

**EVALUATION OF
THE NAMAS SUPPORTED
SAN EDUCATION PROJECT IN TSUMKWE
OTJOZONDJUPA REGION, NAMIBIA**

Submitted to NAMAS
November 2010

by

Jennifer Hays
University of Tromsø, (Norway)

Rodney Hopson
Duquesne University, Pittsburgh, PA (USA)

Willemien le Roux
Pabalelo Trust, Shakawe (Botswana)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations	6
Acknowledgments	7
Section 1: Summary of Evaluation Approach and Methods	9
1.1 Introduction	9
1.2 Desk study	10
1.3 Interviews / fieldwork	10
1.4 Statistical information	11
1.5 Background of the research team	11
Section 2: Background and Context	13
2.1 Context of San educational participation	13
2.2 Background of NAMAS initiatives in Tsumkwe district ...	14
2.3 Village Schools Project prior to NAMAS	15
2.4 Social and economic context of Tsumkwe	18
2.5 Context of this evaluation	20
2.6 Conclusion	21
Section 3: Goals of NAMAS Project	22
3.1 Introduction	22
3.2 Development of NAMAS goals	23
3.3 Goals of NAMAS project as described in 2009	24
3.3.1 General goals	24
3.3.2 General Goal 1: Rights	24
3.3.3 General Goal 2: Education	27
3.3.4 General Goal 3: Social Environment	29
3.4 Discussion: Education and rights	29
3.5 Discussion: Need for a general mission statement	31
Section 4: Impacts of NAMAS Activities in Tsumkwe District	34
4.1 Introduction	34
4.2 Positive Impact of NAMAS in Tsumkwe	34
4.2.1 NAMAS' focus on most marginalized	34

4.2.2 Leadership and networking	35
4.2.3 Contribution to a growing awareness of “rights”	35
4.3 Impact of the CLDC and TRC	35
4.3.1 Space where people come together	35
4.3.2 Professional development	36
4.3.3 Space for Ju'hoansi Transcription Group	36
4.3.4 General access to computers and printing facilities ..	36
4.3.5 Library	36
4.3.6 Potential for language training workshops	36
4.3.7 Cultural exchange visits	37
4.3.8 Accommodation	37
4.4 Teacher and principal support and professional development	37
4.5 Concrete practical assistance	38
4.5.1 Transportation	38
4.5.2 Short-term / ad hoc assistance	39
4.5.3 Improvement of San performance in schools	39
Section 5: Challenges	41
5.1 Introduction	41
5.2 Transitions	41
5.2.1 Current transition from NAMAS to Ministry	42
5.2.2 Original transition	42
5.2.3 Teacher training	43
5.2.4 Transition from VS to Tsumkwe schools	44
5.2.5 General assimilation process of San communities ...	45
5.3 Logistical issues: capacity, responsibility, reality	46
5.3.1 Food security	47
5.3.2 Transportation	49
5.3.3 Payment of teachers	51
5.3.4 School structures	52
5.3.5 Uniforms and toiletries	52
5.4 Stakeholders, roles and responsibilities	53
5.4.1 Primary stakeholders	53
5.4.2 Other important partners and stakeholders	54
5.4.3 Challenges that need to be addressed	55
5.4.3.1 Capacity	55
5.4.3.2 Transitions	56
5.4.3.3 Communication and coordination	57
5.5 Teacher uptake and training	58
5.5.1 Teachers	58
5.5.2 The VS principal	59
5.5.3 Qualifications	59
5.5.4 Teachers, mother-tongue education and the VS	60
5.5.4.1 Ju'hoansi teachers	60

5.5.4.2 Non-Ju'hoansi San teachers	61
5.5.4.3 Relations with Tsumkwe schools	62
5.6 Community involvement and consultation	63
Section 6: Conclusion and Recommendations	65
6.1 Conclusion	65
6.2 Recommendations from Report	66
6.3 Recommendations on the Village Schools	76
6.4 Recommendations for Further Research	77
Bibliography	78
Appendixes	
Appendix A: NAMAS San Education Programme Evaluation: Table of Interviewees and Participants	
Appendix B: NAMAS Supported Teachers, Placement and Characteristics	
Appendix C: Nyae Nyae Village Schools, Enrollment of Schools	
Appendix D: Tsumkwe Junior Secondary / Secondary School Admission Register Statistics	
Appendix E: Survey of VS learners in Tsumkwe Primary School, July 2010	
Appendix F: Terms of Reference	

List of Abbreviations

BERP	Namibian Basic Educational Reform Programme
BED	Basic Education Diploma
BETD	Basic Education Teachers Diploma
ILO 169	International Labour Organization Convention 169
INSET	In-service training
ISC	Instructional Skills Certificate
JTG	Ju'hoansi Transcription Group
KFO	Kuru Family of Organizations
KPF	Kalahari Peoples Fund
LAC	Legal Assistance Centre
MBESC	Ministry of Basic Education, Sport and Culture (now Ministry)
NAMAS	The Namibia Association of Norway
NIED	National Institute for Educational Development
NNC	Nyae Nyae Conservancy
NNFC	Nyae Nyae Farmers' Cooperative
NNDFN	Nyae Nyae Development Foundation of Namibia
NORAD	Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation
OST	Omaheke San Trust
TA	Traditional Authorities
TJSS	Tsumkwe Junior Secondary School
TPS	Tsumkwe Primary School
TRC	Teachers Resource Centre
TUCSIN	The University Centre for Studies in Namibia
UNAM	University of Namibia
UNDRIP	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
VS	Village Schools
VSP	Village Schools Project
WIMSA	Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa

Acknowledgments

As we describe in the introduction to this report, we were welcomed and assisted by many throughout our evaluation process. We are grateful to all of our interviewees and workshop participants for so graciously sharing their time, knowledge and perspectives with us.

In particular, we would like to thank the following individuals and groups:

We acknowledge the Regional Director of Education for the Otjozondjupa Region, Faustina Caley, for general support of our evaluation efforts.

Gerson Kamatuka, Franklin Williams, Cwisa Cwi, Bruce Parcher, and Wilberd Kudumo provided special assistance during the report back consultative meetings in October.

Victoria Goodman (Kalahari Peoples Fund) created data excel tables of Village Schools learners, which we hope will be useful beyond this evaluation.

Rosemary Rynn and Lori Jockel provided various administrative support services at Duquesne University, and Kaleigh Bantum (Duquesne) provided graphic design support.

Bjørn Hatteng (Tromsø) created the graphics for the time line included in this report.

Magdalena Brörmann, Axel Thoma and Megan Biesele provided background information and dates for the time line.

Sheldon Weeks provided suggestions on sources for comparative education.

The Ju|'hoansi Transcription Group (Tsumkwe) and Mrs. Willemien le Roux provided translation support in Ju|'hoansi and Afrikaans (respectively).

Amanda Siegruhn-Mars provided proofreading and professional editing.

Our interpreters and research assistants, Leon Tsamkxao #Oma, and Hanga Kxao #Oma, provided invaluable support and assistance in the field.

Finally, we gratefully acknowledge the cooperation and gracious assistance of the community members in the Tsumkwe district. We hope that this report will serve to assist their efforts and those of others to improve their access to appropriate, quality education.

While we gained much from the assistance listed above, as the authors of this report we take full responsibility for its contents, including any errors, factual or otherwise.

SECTION 1: SUMMARY OF EVALUATION, APPROACH AND METHODS

1.1 Introduction

We were asked by NAMAS to provide an evaluation of their San Education Project over the past eight years, to determine how the project has in its eight years of operation influenced the educational situation in Tsumkwe, and whether it has been able to increase the focus on education in Tsumkwe constituency; in particular for the San communities (see also Terms of Reference, Appendix F).

This report is based on both desk study of relevant material and field research, as described below. The educational situation in the Tsumkwe district is extremely complex, and not one that is easily “solved.” We gathered a substantial amount of data, and in this report we try to present it in a way that will be useful to NAMAS in their decision-making processes, and also to other stakeholders.

We have no simple solutions to the issues, many of which are deeply-rooted in historical, social and economic factors that NAMAS and others cannot change. However, we argue that through a collaborative approach, NAMAS can improve the capacity of the San community in Tsumkwe district to deal effectively with the massive social transition which they are currently experiencing. Based on the long-term experience that we (the consultants) have with San education in the region and / or in the Tsumkwe district, we feel strongly that a new approach to education is needed, one that strikes a much better balance between the need for alternative avenues for San teachers and learners, and the need for access to – and improvement of – existing systems. We emphasize that this dual approach is also outlined repeatedly in both general human rights and indigenous rights mechanisms.

Where we are able to make concrete recommendations, we do this. We have not made concrete recommendations in areas where we feel more research – including community consultation – is needed. We specify areas in which more research and consultation is recommended.

We would like to note that we were very warmly received by all those we interviewed, and much hope was expressed that this evaluation could contribute to an improvement of San education in the Tsumkwe district – and hopefully, by extension, in other parts of Namibia and potentially the region.

The fact that NAMAS hired us to engage in this evaluation process has already begun some of the processes that we are recommending, such as an increase in communication and collaboration between stakeholders (through workshops held to get feedback for this report), and better tracking of students (through our own process of trying to determine patterns of educational participation in the Tsumkwe district).

We hope that the momentum generated by this evaluation process, and by the visit of the managing director to Namibia which immediately followed our recent workshops in October, can be sustained and built upon in order to develop realistic, sustainable, and appropriate educational options for the most educationally marginalized population in Namibia.

1.2 Desk study

The desk study included documentation of NAMAS involvement in Tsumkwe district, as well as reference to research on San and indigenous education. Documents consulted are listed in the bibliography and include those in the following categories:

- Programme agreements
- Meeting minutes
- Project and related reports
- Correspondences
- Evaluations / annual reviews
- Statistics
- Ministry and policy documents
- Previous consultative reports / conferences
- Proposals
- Previous research on San education in the region
- International research on educational initiatives for similar populations.

1.3 Interviews / fieldwork

Research also consisted of two fieldwork periods in Namibia, and one in Norway. The first was from 2 – 30 July, 2010. During this period Hopson and Hays interviewed a variety of stakeholders involved with educational efforts in the Tsumkwe district. Le Roux joined Hopson and Hays for research in the Tsumkwe district itself (see Appendix A for lists of interviewees). The general locations and types of interviewees can be grouped as follows:

- Windhoek / Okahandja: NGOs, Government officers currently and previously involved in Tsumkwe, NAMAS current and future staff, previous consultant
- Otjiwarongo / Grootfontein: Regional Director and Inspectorate officers
- Tsumkwe constituency: Village Schools principal and teachers; learners from TJSS, TPS, VS; community members; NAMAS staff; international and local NGO representatives
- Norway: NAMAS staff including previous and current managing directors; previous project managers; current financial officer.

Hopson and le Roux returned to Namibia to conduct follow-up workshops between October 4 – 13. Three workshops were held, in Windhoek, Otjiwarongo, and Tsumkwe (see Appendix A for lists of workshop attendees). The feedback from these conferences confirmed our initial assessment, and provided further information on specifics, and the way forward. We also sought information on how various role-players would be able to make use of this report.

Also in early October, Hays interviewed key NAMAS role-players in Norway, including two former project managers who had been based in Tsumkwe, and the former and current managing directors, based in Elverum.

1.4 Statistical information

In addition to regular interviews, during the visit to Tsumkwe, the team consulted school records, counted heads in classrooms, and talked to school leaders, teachers, hostel workers and parents in order to get as updated and accurate a depiction as possible of the participation of Village Schools (VS) students in the formal schools in Tsumkwe town, and the participation of San students in general in the government schools of Tsumkwe district.

We collected what statistical information was available, including Namibian government statistics on education, and records kept by the school. There were no consistent records of the participation of VS children in Tsumkwe school that we were able to access, and what was available was not in electronic form. We gathered all the VS records that were available and had them converted into a spreadsheet so that the principal could make use of this format to keep track of students (that spreadsheet is not included in this report, but is available upon request).

The VS principal had compiled a list of students from the Village Schools that were in Tsumkwe Primary School (TPS) this year, which we made use of; we also visited the TPS and went around to every class and counted students who had come from the Village Schools, and found out from teachers about their attendance. We also went to Tsumkwe Junior Secondary School (TJSS) to check the numbers of San learners, both by checking school statistics and talking to teachers. These figures and a discussion are provided in Appendixes D and E.

The information we were able to gather in this way should be seen as a “snapshot” of attendance during the period that we were there. A more complete survey of VS and San attendance in the region would require a longer-term investigation; this is recommended. However, the information we were able to gather is indicative of general trends, and matches information we have from previous years, as well as the information we were able to gather through interviews and observations in this visit.

1.5 Background of the research team

Finally, it should be noted that the three consultants all have extensive background in the field. Although our analysis is based primarily upon the feedback that we received during field research for this evaluation in July and October 2010, our combined experience also provided insight into the deeper issues, historical factors, and the general regional and national context. Our existing relationships with other stakeholders also facilitated access to information. Following is a brief description of the research team.

Dr Jennifer Hays is an anthropologist who has been working on educational issues for the San in southern Africa since 1998. Between 2000 – 2002 she conducted two years of fieldwork in Namibia, including one year of work as a regional San education consultant and one year of intensive fieldwork in the Tsumkwe district, focusing primarily on the relationship between the Nyae Nyae community, the Village Schools, and the government schools in Tsumkwe. She has also been involved in numerous other conferences and projects focusing on San education in southern Africa. She is currently a

research fellow in comparative indigenous studies at the University of Tromsø, Norway, and has made annual visits to the Tsumkwe district since 2007.

Dr Rodney Hopson is trained in educational evaluation and sociolinguistics with a specific focus on comparative language educational reform. Since 1991, he has been involved in a number of research projects related to the socio-economic development of Namibia. Since 2001, he has been conducting fieldwork in the Nyae Nyae area and in the Owamboland area focusing on educational language development and larger issues related to language policy in post-apartheid Namibia. He has served as Fulbright Scholar at the University of Namibia in 2001 in the Department of Educational Foundations and Management.

Mrs Willemien le Roux has been involved with initiating and implementing development projects in San communities in Botswana since 1986. She was the co-founder of Kuru Development Trust (1989), a multi-faceted San community development programme in Ghanzi district, Botswana. She has also founded three education projects that serve San and other minority communities in Botswana. At the regional level she has been involved with research and large-scale project design focusing specifically on San language and education issues in Botswana, Namibia and South Africa, including fieldwork in the Tsumkwe district. Her report *Torn Apart* (1999) which describes educational problems for San in the region, is widely known and referred to in the field of San education.

In addition, the research team included two Jul'hoan translators / research assistants, Mr Leon Tsamkxao #Oma, and Mr Hanga Kxao #Oma. These two knowledgeable and capable men were invaluable assets to our team. Their understanding of local dynamics and relationships helped us to locate and meet with the people we needed to, and their insights into the issues we were researching contributed to our comprehension of the complexity. They are highly skilled translators and facilitators of group interviews and workshops, and excellent team members.

SECTION 2: BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

2. 1 Context of San educational participation

The problems confronting the San in the Tsumkwe district are present for San communities throughout southern Africa. San communities participate less than any other group in the education systems of all the countries that they live in. Government and non-government organizations (NGOs) in Botswana, South Africa, and Namibia have invested funds, materials, and other resources, and tried various approaches to incorporating San learners into existing mainstream education systems (LeRoux 1999, 2002; Saugestad 2000; Hays 2007; Hopson and Hays 2008). Across the region we see very small steps towards achieving some measure of success for San communities in the mainstream systems. While the numbers of San children accessing some schooling are going up slowly, the drop out rates are extremely high.

For example, recent government figures for Namibia show that out of the total enrollment of San learners in Namibia's schools (6,942), 67% are in lower primary (grades 1-3), and 21.6% in upper primary (grades 4-6); only 7% of all San students in school are in secondary school; of these less than 1% are in senior secondary (EMIS 2009:40). In Botswana, school statistics are not disaggregated by ethnic group or language, but a recent survey found that in the freehold farms of Gantsi Farm Block (where most of the farm workers are San), 60% of children aged 6-10, and 55% of children aged 11-15 were not in school (Thuto Isago 2010). The San are commonly known among government officials in both these countries as “the most difficult” group to work with when it comes to educational initiatives. NAMAS' activities in the area must be seen in this context, and an evaluation of their activities must be both written and read with the broader situation in mind.

Furthermore, over the years, there has been a great deal of NGO and donor attention on the Tsumkwe district; there are many actors involved in the area. In particular, there has been a specific focus on education, especially through the Village Schools Project (VSP) begun in 1992 (described below). Despite this attention, educational participation among Jul'hoansi has increased very little. The !Kung have fared somewhat better, and have higher levels of representation in the mainstream schools than the Jul'hoansi; however at rates that are still far lower than average. Given the depth and breadth of the problem, it should not be expected that NAMAS could, in eight years, produce significant “educational results” in terms of increasing participation in government schools – especially with limited staff on the ground and without attention to the quality of the school in Tsumkwe, or to underlying problems affecting education. However, with careful attention to community participation and to improving the educational options available, we feel that it is possible to improve the options that the Tsumkwe community has available to them.

2.2 Background of NAMAS educational initiatives in Tsumkwe district

NAMAS has been active in Namibia for 30 years, as of June this year (2010). In 2002, after experiencing success with the Ondao Mobile Schools Project, NAMAS decided to look into the situation of education for the San, and commissioned a desk study by Bernt Lund. In the resulting report, *Mainstreaming Through Affirmative Action* (2002), Lund provides an update on the situation for San in Namibia, with special attention to: primary level education; strengthening teacher qualifications and skills; and the establishment of a teachers resource centre. The main objective described in this report is the development of a Teachers Resource Centre (TRC) in Tsumkwe, in order to: provide support to San principals, teachers and student teachers; facilitate mother-tongue materials development; build capacity in the community for education and literacy promotion; and address legal issues.

In 2003, a consultative conference was held, which resulted in a proposal to develop TRCs in Mangetti Dune and Tsumkwe, to increase parental partnership, and to establish a steering committee. Partners identified included the Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa (WIMSA), the Legal Assistant Centre (LAC), the National Institute for Educational Development (NIED), the (then) Ministry of Basic Education, Sport and Culture (MBESC), and the Intersectoral Task Force on Educationally Marginalised Children (now defunct). The first coordinator, Trine Wengen, arrived towards the end of 2003, and was based in Tsumkwe; she stayed for five years. In early 2008, a teacher advisor, Wilhelm Jan, was hired to provide increased support to the teachers. In the middle of 2008, a new project coordinator, Jenny Beate Møller took over. In November 2009, NAMAS announced to the Regional Education Office that they would be ending the position of project coordinator as of mid-2010, and that the Ministry would be taking over salaries of the teachers that NAMAS had been supporting. After some negotiation, it was agreed that NAMAS would continue with support for some salaries, including two local positions – a national project coordinator and a teacher advisor, Bruce Parcher, who began in late 2009. In May 2010 Ms Møller's position was ended, and in September 2010 a local Namibian project coordinator, Franklin Williams, was hired and is based in Otjiwarongo. NAMAS' current agreement with the Ministry of Education is through 2012, and the possibilities for future support are still under consideration.

