbooks. The students need to write down exercises and texts in their notebook in order to have texts to read. The notebook functions as a textbook. The pupils' notebook in this project is also of great importance and is used as a textbook. I have noticed many pupils reading in their notebooks when the school day is over. Another reason why copying is common in many countries is that it is a way to better the writing, to train. When they have recently become literate, they like to train to become better. (This is normally what pupils in Norway are asked to do for homework). It is therefore not surprising that the students are fairly concentrated on the task and not as bored as the observer is! (The common pattern of copying and repeating is confirmed in several field reports, cf. for instance field report no. 4/2000 from Toototobi).

Anyhow it is reason to question the use of so much time on these activities. If the extensive copying is done to compensate for the lack of a standard textbook, one solution is to consider making such a textbook. This will secure a certain uniformity of the teaching. The book needs to be differentiated and cover the needs of the beginner as well as the newly literate by including exercises according to the students' different levels. With all the booklets that have already been produced, the foundation for this type of textbook is already laid.

The CCPY teachers in Parawau and Toototobi confirm that asking questions is uncommon in the Y. culture and in the classroom. We have not observed students asking questions, neither the Y. teachers. As Simone in Parawau said, "this is a culture of speeches, not of asking

questions”. Asking questions indicates that the questioner reveals his/her ignorance. When the students do not understand, they try to find an answer on their own before they ask for help. Asking inquisitive questions is considered impolite. The children learn by observing parents, siblings and neighbours or by listening to speeches, not by asking questions.

It is a characteristic of school based knowledge in many countries that it is mediated by the teacher’s or the book’s explanations. Asking questions is part of the mediation. The teacher asks questions to stimulate the child’s thinking, check if she/he has understood and invite the child to become an active learner. A child who starts to wonder why has to make an effort to find an answer, which is the starting point for all modern education theories and methods. But in many cultures a child who asks too many questions is considered naughty. It might mean that the child starts to question authorities and traditions.

In many cultures all over the world the common teaching methods are still copying, repeating in unison and asking questions that are simple repetitions of what the teacher has already said or written on the blackboard. Participatory methods focus on the learner as the active participant in the learning process. Asking questions is part of learning how to argue and engage in discussions.

Is there a reason to introduce asking questions as a method in the Y. school culture, or would that mean to unduly invade their culture? As one of the ultimate objectives of the education project is not only to introduce the Y. to the surrounding society but also to assist them in becoming active participants in that society, as Davi K. says – being able to negotiate with the white - it seems as if learning to ask questions and find answers is unavoidable. Arranging discussions and debating certain pertinent issues can stimulate it. How to introduce these methods should be guided by the project’s objectives.

4.6 Teacher training

The training of Y. teacher has gradually become more important over the years. Although it was mentioned already in the 1998 annual report, it did not receive much attention at that time. The reason being that the CCPY teachers was not able to carry out all their other functions. They were caught in a dilemma of having to teach communities with few or none literate and at the same time take part in the post-literacy program for the most advanced. (Annual report 98).

The notion of “teacher” has been discussed in the reports (cf. for instance by M.R.. 1998) and it seems that in the beginning the expression “literacy trainer” (alfabetizador) and even “multiplicador” was used. The reason is that the teachers were not really teachers in the sense that they mastered several subjects at an advanced level and neither did they have any pedagogical training. Therefore it would have been more correct at that stage to call them literacy trainers. As M. Ramalho points out in his report, the “teachers” are just a little bit more advanced than their students are, and when the students reach their level, all advanced students are potential teachers. M.R. says that it is therefore necessary to make a clear distinction between the most advanced literate students and the literacy trainers (teachers) (report no. 3/1998).

However, the teachers are not selected according to their academic level only, but their position and status in the community and personal qualifications are also taken into account when the community appoints their teachers.

Already in the annual report in 98 it was argued that the training of Y. teachers was the right direction of the program. However, the teacher training does not seem to have been planned from the beginning according to the objective, which says that the school should be the Y. own responsibility *with the assistance of CCPY*. It is this evaluator's conviction that if the role of assisting and advising the Y. in this respect had been better defined the training of Y. teachers would have been taken more seriously from the beginning.

The number of teacher training courses has increased over the years, and particularly the courses in Portuguese (cf. annual report 2000). CCPY has recently reorganised the training courses and will start giving two major courses of one month's duration each per year in stead of smaller courses spread out throughout the year. This arrangement is strongly supported and will allow the teachers to take more advantage of the training periods, not only in terms of the teaching, which will be more thorough, but also with respect to discussing and exchanging ideas with their colleagues. As to the teaching methods and the contents of the courses, we refer to NLM's reflections regarding the training in Portuguese and to our general comments on the use of diversified and participatory teaching methods.

The CCPY team has with the pedagogical assistance of Maria Troncarelli, made a first attempt to elaborate a curriculum (plano pedagógico) that encompasses seven subjects (the Y. language, mathematics, Portuguese, geography, history, environmental learning and citizenship and indigenous rights). The proposal is a first step in developing a systematic plan for the training of teachers. It is a tremendous professional task to develop a curriculum and should be guided by an expert on indigenous education as well as by other experts. The division of the three subjects, geography, history and environmental education should be reconsidered. In many countries they have combined and renamed them. This will allow a more holistic approach, which I believe, would be more in line with the Y. school and its role in the community. Supervision and follow up of the Y. teachers are part of the teacher training and should be included in the plan. This will be discussed under the next heading.

4.7 Supervision and follow up of the Y. teachers

Since the beginning of the project, the CCPY teachers have spent part of their time visiting the various communities, teaching and supervising the Y. teachers. At times other tasks, have taken more time than planned, and the supervision and follow up have suffered (cf. annual reports 1998-2000). It has been a dilemma whether to support the communities that are most distant and backwards in terms of literacy (cf. M.R. reports Parawau 1998) or to concentrate their efforts on the more advanced communities which are closest to the Centres.

Practical obstacles have decided which paths (literally) to follow. On the one hand, the teachers who live isolated in remote places are in most need of assistance and follow up, but on the other hand it has proven difficult to carry out the visits due to the climate. By and large it is better to concentrate on the communities who are more accessible and where the potential teachers are (cf. Luis' report from Parawau). This might allow developing another model for the follow up directed to the Y. teachers': the more advanced/experienced teachers become responsible for the follow up of their new colleagues or teachers/communities that need more assistance.

The follow-up on the spot is important in order to secure that the knowledge gained in teacher training courses is carried out in practice. Regular meetings between the Y. teachers have been arranged over the years and this should be continued and reinforced. It is a way of

learning from others and more advanced colleagues, as well as an occasion for the CCPY teachers to meet with the teachers and listen to their experience and reflection. This might be further developed if the Y. teachers arranged regular visits to other schools, taking the role as peer advisers, observing in the classroom, and helping each other in the planning and evaluation process.

Mozambique has developed a system called the ZIP (zona de influencia pedagogica) that was organised during the war due to difficulties in moving freely from one place to another. It is also a way to overcome the problem of transportation since many schools are located in remote areas. Neighbouring schools form a ZIP and appoint a ZIP director. His job is to supervise the other schools regularly and arrange meetings the colleagues. Inviting the colleagues in one school to make classroom observations in a neighbouring school may further develop the ZIP system.

NLM reports that “the pedagogical practice being recommended here already takes place in indigenous education in Brazil as with the Ticuna in Amazonas and in Acre and others. A pedagogical observation card or guide has already been produced to give support to the practice of exchanges among teachers from several villages. This guide was requested and will be supplied to PEI by the consultant Nietta Monte as part of her ongoing advisory service. She adds

“ The use of exchanges and visits among the indigenous teachers themselves is ever more common in similar projects as a pedagogical policy and strategy in the formation of indigenous educational professionals. This seems to us to be a mode of education where the forming agent is not present, in contrast to the formal situations of courses or of accompanying supervisors in the maloca and which should also be considered as being part of the training curriculum. A visit between schools and colleagues of different regions could bring about great results in increasing their professional capacity. Learning about ones own school through another person’s school is a very interesting pedagogical experience for working teachers, apart from serving to strengthen the links of a Yanomami macro identity within the universe of other indigenous peoples and the nape.”

Another way to facilitate the follow up has been developed through the teachers’ diaries, where they are supposed to write about their lesson plans and reflect upon what was done. NLM adds “this practice is also widely used NGO programmes including those supported by Norway as in the projects in Acre, Xingu, etc..... **The class diary** has been in use in Brazil for over a decade in teacher training programmes and is understood to be an instrument that permits the advisers and institutions to acquire knowledge of and to accompany the work of the indigenous teachers in their schools”(cf. research based on indigenous teachers’ diaries in the book by Lindenber Monte: *Escolas da floresta*).

5 REFLECTIONS ON HOW THE PROJECT HAS SUCCEEDED IN REACHING THE SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES AND GOALS

This part is based on an analysis of the objectives and goals in the annual reports.

The general objective was broken down into the following specific objectives:

collaborate in the training of representatives (ambassadors) that may participate in the various forums where rights of the indigenous people are being discussed and decisions taken

assist in the training of the Yanomami Health Agents (AYS)

collaborate in the necessary training to enable the Yanomami to be better prepared to supervise their own territory

ensure that the Yanomami take part in the new bicultural education process which is being implemented enabling them to later being in charge of and bringing forward the education process on their own

Later a fifth specific objective was added as a result of discussions between RFN/OD and CCPY: - *Guarantee the recognition and financing of the PEI by the Brazilian (cf. TOR).*

Point 1 and 4 point at two different groups that are considered in the education process: the spokespersons or ambassadors who are intended to represent the Yanomami in regional, national and international forums, and “all Yanomami who are interested” (annual report 99) in learning to write their maternal language and speak Portuguese. As Davi Kopenawa says “it is necessary that the Yanomami know how to negotiate with the white”. To negotiate means to master a language at a high level and most of the Yanomami teachers’ level in Portuguese today is not sufficient to fill such a role.⁸

When it comes to the training of health agents, nine microscope technicians have been trained so far.

Point 3, enabling the Yanomami to supervise their own territory, requires knowledge in geography, political geography and the ethno-geography Yanomami. This objective is not yet been reached as the teaching in geography has only recently started.

Point 4, enabling the Yanomami to take part in the new education process and gradually let them take over, is the point that has taken most of the time and energy, in the sense that schools have been built and teachers have been trained. In 1998 there was a school in 11 of the 12 villages in the regions of Demini, Toototobi and Parawau (one in Demini, four in Toototobi and six in Parawau) and the number has increased to reach all the villages. However, whether to give priority to the training a Yanomami elite of spokespersons, who may act as the link between the tribe and the larger society in accordance with specific objectives 1 and 3, or to focus on the training and schooling of the Yanomami in general

⁸ Apparently there are more teacher and inhabitants in Demini who speak Portuguese but there is no indication in the reports as to how many

according to specific objective 4, is not discussed in the reports. But the reality is that specific objective 4 has received most attention since 1998.

The fifth specific objective, to ensure that the project receives financial support from the Brazilian authorities, has not been reached yet.

It is claimed in the annual report in 99 (p. 8) that there were 92 Yanomami who had become literate so far (29 in Demini, 49 in Toototobi and 13 in Parawau).⁹ The exact number of literate in Demini in 98 is not mentioned in the 98 report, but it can be deduced from the information that “60% of the 55 students were literate” (p. 4). Thus the number of literate from 98 to 99 in Demini did not increase (it is actually a decrease if we consider the exact figures: 33 in 98 and 29 in 99, most probably due to the way literacy was being defined). In Toototobi there were 18 literate in 98, which means that 31 more people had become literate in that region. The exact number of literate in Parawau in 1998 is reported to be 23 and in the semester report in 1999 27, a gain of 4. However, due to a new interpretation of the criteria of literacy, it is concluded that only 13 were literate in the region by 1999. Based on the information that the number of literate in Demini stayed the same, and there was only a slight increase in Parawau, an estimate is that there were around 33 new literate in 1999. This is totally a satisfactory figure taken the difficult circumstances that year into consideration, but it varies greatly between the regions due to unforeseen circumstances.

The total number of Yanomami teachers in 98, 99 and 2000 is not specified in the above-mentioned reports.

The three goals for 1998 are:

- define the contents of the subjects to be considered during the year
- produce didactic material relevant to these subjects
- continue the education of the Yanomami Teachers

There is no specific reference to whether the first and second goals have been met in the 1999 report. Apparently they were not reached. There are also some of the other activities planned for 1999 that were not reached (personal information from Marcos). In stead they developed didactic material in literacy and mathematics. However, the training of teachers received gradually more attention and seven courses were arranged in 99, three in Portuguese, two in mathematics and two in literacy, which is a fair distribution between the subjects.

The first goal for 1998 is repeated in 99, the others are:

- production of didactic material
- training of the Yanomami teachers
- make the regional co-ordination more efficient.

It is not defined what is meant by “more efficient”, but the intention was to engage a specialist with experience in indigenous education. This person’s first task was to start defining the contents of the other subjects to be included. However, it was not possible to find the right person, and Marcos Oliveira was instead contracted as the regional co-ordinator. Definite work plans for how to attain this goal are presented.

⁹ The figures – which are quoted from annual report 99 – are not correct. The total should be 91 and not 92.

The idea is introduced to train a group of Yanomami who already speak a little Portuguese and give them an intensive training course, so that they can start teaching Portuguese in their own villages.

Production of didactic material has been rich. Two titles were produced in 98 and seven in 99, divided between literacy and mathematics. The CCPY team produced most of the material, but Yanomami teachers made two.

In year 2000 steps have finally been taken to define the contents of the new subjects to be introduced. The responsibility for the new subjects (geography, environmental education, indigenous rights, history) has been divided between the CCPY teachers and they have contacted specialists in some of the subjects.

As is finally reflected in the report, most of the time of the CCPY teachers has been spent on the literacy program and production of didactic material. Fourteen new booklets were produced in literacy and mathematics, two of which in the Xamatari dialect spoken in Parawau and one for the teaching of Portuguese.

By the year 2000 the first cycle of the literacy program was concluded. The results were as follows:

- 69,77% of the pupils in Demini are literate
- 62% of the pupils in Toototobi
- 40% of the pupils in Parawau, totally 56%

However, if we compare the figures from the beginning of the project (annual report annex 1 1998) with the final product, the gain in year 2000 is not so big. It was reported after the two years' pilot project in Demini that more than 60% of the pupils there were literate. In 2000 the percentage is 69. The figure reported in 99 was 29 and in year 2000 30. There are four more literate in Toototobi in 2000 compared with 1999 and the number of literate in Parawau has doubled since 1999 (but this may be due to the way the criteria of literacy were used in 98). But totally over the three years they have managed to increase the number of literate by 20%. According to the goal of an increase of 30%¹⁰ it is hard to judge whether the quantitative results are satisfactory or not, taken the point of departure and the obstacles met into consideration. CCPY states in their annual report 2000 that the literacy work can be improved. One of the main problems is the communication between the Y. and CCPY teachers. "In the short and long term, it seems to us that the most viable solution to this problem is the training of bilingual Yanomami teachers (...)" (Annual report 2000, p. 7). This priority is in line with the objectives.