The original project coordinator spent a few months familiarizing herself with the issues in Tsumkwe; her position was purposefully vague, to allow her time to work out what the dynamics were and how best to approach the situation (see also section 3 on goals). At this time, the Ministry of Education was in the process of assuming responsibility for the VSP, and NAMAS committed to support the Ministry in this task. It was not clear at first what their involvement should be with the VSP, and part of Trine's initial brief was to determine where the Ministry needed support in fulfilling their responsibility in Tsumkwe district. The most concrete focus was the establishment of the Community Learning and Development Center (CLDC). However, their support of the Village Schools also quickly became a very visible and ongoing area of activity for NAMAS. The background context of the VSP is thus relevant to this report and will be briefly described in the section below.

Before continuing, we would like to draw attention to the fact that there have been numerous role-players involved in the Tsumkwe district in general, and with Nyae Nyae and the VSP in particular.

These role-players have shifted around over the past 20 years, and there have been points of intense transition. The time line (following page) provides a picture of this involvement. It was not possible to include all the relevant events or role-players on this time line, but we hope this illustration can serve as both a reference and a representation. In particular, it is a reminder that it is the Nyae Nyae community that is the most stable stakeholder – and also the most vulnerable to decisions made by parties who will not, generally, have to experience the effects of those decisions personally. This should be kept in mind in all decision-making processes.

We have not created a similar time line for Tsumkwe West and N#a Jaqna conservancy. However, the same point made by the time line and in the above paragraph applies also to that part of the district – the absolute need for community involvement and recognition of historical, economic, and social context.

2.3 Village Schools Project prior to NAMAS

An important element of the background in the Tsumkwe district is the fact that, when NAMAS began working in the area, there was an educational intervention that had already been in process for over ten years – the Village Schools Project (which became the Village Schools, when the Ministry took over in 2003). This project was founded in an educational philosophy that emphasized mother-tongue, community-based education, and had clearly outlined goals.

We found during our consultancy that, on the part of government officials in particular, understandings of the background of the VSP were mixed. The predominant responses were either that a) NAMAS had started the VSP, or that b) the VSP had not been conceived / managed / developed properly before NAMAS and the Ministry took over (this is not true; the Ministry was involved in discussions from the beginning. See below, and time line). We also found that NAMAS employees felt generally uninformed about the history of the Village Schools, and the relationships among the key stakeholders (the Ministry, the Regional Office, the various NGOs and the community itself). However, the Nyae Nyae community is very well aware of the origins and process of the Village Schools, and they are the only stakeholders who have been around to experience *all* the transitions. It is thus important for any organization involved with the Village Schools to have an understanding of the background.

Before the implementation of the VSP in 1992, children from the 35 villages of the Nyae Nyae area who attended school stayed in hostels at the government school in the town of Tsumkwe. They were taught mostly in Afrikaans by teachers from other ethnic groups. Physical abuse at the hostels was reported to be common and the methods of instruction and discipline were alien to the Ju|'hoan children. Attendance of Ju|'hoan children at the government schools in Tsumkwe district was low and inconsistent, and almost all children who did begin school dropped out; most long before attaining any certificates (Kann 1991; Pfaffe 1995). The VSP grew out of a collaborative effort between the Nyae Nyae Farmers' Co-operative (NNFC), the grassroots organization that has been since absorbed by the Nyae Nyae Conservancy (NNC) and the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation of Namibia (NNDNFN), a Windhoek-based support organization, as a response to this high and early drop-out rate among Ju|'hoan children. In cooperation with the Ministry of Education and Culture (now MBESC), training of Ju|'hoansi teachers was begun in 1992 and the inauguration of the VS took place in March 1994 (see time line).

The development of the Village Schools was meant to create a safer, more familiar and more comfortable environment in which the children could learn in their own languages about things relevant to their lives, close to their homes and families. Parents and other relations were expected to participate actively and thus incorporate cultural activities into the learning experience. Although the focus was on providing schooling closer to home and incorporating the home language, knowledge and skills of the communities, the goal of preparing children to be successful in the government schools was central to the project. The ultimate aim was to increase the self-confidence of the learners and the communities, so that Ju|'hoan children could enter the government schools in grade 4 with a firm grounding in their own culture as well as with other necessary skills to succeed in the mainstream environment.

The dual goals of building upon local culture and simultaneously promoting greater access to the mainstream education system was an attractive package, and the Nyae Nyae VSP quickly became recognized nationally, regionally, and internationally as a cutting-edge education project for an indigenous minority. The NNFC and the NNDFN, whose holistic approach to community development made them attractive to donors, both received substantial funding throughout the 1980s and 1990s. The vision and support of NNFC and NNDFN greatly facilitated the creation of the VSP and also meant that the education project was situated within a broader vision that incorporated aspects of the Nyae Nyae development programme into the training of teachers. The teachers themselves worked to incorporate both traditional knowledge and current community issues into the curriculum. In addition to the communities and their NGOs, a number of other important actors have been involved with the VSP. Several consultants and researchers have worked with the community throughout the course of the project, including linguists, anthropologists and education experts.

The linguistic work of the late Patrick Dickens with the Nyae Nyae community was a crucial element (Dickens 1992a, 1992b, 2005). As a result of his work, the Ju|'hoansi orthography was ready for development by Namibian independence in 1990. This preparation, combined with the new government's commitment to mother-tongue education during the first three years of school, resulted in the acceptance of the Ju|'hoansi language under the Namibian Basic Educational Reform Programme (BERP) as the medium for a pilot project in curriculum development for five years (1991-1996). A number of other researchers and educationalists also contributed to the early design and implementation of the project, including Ulla Kann (1991), Megan Biesele (1992, 1993a), Melissa Heckler (1992), Joachim Pfaffe (1995) and Magdalena Brörmann (1993-1994).

The “cardinal objectives” of the VSP, as described in the 1993 and 1994 annual reports (Brörmann) and other documentation are as follows:

- To use the Ju|'hoansi language as the medium of instruction at Village Schools
- To train Ju|'hoan teachers as educators of their own people
- To develop a relevant curriculum and curricular materials in consultation with communities
- To continue building, on request, school facilities close to villages so that the young learners can learn and live in their own familiar environment during their first three years of school
- To enable Ju|'hoan children to join government schools in grade 4 as confident and critically-thinking learners.

Although the project was begun by the community and related NGOs, it was decided early on that the Ministry should ultimately take over the project. One reason for this decision was that in newly independent Namibia, it was important that the goal not be (or even appear to be) separation or isolation of a particular ethnic group. Another important reason was sustainability, and this became clearer as the project went on. Donors are not willing to fund projects indefinitely, and the education of citizens is considered to be a responsibility of the national government. While the transition from a private project to government school was considered an inevitable one for the VSP, from the beginning it was recognized that the process would not be easy. Consultancy reports and internal documents emphasized that in the transition process there was a need for continuity, the cultivation of Ju|'hoan teachers, formal and informal links with Tsumkwe schools, and careful consultation with the communities (Kann 1991; Swarts and Avenstrup 1995; Brörmann and Pfaffe 1995a, 1995b).

The current director of Kalahari Peoples Fund (KPF), Megan Biesele, was among those who spearheaded the VSP. In recent interviews, she described the knowledge that the project would have to transition to a government school as an issue that was “hanging over our head, like an axe...” She referred to the sense that the project needed a longer time to grow and develop before being subjected to the rigid requirements of the government system. Although there was an acceptance on the part of the Ministry of mother-tongue education, and an enthusiasm for including a San language in the BERP, there was also a wariness about a project that might appear to be providing “special” or “separate” education. An element of mainstreaming was thus incorporated into the project at every level. In many ways, this worked against the development of community involvement and other key components of the original project (interview with Megan Biesele, 16 July 2010; see also Hays 2007).

The actual hand-over of the project from the NNDFN to the government occurred in 2003, a year that was marked by a number of transitions that impacted San education. This was the year that NAMAS held a conference to determine how to support San education in Tsumkwe district, in the first part of the year, and decided to include support of the Village Schools in its activities in Tsumkwe. In 2003, in compliance with the central government's policy of decentralization, the Ministry established regional directorships of education in the country's 13 regions. Tsumkwe constituency is in the Otjozondjupa region, whose headquarters are in Otjiwarongo (500 km from Tsumkwe). Thus the Ministry itself was in the midst of a major upheaval as new positions were created, responsibilities were transferred and redefined, and a physical reshuffling of offices took place. In this process, there was very little transfer of information about the Village Schools to the new regional offices who would now be responsible for administering them. The Regional Director of Education in the Otjozondjupa region, who began in 2003, described it in this way:

I don't know what programme they [the VSP] offered...when we went to Tsumkwe, it was like starting from scratch. We did not find them there. They told me there was a lady who was the last person there...If they did any kind of transition, it was at the head office. For us, we did not hear anything.

- Regional Director, 12 July 2010

These transitions thus meant big shifts in approach towards the Village Schools, often without full understanding of what this meant for community members, including the VS teachers (see also section 5.2 on transitions). Thus NAMAS involvement with education in Tsumkwe began during a period of intense transition, during which much continuity was lost.

Currently there is discussion among stakeholders (including NAMAS, government, and the community) about the way forward for the Village Schools. We make the argument in this report that alternative models for educational initiatives in the Tsumkwe district need to be explored. The Village Schools is one existing model – however, the structure of the project needs to be revisited. After over 15 years in operation, both the community and other stakeholders have greater insight into what will work and what seems not to. Furthermore, as will be described in section 5.2.4, the possibility of extending mother-tongue education higher than grade 3 needs to be explored. Any changes to the Village Schools model should be carefully thought through and should prioritize community involvement. **Specific recommendations regarding the Village Schools are included at the end of section 6.2 of this report.**

2.4 Social and economic context of Tsumkwe

Finally, the social and economic context of Tsumkwe district is also critical to contextualizing NAMAS work in the area.

Note: Dr Richard Lee was conducting an extensive social survey of Tsumkwe town at the same time that we were conducting our evaluation research in July. Analysis of the results of his survey are not complete, however, initial findings are relevant to our recommendations, and support our findings. Where relevant, in this report we cite some general findings that were presented in a recent draft paper. When the analysis is complete, we recommend that NAMAS refer to that report for further information about subsistence options, health, employment, and education (among other factors) in Tsumkwe. In particular, we recommend that Lee's findings on the relationship between education level and employment be thoroughly reviewed and considered in NAMAS decision-making processes.

Tsumkwe district is divided into two sides, East and West. Tsumkwe East, where Tsumkwe town is located, is inhabited primarily by Ju'hoansi, who are among the longest residing ethnic groups within Namibia. Archaeological evidence in the area points to habitation at least 4,000 years ago (Smith, 2001) by the same cultural group. Tsumkwe West is mostly inhabited by the !Kung, a diverse group found from Omaheke to Angola and in parts of Botswana, sharing a common language and culture. Today, the western area of Tsumkwe district presents a mix of majority Namibian !Kung, including many whose ancestors lived in the Omatako Valley, and some former residents of Angola; there is also a high level of association with the former South African military presence in the region. Although the !Kung and the Ju'hoansi speak related languages, are both San, and both experience marginalization from the education system, they are not the same group, and have different historical experiences and different experiences of assimilation into mainstream society. This was emphasized in interviews and workshops by the former circuit inspector from Grootfontein (now Deputy Director of Education in the Kunene region), who has conducted research on the difference between the two groups. While it is important to develop collaborative approaches between the two groups, it is equally important to recognize the distinction and the need for separate approaches.

The economic situation in both Tsumkwe East and West is tenuous. The conservancies generate some income through tourism, hunting concessions (in Nyae Nyae), and filming and recording fees, a

portion of which is divided among all conservancy members and distributed at the end of the year.¹ Some individuals are employed by the conservancies (many part-time) and have modest salaries. A few individuals have jobs with the government, and some work on farms on a temporary basis. Employment opportunities are scarce, mostly insecure and poorly paid, and organized income generation schemes (such as craft production) and other attempts at providing a sustainable livelihood (such as agriculture projects) have proved difficult to maintain (see Wiessner 2004 for a breakdown of figures). A very notable initial finding of Lee's analysis is that *education level does not correlate positively – and in fact may correlate negatively – with wage employment* (Lee 2010). This finding is central to decision-making about education in the region and further study on this is needed (see Recommendations for further study, section 6 of this report).

Although none of the communities is living solely from traditional subsistence methods, in many of the villages much food is also still obtained through these methods. In Nyae Nyae, hunting and gathering is a vital part of their subsistence economy; a significant percentage of San living in Tsumkwe reported “veld foods” as their main source of subsistence (Lee 2010). In N#á Jaqna, people also gather (hunting is not allowed), but to a lesser extent. Virtually all Ju|’hoansi and !Kung are dependent, at least to some extent, upon store-bought foods, especially during the seasons when the availability of veld food is low. Food is sometimes donated by the government, by organizations, or by individuals such as tourists or researchers; sometimes traded for crafts; or sometimes purchased with the scant income from a variety of sources, including tourism, craft sales, and begging. Other than the regular salaries of wage jobs, none of these sources of cash or food mentioned above is consistent, and there are periods of extreme hunger. Thus the immediate need to secure access to food often takes priority when choices between short-term gain and long-term planning must be made.

There are also serious health concerns in Tsumkwe district, in particular the rise of TB and HIV infection rates. We were informed by the doctor at Mangetti Dune during our fieldwork that Tsumkwe now has the fastest growing rate of HIV infection in the country (Dr Melitta Bosshart, 21 July 2010). However, according to the recent survey conducted by Richard Lee in Tsumkwe town, the most serious health problem is that of multi-drug resistant TB. Only a small percentage of the TB patients, who are all tested for HIV, were positive (Lee 2010). Rates of infection may vary greatly between Tsumkwe East and West due to different patterns of contact with populations, diet, and other factors.

Another important factor that must be recognized is the threat by neighboring groups and others wishing to access land in both Tsumkwe East and West. The NNC is still struggling to evict over 300 Herero farmers and their families who have settled in the middle of the town, following an invasion into the conservancy with 1,200 head of cattle in May 2009. In Tsumkwe West, efforts on the part of the government to regazette parts of the N#á Jaqna conservancy for smallhold farmers was resisted by the conservancy with the support of the Legal Assistance Centre (LAC) and NAMAS. As described in the following section, support from these organizations for land rights was critical in the resistance; however, the outcome of the case is still uncertain and it is not clear whether the efforts to defend their territory will be successful. Maintaining access to their land and their conservancies is a priority for both Ju|’hoansi and !Kung.

¹ This amounts to a few hundred Namibian dollars per member, per year.

The San communities of Tsumkwe East and West communities are both fortunate in comparison to most other San of the region in that they have access to their own land, and are able to practice to varying degrees their traditional lifestyles. The conservancies provide income and a measure of security that landless San do not have. They also facilitate the development of appropriate educational projects, which could potentially serve as models in other areas. However, the cases noted above, both still unresolved, provide a stark reminder of the vulnerable position of the San in Tsumkwe in maintaining their access to land, and upholding other rights. This vulnerability can be combated by increased capacity-building through appropriate educational approaches, including attention to adult education, and approaches which build upon their access to land.

2.5 Context of this evaluation

Finally, we note the circumstances in which this evaluation is taking place. The managing director of NAMAS, Svein Ørsnes, who saw the San Education Programme in Tsumkwe through its first eight years (including the desk study in 2002), stepped down from his position at the end of 2009, and handed over to a new managing director, Olav Osland. As noted above, the project coordinator on the ground left in May, and during our field visit in July, the new coordinator had not yet been officially named or appointed. Mr Franklin Williams was appointed to this position in September, and attended all three of the workshops in October. Due to this transition process, however, during our fieldwork, there was much concern over NAMAS' continued involvement in the area.

RECOMMENDATION on Context 1:

NAMAS and government efforts in the Tsumkwe district should take cognizance of the historical development of the projects being supported, and the historical role of the community in defining them. Any changes made should be in consultation with the community.

RECOMMENDATION on Context 2:

The current social context of the Tsumkwe district also must be taken into consideration. *In particular, the following considerations must be kept at the forefront of discussions:*

- The vulnerability of the San population in the Tsumkwe district to neighboring groups who seek to move onto the land in the area and encroach onto existing land and educational situation
- The pervasive food insecurity of San communities in Tsumkwe
- The rapid and difficult transition process that San communities – in particular the Ju'hoansi – are currently experiencing in the area
- Rapidly escalating social and health problems including alcoholism, violence, TB and HIV infection rates
- The general lack of employment opportunities in the area and the apparent lack of positive correlation between formal education levels and wage employment.

2.6 Conclusion

The problems of the Tsumkwe district, as with San education throughout the region and indigenous education globally, are complex and not easily addressed through mainstream approaches. This is well illustrated by the education figures for San in the region, nation, and district. While solutions are not obvious, it is possible to identify characteristics of an approach that will create an environment more conducive to positive change. We have identified the following elements (these are also listed under Priority Recommendation 5 in section 6.2):

- a long-range view and willingness to commit to support the *process* rather than setting strict time limits for transitions
- a willingness to support alternatives to current approaches to teacher training
- a commitment to facilitate the development of culturally appropriate education practices, support structures and materials
- a commitment to support alternative community-based training projects that build upon the skills that the community already possesses and that correspond with economic opportunities in the region
- a commitment to community involvement in decision-making processes involving traditional authorities, conservancy, school and other community stakeholders
- an emphasis on sustainability
- an emphasis on capacity-building.

These recommendations are supported by research throughout southern Africa, and by work with indigenous communities throughout the world. Although most of the attention of NAMAS activities has been on the improvement of education, since the beginning a dual goal of the NAMAS programme has been improving the focus on rights. An indigenous rights approach can provide a guiding framework for NAMAS activities in Tsumkwe district.

SECTION 3: GOALS OF NAMAS PROJECT

3.1 Introduction

The purpose of this evaluation is to discuss how the project during its eight years has influenced the educational situation in Tsumkwe, and to see if it has been able to increase the focus on education in Tsumkwe constituency. We began with an effort to determine whether the original goals of NAMAS have been achieved during this time. Our research found, however, that although some overarching general goals appear consistently in NAMAS documents, there is not a consistent set of goals that the organization is working towards; nor is there a clear mission statement or vision for the project.

Our evaluation and research also found that there is unclarity about NAMAS goals among the communities and other beneficiaries, among involved government persons, and among NAMAS staff in Namibia. Some of this confusion is inherent in the issues NAMAS is trying to address – the same ambiguity has been a pattern with all previous and current programmes trying to address the situation. Some of it has to do with NAMAS' own lack of clarity, which in turn is rooted in their efforts to remain flexible and responsive to real needs on the ground – this is a positive quality that should be maintained. We feel that it is possible, however, to define the goals more clearly and in a way that allows NAMAS to target its activities more effectively.

This can be facilitated through the development of vision and mission statements, both for the communities and for NAMAS.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Goals:

NAMAS should facilitate the development by the community of a *vision statement* that reflects what the community wishes to achieve in education. This should be done through a process designed to produce a clear and focused statement (see Recommendation on Community Involvement 5).

NAMAS should develop an overarching *mission statement* that describes their role in helping the community to move towards its vision. This statement should guide their decision-making processes, and contextualize their goals, objectives and activities. In general, the mission statement should:

- reflect the general need for capacity-building of San communities
- allow for both mainstream and alternative approaches to reach this goal
- take its cue from indigenous rights approaches, in particular the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Article 14 ((UN General Assembly; also outlined below).

3.2 Development of NAMAS goals

The two main elements of NAMAS activity in the Tsumkwe district are a focus on *education*, and a focus on *rights*. The initial concrete proposal was primarily focused on education, and plans to establish a *mobile Teachers Resource Centre* and a *Community Learning and Development Centre*, the former to support the teachers, and the latter to provide multi-dimensional support to the community for various learning needs. These remain a visible and important contribution from NAMAS. Over time, most of the focus of NAMAS activities in Tsumkwe has come to be upon supporting the Ministry in their efforts to increase the numbers of San learners in the schools of the area – especially in Tsumkwe schools. NAMAS also has supported LAC in their human rights activities within the Tsumkwe constituency, though this support was terminated in 2009.

The emphasis on *rights* has evolved over the years of NAMAS activities in Tsumkwe. It has been part of the foundation of their approach since the beginning, as a natural continuation of NAMAS' involvement with the struggle to rectify the rights of Namibians in general pre-independence support to SWAPO. After Independence, NAMAS continued to assist their long-term partner apply some of the ideals for which they were fighting. The Lund report cites the Namibian Constitution article 23, and clearly states the need for affirmative action to achieve equal access to basic human rights (2002:1); and mentions human rights violations and indigenous rights issues. The report focuses primarily on educational initiatives, however. Rights issues are not highlighted in the 2003 consultative conference report, which focuses almost entirely on the development of the learning centre. The Halfway Evaluation in 2006, however, describes the long-term development goal of NAMAS as: “to strengthen San's possibility to attend to their rights in the modern Namibia” (2006:7).² The way that NAMAS would do this was through the improvement of education. In subsequent documents, the emphasis on rights comes increasingly to the fore – this will be described below.

The emphasis on *indigenous peoples* has been at the forefront since the early stages of NAMAS San Education Project. Lund cites NAMAS familiarity of educational development with “Norway's own indigenous group, the Saami people” (2002, preamble). In a 2005 report to NORAD, one of the goals listed is “to build competence regarding indigenous peoples questions within the target group and local partners in Namibia.”

These two elements – improving education and improving rights (human, indigenous, etc.) – are present in all of the later articulations of NAMAS goals. Although a relationship between these goals is noted in some places, the nature of that relationship is not clear. NAMAS support for the LAC (described below) prioritized *rights education*, or education about rights, in order to improve people's ability to claim their rights. In other places the overarching goal is stated as improving indigenous rights or human rights in general, and education is noted as one aspect of this (Halfway Report 2006). Bernt Lund (2002) points out that the *abuse* learners experience at government schools can be serious enough to be called a violation of human rights (2002:11). Education itself as a right, and rights having to do with what *kind* of education one has access to, are also noted. Combining the goals of *education* and *rights* can be interpreted in many different ways. Although there are many overlaps,

2 No citation was given for the goals identified in the Halfway Report, and we did not find this specific overarching goal in other documents. The four specific programme goals listed match those in a 2005 report to NORAD. We assume that this overarching goal identified in this evaluation were taken from NAMAS documents available to those consultants.

unless the priorities of the two goals are clearly articulated, the actions taken to achieve the goals will not have the desired effect.

3.3 Goals of NAMAS project as described in 2009

3.3.1 General goals

The most recent and clearly articulated version of NAMAS goals is in the *Yearly Report 2009*, under the heading 'Results on an output and outcome level'. These were developed by the second project coordinator, in consultation with the previous coordinator, for a proposal to renew a five-year contract with NORAD. As these are the most recent and fully articulated set of goals and objectives, we have used this list as a guide during our evaluation. These will be discussed below; they are listed in the 2009 report as follows:

To raise awareness of indigenous, human, legal and cultural rights

- Increased number of reports on domestic violence and other violations of human and legal rights
- Increased appreciation of San culture
- Increased awareness of Indigenous Peoples' Issues.

Improve provision of quality education

- Improved school readiness level through higher enrollment in pre-primary education
- Increased number of qualified Ju|'hoansi and !Kung-speaking teachers
- Higher percentage of village school learners who continue their education after Grade 3
- Increased number of San learners will have completed Grade 10 and 12
- More participation of parents and community members regarding education related affairs
- Improvement of effective teaching through TRC/CLDC services
- Access to information and communication facilities at CLDC and TRC
- Increased reading culture amongst learners and community members
- Higher number of computer literate community members.

Improve and stimulate a positive social environment for the children and youth

- Extracurricular activities are introduced into the school systems.

3.3.2 General Goal 1: To raise awareness of indigenous, human, legal and cultural rights

Most of NAMAS' human rights work has been through support to the LAC. Under the general goal of raising awareness of various aspects of human rights, the most measurable objective is that of "increased numbers of reports on domestic violence and other violations." Increased appreciation of San culture, and an increased awareness of indigenous rights, the other two parts of this goal, are hard to measure, and where they have increased it is difficult to determine the extent to which this has been the result of NAMAS activities. However, NAMAS activities, and the inclusion of rights issues as a goal, *has* fed into a growing awareness within Namibian society of human rights in general, and specifically indigenous rights.

NAMAS activities in the area of rights has primarily consisted of the following activities:

- **Paralegal programme**

In early 2006, NAMAS began funding LAC to support the paralegal programme LAC “inherited” when the Legal Education Project (LEP) was dissolved in 2005. NAMAS housed the paralegal programme in their office, and paid for the salary of a paralegal; one more person also joined this office in the middle of the year. The idea was that the paralegals would go out into villages (getting lifts – no vehicles were provided) to talk to community members about potential cases they could raise. This programme faced many challenges, including personal problems of the office staff, lack of transport, and lack of appropriate cases reported (only criminal cases were reported).

- **Radio broadcasts**

By early 2007 the paralegal programme was phased out, and a radio information programme was begun. With NAMAS funding, information about rights and the contact details for LAC were translated into Jul'hoansi and broadcast on community radio. This does not seem to have resulted in any cases brought forward. However, we found that the communities do listen to community radio whenever they are able to and that they had listened to the rights broadcast when it was on the air. Community radio is thus an appropriate medium for information dissemination. The responses we received indicate that the dominant perception of the programme was that it was about domestic abuse cases. The fact that no appropriate cases were brought forward as a result of this activity indicates that what is needed is a better understanding about how to make the information presented more immediately relevant for the community.

- **Legal advice and rights training in N#a Jaqna**

Another way that NAMAS sought to fulfill the goals around human rights was through activities supporting land rights efforts on the part of the conservancy in Tsumkwe West, N#a Jaqna. The conservancy made a request for support with legal advice when the government was considering resettlement of farmers on conservancy land. With NAMAS support, LAC also provided training in human rights and land rights, both to conservancy members and to local authorities, including police. This support was ultimately limited by lack of funds and capacity for LAC workers to travel to Tsumkwe district frequently to continue with the training of both the community and the service providers, and to provide follow-up.

Both the specific support for land rights in N#a Jaqna, and the rights training was reported by N#a Jaqna conservancy leadership to have been successful thus far (though no conclusion has been reached yet), and very important. However, they noted that there had been only one training session, and that much more training was still needed. Likewise, involved LAC employees noted the need for a) more funding and b) a position to coordinate the rights training.

- **Rights awareness**

The (apparent) limited success of the efforts to “raise awareness” of rights in the Eastern part of Tsumkwe seems to be due in part to the fact that NAMAS was supporting LAC in maintaining a structure (the paralegal programme) that they, in turn, had inherited and that was not working.

Furthermore, support for the paralegal programme and subsequent activities required LAC personnel to travel to Tsumkwe; the budget was not sufficient to cover these costs. At the N#a Jaqna Conservancy office, the conservancy coordinator told us that NAMAS support had been critical in contesting the resettlement of farmers onto their land. However, they emphasized the need for further training and rights-focused activity in their area.

In general, the “rights” angle of NAMAS support to the improvement of rights has not been well-organized or defined, and thus somewhat half-hearted. It has also not been well-integrated into other aspects of the NAMAS programme. Rights-based work requires a level of capacity-building, and NAMAS support for training was a step in this direction but was limited in scope and time.

Furthermore, more clarity is needed on the issue of indigenous rights, and the applicability of an indigenous rights approach to educational activities in Tsumkwe. Specifically, it must be made clear that *indigenous rights are not special rights* – they are a special application and approach to rights issues that allow indigenous communities to access human rights. To this extent, the indigenous rights aspect should be woven into *all* aspects of NAMAS activities. We will return to this aspect of indigenous rights throughout the report, in particular in our recommendations on educational approach.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 2 - Rights:

NAMAS should integrate the emphasis on *rights* into its educational programme, and more clearly articulate its approach to rights for San communities. An indigenous rights approach recognizes the need for alternative approaches, as well as access to mainstream education, in order for indigenous communities to access their basic rights; this is the approach that should be followed.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 3 - Rights:

NAMAS should consider designing and implementing a *rights-awareness programme* that includes training of communities (including teachers), relevant service providers (such as local police) and other decision-making bodies (steering committees, cluster representatives) on specific issues. This should be done in collaboration with LAC. *Specific recommendations in this regard include the following:*

- Radio broadcasts on rights issues in Ju|'hoansi / !Kung are a cost-effective and appropriate way to disseminate information and support for this should be reconsidered by NAMAS
- Research into what issues are most relevant to the community and how to present them would make radio broadcasts and other awareness programmes much more effective.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 4 – Rights :

NAMAS should review indigenous rights mechanisms, in particular those referencing education, and use this approach as a frame for all of their activities in Tsumkwe district (See discussion on education and rights, section 3.4 below).

3.3.3 General Goal 2: To improve provision of quality education

Under the general goal of provision of quality education, the objectives related to the TRC / CLDC and community education (through these structures) are the ones that can most easily be said to have been achieved. These are:

- Improvement of effective teaching through TRC / CLDC services
- Access to information and communication facilities at CLDC and TRC
- Increased reading culture amongst learners and community members
- Higher number of computer literate community members.

The centres have provided access to computers for community members; services such as printing and photocopies are important for the teachers as well as anyone in Tsumkwe who is filling out an application or doing distance education; visiting researchers also make use of the centre. The Ju'hoansi Transcription Group (JTG), supported by Kalahari Peoples Fund, has also benefited enormously from having a room in the CLDC in Tsumkwe in which to conduct their training workshops, and their work at other times. This is in line with the original emphasis in the Bernt Lund report of 2002 that in order to improve San education, broad support to the community is needed and the creation of a more conducive general learning environment. (See section 4 on impacts for a fuller discussion).

Most of the other goals relate to increased participation in the mainstream schools in Tsumkwe, or, in the case of the teachers, increased success in the mainstream teacher training programmes:

- Improved school readiness level through higher enrollment in pre-primary education
- Increased number of qualified Ju'hoansi and !Kung-speaking teachers
- Higher percentage of village school learners who continue their education after Grade 3
- Increased number of San learners will have completed Grade 10 and 12.

These efforts have all had limited success. Furthermore, the extent of the success that there is depends upon how the target group is defined. In the definitions above, both specific language groups – Ju'hoansi and !Kung – and the overarching term *San* are used. This distinction is important, and if the category San is used interchangeably with specific language groups, the interpretation of the goal can vary. Furthermore, increasing the number of teachers who can *speak* Ju'hoansi and !Kung is not necessarily the same thing as increasing the number of teachers who have these languages as their mother tongue; it is also not the same thing as ensuring that the mother tongue is taught in the Village Schools.

These distinctions become important when talking about increasing the number of qualified Ju'hoansi teachers. When this is interpreted as simply increasing the number of teachers who are San, and / or who can speak Ju'hoansi, the result is an increase of the number of teachers in the training programme – as has happened to a limited degree with NAMAS assistance since the government took over responsibility for teacher training in 2004. However, Ju'hoansi teachers themselves continue to do poorly in the formal systems, and the number of teachers who are actually from the Nyae Nyae area and teaching in any of the government schools (including the Village Schools) has in fact decreased

since the initial stages of the VSP when there were 12 teachers in the training programme – all Ju'hoansi (see the table of teachers, Appendix B, and further discussion in section 5.5).

The goal of increasing the number of *Village Schools* students (all of whom are Ju'hoansi) in Tsumkwe school has met with limited success (see Appendix E). Over the past few years there has been a small progression of students from the Village Schools who have made it through grade 6. This year, there were also four students enrolled in grade 7, and one in grade 8. During our research period, however, none of the students in grade 7 or 8 were attending school despite the fact that they were registered. The drop-out rate continues to be high, and attendance inconsistent. Interviews with VS students at the school indicate that learners who are older, and who have a relative that is working in Tsumkwe are more likely to stay in school (see also section 5.2 on transitions).

The number of *San* learners at Tsumkwe Junior / Senior Secondary School seems to have gone up somewhat according to a comparison between admissions to TJSS in 2008 and 1999 (see Appendix D).³ However, we do not know specifically if the students who are attending higher grades at TJSS are Ju'hoansi, !Kung, or from another San group (this would require further study). According to all sources, there are no students from the Village Schools above grade 8.

Finally, we were not able to get detailed information tracking students, from the Village Schools to Tsumkwe school, or from Tsumkwe school beyond. To get more specific data about the language groups of San students who attend Tsumkwe, their success rates, and choices beyond junior secondary school further research will be needed.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 5 - Education:

Systems for tracking learners from Tsumkwe East and West should be put into place. In particular, learners from the Village Schools should be more carefully monitored, in order both to track individual learners and to monitor trends in learner attendance and matriculation at Tsumkwe Primary, Junior, and Senior Secondary schools in order to improve educational provision and attainment (see also Specific Recommendations for Further Research, section 6.2).

Under the general goal of Education, one other goal is to increase the participation of parents and community members regarding education related affairs. This will be discussed in the section on community consultation. However, we can state generally that the Nyae Nyae community expresses strong feelings of alienation from educational processes, especially Tsumkwe schools. They are much more positive towards the Village Schools, but most express a sense of not being adequately consulted on decision-making processes involving teacher placement, and other issues.

Finally, and importantly, we find that the concerns that parents express about their children in Tsumkwe school are valid and reasonable, and that they should be listened to. Actual problems should be addressed instead of trying to “convince parents about the value of education” (see also section 5.6 on community consultation).

³Tsumkwe Junior Secondary/Senior Secondary School Admission Register Statistics

3.3.4 General goal 3: Improve and stimulate a positive social environment for the children and youth

This goal is the least articulated; the only activity listed is increasing of extracurricular activities in the school system. As far as we could tell, this is not happening at all and has not been a primary focus of NAMAS activities. Support for the librarian at the CLDC does provide one important extracurricular activity for learners; though it is not specifically connected with the school itself.

The appointment of a San hostel caregiver in early 2010 is an important step towards fulfilling this goal, as an effort to improve the social and cultural connectedness between the Ju|'hoansi learners and the school environment. However, the hostel matron left for maternity leave after only a short time at the hostel. Partly for this reason, one person is not enough to have in this role – there is no one to fill in if that person is absent for any reason. In addition, any one individual will be vulnerable to criticism of favoring children from their area. If multiple people from different areas are appointed, it will minimize both of these issues.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 6 – Social Environment:

In general, much more attention should be given to the creation of “positive social environment for children and youth” at Tsumkwe schools and in town. Specific recommendations in this regard include the following:

- More activities at school and in town that are based in San culture, including art, music, dance and drama, as well as other activities like sports
- More Ju|'hoansi hostel caretakers should be appointed. They should be both male and female, from different parts of the conservancy, and should receive training.

3.4 Discussion: Education and Rights

It should be emphasized that much of the confusion around the goals is embedded in the paradoxical issue that NAMAS is trying to address: education for an indigenous group. Most efforts to improve San education are focused on improving participation in mainstream education. San communities also indicate that they would like access to mainstream systems – or at least the skills / opportunities associated with it. Yet, in these systems the San, like indigenous peoples around the world, do not achieve anything close to the results of other groups. Furthermore, in the end these systems become what is part of a concerted assimilation process, and often undermine the Ju|'hoansi's own socialization processes and attack the core of their identity, thus contributing to some of the problems the communities face. Among the San, the Ju|'hoansi are among the lowest achievers. Furthermore, these systems are part of an assimilation process, and can undermine the Ju|'hoansi's own socialization processes thus contributing to other problems the communities face.

Approaches that focus primarily on increasing Ju|'hoansi children's participation in government schools under the existing circumstances, given the poor quality of these institutions and the host of well-documented problems: a) have not shown to be effective and b) do not ultimately serve the interests of the San community. They also do not take into account the depth of the transition process involved for the San communities and individuals in participating in the mainstream schools. In short,

they neglect the root problems – and they do not work. The failure of Ju|'hoansi children to go beyond grade 7 in the Tsumkwe school, and of the Ju|'hoansi teachers to make it through the BETD (soon to be BED) system can both be attributed to underlying root problems that must be addressed before educational attainment can be improved. But what are these root problems, and how can they be addressed? This question came up again and again in interviews in Windhoek and Otjiwarongo in July, and again during the feedback workshops in October. In other words, the goal of “improve access to quality education” for San communities is agreed upon – but what do we mean by “quality education”? What does that mean for different San groups? How should this goal be achieved?

The most comprehensive effort to answer this question was a year-long survey conducted by Willemien le Roux in 1998-1999. This survey was based on the feedback of San communities across the region, including Tsumkwe (le Roux 1999). Long-term research conducted by Hays in the Nyae Nyae conservancy supported the recommendations of le Roux's report (Hays 2007), and suggested that this area in fact provides an ideal site for a pilot project that truly takes on board the findings of *Torn Apart*. The findings of both le Roux and Hays are supported by a great deal of other research in southern Africa and internationally which argues that indigenous groups like the San require and *have a right to* forms of education that match their language and their culture, that allow them to maintain community integrity, and that provide access to skills that they determine to be relevant.

In the southern African environment, however, arguments that emphasize the need for special approaches for a particular group – any approach that appears either to privilege *or* to isolate / disadvantage a particular group is easily dismissed with reference to apartheid. In this political / social environment, the default approach becomes to channel all efforts towards simply increasing numbers in the education system without addressing the root problems. This was not the original intention of NAMAS efforts, as is clearly highlighted by Bernt Lund, who stated in his 2002 desk study (following a list of reasons for San students' non-attendance at Tsumkwe school):

Efforts are being made to remove or lessen the effects of these causes, but some of them need more than government intervention. A holistic approach is needed, removing one cause only will not have the desired effect...Creating a flexible school system that goes hand in hand with the motivation of the parents will be two important points of departure.