For the first time during the three years the project has been going on, a comparison is made in the annual report 2000 between the goals made and whether they have been reached. Many of these goals have not been presented in the previous annual reports. (see annex 1 annual report 2000 and a table regarding the percentage of literate in the regions). Future reports should be prepared according to this model, stating clearly which of the goals in the previous year that have/have not been reached and discuss the reasons for it. How the goals relate to the specific and general objectives should also be considered in the annual reports, if some have been altered and the reasons why (see guidelines for annual reports, OD).

¹⁰ Indicated in the yearly report 2000, but not in the previous reports 98 and 99

The teacher training has been followed up, the first course in geography has been given, and it is a big leap forward when it comes to the number of courses taught in Portuguese. New things that were introduced in 2000 were the production of newspapers that present news from the various regions.

6 MANAGEMENT, PARTNERSHIPS AND COOPERATION

Within the limited time available it has not been possible to look thoroughly into the management of the project. The information we have been able to get comes from the regional co-ordinator in Boa Vista and the executive secretary in Brasilia where the executive board is located, the CCPY teachers and from documents. This point addresses issues that regard the political and administrative management of the project.

Partnership and Co-operation will be treated under the same heading, as they are closely interrelated.

CCPY is a small organisation. It has offices in Brasilia and Boa Vista. The Assembly of members (Assembleia dos Socios) meets once a year. The role of the Board of Directors (Conselho Director, CD) whose members are appointed by the Assembleia dos Socios, AS) has been strengthened thereby allowing a closer contact between the regional office in Boa Vista and the Board of Directors. But the CCPY teachers do not have any representatives (apart from the regional co-ordinator) at the meetings taking place in Brasilia. From the available documentation on the project, it does not seem as if this has had a negative influence on the project in the sense that their experience has been disregarded. As we have seen the project is firmly field based and has been guided by these experiences. Their voice is heard through the regional co-ordinator, who is a former CCPY teacher. But the teachers still feel that the distance between them and the CD and AS is too great.

Apparently the communication and co-operation between the offices in Brasilia and Boa Vista is close and frequent and so is the communication between the regional co-ordinator and the CCPY team in the field. The communication between the CCPY teachers and the regional co-ordinator is facilitated by radio. The CCPY team and the regional co-ordinator are in regular contact and discuss all major issues. We are sure that the internal discussions are rich and frequent before a conclusion is reached, but the various points of view and how they are reconciled are hardly reflected in the field reports and the annual reports. It would have been of value to co-operating partners like the RFN and OD, as well as to external evaluators, to learn more about the ongoing discussions in the organisation, opposing points of view, doubts and how a solution is found.

The communication and Cupertino between CCPY and RFN are taken care of by frequent electronic communication and through visits to the PEI. The Cupertino is considered satisfactory by the regional co-ordinator of CCPY.

The regional co-ordinator's job is diversified. Apart from being the link between the field and the rest of the organisation and co-operating partners abroad, he spends approximately 2 months in the field, plans the teacher training courses, takes part in the development and production of didactic material, new projects, development of the pedagogical plan, external contacts apart from the administrative work. Although the CCPY teachers also take turns at the office, which is an excellent solution, this does not change the fact that the co-ordinator's job is vast and demanding. Due to the high activity in the field, much time is spent on practical matters and there is little time left to plan the teacher training and the curriculum. Increasing demands to extend the school project to other communities will mean more work of the same kind. The regional office is caught between the daily ongoing tasks being close to the field and long term planning which is of utmost importance at this stage. The need for a

steady education adviser to help in the planning of the teacher training and the curriculum is obvious, but such a person is apparently hard to get hold of.

The contact with the local society and the state needs to be strengthened. It is no secret that there is a lot of ignorance and political negativism against the Indians and the NGOs who support their cause in the states of Roraima and Amazonas. It is necessary to work more in this direction. NLM has the following comments:

The difficult political conditions that make up the desolating landscape of reactionary forces in Roraima, are well known. But this tendency can be the object of a counter force constructing new political alliances and making use of powerful resources such as the Brazilian legislation, institutional allies at Federal level and jurisprudence established in several other indigenous experiences within the country.

The work that has to be done has partly the character of lobbying, partly it is information to sensitise and enlighten the public. An example of the last mentioned is a project that aims at informing the public schools. A Centre of Yanomami Education and Documentation has already been set up to help form opinion among students in Boa Vista and in other States. This has offered itself to certain Brazilian and foreign institutions with a view to financing. It is aimed to form a new frame of mind among non indians in relation to the Yanomai. Steps should be taken to strengthen this part of the work at the regional office. The job might be done with the assistance of journalists or public relations personnel.¹¹

We shall take a brief look at the budget and present some major reflections. When we look at the number of inhabitants in the three regions Demini, Toototobi and Parawau (totally 708) and the total costs involved (R\$ 427.778,75 solicited for 2001) it is evidently an “expensive” project in terms of how many people who are reached. It becomes even more expensive when we considered the number of students in each region and the number of literate (106). There are several reasons for the high costs involved, one is the access to the Yanomami villages which has to be done by air, and another is that that the Yanomami are still mainly monolingual which makes external assistance difficult since few advisers/non indigenous teachers speak their language.

Salaries to the non-indigenous teachers and the regional co-ordinator absorbed nearly 50% of the budget in 2000. As previously discussed, it is without doubt that the assistance of the non-indigenous teachers has been valuable above all because it has been the close link to understand and preserve the Yanomami culture. As to a possible expansion of the number of CCPY teachers/advisers due to the extension of the project, it should be discussed at this stage in the project what the main task of the non-indigenous teachers should be and whether they should clearly redirect their work and become advisers to the Y. teachers. (Also advising them on how to advise their colleagues). In some villages there are several Y. teachers and some of them may act as advisers to others. It is particularly important to consider these aspects when the project is being extended to new places. Although the CCPY team’s field visits to remote places are valuable in many respects, it is reason to discuss their frequency considering what is most important at this stage. A redirection may give more time to urgent tasks: like teacher training, curriculum development, and information work to the public in the states of Roraima and Amazonas. Long time planning, considering how to reach the general and specific objective, has to receive more attention.

¹¹ .There is a sector of the CCPy led by Claudia Andujar and other allies that has always been able to project the Yanomami in the media and on the more global circuits. This sector (called the visibility sector) has had an important role in the forming of political and financial alliances in the national and international ambits.

In the coming period the project will need more expert assistance in preparing and finalising the curriculum. This should be reflected in the budget and would mean an increase in the item "consultant services".

Is it worthwhile spending so much money on so few people? This is and has always been the question in similar projects geared to minorities. The rights of indigenous people are part of the general human rights and the UN declaration on Education for all (Jomtien). Catering for the needs of indigenous groups whether in Brazil, Norway or any other part of the world will always be costly in a strict cost-benefit sense. I would like to illustrate this by a parallel example regarding the Norwegian education policy towards a minority group, disabled children. They are entitled to inclusive education and support irrespective of their handicap and where they live. The goal is that the quality of the teaching they are entitled to should be equal to the quality any Norwegian child receives anywhere in Norway. It is part of a human rights perspective that all children irrespective of their physical and mental constitution have a right to an appropriate education and to be included in the society. In this respect it does not give sense to make a simple calculation of costs divided by persons reached.

The information in the annual reports on partnerships (parcerias) is scarce. This reflects that CCPY up till now has not put much emphasis on the aspect. Considering the nature of the PEI and the enormous effort it has taken trying to reach the objective within the Indian communities, it is no wonder that developing partnerships, which is also a demanding task, has not received so much attention. However, it is time to strengthen the links to official education authorities as well as to other organisations.