- Lund 2002:5

Lund's initial recommendations match ours: a holistic, flexible approach is needed. However, without a clear framework under which goals are defined, it is very difficult to maintain the necessary focus on addressing the specific situation of indigenous communities. For example, there are times when tension arises between the need for “special” approaches, and the emphasis on not compromising quality (this is particularly the case with teacher training; see section 5.5). We would like to emphasize that *there is no inherent tension in these goals – it is just how they are interpreted.*

Thus far the educational goals of NAMAS have been primarily understood / interpreted as aimed at getting more Ju|'hoansi / San children through the education system. In recognition that mother-tongue / culturally relevant education provides the best foundation for this, there has been support for the VS model. This model requires Ju|'hoansi-speaking teachers to be trained – so an emphasis has been on teacher training and support. There has also been work on the development of mother-tongue

educational materials (although it is not clear how much these are being used). Despite the support for the Village Schools, and for the teachers, the numbers of VS learners improving performance at the schools in Tsumkwe has continued to be low. From the measure of increasing participation in the mainstream schools, NAMAS activities have not been very successful.

What has not been recognized, however, is the depth of the transition that the San communities are experiencing. Three years at the Village Schools are not enough to prepare learners for the mainstream schools; and there is currently no bridging programme to allow the teachers to be adequately prepared for the teacher education programme. Thus attempts to achieve the goals of getting more San children in Tsumkwe school, or developing more San teachers, underestimate the amount of time and support needed; they also largely neglect the traditional culture of San communities and the skills that the children and the teachers already bring with them to their educational processes. Special approaches are needed for these communities to achieve these two goals, and many others that NAMAS strives to achieve.

In this report, we argue that taking a *rights-based approach* to improving education in the Tsumkwe district can provide a way through the paradoxes and apparent contradictions. In particular, we support an *indigenous rights* approach that recognizes that indigenous rights is not about special rights, but about providing access to basic human rights. When this is lined up with educational rights, language rights, and linguistic rights, and other human rights, a clear justification for the other recommendations can be highlighted; as well as a general approach for NAMAS.

3.5 Discussion: Need for a general mission statement

When NAMAS first became involved in the Tsumkwe district, according to initial project coordinator and managing director at the time, their approach was to try to understand what was happening on the ground and to solidify networks before clearly and concretely outlining their approach. This was an appropriate way to begin the project. Because of this flexible beginning, however, NAMAS did not define clear goals at the outset, and eventually developed an approach very much based on personal understanding of the situation and prioritization of needs and activities. This was confirmed by both project coordinators and the previous managing director. Without a clear overarching guide, when individuals in particular positions changed, individual interpretations of goals and how to reach them were also vulnerable to change (this will be discussed in section 5.2 on transitions).

Both aspects of the NAMAS programme, *rights* and *education*, need to be clarified. One way in which the approach to rights needs to be clarified is in terms of whether NAMAS is improving “awareness of” (as stated in the 2009 document) or “access to” rights – or both. These are overlapping, but different approaches. Furthermore, the concept of “rights” itself can mean different things. Both human rights and indigenous rights are discussed in NAMAS documents. If these are not clearly defined it can be problematic. For example, indigenous rights can be misunderstood as “special rights,” which in modern Namibia creates political problems and misunderstanding. On the other hand, they can be misunderstood to be the same thing as human rights, only for indigenous peoples; this is also a misinterpretation. What needs to be clear is that indigenous rights is a special *application* of human rights, specific to a particular community – in order that they may have access to the same human rights as the rest of the citizens. In Tsumkwe, and with San in general, clearly they do

not have access to the same opportunities and rights as the rest of the country – therefore it is necessary for a clearer definition of what is meant by “improving awareness of” or “access to” rights.

Likewise, the focus on education needs also to be more carefully defined. What kind of education is NAMAS interested in improving access to? In most of the articulations of goals it is defined as “quality education.” Since the beginning of NAMAS involvement in Tsumkwe there has been a recognition that the approach to education must be broad, and “make use of potential of the old San culture and the combined efforts of existing services” (Lund 2002:1). Much of the emphasis, however, has come to be upon whether or not learners transfer to government schools in Tsumkwe. Little mention is made of the cultural climate and living conditions at that school, and whether it can be defined as “quality education” or whether it is an appropriate learning environment for San learners. Parents consistently articulate serious concerns about the lack of care their children receive at the school, and the children themselves consistently “vote with their feet” and leave the school. What *kind* of education NAMAS is helping to provide access to is critical – but is not clearly articulated in any of their documents.

Thus NAMAS goals need to be much more clearly defined, and linked. This would be greatly facilitated by the development of a Vision and Mission Statement for NAMAS activities in Tsumkwe district. An overarching, guiding frame within which NAMAS activities are taking place is very important for many reasons. The principal of the Village Schools was recently required to come up with a Vision Statement for the Village Schools; he worked together with the NAMAS teacher advisor on this. However, as the teacher advisor pointed out, “A vision statement isn’t something that you write and then you submit it because you’re required to. A vision statement defines your school, and everybody should know the vision statement from the community to the parents, to the children and the teachers. And everyone together works towards achieving the vision...” (interview with teacher advisor).

As an example, the following is an adaptation of the proposed mission statement for a project to develop San schools in Botswana:

Mission Statement: To support and facilitate the development of educational options that will assist San students in making the transition from their current state of marginalization in today’s society, to being effective advocates for their communities and their rights at local, national and international levels, and to be able to participate, along with other groups, in all fields of employment and further education, while still retaining a deep pride in and knowledge of their cultural heritage and resources.
- from the Minority Education Programme proposal, 2005

Also as a reference, we include here Article 14 of the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP), which refers specifically to education. All three parts are relevant; none of these are fully implemented in Namibia (or anywhere in the region):

1. Indigenous peoples have the right to establish and control their educational systems and institutions providing education in their own languages, in a manner appropriate to their cultural methods of teaching and learning.

2. Indigenous individuals, particularly children, have the right to all levels and forms of education of the State without discrimination.
3. States shall, in conjunction with indigenous peoples, take effective measures, in order for indigenous individuals, particularly children, including those living outside their communities, to have access, when possible, to an education in their own culture and provided in their own language.

Namibia is a signatory of the UNDRIP (as is Norway), and thus has agreed that these are, in fact, rights which their citizens have (*not* special privileges). If the Namibian government does not currently have the capacity to ensure that these rights are fulfilled, and if NAMAS is sincere in its commitment to improving both *education* and *rights* for San learners, then these goals provide a clear justification for continued support to alternative approaches to education in Tsumkwe district. For this to be effective, however, there is a need for a clear *vision* towards which they are working and an *overarching mission statement* to guide the process of moving towards it, as described above.

SECTION 4: IMPACTS OF NAMAS ACTIVITIES IN TSUMKWE DISTRICT

4.1 Introduction

Although, as noted in the previous section, the goals of NAMAS and concrete steps towards achieving them have not been laid out consistently in their proposals or reports, it *is* possible to identify several areas in which NAMAS has had a positive impact in Tsumkwe. Some of these are identifiable improvements in ways that NAMAS intended. These have primarily to do with the improvement of education in Tsumkwe District. There have also been some “side benefits” that were not anticipated, but are nonetheless important and ultimately contributing towards NAMAS goals. Finally, there are some less tangible benefits that are difficult or impossible to measure, but which should be acknowledged, and built upon as NAMAS activities continue in Namibia. Below we discuss:

- The general positive impact of NAMAS presence and activities in Tsumkwe district
- Impact of the CLDC and TRC
- Teacher and principal support and professional development
- Concrete practical assistance
- Impact on San educational performance in the government schools.

4.2 Positive impact of NAMAS presence and activities in Tsumkwe district

As noted before, NAMAS has a very high level of approval from all stakeholders that we interviewed. Although perceptions of who NAMAS “is” vary (for example, people living in the villages in particular associate NAMAS with individuals working in the area), we received strong feedback that NAMAS is a positive presence in the area, and that they should continue their activities in Tsumkwe district. Throughout the consultation process it became clear that other stakeholders are looking to NAMAS for guidance in San education; in particular in the Tsumkwe district, but elsewhere too.

We will start with the less tangible aspects, as these are overarching and important areas of consideration.

4.2.1 NAMAS' focus on most marginalized

The initiatives of NAMAS have brought other important stakeholders to the table, especially on topics that related to marginalized indigenous groups. NAMAS has been working for over 30 years in the country; they worked prior to independence and have continued to support the most marginalized members of the population. This long-term involvement is important to their projects.

4.2.2 Leadership and networking: regional, national, local

NAMAS' willingness to work with other organizations and with government is perceived as having contributed to increased collaboration among stakeholders involved with indigenous issues in Namibia. Another aspect of this is that NAMAS has a good reputation among government and other NGOs.

4.2.3 Contribution to a growing awareness of “rights”

Community members have an increased awareness of “rights” and how they might be able to use this concept and related legal tools. Although the measurable impact (i.e. in terms of increased cases reported) was not always what was anticipated, NAMAS support for rights-based activities has contributed to general awareness of the concept of rights. The area is thus primed for more focused attention on rights, with deeper understanding of how the concept of rights can be specifically useful in Tsumkwe district.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Impacts:

The position of NAMAS in Namibia is extremely important. We strongly recommend that NAMAS should build upon their historical relationship, long-term perspective and sustained investment in the country. San issues require long-term involvement, and NAMAS is in a position to commit to this. The socio-political capital they have accumulated should be utilized to pressure for the need for appropriate approaches to San education, and an indigenous rights approach. (See also Priority Recommendation 1).

Below we will list some more visible and identifiable achievements of NAMAS. The points below were all identified by individuals consulted during the consultation process. Most of these contribute directly to the ultimate goals defined by NAMAS.

4.3 Impact of the CLDC and TRC

The Community Learning and Development Centre (CLDC) in Tsumkwe and Teachers Resource Centre (TRC) in Mangetti Dune play important roles both as spaces for people to gather formally and informally, and in their contribution to skills development. In particular, the CLDC in Tsumkwe was seen as critical, and the TRC in Mangetti Dune was identified by people in that area as a successful contribution of NAMAS. The CLDC is much bigger and more equipped, it has (intermittent) internet access, and it is in the biggest town in the district; therefore it plays a more central role. The specific aspects of how these buildings and their resources benefited the community are described below.

4.3.1 Space where people come together, a “watering hole”

In particular the CLDC was identified as a space where workshops and training could be held; we also observed that it was a general meeting place for teachers and other young Ju|'hoansi professionals.

Students gather at the TRC and the CLDC after classes to use the library or play games that are available.

4.3.2 Professional development

Many people use the resources of the CLDC for the purposes of seeking or applying for employment, or use the internet for professional networking. The TRC is used to send faxes, and the library is used by those conducting distance education.

4.3.3 Space for the Ju|'hoansi Transcription Group

Both of the aspects above have greatly facilitated the development of the Ju|'hoansi Transcription Group, which itself plays a major role in fulfilling NAMAS goals in the region. The JTG is involving community members in Ju|'hoansi language development, providing professional development, and contributing to an increased reading culture in the community in general – for example, in addition to other activities, they are now starting a creative writing component. Its activities are very much in line with NAMAS general goals and they are a strong and important partner, as illustrated by the two points below.

4.3.4 General access to computers and printing facilities

People use the computers for typing CVs, resumés, and making photocopies for work-related and other purposes. People who are scribes for the traditional authority and for the conservancy also regularly use the computers of the JTG workshop to type letters for their organizations, which are then taken on thumb drives to print out at the CLDC next door.

4.3.5 Library

Both the CLDC and the TRC contain libraries; the CLDC in particular has a growing library and a very active San librarian, whose salary is paid by NAMAS. School children and others needing information make use of these libraries on a regular basis, especially the CLDC. The TRC library resources are used by teachers at the school in Mangetti Dune.

4.3.6 Potential for language training workshops for VS teachers

There has recently been a suggestion by the VS principal that the JTG be used to increase Ju|'hoansi language skills among the teachers of Tsumkwe. The initial suggestion was for VS teachers who don't know how to read and write Ju|'hoansi. Ultimately, such a service could be expanded and tailored to include language development for all teachers in the Tsumkwe district to facilitate communication between San groups and others working in their area, as well as to increase respect for San languages.

4.3.7 Cultural exchange visits

The CLDC has also been a site for at least one week-long programme in 2008 in which San groups from other parts of Namibia and Botswana gathered for a celebration and exchange of their unique and related cultures and languages. This was considered an important event by participants, especially those who traveled from Botswana, and left the impression that Tsumkwe is a place of cultural strength and positive donor support for a San community.

4.3.8 Accommodation

The CLDC is used as accommodation by visitors from various organizations to Tsumkwe and provides a comfortable and affordable place for people to stay. It also serves as income generation for the CLDC.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 2 – The CLDC and TRC:

The CLDC and TRC have grown into important centres of personal and professional development. There is now a need to support the development of activities that build upon and utilize the resources of these centres. In particular we recommend the following:

- Strengthening partnerships with existing bodies like Kalahari Peoples Fund and the Ju|'hoansi Transcription Group already using the CLDC, and developing new partnerships
- The CLDC should also be used to inform non-San in Tsumkwe, visitors, and others about San culture, rather than being only a “one-way” knowledge transfer and a tool for mainstreaming; the library can be the starting point for this exchange of knowledge
- Internet access in the area should be upgraded so that it is reliable and consistent and broader reaching. This will greatly improve the usefulness of the CLDC, which is already used for internet communication; having internet access would benefit the TRC enormously.

4.4 Teacher and principal support and professional development

The support that NAMAS has provided to the teachers and the principal are indisputably another area in which the impact has been great. Many of the teachers explicitly said that without NAMAS support they would not be teaching. The person who most emphatically stated his appreciation for NAMAS support was the principal. Given his position at the center of the web of relationships relating to Ju|'hoansi education, the difficult circumstances under which he is working, and his need for focused capacity-building, NAMAS support has been central to his continued ability to function as a principal in the area.

Another important contribution that NAMAS made was to organize and fund training in multi-grade teaching, with an instructor from Zambia. This was mentioned by several stakeholders, in particular several teachers. This was important to them, and this is the kind of training – specific to their circumstances – that the teachers need more of.

An important aspect of NAMAS support for teachers was their support for the reintroduction of the Instructional Skills Certificate (ISC) from September 2008 – July 2009. The ISC was a special bridging programme implemented by NIED to help unqualified San teachers who did not meet the entry requirements for BETD, to attain the minimum requirements so that they could be accepted into the BETD INSET programme. (The ISC had been in place previously to assist the VS teachers when the VSP was under the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation). Of eleven who participated, eight ultimately passed the exams. This kind of bridging programme is desperately needed, especially for Ju'hoansi teachers, and should be continued and expanded.

These dynamics are described in more detail in section 5.5 on teachers. Here we wish to emphasize this as a critical part of NAMAS activity in Tsumkwe district, and one that should not be withdrawn without careful consideration.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 3 – Teacher Support:

Support for teachers should be carefully worked out between stakeholders and should be increased where possible considering the great need for local teachers in Tsumkwe district, as well as the very difficult and uncertain circumstances in which these teachers are working – see recommendations under section 5.5 below.

4.5 Concrete practical assistance

4.5.1 Transportation

NAMAS' assistance with transportation of the learners between their villages and both Tsumkwe school and Mangetti Dune school, at the beginning and end of each term, was identified by many we interviewed. It was also noted that learners often take advantage of the regular trips of the teacher advisor to get lifts between the school and their villages – though this is not formally a part of NAMAS activities, nor is there a budget for it.

Although these transportation opportunities were appreciated, limitations must also be emphasized. It was pointed out by all who mentioned it that this limited transportation was not sufficient. The younger learners want and need to return home more frequently than three times per year; it was suggested that transport should be extended at least to include home weekends, long weekends which occur once a month.

In the absence of reliable transportation, learners rely on lifts to get where they need to go. This is inconsistent and unequal; furthermore the informality of this arrangement leaves those in the position as drivers (whether NAMAS employees, community members, or others) in a position where they are vulnerable to intense criticism for refusing lifts – which is sometimes necessary. This can strain relations between the driver and others. If the driver is a NAMAS employee, this can affect relations with the community (if it is a community member who is from the area this strain will be avoided at all costs, sometimes resulting in the misuse of vehicles). These factors need to be taken into consideration in discussions on transportation (see recommendations from section 5.3.2 on transportation).

4.5.2 Short-term / ad hoc assistance

When asked how NAMAS has helped in the area, several respondents noted contributions including the following:

- school uniforms
- toiletries for learners
- school supplies, including notebooks, pencils and erasers
- cleaning supplies for the schools
- fence around the school (Mangetti Dune).

These were noted positively, with emphasis on how much they were needed. However, some of these are needed on a consistent basis, and a one-time contribution will help only for a short while (school uniforms wear out quickly, for example). Furthermore, not all of these were specifically contributed by NAMAS; some assistance was channeled through private funds collected by NAMAS employees through their own social connections, or from visitors to the area (including tourists). While we would not specifically discourage this channeling of funding for these purposes, it would be better to have a consistent fund which is used to finance specific needs, such as school uniforms and toiletries for learners at the mainstream schools in Tsumkwe and Mangetti Dune. (See section 5.3 on logistics). Providing short-term assistance that cannot be sustained in some cases creates expectations on the part of the community, who then feel disappointed or even cheated when it is not continued.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 4 – Practical assistance:

NAMAS should ensure that the tangible support that it provides and that is recognized by other stakeholders is sustainable, and not creating unrealistic expectations on the part of other stakeholders (see also recommendations on logistics, section 5.3).

4.5.3 Improvement of San performance in government schools

As discussed earlier, and as illustrated by the numbers, the goal of improving San educational participation and performance in the government schools has been elusive. As all stakeholders acknowledge, the reasons for this are complex and interlinked. The next section of the report, “Challenges”, outlines the main barriers to achieving this goal.

However, we would like to emphasize that the failure of students to transfer to Tsumkwe school should not be taken as a failure of the Village Schools, or of NAMAS efforts. The current teacher advisor suggests that “in general the children that come from our schools [the VS] are as well prepared or better prepared in some areas of the curriculum than the children who start at Tsumkwe in Grade 1 and 2,” indicating that the issue is not only, or always, academic under-preparation (see also Appendix E). There are serious issues regarding the entry of San students into Tsumkwe schools that must be addressed by government educational bodies – although NAMAS can encourage solutions. Furthermore, other benefits of the Village Schools should be recognized. The current teacher advisor also pointed out that VS children have a strong sense of cultural pride and self-confidence which is not

always recognized. He points out that for these students to come to Tsumkwe school from a rural village environment is a “huge risk” – but one that many do take, indicating great confidence. He notes that “even for a child in the best of circumstances to go at the age of nine years to a hostel situation is very stressful...and even more so for kids coming from a unique school environment in a rural area.” Unfortunately, the environment they find is not welcoming – and many leave.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 5:

Unless the situation at government schools and hostels in Tsumkwe are more welcoming to San students, NAMAS impact on San education cannot be measured through increased attendance in these schools. NAMAS can address the situation by simultaneously supporting the development of alternative approaches, and working with the government to develop a plan to improve the government schools.

SECTION 5: CHALLENGES

5.1 Introduction

Although NAMAS support in the Tsumkwe district has been important and much appreciated and there have been several positive outcomes, there were several challenges that came up during our research. These challenges are multiple and interlinked; the general categories of challenges include:

- **transitions** – main theme, including transition from NAMAS to Ministry, and changes taking place in national teacher training; also transition of children from VS to Tsumkwe schools and the impact of education as agent of cultural transition of the San community
- **logistics**, including transportation, food, and payment of teachers
- **roles** of various stakeholders
- **teacher** uptake and training
- **consultation** of community / community involvement.

Of these, it is the issue of **transitions** that seems to be the most overarching, and that also weaves throughout the other problems identified. Transitions create changes in how logistics are handled; in the roles and responsibilities of various stakeholders; and, in the way that potential teachers are identified and training options available. If the local stakeholders – including teachers, parents, and others in the community – are not brought into the decision-making processes that occur around transition, this creates confusion and (sometimes) resentment, and does not facilitate the long-term goals of the project. Each of the issues will be discussed in turn.

As will be emphasized in the next section, the most fundamental transition to be aware of is that of the communities themselves. As described in the introduction, the San communities of both East and West Tsumkwe are in the midst of a dramatic social and economic transition. This has historically taken different shapes for communities in the East and in the West, but is a real challenge for both Ju'hoansi and !Kung, as well as for San communities across southern Africa. This underlying transition is the fundamental challenge that educational initiatives confront, but often the one the least acknowledged or addressed.

5.2 Transitions

During our consultancy we found that many of the challenges relate to numerous transitions that the San community is currently experiencing. We identified the following general transitions:

- transition from NAMAS to Ministry
- transition from NNDFN to Ministry / NAMAS

- transitions in teacher training
- transition of children from VS to Tsumkwe school)
- general assimilation process, intense transition of San communities in general.

5.2.1 Current transition from NAMAS to Ministry

During our evaluation we found that there were concerns about the anticipated changes and transitions that are taking (or are due to take) place. There were numerous questions and concerns about the ongoing transition from NAMAS to the Ministry generally concerning anticipated administrative support by coordinator to teachers, principal, community and the nature of NAMAS' continued support for education, schools, and resource centers and advisors.

Communication issues were identified as a central problem. In particular, it was expressed by the Chief Inspector for Education (Windhoek), the Regional Education Director and the NAMAS project coordinator that the transition took place too quickly, and without consultation by the NAMAS head office of the local individuals and offices that would have to take responsibility for implementing the changes. The decision was seen to be top-down, and did not leave adequate time for preparation and good decision-making processes. The willingness of NAMAS to renegotiate their position with the Ministry was seen as a positive move on NAMAS' part. However, we found that there is still concern on the part of the Ministry offices about transparency (especially financial) and the communication of expected changes.

Furthermore, we also found that there is little understanding on the part of the three main geographical groups of stakeholders (Windhoek, Otjiwarongo, Tsumkwe) about what is going on in the other areas. For example, stakeholders in Otjiwarongo and Tsumkwe seemed unaware of the Windhoek-based San Support Network, while some stakeholders in Windhoek were not aware of the existence of the Steering Committee that meets in Tsumkwe. This indicates that there are major gaps in the communication channels; during transition periods much information falls through these gaps.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Transitions:

There is an urgent need to develop greater transparency and communication among stakeholders, including between NAMAS and the Ministry; between the Ministry and the teachers and principal, and between all parties and the communities – particularly when it comes to changes that are being considered or have been decided.

5.2.2 Original transition

Some of the current issues that are being faced by the Village Schools in particular can be traced back to the transfer of support for the project from the NNDFN to the Ministry; this coincided with NAMAS support for the Ministry in 2003. As described in section 2 on background, there was little continuity in the handing of the project from NNDFN to the Ministry. NAMAS employees who were hired after this process, including the current teacher advisor and national coordinator, and the previous project coordinator, all expressed a lack of information about the beginning of the project. As

the current teacher advisor pointed out, “if there's a document that has defined the schools from the beginning, then everyone should know what it is, and everyone should know how it's changed” in order to maintain continuity of the project and / or make informed decisions about changes.

This lack of historical understanding means that there are misperceptions about the origin of the Village Schools, for example. The current Deputy Director informed one NAMAS employee that “the village schools were started without any knowledge of the Ministry of Education.” This is not true – the Ministry was very much aware of the process all along, and increasingly involved through the payment of teachers. The lack of “knowledge” of the project came with the transition in 2003, which (as described in Background) coincided with the decentralization process, the opening of the Regional Office in Otjiwarongo, and the installation of a new person in a newly created position of Regional Director – and whatever documents had been handed over in the transition process did not make it to the new Regional Office.

These misperceptions affect attitudes towards the Village Schools, and possibly decision-making processes. If the Village Schools are perceived at the Regional Office as an “illegitimate” project that was begun without the involvement of the Ministry (despite the fact that the project was, from the beginning, striving to comply with Ministry requirements), there will be much less willingness to support teachers who need special support, for example, and more emphasis on strict conforming to Ministry requirements.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 2:

The process of decision-making about the way forward for the Village Schools should include the provision of basic historical information about educational processes in the Tsumkwe area over the past 20 years.

5.2.3 Teacher training

The transitions described above also entailed shifts in requirements for teachers. Special support for the Ju|'hoansi teachers that had been in place under NNDFN ended; in particular the ISC was phased out and meeting the BETD requirements became the only option. Since most Ju|'hoansi did not meet these requirements, this is when a number of teachers “fell out” of the programme. Now, new changes in teacher training are also underway as the programme transitions to BED under UNAM. With the transition of teaching requirements, concerns were raised about the status of current teachers and appropriate needs for San learners.

It was not clear yet how standards will change with this transition, whether there will be a bridging programme through UNAM and what form this will take.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 3:

NAMAS should continue its support to teachers in the interest of maintaining a consistent, supportive presence, and should encourage the development of bridging programmes by other role-players.

5.2.4 Transition from Village Schools to Tsumkwe schools

This is an issue of critical importance. There are several factors that impede the transition of San learners (especially those from the Village Schools) to Tsumkwe schools; some of these have already been addressed elsewhere in the report. These include:

- environment at Tsumkwe schools / hostels (including the social and physical environment)
- young age of the learners who transfer
- lack of personal attention to VS students, monitoring
- lack of involvement of communities in the process
- lack of ability for students to go home and visit parents / families
- lack of clothes, shoes and toiletries
- language issues (key).

In Bernt Lund's report of 2002, he points out that the Village Schools are meant to prepare learners for the transition to Tsumkwe schools. However, “in spite of a lively and creative learning environment at Tsumkwe JSS under the leadership of...the principal, many of the VSP learners do not cope with this transition to their new school...” (page 9). A few pages later, he cites reports from the communities that show that the learners are often exposed to “grave social problems” at the school, including “abuse of female learners with resulting pregnancies and HIV infections, distribution and use of alcohol, ineffective hostel supervision, absent medical treatment, lack of food...” (page 11). He notes that some of these are human rights violations, and all of them seriously affect the school situation.

These two descriptions of the Tsumkwe school illustrate very well the different attitudes towards the government schools, and the transition of the learners from the Village Schools, or the other schools which are in the learners' community, and Tsumkwe school (or Mangetti Dune). (This difference in perspective was also noted in several places in the Halfway Evaluation). On the one hand, the Village Schools are supposed to prepare learners for an academic transition to a bigger and more mainstream institution of learning – one which is “lively and creative.” However, these students are transitioning into an environment where they are often the target of extreme abuse – and victims of human rights violations. The Village Schools cannot – *should* not – be preparing them for this.

The reasons that the students drop out are many; some may have to do with lack of academic preparation. The former NAMAS project manager notes that some of the Village Schools students entering grade 4 at Tsumkwe could not even write their names. This is certainly a problem, and could be a reason for dropping out if students feel they cannot keep up with the rest of the class. However, many of the reasons have to do with the environment at the Tsumkwe schools and have nothing to do with the Village Schools or the teachers. As noted elsewhere in this report, parents consistently state that their children should be older and bigger before going to stay in the hostels at the government school. We found that those former Village Schools students who continued at Tsumkwe tended to be older and / or have a relative working in the town (usually both were true) – in other words, they had family support in the area (see Appendix E).

While the focus on the early use of the mother tongue and home culture is very appealing—especially for a group that has had virtually no access to mother-tongue education—this model in fact typifies a kind of transition model called the *early-exit model*. These models, which involve a transition to a

foreign target language within one to four years, have been shown *not* to work well for the vast majority of children (Thomas and Collier 1997; Heugh 2006). They are also the most common language-in-education models in Africa. So, although the use of mother-tongue education for the Ju|'hoansi in the Village Schools Project was a breakthrough for a San minority, the model that was followed has been shown, in fact, to be minimally effective – even for students who are members of more dominant social groups. Marginalized minorities are at an even greater disadvantage.

In general, what is vastly underestimated in early-exit models, and in most approaches to the Village Schools, and other educational efforts by outsiders in Tsumkwe, is the enormity of the transition that the marginalized community – in this case the Ju|'hoansi students, teachers and community – is being asked to make. The tendency to oversimplify this transition is certainly not unique to those involved in the Nyae Nyae VSP; it is a common – perhaps the biggest – stumbling block for indigenous education efforts worldwide. This is a key issue in education in the Tsumkwe district, and especially for those San in the roles of teachers and principal.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 4:

The issue of mother-tongue education is central, and NAMAS should take the following into consideration in all planning (see also recommendations on teachers, section 5.5):

- The consistent request of the community for mother-tongue education beyond grade 3
- The need for Ju/'hoansi and !Kung materials development and distribution
- The need for better coordination among various stakeholders working with mother-tongue education.

5.2.5 General assimilation process of San communities

This issue links with all of the above. The San communities are in a dramatic process of transition from a hunting and gathering people with band-level societies to participation in a national economy, political system and increasingly urbanized situation. This transition is extreme, problematic, and expectations on all sides tend to be unrealistic. There is no formula for making it work – but there does exist a great deal of evidence as to what factors inhibit or facilitate positive processes from similar cases in other parts of the world, and other parts of southern Africa. Furthermore, there is a lack of recognition of what San culture and educational approach has to offer the general society.

An extremely important issue to consider is that of avoiding the creation of dependency, through the development of a sustainable programme. There must be a strong emphasis on *capacity-building* of communities and the programme as a whole.

Important factors to consider:

- Extent to which community is involved in decision-making processes
- Education: extent to which it is built upon and respects culture and language of students
- Need for a process-oriented approach
- Need for more emphasis on the progressive nature of traditional San education as something that could benefit not only San learners, but Namibian education in general.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 5:

There is a need for constant recognition of the enormous transition the community is negotiating and to take this into consideration in all activities and decision-making processes – local *capacity-building* should be central to all efforts.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 6:

Trends indicated by the limited statistical research conducted for this evaluation (in particular that VS learners who remain at Tsumkwe school tend to be older than average, and have family support in the town) should be followed up and taken into consideration for future planning (see also Appendix E and Specific Recommendations on the Village Schools in section 6.2).

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 7:

In general, relationships between the Village Schools, or any other schools that San children attend, and the schools into which learners will transfer must be cultivated and maintained, and students who transition should be monitored and receive support. The change in environment from a mother-tongue, culturally-based school into a more mainstream school is overwhelming to young learners, and support is needed through this transition.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 8:

Parents clearly state that their children are not well taken care of at Tsumkwe school and that they are too young to be in that environment. Thus:

- If possible, transition to Tsumkwe school should be delayed until learners are older (see Specific Recommendations on Village Schools below)
- Simultaneously, efforts should be made to develop accommodation for VS learners at Tsumkwe school, with an adequate number of Ju|'hoansi caregivers
- Teachers at Tsumkwe school need to be sensitized to Ju|'hoansi culture
- More Ju|'hoansi should be employed at Tsumkwe – as teachers assistants for example, if they are not qualified teachers.

5.3 Logistical issues: capacity, responsibility, reality

It is essential that the support structures are functioning. No education programme, regardless of theoretical perfection, seems to survive if food-aid delivery, water supply and transport services break down.

- Lund, “Overview of Planned Project” Consultative Conference Report, 2003:37

Our research revealed several areas in which logistical / practical issues are severely hampering the strength of the Village Schools, the training of teachers, and other related efforts to improve educational outcomes in Tsumkwe district.

Whether or not these issues are NAMAS' responsibility to address, it must be recognized that they will halt all other progress if they are *not* addressed. In order for NAMAS activities to be successful, these logistical problems must be addressed or they will undermine all other efforts. This is not a new

finding; all of these issues have been recognized from the beginning of educational activities in the Tsumkwe district, and various efforts have been made to deal with them. As the above quote makes clear, these realities were also acknowledged from the beginning of NAMAS' involvement. Lund suggests that these essential issues could be regarded as “additional leverage points.”

While we agree wholeheartedly with this approach, we must also emphasize that solving these logistical problems is not a straightforward matter, but relates to deeper underlying issues. We recommend a collaborative approach focused on solving immediate problems, while simultaneously focusing on the development of sustainable, long-term solutions to these problems. The latter will require capacity-building for the community; this should be considered in the design of solutions. General and specific recommendations on logistics are outlined in each section below.

The basic logistical issues confronting educational provision in the Tsumkwe district can be grouped into the following general areas, each of which will be discussed in turn:

- food
- transportation
- payment of teachers
- school and accommodation structures
- uniforms and toiletries for learners at central schools in Tsumkwe and Mangetti Dune.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Logistical Issues:

Although NAMAS cannot be expected to take on all the logistical issues raised here, until these are addressed, progress will be halted. NAMAS and the Ministry should organize a meeting as soon as possible in order to identify who is responsible for what and reach consensus on the priorities of issues that need to be addressed.

5.3.1 Food security (most critical underlying issue, central to VS and Tsumkwe school attendance)

The importance of the issue of food cannot be overemphasized – food security is the most critical issue that any development project at Nyae Nyae needs to take into account. Any project will only be sustainable and have a deep lasting effect if food security for the community is integrated into project design. Nutritious food is the foundation of all physical life, growth and learning. Furthermore, both learners and communities will prioritize the issue of food when it is scarce. This means that learners will leave school – either the Village Schools, or Tsumkwe school – if the food is not sufficient (or if they are unable to get enough because they don't have plates and bowls, or for other reasons). It also means that other community members will consume school food if there is not enough other food in the village.

During our research, reports from villages suggest that food delivered to schools was not sufficient and that the lack of food affected learners' ability to concentrate at school, and led to dropping-out. The following two quotes are excerpts from letters written by Village Schools teachers to the Regional Education Office.

*In Den|ui most learners are from surrounding villages and they stay in a classroom as a small hostel. The learners are fed from the school feeding programme. Even so, in the village there is hunger. Hunting is not successful these days and the villagers have nothing to eat. Learners are struggling since the maize meal was finished on the 6th of the month. Since then, nothing was provided and the children have to come to school without having anything to eat. **This makes teaching and learning difficult as learners come and just sleep in class because they are weak.** It also affects our studies since we are student teachers.*

- letter from teachers in Den|ui, no date (2010)

*This school did not receive any maize meal since March 11 2010. **The children were suffering of hunger and had difficulties of attending.** Therefore I postponed the observation [by the principal] until next term, so that I can have a good and successful teaching together with learners learning.*

- letter from teacher in Baraka, 13 April 2010

The principal also tried to follow up on this issue with a letter that included the following:

*In my capacity as Principal of the Nyae Nyae Village Schools, I would like to inform you about my visit to the Village Schools. **The numbers of learners are increasing and the food which they received cannot last until the day when the schools close... We now have six schools altogether with 187 learners, but the lack of school feeding programme will make them disappear and lose out on Education.** This term we have received 125 maize bags which we have to divide among 6 schools.*

- letter from the principal to the Inspector of Hostels, Otjiwarongo, and copied to the Director of Education, Otjozondjupa region and the Inspector of Education, Grootfontein circuit, 01 March 2010

Although the principal did not get a direct response to this letter, when he showed it to us, he had attached to it the receipt of the school food delivery for the following term – 116 bags of maize meal. Thus the actual response was that *less* food was delivered the following term. This indicates either a lack of communication, or a lack of respect for the issue, or both. The Regional Director acknowledges the importance of the problem, and suggested to us that the food for the VS should be increased to 2-3 meals per day. However, the practical implementation of a solution needs to be worked out at the intermediate and ground levels.

People in the villages are sometimes criticized by outsiders for eating the school food, or for giving too much food to the learners (especially those from other villages who are staying at the school, as noted in the letter from Den|ui). However, it is generally true that people in the Tsumkwe district do not have enough access to food. In such a situation, people will eat the food earmarked for the school, if there is nothing else. In addition to pure hunger, the use and sharing of food is a deep cultural value.

The amount of food for learners at Tsumkwe school was also reported as problematic. Another complaint was the quality of the food, and the cleanliness of the cooking equipment. This could be extreme; for example, we received reports of cooking pots being left out overnight which were then

used by people as a toilet. Obviously when learners became aware of that they no longer wanted to eat the food cooked in these pots. Another complaint was the inability of learners living in Tsumkwe to access the same food support as hostel dwellers. Some of these learners were living with family members who, although they may have some income, also had limited supplies of food themselves.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical issues 2 – Food Security:

There is an urgent need to discuss a sustainable solution to the issue of food that is *nutritionally*, *practically*, and *culturally* acceptable, and that does not increase dependency.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical issues 3 – Food Security:

A thorough assessment of strategies that have been tried thus far, their success rates, and the actual opportunities for accessing food (including bush food, livestock, donations and shops) should be carried out and should result in suggestions for sustainable food procurement strategies, and how they relate to education in the area.

5.3.2 Transportation (most consistently expressed; difficult to resolve)

Lack of reliable transportation (other than people's own feet) is an ongoing problem in Tsumkwe district. For educational purposes, the following categories of transport are the most critical:

- for the VS principal
- for VS teachers between their school and Tsumkwe town
- for VS teachers and others involved with language development between Tsumkwe and Windhoek for training, and within Windhoek
- for students at Tsumkwe school between Tsumkwe and home village (especially for home weekends or holidays).

NAMAS support with transportation: NAMAS has provided transportation for children attending central schools in Mangetti Dune and Tsumkwe to return to their villages during the school holidays. The NAMAS teacher advisor provides transportation for VS children when he is going in that direction, but this cannot be his responsibility on a consistent basis. As noted in the section on Impacts, though this support is much appreciated, it is limited. Most children would like to go home more frequently; furthermore this assistance does not address all the transportation needs of the principal and teachers. Other efforts to address this problem include donkey carts, which were tried on two occasions and both times considered to have “failed” (as evidenced by unused or decaying donkey carts); however in both cases specific factors have been identified as contributing to the failure.

When I was the principal [of the VS, 1998-2005], the transport programme was partly addressed when we agreed on donkey carts for learner support between Tsumkwe and home villages during the holidays and home weekends – but the problem was maintaining those. What I see now is the routine visit of the principal and teacher advisor, and learners benefit from that, but there is no specific learner support any more. This is an issue that has been there all along, and it needs to be looked at critically if we want to retain learners and teachers.

- Former VS principal, Tsumkwe workshop, 11 October 2010

The teachers also experience problems with transport. If they need to come into Tsumkwe for any reason – to access the CLDC; to get their pay – or to sort out problems regarding lack of pay; to do their shopping or to visit friends and relatives on the weekend, they struggle to get back to their villages. This leads to teacher absenteeism, which is considered problematic by other stakeholders even if teachers have a legitimate excuse.