RFN is particularly preoccupied with the importance of building partnerships with other organisations in order to strengthen the PEI. We have not been able to analyse the results of the Brazilian network, which includes RFN partners, but we strongly support building this type of partnership. As NLM says "A strategic drawing closer to other indigenous organisations in the State and in Brazil as is the case of OPIR and COPIAR and of other indigenous teacher's organisations springing up in the country could be extremely important for the renewal by the organic indigenous political forces of the internal discussions of the CCPY team, for supporting the legion of allies and for bringing up at the negotiating and debating table, new suppositions and paradigms"

The Yanomami schools need the approval of the political authorities. Links and Co-operation with the official Brazilian authorities (in accordance with the fifth specific objective) will be further discussed under the next heading (sustainability).

In the annual reports (in 1999 and 2000) the partnership between CCPY and the department of Geo-sciences at the University of Roraima is mentioned, as is the partnership between the Univ. of Brasilia and CCPY in terms of linguistics. Establishing partnerships with the Universities appears to be dependent on contact with individual professors and does not exist at an institutional level. As a result it has not found a satisfactory solution yet. It is not easy to see how this might be changed, as there are few professors at University level who have knowledge of the Yanomami language and culture. It is of importance to build partnerships with consultants on indigenous education who may assist CCPY in finalising the curriculum and develop the program further.

Over the years the CCPY has had close contact with other organisation who do literacy work among the Yanomami, like Diocese and Secoya. These are like-minded organisations that

know the Yanomami culture and language. However, it is no doubt that CCPY also needs to extend its co-operation with other NGOs and organisations. Even though the linguistic situation is different, there are many other aspects in terms of pedagogy and teaching that might be shared.

The evaluation has contributed to a future co-operation between CCPY and other organisations through its members Enilton A. da Silva and Nietta Lindenberg Monte who will continue staying in contact with the project. As for the partnership between OPIR, the leader Enilton da Silva ensures in his report that the organisation will co-operate with the Yanomami in finding solutions that support them, not only in terms of schooling but also with respect to their total situation regarding health issues and nutrition. He makes comparisons with other tribes who have lost their culture and their language and emphasises that it is necessary to respect the knowledge that the Yanomami possess in order to develop any other project. ***“It is necessary to promote a collective discussion on a plan of political and pedagogical action and not merely an assistencialist one.”***¹² He suggests that indigenous teachers from other tribes pay visits to the Yanomami schools to exchange experiences.

Another urgent issue regarding partnership and co-operation is the relationship between the Yanomami health organisation URIHI (which was formerly part of CCPY) and the PEI. At the Centres (postos) there are also health clinics served by non-indigenous health agents of URIHI and Yanomami microscope technicians. Since health topics are extremely important to all Yanomami, there ought to be a close co-operation between the two parties, which is unfortunately not the case. One reason being, as is elaborated in the individual reports, that the URIHI non-indigenous health agents are far less prepared for the cultural encounter with the Yanomami than the CCPY team. The URIHI personnel’s lack of cultural sensitivity creates tensions between them and the CCPY personnel as well as between them and the Yanomami. As NLM says in her report, the daily routines at the Centres (postos) serve as an example to the Yanomami, which have just as much educational effect as what they learn in school.

For all of these reasons combined with the effect of social assistance agents living among the Yanomami, it would seem to be advisable that the PEI, calling into action all the other members of the CCPY should put on the agenda of its institutional reorientation “the school of the Support centre” whose educational value is no less than that of the “ school within the village” (NLM, p. 37)

This important issue is further elaborated in NLM’s report (cf. attachment II).

¹² Knut O.K. Lakså also writes about these issues and has suggestions on how to improve the living conditions of the Yanomami

7 SUSTAINABILITY OF PEI

The future of the PEI does not only depend on financial support, but on the political support of the school. The political aspects are related to

- whether the school will enable the Yanomami to defend their territory (which has been emphasised by Bruce Albert several times)
- the education authorities' approval of the schools
- the Yanomami taking responsibility for the continuation of the project

In the following NLM discusses the necessary support and approval of the schools by the education authorities. This relates to the financial and political sustainability, as expressed in the objective: to ensure that the Brazilian authorities recognise and finance the PEI.

It is on this scene that some of the most difficult but nevertheless indispensable figures appear, such as the Brazilian State: within it are FUNAI, the Ministry of Education, The State and Municipal Education Secretariats.....these official role players are at the moment a long way off from the Yanomami school. The PEI keeps them at a strategic distance and has a huge degree of political, financial and pedagogical independence.

But these agencies and not any others are the ones that can gradually come to guarantee the political, financial and pedagogical future of these schools. Thus the PEI's actions like training courses, publications, payment of salaries to the teachers and supplying school material without depending on the excellent Norwegian partners and others in the international ambit, would continue to be developed with compulsory resources from the Public Treasury as Davi has foreseen:

I also need this CCPY school which is not a public one..... how is the Government going to recognise this school, Yanomami education ?...It is not the Government's own, it was I who managed to get this school. I travelled in Europe and I talked there about the school... Now I want the Government to recognise the school. (Davi, 2001)

On the other hand, the institutional recognition of the Yanomami School comes from the Public Authorities guaranteeing the political and pedagogical autonomy foreseen under the present legislation (LDB, 1996 and Resolution 03/99 of the CNE). This is the equation that has been tried out in other regions to advance in the field of the political/institutional struggle. The dialogue between the Yanomami school and the State Education Council on which the analysis and approval of the proposed curriculum for Yanomami teacher training and for the schools depends, is absolutely indispensable (a long, widespread and ongoing process which should be begun from 2002 on)

In short I imagine that the great leap forward in quality to be obtained in the second phase of the PEI is to solidify a Yanomami educational policy increasingly reinforcing its political and pedagogical competence throughout its formation which translates as the capacity to identify solutions and plan strategies for the continuance of their education. Some of the teachers and microscope technicians are already able to form a more incisive political delegation on the occasion of debates with other peoples in a way that creates a new awareness of the destiny of the schools and of the assistance programmes within the communities in general. It is obvious that to this end the reinforcing of the teaching of the Portuguese language in the training of these representatives is an indispensable instrument for intercultural communication.

On the other hand the political and cultural aspect of the Yanomami School should become more relevant in detriment to the tendency that some call technical

and formalist based on descriptive language only. There is an open window on the knowledge of the Yanomami and Nape worlds. Reconciling in the curriculum these two movements on the intercultural frontier is a task that has already been undertaken with successes and failures in many indigenous schools in Brazil and the Americas.

It seems to me that thinking of the Yanomami School in terms of the present relationship established with international or Norwegian support, is not really operative in terms of political and financial suitability in the short and medium terms. Even though the NGOs like CCPY owe a large part of their political and pedagogical independence to this international support and the original nature of their actions, it now seems to be time to face up to, as NGOs, those channels of dialogue with the Brazilian public institutions, stretching democracy to its most difficult limits which are the discussion and the practice of diversity

8 SUMMARY

In the following I will make a **short** summary of the report. The project's **relevance** (whether it addresses the needs of the beneficiaries), **efficiency** (how productively the resources have been used), **effectiveness** (whether the objectives of the resources were achieved), **impact** (long term effects) and **sustainability** (maintenance of the project) that have been discussed throughout the report are incorporated in the text that follows.

In the summary I have included some comments from NLM, which elaborate or disagreed with mine.

- Over the years the project has received financial support from Norway, it has been developed in accordance with the overall objective – of working out an education policy in close co-operation with the Yanomami. The project has definitely proved to be relevant to the Yanomami. However, it remains to be seen whether the priority of learning to speak Portuguese (stated by CCPY in their annual report 2000) as a means to be heard in the larger society will be reached. Taking into account the Yanomami teachers' level today, it is not realistic to reach this objective within the next 3 years.

NLM's comments: The curriculum that has been thought up so far favours a solid literacy training and post- literacy training I Yanomami, followed in second place by a functional bilingualism related to contact situations. As Davi said to me " I want Portuguese, but only a little bit. In first place, our own language and writing".

The PEI did not intend to offer equal competence in the two languages as other educational programmes in the country have hoped to do. Bringing in writing (first in Yanomami and then in Portuguese) to obtain its place and its social utility in a community which up until now has been without written language, seems to have been the PEI's main success (and not the number of people considered to be now literate).

Thus in accordance with Davi's voice " a little bit of Portuguese" desired by the Yanomami is coming in little by little without shocks. In my understanding, the time that remains to be financed by Rainforest means neither the failure nor the end of this (slow but irreversible) process. Indeed the problems of methodology and procedure in the teaching of the mother language and of the second language already extensively discussed and evaluated above, must be reconsidered.

By 2003 and even afterwards many valuable lessons on the mysteries of plural societies and on the language of the nape may be developed especially if the corrections already proposed are taken into account.

- The school is an integrated part of the Yanomami life, not intruding unduly into their daily activities. The Yanomami culture is however in a process of change due to contact with the whites, which also include the effects of schooling, a process that is inevitable. It is not possible at this stage to know the positive and negative long-term effects of this interchange.
- Some of the specific objectives have been reached, others not. The objectives that have received most attention are the literacy program and the production of local didactic material. Although the number of literate is still low compared with the goal, representing an increase of 20% compared with the level in 1998, this must be understood in light of the time consuming process a true co-operation is and all the obstacles met. Involving the Yanomami in the total process, empowering them to take over the responsibility for their

school takes time. The fact that the Yanomami are monolingual and that the non-indigenous teachers did not speak their language has also slowed down the process. It is not possible to tell whether a more varied choice of literacy methods would have yielded better results, as all methods depend on the instructors and their mastery of the local language.

- The political sustainability depends, among others, on whether the Yanomami are able to take responsibility for the continuation of the project. It is related to how the role and tasks of the non-indigenous teachers are defined and the gradual shift from being in direct contact with the students to becoming advisers and teacher trainers to the Yanomami teachers.
- The education authorities have not yet approved the PEI and finalising the curriculum is a first step in this direction. This refers to the specific objective: to ensure that the Brazilian authorities recognise and finance the PEI.
- To what extent the specific objective of training Y. ambassadors to represent the Yanomami in the larger society has been attained is not clearly stated in the annual reports. It needs to be discussed and specified more clearly. It is related to the school's political role and to the training in Portuguese.

*NLM has the following comments to this: (...) I do not agree with the statement that **the objective of training the Yanomami as ambassadors has not been achieved.***

Around 34 youngsters (mentioned in the first section) are undergoing training by the PEI9 and at the moment, by the URIHI as well) and are being transformed into the categories of teacher, multiplier and microscope technicians. Even though they do not yet have a satisfactory bilingual capacity, as Eva argues, they have already formed themselves into important cultural mediators. Personalities that we met in the field like Geraldo, Pipiu, Lourenço, Joãozinho, Dario, Eudes etc are potentially and even already, important interlocutors between the other Yanomami and the Nape world. They swell the ranks together with Davi and other older leaders of those who represent the Yanomami in wider contexts..

- The two most outstanding positive results of the project so far are the use of the written language and the production of local didactic material. The written language serves as a means of internal communication between Yanomami in different communities and as a way of communicating with the CCPY teachers and the outside world. Whether it is firmly consolidated is difficult to know, more texts and reading material need to be developed, but the foundation is laid. The Yanomami teachers and students are motivated, dedicated and eager to learn. The production of didactic material serves several pedagogic purposes and stimulates the written and oral communication
- The teaching methods used are a combination of the Yanomami teachers' style and participatory methods.
- The training of Y. teachers has gradually been developed and receives more attention today than it did in 1998. This is a positive development in line with the objectives.
- The anthropological advisory has been stable and supportive, while the educational and linguistic advisories have been sporadic. There is a need to extend the group of consultants in specific areas. And this kind of team is available in the growing Brazilian market for indigenous school. They may come in to support the PEI team swelling the ranks of the present consultants (Bruce Albert e Maria Cristina Troncarelli,) in the renewal of forces for the phase referred to as "post literary training" in schools and continuing the increasingly complex capacitating of their teachers. Even though these advisers may not be speakers of the Yanomami language, an interesting requisite from a certain pedagogical and linguistic point of view, what prevails at the moment is the need for intercultural communications that are not intermediated by a translation or an

interpreter, signs of power that need to be turned over to the Yanomami themselves as they gradually become bilingual.

- The immediate tasks that need attention are: finalising the curriculum, defining the contents of the new subjects, define of the role of the CCPY teachers and the Y. teachers, how to reinforce the teaching in the remote villages, and long-term planning as to how to reach the specific and general objectives
- The sustainability of the project depends on all the factors mentioned and on the training and follow up of the Y. teachers, the regular follow up from the CCPY team, the steady production of didactic material and the provision of the necessary means to make this material, the teaching methods, the relationship between the school and the society and how the school is being supported by the society. The most important factor is to form a team of well-qualified and dedicated Y. teachers and other literate persons who will take responsibility for the continuation of the program.
- The main challenge regarding the management of the PEI is how to combine long time planning and reflections on the objectives and the co-ordination of the rich and diversified activities in the field. As to the objectives and goals, it seems as if the ambitions in 1998 were too high but that they have gradually become more realistic.
- Developing partnerships with other institutions and organisations has not received much attention so far. This aspect is related to the efficiency and sustainability of the project.
- Although the costs involved may be considered high taking the low number of beneficiaries into consideration this has to be reflected in a human rights perspective. It is not possible to apply a rigid cost-benefit analysis. Catering for the needs of the few is always expensive but within the global action of Education for all, indigenous people have the right to an education in their own language and on their own conditions.

We conclude our evaluation with the following words from Enilton A. da Silva's report:

An educational action that values and strengthens the customs, traditions and beliefs (Xamanism), traditional medicine, culture and everything of worth that is good or important to the Yanomami kinsfolk, is indispensable.

If we act in this way we will certainly be helping and contributing to the strengthening of education, health, self-maintenance and improvement in the lives of our Yanomami kin.

We do not want our Yanomami kin to suffer the same violence that we the Macuxí, Wapixana and other peoples suffered through the contact process with the surrounding society. Let all their rights be respected.

9 SUGGESTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The following suggestions and recommendations are a continuation of an ongoing discussion with CCPY that started during the fieldwork, but it is up to them and RFN/OD to select those they find necessary, useful and realistic.

Many of the suggestions mentioned are already being implemented by CCPY. The recommendations cover actions that need to be continued or strengthened, actions that involve reconsideration of existing practices, and new actions to be initiated.

- The successes and failures of the program need to be summed up in view of the general and specific objectives and ways to reach the ultimate objectives must be spelled out step by step. The part that needs most attention is how to enable the Yanomami to take over the project and how to secure that a group of well-trained and educated Yanomami can take the role as spokespersons for their people in the larger society and defend their territory.
- The actual and future role of the CCPY teachers needs to be discussed emphasising their role as consultants to the Yanomami. In this respect it is recommended to strengthen the language courses in the Y. language to the non-indigenous teachers
- It follows that the role of the Y. teachers also should be considered, evaluating their role as teachers and advisers in the communities. New adviser models might be tried out as the project is being extended to other communities including training the more advanced and experienced Y. teachers to become advisers to other colleagues
- Encourage and train the Y. teachers to take more responsibility for the follow up and supervision of their colleagues in remote and small villages. Encourage co-operation and support between neighbouring schools
- The teacher training needs to be strengthened and developed with respect to the academic and pedagogical contents, the follow up and support the Y. teachers may give each other. Portuguese should have a high priority and the teaching methods in this subject need to be reconsidered. Literacy training is the best-developed subject, while mathematics must be strengthened as well as the other subjects announced. The teaching methods in literacy training should be discussed and the criteria for defining literacy need to be reconsidered.
- The planned curriculum needs to be finalised with the assistance of an education advisor and experts in the various subjects.
- The production of didactic material should be continued and strengthened considering the sustainability. The same methods that have been used in the development of literacy and mathematics might be extended to the other subjects that are in the process of being defined
- It is time to sum up the experiences so far before extending the number of schools. A new step in the process of producing didactic material might be to consider compiling a textbook for the students and a manual for the teachers, which secure a certain uniformity of the teaching. This may be done in co-operation with Secoya and Diocese.