Vehicles in the hands of the inspectorate in Grootfontein do not reliably reach Tsumkwe when they are needed. The principal does not have access to regular transport, so must request a car from Grootfontein for his activities. That vehicle is shared by others in Grootfontein, and the VS principal's requests do not always take priority; furthermore, communication between the offices is a serious problem (as noted above and in section 5.4). The principal describes it like this:

Most of the times when I request a car, I get no answer. Then maybe I will find that, oh, the car is here, but they did not tell me that the car is coming, so I could not plan on it...Then sometimes I plan on my activities, and I request the car. But then people are using the car for the other things. So my programmes are just sitting there...

Regular transport support is critical. If people know there is a regular service, even if it is once per week, there will be much less anxiety about attendance of teachers on the job, and about the ability of learners to return home to their villages more regularly than school holidays three times a year. In particular, the principal should have dependable and regular access to transport in order to keep to a regular schedule; he should not need to share a vehicle with more dominant government partners in Grootfontein, 300 km away.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical issues 4 - Transportation:

NAMAS and the government should work together to determine an appropriate solution to ensure that consistent transportation is available, especially for principals, teachers, and learners.

Examples of possible solutions for discussion include:

- Purchase of a vehicle and hiring of a driver by NAMAS or government with the specific job of driving the principal, teachers, and learners for clearly defined purposes
- Assistance to village entrepreneurs to get a taxi license, support to start an income generating activity that could help each village with (paid) transport. Support needed would include driving lessons, help with applications for small business support and help administering first income so as to pay back loan on vehicles
- Alternately, a similar programme could be tried with donkey carts. Although the donkey cart programme appears to have failed both times it was tried, there were specific problems both times that could be addressed (i.e. lack of ownership of the carts and donkeys; design of the carts). This solution could be revisited as a small business (rather than a communally-owned donation).

5.3.3 Payment of teachers (central for teachers and other employees)

The payment of teachers has been a problematic issue for teachers since the beginning of the VSP, both logistically, and socially / culturally. Currently, the main problems identified for payment are as follows:

- Of teachers for teaching duties and clerical assistant at TRC (Mangetti Dune) – these are linked specifically to the transition to the Ministry in April 2010
- Of teachers and Ju|'hoansi language committee when they travel
- General issues regarding the way salaries are paid, the time lines of payment, the ability of teachers to access pay from villages (this combines with transport issues)
- The situation for paid teachers vis-à-vis their community.

This section will describe the logistical problems; the social issues will be discussed in section 5.5 on the teachers and training issues. During our research it came up repeatedly that teachers experienced extreme delays in their payment – sometimes for months; some were still not being paid. There were two categories of teachers who experienced this problem. One was those teachers who are in the BETD programme (and supported in this by NAMAS) but whose salary is paid by the government on a yearly basis; each year they must reapply for the position. This year four of the teachers who were hired by the Regional Office and who were teaching did not receive their salary from January 2010 well into the second term (the specifics of when the salary and back pay were received varied and was not entirely clear, but it was reported that the issue was in the process of being sorted out).

The second set of teachers were from the group whose salaries were taken over by the government during the transition of responsibility in April 2010. At the time of our research in July, these teachers had still not received their pay. Both groups of teachers expressed experiencing serious hardship as a result of this. They were using credit to purchase food and other needed items, and this credit was being called in. It must be emphasized, however, that *these teachers continued to teach* despite not being paid– demonstrating a very high level of commitment to their job.

There is a serious lack of communication between Otjiwarongo / Grootfontein and the VS principal, who is trying to address payment issues. There were reports of VS teachers (including those who reapply to Ministry on yearly basis, and those whose salaries were to be taken over from NAMAS by Ministry in April) who had not been paid or whose back pay had not been fulfilled. This lack of payment contributed to low teacher morale, perceived lack of support, and living hardships in a few cases. The principal of the VS has written letters to the appropriate offices, but has not received a response.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical issues 5 – Payment of Teachers:

NAMAS and the Ministry should reconsider the issue of payment to teachers, and how it is handled. This is an issue that must be taken very seriously in order to build upon investments already made in teacher training. Lack of payment sends messages to teachers that they are not respected, and puts them in a vulnerable economic position. It does not enhance commitment or performance.

5.3.4 School structures (important to teachers and VS learners)

Complaints about the conditions of the schools and furniture, and the accommodation for teachers also came up throughout the interviews and workshops. Most of the schools are in states of quite serious disrepair, and lack adequate furniture. Furthermore, teacher accommodation is not at all conducive to the activities expected of teachers. The fact that they are supposed to teach and prepare for their BETD courses while living in small tents was specifically highlighted by the Regional Director of education as a serious problem, and it was noted by many others.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical issues 6 – School structures:

The lack of appropriate accommodation for the teachers, especially at the Village Schools, and the poor state of the schools themselves does not contribute to a good learning environment. Upgrading of the Village Schools structures, including the school buildings, furniture, and the accommodation for the teachers should be incorporated into future plans for the Village Schools (see Specific Recommendations on Village Schools in section 6.2).

5.3.5 Uniforms and toiletries (critical to learners)

Although this may seem a minor issue in comparison to the issues notes above, from the perspective of the learners, being properly clothed and maintaining the level of hygiene expected by the school is often central to their attendance. Lack of clothes and toiletries (in particular, sanitary items for older girls) is one of the most frequent reasons cited by parents as the reason their children drop out (others have to do with treatment at the school; see section 5.6 on community consultation). Learners who feel that they are dirty and wearing the wrong clothes, especially if they are teased about this by other learners, will simply not stay at the school – this was specifically emphasized in several interviews, and succinctly summarized by a teacher at the Tsumkwe workshop as follows:

According to parents the reason for dropping out is lack of clothes, washing powder and Vaseline. At the Village Schools there is no one who laughs at them, when they come to Tsumkwe they have no shoes; they are ridiculed and run back to villages. Basic help like that is needed to retain older children in transition to other schools.

– Teacher, Tsumkwe meeting, 10 October 2010

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical issues 7 – Uniforms and toiletries:

A specific fund should be set up to provide learners with uniforms and toiletries, if they are expected to attend the mainstream schools with other children who are clothed in uniforms and have access to soap, toothpaste, and other necessary items (including sanitary items for older girls). This should not be a once-off donation, but an ongoing supply.

5.4 Stakeholders, roles and responsibilities

There are a number of important stakeholders in NAMAS activities, with various levels of involvement. The primary stakeholders can be grouped into the following categories.

5.4.1 Primary stakeholders:

- NORAD: primary donor
- NAMAS employees, including those in Elverum and Namibia
- Ministry of Education, including Head Office in Windhoek; National Institute for Educational Development (NIED); Regional Office in Otjiwarongo; Circuit Office in Grootfontein
- Staff of government schools in Tsumkwe East and West
- NAMAS-supported VS teachers and principal
- Ju|'hoansi and !Kung community members and their organizations, including conservancies.

The “primary stakeholders” are listed in a general “top-down” order, as an illustration of how decision-making processes are often understood to take effect. For example, a communication by NORAD to the NAMAS head office in Elverum that too high of a proportion of funds are spent on Norwegian staff in Namibia resulted in NAMAS' decision to reduce the number of project coordinators on the ground in Namibia and not to renew the contract of the Tsumkwe project coordinator. This decision was communicated to the Regional Office of Education, who was required to undertake a hiring process to find a local project coordinator. Because of the short time allowed for this process, there was a four-month gap in between the departure of the NAMAS project coordinator who was based in Tsumkwe, and the hiring of a new local coordinator, who is currently based in Otjiwarongo. Support for the VS principal, previously the responsibility of the NAMAS project coordinator, temporarily transferred to the NAMAS teacher advisor during the absence of a coordinator, who moved from Mangetti Dune to Tsumkwe. There was thus no longer a teacher advisor based in Tsumkwe West; this was a loss for the school staff and VS teachers based in that area. In Tsumkwe East, there was confusion about the roles and responsibilities of the teacher advisor, who moved into the house formerly occupied by both NAMAS project coordinators. This example shows how the top-down nature of decision-making that most recently took place has a ripple effect to key elements of the project.

However, decisions about participation in education-related activities are ultimately made by the people on the ground. Other stakeholders can, through their decisions about how and what to support, help to create an environment in which parents, children, teachers, leaders, and others from Tsumkwe East and West can make *fully-informed* choices. They can also help create and support more positive learning environments, in which children and others will have the opportunity to build capacity and to improve their economic situation.

There are a number of partners with whom NAMAS can productively work to help create such an environment. In addition to the key involved stakeholders listed above, there are also a number of other government and non-government organizations and training institutes that are either already working in partnership with NAMAS, or who have expressed interest in working with NAMAS.

5.4.2 Other important current / potential partners and stakeholders

- Other Namibian government offices, in particular the Deputy Prime Minister's Office, San Development Programme and the Department of Adult Education
- Other NGOs providing complementary or related services, including WIMSA, NNDFN, LAC, OST, and KPF
- Training institutes, including TUCSIN in Windhoek and !Khwa ttu, the San Education and Culture Centre (in South Africa)
- Tertiary institutions, including the University of Namibia (UNAM, where the new BED programme is housed), Windhoek Polytechnic, and other tertiary or training institutions
- Other donors willing to fund education and rights related activities in Tsumkwe district
- Materials developers (previously NAMAS worked with the GTZ AfriLa project)
- Potentially: regional stakeholders in San education, such as the Kuru Family of Organizations in Botswana, and the Centre for San Studies at the University of Botswana.

Some of these are already in cooperation or communication with NAMAS, including most of the NGOs listed; previously there was also communication with the Windhoek College of Education. There is a need to cultivate relationships with tertiary institutions (especially those that will be relevant to teacher training).

NAMAS enjoys a very high approval rating from other stakeholders. The organization is seen as committed to the country in general, and as a central role-player in San education, as we have emphasized throughout this report. Previous commitment and positive reception means that NAMAS has an *opportunity* to take the lead in helping to develop and support innovative solutions to the chronic problems that face San communities regarding education.

It also means that NAMAS has assumed a level of *responsibility* in this area. It is important to all stakeholders that support for activities that NAMAS helped to initiate, or otherwise supported, not be withdrawn without ensuring that adequate capacity is in place to take over these activities.

Furthermore, we recommend here and elsewhere in this report that rather than withdrawing, NAMAS is well-positioned to take a lead role in coordinating a collaborative approach to San education in Namibia, and potentially drawing in regional stakeholders as well. This is not to suggest that NAMAS needs to expand its area of operation, but rather that it build upon its strong position in Namibia and bring other stakeholders to the table to determine who can best fulfill which responsibilities to improve San education. Such a position could be carried out in conjunction with WIMSA's regional education programme, for example.

The creation of a position of a *NAMAS national education coordinator* was suggested by previous project managers. The individual in this position would become very familiar with the situations on the ground in Tsumkwe and in Opuwo, and would liaise regularly with the NAMAS head office in Elverum. This could be either a Norwegian or a local position. Based in Windhoek, this person could also play a role in the coordination suggested above, and play a more deliberate and active role from the current NAMAS office in Windhoek – which currently appears to be primarily a repository of NAMAS files and a guest house.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Roles and Responsibilities:

NAMAS should consider the creation of the position of a *national education coordinator* who can be based in Windhoek, work with projects in Tsumkwe and Opuwo, and liaise more regularly with the NAMAS head office in Elverum. This person could also play an important networking role for indigenous education in Namibia and potentially the southern African region.

5.4.3 Challenges that need to be addressed

Currently, there are several problems and questions concerning the roles and responsibilities of stakeholders. General Challenges include the following:

- **Capacity**, especially concerning delivery and operation of project at national and local levels
- **Transitions** and unclarity about who is doing what
- **Communication** gaps, leading to feelings of being disrespected or neglected.

5.4.3.1 Capacity

The question of capacity came up at various levels – expressed as a questions about whether the various stakeholders have the capacity that is needed to manage the responsibilities expected of them. In particular this came up with regards to three primary stakeholders: the community (including the teachers); the principal; and the Regional Education Office.

Ultimately, it is the *community* whose capacity needs to be built, in order to make the best decisions that they can, and to advocate effectively for themselves. Any education project must also include an element of capacity-building in a broad sense. This is part of the concept of the Village Schools, for example, to build capacity both by incorporating parents and others into the school, and also by supporting a new generation to access the skills needed to gain employment, be effective leaders in a national society, and to advocate for their rights. However, as the Village Schools focused increasingly on corresponding to mainstream standards, there was less and less room for “uneducated” parents and others to be involved. Education became another thing that was provided for them. Unfortunately, this approach has not succeeded in substantially increasing the numbers of Ju|'hoansi who make it through the school system.

The Village Schools were also intended to build the capacity of local Ju|'hoansi *teachers* by providing them with training and experience. As described in the following section 5.5, most of the Ju|'hoansi teachers had difficulty meeting the standards of education required for formal qualifications. This issue will be addressed in more depth there; here however we include the teachers in the following recommendation.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (2) on Roles and Responsibilities:

Capacity-building for the community, the learners, and the teachers should be facilitated by NAMAS San Project staff – including returning to the original goals of the Village Schools and the stated ideals of NAMAS – by building upon the existing skills in the community and using them as a foundation for further learning opportunities.

The VS principal was also frequently described as not having the capacity to do his job. The VS principal, unlike most of the teachers, did complete his teacher training and became a qualified teacher. However, before he had gathered the necessary teaching experience that normally precedes appointment as a principal, he was moved into a position where he was responsible for five (now six) remote schools – a very unusual and difficult position. Although the current VS principal acted as deputy principal for some time, initially with support from the then-principal of Aasvoëlnes school who served as principal of the Village Schools, this limited administrative experience by the current VS principal is important to note. In short, the current VS Principal did not have adequate time to receive the guidance or administrative support and training necessary to become a principal. He was expected to take on a role he was not ready for, and then described as not having the capacity.

The Regional Director of Education in Otjondjupa very clearly said that her office did not currently have the capacity to take over the responsibilities that NAMAS had previously assumed. She reported that the decision for NAMAS to hand over all responsibility to the Regional Office was unexpected, and sudden. She was appreciative of NAMAS' willingness to renegotiate and to continue to support a local (national) project coordinator and some other salaries, and to provide some other assistance. She was not sure whether the office would be able to take over responsibility in 2012, as scheduled, but realizes the inevitability of the current situation of administrative transition. The implications of NAMAS support (or lack of it) are in large part financial; however there are also other important elements to NAMAS' contribution, including networking and broad experience in alternative forms of education and indigenous groups that the Ministry and the Regional Office may not be able to assume.

An important element of capacity-building is determining whether or not individuals and organizations actually *have* the capacity before placing them in a situation where they are expected to perform at a certain level. Expecting a level of capacity beyond a stakeholder's current abilities sets them up for failure.

RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 3:

Before decisions are made to promote individuals in particular positions, or for government to take over responsibilities, a careful assessment must be made to determine whether the readiness is truly there, and what forms of support are still needed to build capacity.

5.4.3.2 Transitions

The topic of transitions has been described in detail in section 5.1. Here we will briefly note how it relates to stakeholder roles and responsibilities. The main point here is that during transitions, unless efforts are made to fully inform stakeholders about the upcoming transitions and what it will mean for them, confusion occurs. This happens with transitions between organizational responsibility (such as

those involving NNDFN, the Ministry, and NAMAS, or also with changes of individuals in key positions – such as the change in NAMAS project coordinators in Tsumkwe in 2008. This change also entailed a shift in role and responsibilities, which was not be adequately communicated to communities. The result, such as in this example of change of project coordinators, can quickly lead to tensions and misunderstanding.

During the October workshops in Tsumkwe, one young Ju|'hoansi leader commented, “*Before NAMAS and the Ministry took over, the community was more involved. Now it is not clear who is involved and whom we should talk to.*” When one NGO (in that case, NNDFN) was supporting the Village Schools, the community knew who they could approach. But with responsibilities split and shifting, people currently do not know who they should approach – the result is that they often either approach the wrong person, or withdraw. This does not mean that NAMAS and the Ministry cannot work together – but it does mean that, especially during periods of transition, it is important that the community is fully *on board*. Although NAMAS sees themselves as having informed community members, it may not have been enough. See sections 5.2 and 5.6 for further recommendations on these issues.

5.4.3.3 Communication and coordination

At workshops in Namibia in October, it became apparent that there is little connection between the networks in Tsumkwe, and support networks in Windhoek. For example, some key Windhoek stakeholders were not aware of the existence of the NAMAS Steering Committee in the Tsumkwe district, for example; and key stakeholders in Tsumkwe and Otjiwarongo were not aware of the existence of the San Support Network. This indicates that there is a lack of communication and information transfer between the different regions of responsibility; this was noted frequently during the workshops.

In terms of the NAMAS Steering Committee, it is also not clear that all of the stakeholders are represented in that body. According to our information, neither the teachers, nor the community in general are adequately represented on that committee and considering the current administrative transitions, it may be necessary to consider other purposes and inputs within the steering committee, including leadership, representation, and other support needed.

RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 4:

There is a need to revisit the composition of the NAMAS Steering Committee and its role, to ensure that all the players are at the table – and have a voice.

RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 5:

As described in Priority Recommendation 1, there is a need for a *consultative conference*. Currently the stakeholders are not communicating effectively, and outcomes of this conference should include a clearer understanding of stakeholder roles and responsibilities and communication strategies.

5.5 Teachers and training

5.5.1 Teachers

The uptake and training of teachers from the Ju|'hoansi and !Kung communities is crucial to the success of the Village Schools, and of any other educational endeavor in the Tsumkwe district. Much of NAMAS investment is focused on their training, and it is acknowledged that the programme cannot proceed without them. This section will discuss some of the complicated issues around teacher uptake and training, mother-tongue education, and the issue of qualifications. Appendix B provides an outline of the teachers and some of the defining characteristics and provide a reference for the discussion in this section. The teachers in Tsumkwe district play a pivotal role in the educational success of San students, yet they are in very difficult positions educationally, economically and socially. Specifically:

- They are “in between” all the other stakeholders – community and students, NAMAS local staff, Ministry and other officials, the mainstream schools
- They are expected to facilitate the transition of students to Tsumkwe school, without having any control over what happens at that school
- There is little attention to the challenges they face on the forefront of an extreme cultural transition, in particular for the Ju|'hoansi community
- They are expected to complete the same kind of teacher training as other potential teachers in the country, but have not had the same background or educational opportunities
- They are expected to adopt a style of teaching and evaluation that differs – in some ways dramatically – from cultural styles of teaching
- They are expected to use materials that were designed for children from other cultures, more urban situations, and in some cases from very different countries
- Finally, those who are employed and who have shown commitment and dedication were “rewarded” in the first part of this year by not being paid – this is addressed under logistical issues (see section 5.3.3), but important to note here as an illustration of how teachers are treated.

It is thus very important that all decision-making processes around the teachers and teacher training take into consideration the difficult circumstances under which these teachers are operating. Support provided to the teachers must be tailored to address the circumstances and background of the teachers, and the needs of the community. For many teachers, *this will require programmes other than the mainstream teacher training programmes*. Suggestions regarding the priorities of alternative programmes and potential partners will highlighted in the recommendations below.