NLM is not in favour of this proposal and has the following comments:

Even though it be necessary to continue improving the subject matter in the production of books for the programme, the methodological solution actually developed is quite efficacious. It allows for more than the existence of just one text book, it allows for the active circulation of written language with rapid response to the varying necessities of studies which has come to help in the success in

consolidating the presence of writing and the school itself among the Yanomami; many home-made books, newspapers and other divers materials will probably continue to be produced.

On the other hand, the continued use by the students of notebooks and boards has nothing against it. It is interesting, as Eva herself noted, as it propitiates the training and exercise of the written word actively practised in the construction of texts and pictures or passively practised to assimilate and fix writing in the initial phase with exercises like copying, as has been previously commented.

It also seems to me to be more constructive and adequate to maintain this permanent and continuous flux of editorial production in the PEI which has so far been the fruit of co-authorship between the team and the Yanomami, without forgetting the renewal and deeper exploration of certain subjects of interest as they present themselves in the training curriculum.

*Also, the idea of producing a **manual** does not seem very convincing to me as it represents reading material of a difficult nature due to the kind of abstract and procedural subject matter it involves. I would go so far as to say that in our western society, highly literate groups and sectors only make use of the manual when it has been simplified and may be more attractive; except when they are made compulsory as they are in schools, manuals are usually destined to the drawers deprived of any great usefulness in facing up to the varying situations that present themselves in the classroom.*

I have been witness throughout my experiences as an educator in the indigenous context, to the low functional use of this type of text among teachers whose fluency and literary competency are still at a low level.

*I do believe that some **principles and general procedures on teaching and learning** can be elaborated by the Yanomami teachers during there conversations with other Yanomami teachers in the training courses and in the schools and can be registered in books for reading that offer support for pedagogical reflection and methodology.*

In this sense, there is at the disposal of the indigenous teachers of this country the National Reference Curriculum for Indigenous Schools, RCNEI (MEC, 1998). In it many pedagogical and didactic orientations in subjects such as the teaching of languages, literacy training, mathematics, geography, are ready organised and systematically set out based on the accumulated experience of 20 years in this field and available to be read by the teacher and to assist in his professional qualification.

At this moment we could suggest that the Reference become part of the courses for the Yanomami in the area of Pedagogy and recommend its reading in those parts where comprehension is possible (the quotes of teachers on their procedures and principles in their respective schools)

- Continue the literacy program, but reconsider the goals for 2001 that seem unrealistic taken all the other urgent tasks into consideration.
 - One of the questions in the TOR is if it is advisable to let children below 10 years participate in the program. We have no objections to this, as it is quite correct that many of the younger students are fast learners. It is advisable to continue the practice of letting the community decide whether they want their younger children to participate or not.
 - Continue encouraging girls and women to join school and pay particular attention to their participation in the classroom. Encourage and support those who want to become teachers
- NLM adds the following:

A policy of fomenting the participation of women in professional training in the Yanomami forest should be undertaken with caution in spite of the tendency of this theme to be an orientation on the part of International Humanitarian Agencies. It is necessary to analyse the specific conditions and contexts, to carry this debate into the

meetings in the schools so that a reflection can be undertaken by the community as to its point of view on this matter of such great interest.

- Strengthen and develop teaching methods ensuring that the Y. teachers use a variety of methods which promote the project's objectives
- Continue strengthening the link between the school and the community, adapting the school to the community and not vice versa and continue involving the community in major decisions regarding the school and the teachers
- Continue stimulating the students' production of letters and written texts and the written language's social function in the communities. EAS suggests that writing the history of the Yanomami in the Yanomami language should be encouraged, which serves the double purpose of consolidating the culture and the language.
- It is urgent to pay more attention to the sustainability of the project by strengthening the contacts with MEC and the education authorities. Sensitise the public on the project. Consider the use of external consultants in this matter
- Building partnership with consultants on indigenous education, pedagogy, literacy and linguistics in order to strengthen and develop the program
- Strengthen partnerships with other NGOs and indigenous. This type of partnerships may be developed if "Macuxi and Wapixana teachers and other indigenous people can undergo training periods and lend a hand in Yanomami schools" as EAS suggests
- CCPY set up a partnership with the URIHI as they both operate in the same centres and bearing in mind that URIHI also runs an educational program for the Yanomami;
- Continue and strengthen the routine of writing regular field reports. They provide valuable documentation on how the project has developed. Strengthen the annual reports and the field reports by presenting main issues and how they have been discussed in the CCPY team and the organisation.
- Continue writing annual reports as detailed as possible, like the 2000 report, making it clear which goals that have been reached or not and for what reasons

LITERATURE

Albert, B. (1977) Considerações sobre as escolas do Demini, Tootobi e Parawau (setembro e outubro de 1997)

CCPY: Annual reports, field reports, documents regarding PEI 1998-2000.

Da Silva, Enilton A. (2001): Relatório de visitas ao coordenador da OPIR as Escolas Indígenas Yanomami assistidas pela CCPY no programa de Educação Intercultural

Johannessen, E.M. (2000) Memo on Mediated Learning Experience. Paper. Oslo. Save the Children Norway (available upon request)

Johannessen, E.M.. (2001) Methodology and Main findings in the PEI.

Johannessen, E.M. and Lindenberg Monte, N: (2001) Pontos a observar na sala de aula (observation guide). Draft.

Lakså, Knut O. Krohn (2001): Report on PEI

Lindenberg Monte, N (1996): Escolas da Floresta. Entre o passado oral e o presente letrado. Rio de Janeiro. Editora Multiletra Ltda.

Lindenberg Monte, N. (2001): Relatório preliminar de avaliação do PEI

MEC (1998): Referencial Curricular Nacional para as Escolas Indígenas

RFN/OD: Reports and documents regarding PEI 1998-2000

Schön, D. (1990): Educating the reflective practitioner. San Francisco. Jossey-Bass Publ.

Troncarelli, M.C. (2001): Report.

ATTACHMENTS

i. Terms of Reference

ii. Excerpts from NLMs individual report (p. 35-40):

A Escola do Posto

Nos dias que passei no Demini, a maloca, distante 3 km do posto, é o lugar principal da vida portanto da saúde e da doença da população de mais de uma centena de pessoas. Uma forte gripe e alguns casos de pneumonia acometiam crianças e alguns velhos... no entanto, a auxiliar de enfermagem moradora desta região por alguns dias, com frágeis laços de amizade e respeito aos Watoriki theri, entendia que era no posto que deveria cumprir seu ritual de cura e não na maloca. Passava manhã e tarde no posto (de 8 as 5 da tarde) , numa espécie de rotina doméstica, sem trabalho específico de atendimento aos doentes, na companhia de alguns outros funcionários, microscopistas Yanomami (que estão aprendendo já cedo a não fazer nada de especial no posto)

Estranhamente, constatei a presença de uma poderosa bateria solar montada na maloca do Demini, o que significa que todo o esforço de deslocamentos dos doentes até o posto podia ser evitado. Não entendi porque, diante destas condições, os trabalhos com os doentes no cotidiano de sua enfermidade, como a nebulização 3 x ao dia para a pneumonia, não são executados na própria maloca, para garantir saúde e conforto de mães, pais e filhos doentes e o trabalho mais responsável destes funcionários.

No posto, os funcionários aguardam (como Godot) o aparecimento heróico de alguma mãe mais desesperada e obediente aos serviços médicos oferecidos. Se considerada a viagem de ida e volta para a maloca (6 km), chegar ao posto do Demini para receber medicação pode ser entendido como um esforço desumano para as mulheres com suas crianças, em estado de fraqueza relacionado à doença. Presenciei alguns deslocamentos debaixo do sol e chuva para receberem a famosa nebulização oferecida como alternativa mais branda as doses de injeção para tratamento de grande parte dos casos de gripe e pneumonia.

Tratamento que parece insuficiente aos olhos leigos dessa avaliação. Mesmo que consigam chegar uma vez ao dia no posto, convencidas do poder de cura desses aparelhos de nebulização e da fartura medicamentosa das farmácias, não o fazem três vezes ao dia. Assim, a nebulização parece funcionar mais a nível simbólico como justificativa para a presença da auxiliar durante todo o dia no posto, cumprindo uma rotina burocrática (falar no rádio com a URIHI, por exemplo, onde a maioria das comunicações são trocas de informações nem sempre relativas ao trabalho e sem conteúdo específico). Lembremos que o rádio foi concebido pela CCPY, em priscas eras, como instrumento de autonomia para as comunicações dos Y com os nape e destes entre si.. Mas vem sendo monopolizado numa espécie de *conversa fiada* de jargões e códigos já desenvolvidos pela tradição de seu uso exclusivo pelos funcionários. Este uso funciona como uma operação diária de consolo desses que parecem padecer de síndrome de naufragos de outras praias, ilhados da civilização, trancafiados nos postos por sofridos 60 dias, quase sempre com ansiedade para voltarem aos seus lares.

Enquanto no Demini a auxiliar era apenas uma habitante isolada e saudosa, no posto do Toototobi o cenário era diferente.. Um pequeno exército de funcionários estavam no pedaço, auxiliar, guarda endemia, instrutor de microscopista, supervisor...e quase todos na casa dos postos esperando a visita de doentes, falando e ouvindo no rádio, preenchendo relatórios; e cozinhando, varrendo, lavando suas roupas, e mantendo a administração deste espaço do posto que é seu lar longínquo e escritório de trabalho por períodos curtos.

Apesar da existência de varia malocas debilitadas pela gripe e malária, o esquema de permanência no posto, não parece priorizar a vida profissional, com a liberdade de agir dos funcionários. Dos dias que passamos no posto do Toototobi, em reunião com a equipe de professores e os avaliadores, pudemos presenciar baixa produtividade no trabalho dos funcionários da saúde. Das três malocas visitadas em nenhuma delas encontrei gente trabalhando. Estavam concentrados nos postos.

Por outro lado, a situação epidemiológica e sanitária de algumas dessas malocas chama a atenção pelo abandono. Uma delas, a do Okarasipi, me pareceu um campo de pós guerra. Encontrava-se tomada por alto capim no seu interior, com uma vala de água da chuva formando pequeno igarapé de água suja cruzando o chão interno por dentro da vida de seus moradores, água permanente para algumas galinhas, paraíso dos mosquitos e da malária..

Nenhum sinal de ter sido o quadro sanitário objeto de trabalho, ou de uma ação preventiva de educação para a saúde, o que significaria a cooperação das duas instituições no reforço do poder de liderança do Abel Yanomami. Não percebi vestígio de orientação preventiva realizada por meio de uma ação dos auxiliares de enfermagem, microscopistas, borrifadores de fumaça, ou os famosos guardas de endemia Não seria demais pensarem-se aspectos ecológicos e sanitários da vida da maloca, parte do currículo de formação dos novos profissionais das duas instituições responsáveis.

Uma ação de cuidado e limpeza interna do pátio da maloca e da área endêmica, ocupada pelo capim no Okarasipi, podia ser pensada durante os períodos de campo dos assessores, envolvendo microscopistas, professores e alunos e famílias, objetivo de uma política de saúde com componente educacional e preventivo.

Além disto, tanto no Okarasipi e na vizinha maloca do Koiobi, alguns doentes de pneumonia davam a noite lá dormida a sonosplatia da carência e fragilidade em que se encontram alguns Yanomami, mesmo vivendo próximos ao poderoso posto do Toototobi onde uma boa infraestrutura de recursos humanos e materiais está ali de plantão, contratada para atendê-los.

Em suma, minha impressão é de que os postos parecem funcionar mais na contramão das boas intenções da tradicional maloca-escola do PEI, em seu respeito a língua e cultura.

As lições aprendidos no posto são, ao contrario, resultado de um currículo oculto de gestos, atitudes e valores de parte da vida dos *nape*, muitas delas implicando na negação de vários princípios de socialização Yanomami e de seus valores e etiquetas de bem receber e tratar. Uuma escola de ensino e aprendizagem do mundo do trabalho e da sociabilidade entre desiguais. Seu currículo, ainda que de forma subliminar, está ordenado para informar aos Yanomami que, mesmo em sua terra demarcada, o posto e uma ilha em miniatura da vida social onde a fartura e poder de uns relacionam-se à carência de outros.

Por todas estas razões, ligadas ao efeito da convivência dos agentes de assistência com os Yanomami, parece aconselhável que o PEI, acionando os demais membros da CCPY, ponha na

pauta de suas re-orientações institucionais também a “Escola do Posto” cujo valor educacional não é menor que o da “Escola da Maloca”.

Terra, saúde e alimento.

Parece necessária adotarem-se assim medidas transversais às ações de assistência na saúde e educação, como pensar os programas atualmente em vigor da CCPY: o de educação e de agro-floresta. Em convergência com a URIHI, pode-se pensar por exemplo numa política alimentar relacionada à gestão dos recursos naturais para atender interesse de todos, funcionários e Yanomami’.

Tanto a escola na maloca como a do posto fariam bem em começar a incluir em seus conteúdos os eixos transversais já definidos pela equipe do PEI, atualmente pensados como Terra, Saúde e Língua dando-lhe temáticas de pesquisa e trabalho para a melhoria das condições atuais de vida. Alguns assessores do PEI sentem na pele o rigor dessa problemática em algumas das malocas, como no caso do Okarasipi

Comunidade do Okarasipi com 6 famílias e 29 pessoas...só 2 famílias tem roças novas, o restante retira das roças antigas. Conhecemos a capacidade Yanomami de extrair alimentos da floresta. Sabemos que a floresta e ria em alimento. Mas o fato é que essa comunidade está passando por período de pouca alimentação, algumas crianças estão debilitadas devido as varias doenças contraídas e a alimentação que é insuficiente (Lidia, 2000)

Uma linha de estudo relacionada ao meio-ambiente e agricultura pode ser parte da formação de microscopistas, professores, alunos, indo-se além das atuais listas de nomes de alimentos como base da proposta de alfabetização. Seriam os recursos naturais, sobretudo aqueles que são alimentos- frutas, caças, peixes, raízes, etc - motivo de reflexões diagnósticas, pensando-se sua qualidade e quantidade, localização e importância para a vida ritual e social, estimulando as ações demonstrativas nos cursos para alternativas à diversificação e auto-sustentação alimentar.

As ações de desenvolvimento sustentado e gestão do território estão concentradas atualmente pelo Projeto Agro-florestal da CCPY via programa demonstrativo do PDA, MMA, desenvolvido por um agrônomo. Não parecem, no entanto, que as temáticas de manejo e sistemas agroflorestais estejam sendo incorporadas no programa de educação de forma mais ampla, fonte de conhecimento e melhoria da qualidade de vida.