We would also like to highlight the point that, while in general San teachers struggle in the mainstream teacher training programmes, it is specifically the Ju|'hoansi who are “falling out” of the BETD programme at the highest rates, and having the most problems coping with the requirements. This should be viewed as indicating a serious *mismatch* between the training programmes and San culture and experience – with the Ju|'hoansi at the most most extreme end of a scale of incompatibility. Thus, the focus should be on finding culturally appropriate ways to help all San teachers to develop in a way that will serve their specific communities; particular attention to this is needed in the case of the Ju|'hoansi. Many recommendations below relate to this point.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Teachers and Principals:

The goal of increasing the number of *mother-tongue teachers* (speakers of Ju|'hoansi and other San languages) should be separated from the goal of increasing the numbers of *formally* qualified teachers working in Tsumkwe district, and appropriate strategies taken to reach each goal.

The discussion and recommendations below relate to these issues.

5.5.2 The VS principal

The principal is even more central than the teachers – he is in many ways at the nexus of the whole web of relationships around education in the Tsumkwe district. He was trained as a teacher – the first from his community – and had very little actual teaching experience before being promoted to principal of the Village Schools. Not only is he expected to take on a position that normally would require more years of service and training, he is also in a unique situation as a principal – responsible for multiple schools in hard to reach areas. He is also supposed to be responsible for the VS students who transition to Tsumkwe. He has no transport of his own, no phone line, fax, photocopying machine, etc. His communications to the Ministry are not answered in a timely way (see section 5.3). Without NAMAS support he would not be able to function as principal – he emphasizes this himself. Even with NAMAS support, he struggles. He has the enormously difficult position of leadership in an egalitarian community; in such a context it is extremely stressful for an individual to “rise above” the group and to bear the brunt of sometimes unpopular decisions. He gets little recognition or support for maintaining his position regardless of this pressure – to the contrary, he seems to be an easy target for criticism from the communities, the teachers, education officials from the Ministry, and others.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 2 -Village Schools Principal:

Special consideration should be given to the role of the principal and the critical but extremely challenging position he is in, and he should be more fully supported in ways aimed at developing his own capacity and maximizing his strengths.

5.5.3 Qualifications

Of the many issues related to the teachers that are problematic, as identified here and elsewhere in the report, most can be traced back to the question of “qualified” vs “unqualified” teachers. While it is important that teachers be able to prepare Ju|'hoansi and other San learners ultimately to succeed in mainstream systems, it is equally important that they be able to do this by drawing upon their own, and the learners', language and culture, and with awareness of social and economic realities. The current NAMAS teacher advisor made the following comment, based on his years of teaching experience in Namibia, as well as his initial experience and observations in the Nyae Nyae area:

It's my opinion that an untrained, unqualified teacher...can sometimes do a better job than a qualified teacher who doesn't have a full grasp of the language...Mother-tongue instruction at the early childhood level, as many researchers suggest, is greatly to the children's advantage. There is no one better to do that than a Ju|'hoansi himself or herself, and they could do it better than someone who simply speaks the language

conversationally, even if they have a certificate...A certificate means a lot to some people. But a good teacher without a certificate is better than a bad teacher with a certificate.

- NAMAS teacher advisor, 20 July 2010

There are two important points here that are central to the issue of teacher uptake and training. One is the critical importance of mother tongue-education – which requires teachers from the speech community. The other point is that if the formal qualifications become central to the process of teacher identification and placement, good teachers who are unable to become certified will be lost; likewise, inappropriate teachers can be hired simply because they are qualified. The section below will briefly discuss and make some recommendations regarding the uptake, training, and qualification of teachers for Tsumkwe district.

5.5.4 Teachers, mother-tongue education and the Village Schools

As noted elsewhere in this report, for the Village Schools in particular, it is important to distinguish between *San* teachers, teachers who *speaks* Ju|'hoansi, and teachers who *are* Ju|'hoansi. While teachers in all of these categories are important and in need of cultivation and support, it is the latter – the Ju|'hoansi – who struggle the most with the formal system – both students and teachers. Throughout our research, an issue that came up repeatedly is the fact that *Ju|'hoansi* themselves are “falling out” (or some said “pushed out”) of teacher training programmes. This is especially problematic given the emphasis on the cultivation of Ju|'hoansi teachers in the initial design of the VSP, and throughout the ten years of its operation before transition to the Ministry. It appears as though an original emphasis of the project has been compromised as the focus shifted to ensuring that teachers were formally qualified.

5.5.4.1 Ju|'hoansi teachers

Although people in Nyae Nyae were not necessarily unhappy with current teachers, they were unhappy with the fact that very few Ju|'hoansi were left in the programme (the Ju|'hoansi who are still teaching are also the ones struggling the most with the requirements of the BETD programme). The message that then comes across for the Ju|'hoansi is that they are lacking and inferior. Although the exceptional educational qualities the San practice naturally are recognized by educators from around the world no recognition is given to this in the mainstream systems, and most of them “fail”.

Another important aspect that must be taken into consideration for the Ju|'hoansi teachers is the contradictory social situation that they find themselves in. As is recognized in numerous writings about the Ju|'hoansi, an individual in a position of authority, or receiving a salary finds themselves in a situation that directly contradicts Ju|'hoansi social norms (Biesele 1993, 1994; Hays 2007). There is little or no recognition of the intense social negotiation that the Ju|'hoansi teachers are in the midst of. They are expected to perform like other teachers, although they do not have adequate resources, social support or counseling.

Given this situation, we recommend the development of a specialized teacher training programme for San teachers. It should function as a bridging programme, like the Instructional Skills Certificate

(ISC), but should be more extensive and more specialized to the situation of San potential teachers. The emphasis of the programme should be on developing the confidence of San teachers to teach *mainstream subjects* in a way that *matches their own cultural background and that of their students* – it is important that teacher training strikes a balance between these priorities. Too much emphasis on one or the other leaves teachers feeling unprepared in some of the circumstances they encounter.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 3:

A *specialized teacher training programme* for San teachers needs to be developed. The programme should be multi-faceted and should:

- include awareness of teaching strengths of Ju|'hoan and !Kung culture and build upon them
- recognize the difficult position that Ju|'hoan teachers are in, and provide culturally appropriate counseling and support for negotiating community dynamic
- function as a bridging programme to a variety of other educational, training, and employment initiatives including: the B.Ed programme at UNAM, adult education, curriculum and materials development programmes
- also link with other community-based education programmes, for example the proposed tracking academy
- recognize the role of the teachers as agents of their communities and empower them through training on rights issues and legal issues as part of the teachers training programme and curriculum
- make use of other NGOs in a position to provide such training, such as TUCSIN.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 4:

Serious consideration should be given to developing an official qualification for *Ju|'hoansi language experts* who can work with learners in the Village Schools and Tsumkwe schools, even if they are not officially qualified teachers (see recommendations below).

5.5.4.2 Non-Ju|'hoansi San teachers

During our research period, we did not receive any specific complaints about individual teachers based on the fact that they are “not Ju|'hoansi” (the few complaints we did receive were about individual behaviors, and are something that must be negotiated on a case-by-case basis). Given the lack of qualified San teachers, the fact that these teachers speak Ju|'hoansi, and the commitment they have shown to teaching in Tsumkwe district, we strongly recommend their continued support. In addition to support obtaining formal qualifications, support improving their Ju|'hoansi language skills is also recommended.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 5:

Teachers who do not read or write (or possibly in some cases speak) Ju|'hoansi, but who are committed to teaching in the area should be given special support in improving their abilities in the language. The principal has suggested that this should be done through the Ju|'hoansi Transcription Group, at the CLDC. This suggestion should be supported and this training facilitated.

5.5.4.3 Relations with Tsumkwe schools

The relationship between the Village Schools and the Tsumkwe schools is tenuous in all ways. In particular for the teachers and principal, there should be much more communication and interaction between the two sets of schools. At various points in the past, there have been Ju|'hoansi teachers posted at TJSS, either on a yearly or rotational basis. However, that is not currently happening. According to the current teacher advisor, this is because there are not enough teachers to rotate.

However, if skills in the Ju|'hoansi language are recognized as a legitimate skill and a qualification developed for this skill, then a qualified Ju|'hoansi language expert could teach alongside a government-certified teacher, and their complementary skills could enrich the teaching and learning experience.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 6:

There is simultaneously a need for more flexible options for the development of San in teaching positions in government schools, including those without official qualifications. Positions should include teacher aids, language teachers working together with “qualified” teachers, and others. Such pairings should be approached as an opportunity for cultural exchange and mutual learning and teaching. The language skills and cultural knowledge of the Ju|'hoan teachers should be recognized alongside the teaching skills of the government-qualified teacher.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 7:

In general there is an urgent need for more communication between the government schools and the Village Schools teachers. This should happen through cluster schools mechanisms – there should be more opportunities for teachers in Tsumkwe to visit and support the Village Schools and more opportunities for VS teachers to do rotations. Cross communication between the government schools and the Village schools teachers should ultimately allow opportunities for teachers from both schools to exchange materials and ideas on innovative approaches to training for teachers of San children.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 8:

The above discussion on teacher development suggests three categories of potential teachers for the San / Ju|'hoansi community. These may be overlapping – but they will also require different strategies for identification, training, support, and placement:

- A priority should be the identification and cultivation of *good teachers from the San / Ju|'hoansi community*
- A complementary approach should be the identification and ongoing support of *good teachers who are familiar with and sensitive to the San / Ju|'hoansi culture and who speak the relevant language*
- There should also be room for *good, qualified teachers who are sensitive to the San / Ju|'hoansi culture* (even if they are not themselves San), interested in working in the area who can be placed together with a local teacher who speaks the language.

In conclusion, the options for the development of teachers in the Tsumkwe district need to be expanded and made more flexible to accommodate the needs of the community and increase the options for Ju|'hoansi and San education.

5.6 Community involvement and consultation

The parents must be convinced that schooling for their children will have a positive effect for them and their children. They must trust in the quality and order in the school and that their children are not exposed to harassment and abuse. They expect that their children are taught to respect their parents and culture but fear the generation gap that will be created when their children receive the education they themselves were never offered.

- Bernt Lund, Consultative Conference, page 39

NAMAS has recognized since the beginning the importance of involving the community in the education of their children. In fact, the Ju|'hoansi and !Kung communities *are* active, and very clear and consistent about what they want. The stereotype that San parents “don't care about education” or are “not involved” (frequently stated by government representatives, for example) is not true when one looks at a closer level and actually talk to them. The issue is not just about “parent involvement.” In general, people in the Tsumkwe district are acting on their beliefs about what is right for them.⁴

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Community Involvement:

It should be recognized that the community has been expressing their suggestions and recommendations about their educational needs all along, including to this evaluation team. Their opinions should be taken into consideration in all decision-making processes, and where possible given priority. No major changes should be made without intensive consultation of communities, and their input should be taken seriously.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (2) on Community Involvement:

Consultation should be seen as a step towards ultimate *ownership* of educational initiatives by the community, and *responsibility* for them. This can only happen when the community is included at all levels of design and implementation and evaluation.

Specifically related to the Village Schools and transition to Tsumkwe school, the most consistent input that the Nyae Nyae communities give is that after finishing three years at the Village Schools, their children are still too young / small to go to Tsumkwe, and that they are not well-cared for there. This was repeated in our interviews with communities, and was raised again at the October workshops in the Tsumkwe district.

⁴We acknowledge the social problems that do exist – and in some cases are getting worse (for example, alcohol abuse), and which interfere with parents' ability to make good decisions about their children. However, the majority of parents in the Nyae Nyae villages do not fall into this category. Furthermore, one potential approach to such social problems is to involve people in decision-making processes.

This is supported by the ages of the children that we found at Tsumkwe school – all those from the VS who were still there in grades 4-6 were between the ages of 12–16 (and mostly in the older years of this range; see Appendix E). Many reported having tried earlier, returned home, and eventually come back when they are older.

RECOMMENDATION on Community Involvement 3:

In particular, the concern that parents have for their children being old enough to go to Tsumkwe, and their frequently-expressed concern over how their children are cared for in the hostels, *must* be considered. They have been saying this for at least ten years and it has been largely disregarded or not perceived as a priority.

Another issue is the relationship between the schools, and other leadership and management structures in the area. For example, prior to the takeover of the VS by the Ministry, and NAMAS involvement, when NNDFN was responsible for the Village Schools, there was a link between the VS School Board and the NNC and the Traditional Authorities (TA). Since the Ministry took over, it is not clear how NNC or the TA are involved with the Village Schools or with education in general. This situation also limits community involvement in education. The Village Schools committees also need more attention.

RECOMMENDATION on Community Involvement 4:

Develop more interaction and relationships between the offices of NNC and the TA. It is also necessary to develop much more active community school committees, and more ways to interact with them. This requires training for the school boards, as well as more frequent meetings in order to keep people informed.

The community and others have raised the issue of extending the Village Schools beyond grade 3, and also having a transitional structure before they go to Tsumkwe school – something to prepare them for school in Tsumkwe. These possibilities have been under discussion for several years now, and it is time for concrete possibilities to be laid out, and for another round of community consultation to take place on this question. (See Specific Recommendations on Village Schools in section 6.2.)

RECOMMENDATION on Community Involvement 5:

Methods of community consultation must be carefully considered and undertaken in a way that matches community decision-making processes. Following are two possibilities for conducting consultation; the method should be decided together with community leadership:

- A consultant or team of consultants visits every community in the area, presents the primary decisions under consideration and various factors involved, discusses these, and gets feedback. Time has to be allowed for the community to fully discuss; two visits may be necessary
- A consultant or team of consultants can work with a team of carefully chosen community representatives from different districts, work through the options to them, and facilitate their gathering of information from the communities, over a period of time.

SECTION 6: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Western and formal notions of education have weakened the traditional and community-based learning and socialization processes in San communities and thereby contributed to their marginalization and alienation. To retain the strengths of the San culture...while simultaneously adding knowledge needed for modern survival...poses a tremendous challenge. This should be achieved through alternative or complementary forms of education. Such alternatives have to be low-cost, replicable, culturally appropriate but politically non-threatening and adaptable to ethnically mixed group situations.

- Le Roux, 1999, *Torn Apart*, page 5

Nothing is more unequal than equal solutions to different problems

- Lund Report, 2002, cover page

6.1 Conclusion

Bernt Lund's desk study from 2002 begins with the quote above. This evaluation reflects the perspective that access to quality mainstream education is critical to indigenous communities, and is a right. However, San communities are currently not accessing mainstream education in Tsumkwe district at the levels expected, or the levels of other ethnic groups – despite almost 20 years of focused attention to education in the area. The current educational situation is resulting in further marginalization, and undermines San communities' own efforts and decision-making processes. This calls for a re-evaluation of strategy, and a need to reconsider the original emphasis of the Nyae Nyae Village Schools on providing alternative approaches based in the culture and language of the local community, and consider ways that the model can be adapted to fit current circumstances and experience.

Ultimately, access to formal education, and to economic opportunities, will be best achieved through approaches that build upon the unique culture, language and skills of San communities. This perspective is not founded in ideal romanticism – it is based on long-term experience and research in the region, as well as research on indigenous education in other parts of the world.

The findings of le Roux's region-wide study on education over ten years ago (le Roux 1999) came to very clear conclusions that resonated with government officials, researchers, community members, and others involved in San education. Her conclusions and recommendations have been widely cited. However, a core finding – the need for development of alternative or complementary forms of education, summarized in the above quote – has yet to be addressed anywhere in southern Africa. The Tsumkwe district, and in particular the Nyae Nyae Conservancy, is in an ideal position to develop workable, community-based solutions to improving the access of San learners to quality education.

NAMAS is also the ideal partner in such an endeavor. During 30 years of involvement, NAMAS has developed the capacity to address education in Namibia. NAMAS has also developed sensitivity to the specific needs of the community in the Tsumwke district. They have a positive image in the country and in the district, and are recognized for their commitment and support of innovative approaches. Their strategy of understanding the situation deeply before acting and willingness to be flexible in their approach is also very much needed to develop workable approaches with San communities. The recommendations below indicate ways in which these strengths can be built upon to improve NAMAS' effectiveness in the Tsumkwe district.

6.2 Recommendations

This sub-section lists the recommendations from each section, beginning with some priority recommendations. These recommendations are intended to help find a balance in the need to access mainstream educational and economic opportunities (including teacher training), and the need for the development of alternative approaches – and for bridges between these, in order to maximize the options available to the San community of Tsumkwe.

PRIORITY RECOMMENDATIONS

PRIORITY RECOMMENDATION 1:

NAMAS should remain active in the Tsumkwe district and if possible should increase support – not reduce it. NAMAS support and activities currently play a vital role in educational initiatives in Tsumkwe district and they are the best-positioned role-player in Namibia to support the process of improving education in the Tsumkwe district.

PRIORITY RECOMMENDATION 2:

There is an urgent need for a consultative conference that includes the variety of stakeholders and that addresses the state of NAMAS and the current transition. This conference should be planned for as early as possible next year, and should include all stakeholders. A community information and consultation campaign should take place before this conference and the San community should dictate the terms of their participation in the conference.

PRIORITY RECOMMENDATION 3:

NAMAS should develop an overarching mission statement that guides their decision-making processes, and which contextualizes their goals, objectives and activities. This statement should reflect the general need for capacity-building of San communities, and allow for both mainstream and alternative approaches to reach this goal. This statement should take its cue from indigenous rights approaches, in particular the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UN General Assembly 2007) and the ILO 169 (ILO 1989).

PRIORITY RECOMMENDATION 4:

NAMAS and Government need carefully to work out their roles in relation to each other in educational activities in the Tsumkwe district.

In particular, the following considerations must be kept at the forefront of discussions:

- Alternative education programmes needed (as evidenced by the consistent low participation of Ju!'hoansi in existing formal systems)
- Governments in general – not just Namibia – have difficulty integrating progressive programmes into their systems
- The overwhelming tendency to standardize and require adherence to linear, tight schedules does not work well for indigenous communities negotiating their own transition processes
- There thus needs to be a degree of flexibility in relationships and roles, time lines, and delivery of key outcomes
- NAMAS should be willing commit themselves to long-term processes of community education and development. Particular areas that need such focus include: teacher training and the support of mother-tongue education beyond grade 3.

PRIORITY RECOMMENDATION 5:

NAMAS should build upon existing efforts and develop alternative approaches to education in the Tsumkwe district. The problems are complex and not easily addressed through mainstream approaches – as illustrated by the figures for the region, nation, and district.

In particular, we recommend the following guidelines for an approach:

- a long-range view and willingness to commit to support the *process* rather than setting strict time limits for transitions
- a willingness to support alternatives to current approaches to teacher training
- a commitment to facilitate the development of culturally appropriate education practices, support structures and materials
- a commitment to support alternative community-based training projects that build upon the skills that the community already possesses and that correspond with economic opportunities in the region
- a commitment to community involvement in decision-making processes involving traditional authorities, conservancy, school and other community stakeholders
- an emphasis on sustainability
- an emphasis on capacity-building.

SECTION 2: BACKGROUND and CONTEXT

RECOMMENDATION on Context 1:

NAMAS and government efforts in the Tsumkwe district should take cognizance of the historical development of the projects being supported, and the historical role of the community in defining them. Any changes made should be in consultation with the community.