Encontrei uma restrita ação de plantios de frutíferas, algumas espécies no Demini, concentradas no roçado de Davi e no Apiariki, Toototobi uma experiência de viveiro ao lado da maloca. Apenas uma curta cooperação entre a assessora Lidia e Ari foi feita no Toototobi, mais pela inevitável convivência no trabalho de campo do que por uma orientação macro institucional de cooperação entre a dimensão educativa e a de ordem técnica do projeto agro-florestal.

Conversando com Ari foi discutido

Projeto Agroflorestal. O que é?

E plantar fruta. Por que ? Porque estão as caças diminuindo e porque estão os Yanomami aumentando. Para enriquecer as capoeiras.

Atividades a serem desenvolvidas. Levantamentos frutíferas da região. Plantio sementes e mudas. Viagem de intercâmbio. Escrever manual agroflorestal...Começamos a aula registrando a conversa com Ari sobre o Projeto Agroflorestal.. Os professores ajudaram a plantar algumas mudas... Juntamente com Ari, fizemos levantamento das plantas que querem cultivar. Fizemos reconhecimentos das roças e das plantas que cultivam...(Lidia, 2000)

Como lemos nas palavras de Davi para essa avaliadora, a diversificação alimentar representa uma área de trabalho de grande interesse para os yanomami:

Quem planta aqui somos nós mesmos .O homem precisa bastante espaço para abrir roçado. Tem de ter espaço bom para ele botar bastante alimento. Não quero que aconteça como em outros lugares ficar pedindo assim manda feijão, manda arroz...

Nos tamos costumado comer mais fruta, buriti, cai, bacaba...e caça , peixe e trabalho na roca, banana, macaxeira.

Isso e o principal para fazer sua alimentação.

Tem que dar muita fruta para todo mundo ter sua própria alimentação para viver. E isso que nos pensamos..

Para melhorar a alimentação para ficar forte para trabalhar melhor, tomar mingau de milho de manha preles poderem estudar animados...fazer roçado ano que vem de educação, está faltando semente da cidade, arroz, milho, feijão. O resto já tem. (Davi Kopenawa, 2001)

Assim, parece urgente para o PEI e para a URIHI a adoção de uma perspectiva socio-ambiental para a formação de professores e microscopistas, com componentes de currículo relacionados às alternativas alimentares, visando-se ampliar a auto-sustentação dos Yanomami (e de quebra dos funcionários do posto, enquanto ainda lá estiverem) buscando-se uma política institucional integrada, de Saúde, Educação, Agricultura e Meio Ambiente.

A abertura de roças novas, pomares e horticultura o enriquecimento de capoeiras, ações de caráter demonstrativo nos arredores dos postos e das malocas, seriam campos interessantes de experimentos para o consorciamento de novas e antigas espécies de frutíferas, leguminosas e tubérculos, plantas medicinais e mesmo alguns temperos, verduras, etc (ainda que estes últimos não sejam parte da alimentação Yanomami, podem ser um complemento alimentar e substituto de parte dos produtos importados de Boa Vista para os funcionários).

Com esse tipo de iniciativa, garante-se melhor aproveitamento de profissionais, aqueles com função muito reduzida e curta responsabilidade.. Assim, alguns dos funcionários contratados pela URIHI e pela CCPY poderiam ser recrutados para desenvolver junto aos Yanomami trabalho mais múltiplo e ampliado, atuando na preparação e manejo de horticultura e agricultura demonstrativa, cuidando de alguns desses cultivos, como parte de sua ação de assistência à saúde e educação alimentar sob princípio da sustentabilidade.

Exemplos cada vez mais comuns de trabalhos educacionais e de saúde entre povos indígenas, incluindo o manejo dos recursos naturais e ampliação da agricultura tradicional, vem produzindo importantes resultados, considerados positivos entre os índios de outras regiões. Apostar no potencial dessa linha de ação implica em valorizar e incentivar diversos aspectos da autonomia alimentar dos Yanomami e reduzir o risco de sua dependência de espécies alimentares industrializadas.

Reúne-se assim a meta contemporânea do uso sustentável da URIHI com a melhoria das condições de saúde e o desenvolvimento social e espiritual dos Yanomami, aumentando seu ideal de riqueza e fartura alimentar como parte do sentido mais amplo de escolarização e da assistência.

Desta maneira, a adoção mais incisiva de uma política agro-florestal com componente educacional pode abrir a abordagem assistencial sobretudo restrita ao tratamento “de choque” das epidemias, repensando-se a qualidade e quantidade de produtos alimentares semi-industriais vindos de supermercados, e a grande quantidade de medicações, que redundam em impacto ambiental e de saúde: entre eles o lixo trazido pelos *nape* em sua ação de assistência

O lixo nape sua origem e destinação

Decorrente da entrada de produtos para a alimentação das centenas de funcionários e da grande quantidade de medicação para cuidar da saúde Yanomami, um novo mal da civilização se instala nas aldeias. O lixo. Desde as agulhas descartáveis, caixas e frascos de remédios, sacos plásticos, latas de alumínio, papel, vidro, etc os produtos relacionados à ação e às condições de trabalho da equipe de assistência são matéria de discussão ainda tímida pelas instituições (e mais tímida pela escola).

Por exemplo, o lixo hospitalar da auxiliar que trabalhava no Demini durante nossa estadia de uma semana, ficou aberto na mesa dentro da maloca exposto a baratas e curiosos: agulhas e frascos, disponíveis ao manuseio e a curiosidade de crianças etc...somente com nossa iniciativa de trazê-lo de volta ao posto, a auxiliar passou, no último dia, a carregar o lixo hospitalar feito por ela de volta. O mesmo acontece com os alimentos consumidos pelos assessores e visitantes, que ajudam a proliferação de baratas já em grande quantidade em algumas malocas visitadas. Apesar de alguma iniciativa da parte de funcionários orientados por sua instituição para não deixarem lixo para trás, trazê-lo para o posto não constitui ainda uma solução.

Apenas um dos assessores do PEI, atualmente, vem concentrando a tarefa de pensar alternativas de processamento/desaparecimento do lixo, assim como elaborar material, trazendo o tema para o currículo da escola onde atua. Iniciativa localizada que precisa ser aprimorada e expandida a todos do programa e incluído de forma sistemática na proposta curricular de formação de microscopistas e professores.

Trabalhamos com o lixo que foi dividido em 3 tipos, lixo bom, lixo ruim e lixo que mata(pilhas e lixo hospitalar) Que destino dar a esses lixos?(...) (Ludian, 2000)

Uma pesquisa foi também recentemente realizada pela bióloga da UNIR, Eliane Bastos, ex-assessora do PEI. Mas seus resultados não apresentaram ainda uma solução para o destino mais racional e ecologicamente adequado do lixo que se acumula. Sabido é que não deve ser queimado, por razões de ordem ecológica e cultural para os Yanomami. Mas, também é evidente que o lixo produzido na assistência de saúde e educação não pode ficar aberto à luz do dia e da noite, nas malocas e nos postos.

Para o enfrentamento mais definitivo desse problema, que atinge a vida atual e futura dos Yanomami (e outros povos no planeta), as instituições precisam não só refletir sobre o destino do lixo, mas alterar a quantidade da sua produção e a natureza de sua origem

Ou seja, é urgente que se dêem novos encaminhamentos institucionais para pensar alternativas alimentares de caráter agrícola. A perspectiva é melhorar a auto-sustentação do programa e dos Yanomami, além do controle progressivo do uso da medicação. Assim, atua-se na recuperação progressiva da saúde do corpo com apoio da saúde do espírito, garantidos por vigorosos xamãs Yanomami, e por uma medicina fitoterápica desativada e desvalorizada na etapa atual da assistência.