RECOMMENDATION on Context 2:

The current social context of the Tsumkwe district also must be taken into consideration. *In particular, the following considerations must be kept at the forefront of discussions:*

- The vulnerability of the San population in the Tsumkwe district to neighboring groups who seek to move onto the land in the area and encroach onto existing land and educational situation
- The pervasive food insecurity of San communities in Tsumkwe
- The rapid and difficult transition process that San communities – in particular the Ju|'hoansi – are currently experiencing in the area
- Rapidly escalating social and health problems including alcoholism, violence, TB and HIV infection rates
- The general lack of employment opportunities in the area and the apparent lack of positive correlation between formal education levels and wage employment.

SECTION 3: GOALS

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Goals 1:

NAMAS should facilitate the development by the community of a *vision and mission statement* that reflects what the community wishes to achieve in education. This should be done through a process designed to produce a clear and focused statement (see recommendations on community consultation).

NAMAS should develop an overarching *mission statement* that describes their role in helping the community to move towards its vision. This statement should guide their decision-making processes, and contextualize their goals, objectives and activities. In general, the mission statement should:

- reflect the general need for capacity-building of San communities
- allow for both mainstream and alternative approaches to reach this goal
- take its cue from indigenous rights approaches, in particular the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Article 14 (UN General Assembly; see also section 3.5 of this report).

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 2:

NAMAS should integrate the emphasis on *rights* into its educational programme, and more clearly articulate its approach to rights for San communities. An indigenous rights approach recognizes the need for alternative approaches, as well as access to mainstream education, in order for indigenous communities to access their basic rights; this is the approach that should be followed.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 3:

NAMAS should consider designing and implementing a *rights-awareness programme* that includes training of communities (including teachers), relevant service providers (such as local police) and other decision-making bodies (steering committees, cluster representatives) on specific issues. This should be done in collaboration with LAC. *Specific recommendations in this regard include the following:*

- Radio broadcasts on rights issues in Ju|'hoansi / !Kung are a cost-effective and appropriate way to disseminate information and support for this should be reconsidered by NAMAS
- Research into what issues are most relevant to the community and how to present them would make radio broadcasts and other awareness programmes much more effective.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 4:

NAMAS should review indigenous rights mechanisms, in particular those referencing education, and use this approach as a frame for all of their activities in Tsumkwe district.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 5:

Systems for tracking learners from Tsumkwe East and West should be put into place. In particular, the learners from the Village Schools should be more carefully monitored, in order both to track individual learners and to monitor trends in learner attendance and matriculation at Tsumkwe Primary, Junior, and Senior Secondary schools in order to improve educational provision and attainment.

RECOMMENDATION on Goals 6:

In general, much more attention should be given to the creation of 'positive social environment for children and youth' at Tsumkwe schools and in town. Specific recommendations in this regard include the following:

- More activities at school and in town that are based in San culture, including art, music, dance and drama, as well as other activities like sports
- More Ju|'hoansi hostel caretakers should be appointed. They should be both male and female, from different parts of the conservancy, and should receive training.

SECTION 4: IMPACTS

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 1:

The position of NAMAS in Namibia is extremely important. We strongly recommend that NAMAS should build upon their historical relationship, long-term perspective and sustained investment in the country. San issues require long-term involvement, and NAMAS is in a position to commit to this. The socio-political capital they have accumulated should be utilized to pressure for the need for appropriate approaches to San education, and an indigenous rights approach. (See also Priority Recommendation 1).

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 2 – The CLDC and TRC:

The CLDC and TRC have grown into important centres of personal and professional development. There is now a need to support the development of activities that build upon and utilize the resources of these centres. In particular we recommend the following:

- Strengthening partnerships with existing bodies like Kalahari Peoples Fund and the Ju|'hoansi Transcription Group already using the CLDC, and developing new partnerships
- The CLDC should also be used to inform non-San in Tsumkwe, visitors, and others about San culture, rather than being only a “one-way” knowledge transfer and a tool for mainstreaming; the library can be the starting point for this exchange of knowledge
- Internet access in the area should be upgraded so that it is reliable and consistent and broader reaching. This will greatly improve the usefulness of the CLDC, which is already used for internet communication; having internet access would benefit the TRC enormously.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 3 – Teacher Support:

Support for teachers should be carefully worked out between stakeholders and should be increased where possible considering the great need for local teachers in Tsumkwe district, as well as the very difficult and uncertain circumstances in which these teachers are working – see recommendations under section 5.5 below.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 4 – Practical assistance:

NAMAS should ensure that the tangible support that it provides and that is recognized by other stakeholders is sustainable, and not creating unrealistic expectations on the part of other stakeholders.

RECOMMENDATION on Impacts 5:

Unless the situation at government schools and hostels in Tsumkwe are more welcoming to San students, NAMAS impact on San education cannot be measured through increased attendance in these schools. NAMAS can address the situation by simultaneously supporting the development of alternative approaches, and working with the government to develop a plan to improve the government schools.

SECTION 5: CHALLENGES

5.2 Transitions

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 1:

There is an urgent need to develop greater transparency and communication among stakeholders, including between NAMAS and the Ministry; between the Ministry and the teachers and principal, and between all parties and the communities – particularly when it comes to changes that are being considered or have been decided.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 2:

The process of decision-making about the way forward for the Village Schools should include the provision of basic historical information about educational processes in the Tsumkwe area over the past 20 years.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 3:

NAMAS should continue its support to teachers in the interest of maintaining a consistent, supportive presence, and should encourage the development of bridging programmes by other role-players.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 4:

The issue of mother-tongue education is central, and NAMAS should take the following into consideration in all planning (see also recommendations on teachers, section 5.5):

- The consistent request of the community for mother-tongue education beyond grade 3
- The need for Ju/'hoansi and !Kung materials development and distribution
- The need for better coordination among various stakeholders working with mother-tongue education.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 5:

There is a need for constant recognition of the enormous transition the community is negotiating and to take this into consideration in all activities and decision-making processes – local *capacity-building* should be central to all efforts.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 6:

Trends indicated by the limited statistical research conducted for this evaluation (in particular that VS learners who remain at Tsumkwe school tend to be older than average, and have family support in the town) should be followed up and taken into consideration for future planning (see also Appendix E and Recommendations on the Village Schools).

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 7:

In general, relationships between the Village Schools, or any other schools that San children attend, and the schools into which learners will transfer must be cultivated and maintained, and students who transition should be monitored and receive support. The change in environment from a mother-tongue, culturally-based school into a more mainstream school is overwhelming to young learners, and support is needed through this transition.

RECOMMENDATION on Transitions 8:

Parents clearly state that their children are not well taken care of at Tsumkwe school and that they are too young to be in that environment. Thus:

- If possible, transition to Tsumkwe school should be delayed until learners are older (see Specific Recommendations on Village Schools below)
- Simultaneously, efforts should be made to develop accommodation for VS learners at Tsumkwe school, with an adequate number of Ju'hoansi caregivers
- Teachers at Tsumkwe school need to be sensitized to Ju'hoansi culture
- More Ju'hoansi should be employed at Tsumkwe – as teachers assistants for example, if they are not qualified teachers.

5.3 Logistical issues

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 1:

Although NAMAS cannot be expected to take on all the logistical issues raised here, until these are addressed, progress will be halted. NAMAS and the Ministry should organize a meeting as soon as possible in order to identify who is responsible for what and reach consensus on the priorities of issues that need to be addressed.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 2 – Food Security:

There is an urgent need to discuss a sustainable solution to the issue of food that is *nutritionally*, *practically*, and *culturally* acceptable, and that does not increase dependency.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 3 – Food Security:

A thorough assessment of strategies that have been tried thus far, their success rates, and the actual opportunities for accessing food (including bush food, livestock, donations and shops) should be carried out and should result in suggestions for sustainable food procurement strategies, and how they relate to education in the area.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 4 - Transportation:

NAMAS and the government should work together to determine an appropriate solution to ensure that consistent transportation is available, especially for teachers, principals, and learners.

Examples of possible solutions for discussion include:

- Purchase of a vehicle and hiring of a driver by NAMAS or government with the specific job of driving the principal, teachers, and learners for clearly defined purposes
- Assistance to village entrepreneurs to get a taxi license, support to start an income generating activity that could help each village with (paid) transport. Support needed would include driving lessons, help with applications for small business support and help administering first income so as to pay back vehicles on loan
- Alternately, a similar programme could be tried with donkey carts. Although the donkey cart programme appears to have failed both times it was tried, there were specific problems both times that could be addressed (i.e. lack of ownership of the carts and donkeys; design of the carts). This solution could be revisited as a small business (rather than a communally-owned donation).

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 5 – Payment of Teachers:

NAMAS and the Ministry should reconsider the issue of payment to teachers, and how it is handled. This is an issue that must be taken very seriously in order to build upon investments already made in teacher training. Lack of payment sends messages to teachers that they are not respected, and puts them in a vulnerable economic position. It does not lead to increased commitment or better performance.

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 6 – School structures:

The lack of appropriate accommodation for the teachers, especially at the Village Schools, and the poor state of the schools themselves does not contribute to a good learning environment. Upgrading of the Village Schools structures, including the school buildings, furniture, and the accommodation for the teachers should be incorporated into future plans for the Village Schools (see recommendations on Village Schools).

RECOMMENDATION on Logistical Issues 7 – Uniforms and toiletries:

A specific fund should be set up to provide learners with uniforms and toiletries, if they are expected to attend the mainstream schools with other children who are clothed in uniforms and have access to soap, toothpaste, and other necessary items (including sanitary items for older girls). This should not be a once-off donation, but an ongoing supply.

5.4 Roles and Responsibilities

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 1:

NAMAS should consider the creation of the position of a *national education coordinator* who can be based in Windhoek, work with projects in Tsumkwe and Opuwo, and liaise more regularly with the NAMAS head office in Elverum. This person could also play an important networking role for indigenous education in Namibia and potentially the southern African region.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 2:

Capacity-building for the community, the learners, and the teachers should be facilitated by NAMAS San Project staff – including returning to the original goals of the Village Schools and the stated ideals of NAMAS – by building upon the existing skills in the community and using them as a foundation for further learning opportunities.

RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 3:

Before decisions are made to promote individuals in particular positions, or for government to take over responsibilities, a careful assessment must be made to determine whether the readiness is truly there, and what forms of support are still needed to build capacity.

RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 4:

There is a need to revisit the composition of the NAMAS steering committee and its role, to ensure that all the players are at the table – and have a voice.

RECOMMENDATION on Roles and Responsibilities 5:

As described in the priority recommendations, there is a need for a *consultative conference*. Currently the stakeholders are not communicating effectively, and outcomes of this conference should include a clearer understanding of stakeholder roles and responsibilities and communication strategies.

5.5 – Teachers and Principals

MAIN RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 1:

The goal of increasing the number of *mother-tongue teachers* (speakers of Ju|'hoansi and other San languages) should be separated from the goal of increasing the numbers of *formally* qualified teachers working in Tsumkwe district, and appropriate strategies taken to reach each goal. The recommendations below relate to this issue.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 2 -Village Schools Principal:

Special consideration should be given to the role of the principal and the critical but extremely challenging position he is in, and he should be more fully supported in ways aimed at developing his own capacity and maximizing his strengths.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 3:

A *specialized teacher training programme* for San teachers needs to be developed. The programme should be multi-faceted and should:

- include awareness of teaching strengths of Ju'hoan and !Kung culture and build upon them
- recognize the difficult position that Ju'hoan teachers are in, provide culturally appropriate counseling and support for negotiating community dynamic
- function as a bridging programme to a variety of other educational, training, and employment initiatives including: the B.Ed programme at UNAM, adult education, curriculum and materials development programmes
- also link with other community-based education programmes, for example the proposed tracking academy
- recognize the role of the teachers as agents of their communities and empower them through training on rights issues and legal issues as part of the teachers training programme and curriculum
- make use of other NGOs in a position to provide such training, such as TUCSIN.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 4:

Serious consideration should be given to developing an official qualification for *Ju'hoansi language experts* who can work with learners in the Village Schools and Tsumkwe schools, even if they are not officially qualified teachers (see recommendations below).

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 5:

Teachers who do not read or write (or possibly in some cases speak) Ju'hoansi, but who are committed to teaching in the area, should be given special support in improving their abilities in the language. The principal has suggested that this should be done through the Ju'hoansi Transcription Group, at the CLDC. This suggestion should be supported and this training facilitated.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 6:

There is simultaneously a need for more flexible options for the development of San in teaching positions in government schools, including those without official qualifications. Positions should include teacher aids, language teachers working together with 'qualified' teachers, and others. Such pairings should be approached as an opportunity for cultural exchange and mutual learning and teaching. The language skills and cultural knowledge of the Ju'hoan teachers should be recognized alongside the teaching skills of the government-qualified teacher.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 7:

In general there is an urgent need for more communication between the government schools and the Village Schools teachers. This should happen through cluster schools mechanisms – there should be more opportunities for teachers in Tsumkwe to visit and support the Village Schools and more opportunities for VS teachers to do rotations. Cross communication between the government schools and the Village schools teachers should ultimately allow opportunities for teachers from both schools to exchange materials and ideas on innovative approaches to training for teachers of San children.

RECOMMENDATION on Teachers and Principals 8:

The discussion on teacher development suggests three categories of potential teachers for the San / Ju'hoansi community. These may be overlapping – but they will also require different strategies for identification, training, support, and placement:

- A priority should be the identification and cultivation of *good teachers from the San / Ju|'hoansi community*
- A complementary approach should be the identification and ongoing support of *good teachers who are familiar with and sensitive to the San / Ju|'hoansi culture and who speak the relevant language*
- There should also be room for *good, qualified teachers who are sensitive to the San / Ju|'hoansi culture* (even if they are not themselves San), interested in working in the area who can be placed together with a local teacher who speaks the language.

5.6 – Community Involvement

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (1) on Community Involvement:

It should be recognized that the community has been expressing their suggestions and recommendations about their educational needs all along, including to this evaluation team. Their opinions should be taken into consideration in all decision-making processes, and where possible given priority. No major changes should be made without intensive consultation of communities, and their input should be taken seriously.

MAIN RECOMMENDATION (2) on Community Involvement:

Consultation should be seen as a step towards ultimate *ownership* of educational initiatives by the community, and *responsibility* for them. This can only happen when the community is included at all levels of design and implementation and evaluation.

RECOMMENDATION on Community Involvement 3:

In particular, the concern that parents have for their children being old enough to go to Tsumkwe, and their frequently-expressed concern over how their children are cared for in the hostels, *must* be considered. They have been saying this for at least ten years and it has been largely disregarded or not perceived as a priority.

RECOMMENDATION on Community Involvement 4:

Develop more interaction and relationships between the offices of NNC and the TA. It is also necessary to develop much more active community school committees, and more ways to interact with them. This requires training for the school boards, as well as more frequent meetings in order to keep people informed.

RECOMMENDATION on Community Involvement 5:

Methods of community consultation must be carefully considered and undertaken in a way that matches community decision-making processes. Following are two possibilities for conducting consultation; the method should be decided together with community leadership:

- A consultant or team of consultants visits every community in the area, presents the primary decisions under consideration and various factors involved, discusses these, and gets feedback. Time has to be allowed for the community to fully discuss; two visits may be necessary
- A consultant or team of consultants can work with a team of carefully chosen community representatives from different districts, work through the options to them, and facilitate their gathering of information from the communities, over a period of time.

Section 6.3

SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS on the Village Schools

The Village Schools, although not the only focus of NAMAS, is an important area of involvement. Discussion around the Village Schools has been one of the most focused areas of conversation and recommendations.

As we have emphasized in this report, it is clear that potential models for educational initiatives in the Tsumkwe district need to be explored. The Village Schools is one existing model, but the structure of the project needs to be revisited. After over 15 years in operation, both the community and other stakeholders have greater insight into what will work and what seems not to. Furthermore, the possibility of extending mother-tongue education higher than grade 3 needs to be explored.

Models that have been suggested include the following:

- Upgrading the Village Schools to higher grades, and improving the facilities (frequent request from the community)
- Maintaining / Upgrading the Village Schools to grade 3 and starting a consolidated school outside of Tsumkwe. This school would be aimed at Ju|'hoansi students and work towards mother-tongue education up to as high a grade as possible. The consolidated school could begin in grade 1, but should be structured to absorb a significant intake of VS graduates in grade 4. This school would go up to grade 6 or higher, and include a hostel
- Closing the Village Schools and consolidating Ju|'hoansi learners in a school outside of Tsumkwe, beginning in grade 1, and continuing up to grade 4, 6 or higher
- Mainstreaming San children into the government school in Tsumkwe from grade 1.

RECOMMENDATION on Village Schools 1:

We strongly recommend that no concrete decision should be made on this issue without extensive community discussion. However, based on our research and experience in San education and in the Nyae Nyae area, we recommend moving in the direction of *expanding* the options available to the Ju|'hoansi community for mother-tongue education, for increasing opportunities for parents to be involved, and for delaying their transition into Tsumkwe School until they are older. Thus the **first two options** above most closely fit these priorities.

RECOMMENDATION on Village Schools 2:

Other models that have been developed for San communities, most importantly the Minority Education Programme (Botswana, 2005) as well as models for indigenous communities in similar situations in other parts of the world, should be consulted for potential input.

Section 6.4

SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS on Further Research:

We cannot emphasize strongly enough the need for extensive consultation with Nyae Nyae communities to determine what people think will be the best solution for them and their children. We recommend the following areas for further study:

- Community consultation on any further changes to the Village Schools Model, or other changes to educational delivery in the area
- Tracer study of former Village Schools students
- Survey of economic opportunities in the Tsumkwe area, including those drawing upon indigenous / traditional knowledge, and appropriate education and training possibilities
- Research regarding international models for indigenous education to identify which might be adapted to the Tsumkwe district, and to identify potential partners
- Research regarding how concepts of human and indigenous rights are specifically relevant and useful to the Tsumkwe community.

Bibliography of Sources Consulted and Referenced

- Biesele, Megan. 1992. Texts for Self-Literacy in Nation-Building: Ju|'hoan Curriculum Consultancy Report. Windhoek: Nyae Nyae Development Foundation of Namibia.
- Biesele, Megan. 1993. Eating Crow in the Kalahari: Leveling Lessons Taught by the Ju|'hoan Bushmen to their NGO. Manuscript in possession of author.
- Biesele, Megan. 1994. Human Rights and Democratization in Namibia: Some Grassroots Political Perspectives. Paper prepared for the Annual Meeting of the African Studies Association, Toronto, Ontario, November.
- Brörmann, Magdalena. 1991-1993. Quarterly reports on the Village Schools Project in the Nyae Nyae area. Windhoek: NNDFN.
- Brörmann, Magdalena. 1993-1994. The Village Schools Project in Nyae Nyae, Otjozondjupa Region, Namibia. Annual Reports.
- Brörmann, Magdalena & Pfaffe, Joachim. 1995a. The "New Spirit": A Pedagogical Viewpoint of Recent Developments in Nyae Nyae.
- Brörmann, Magdalena & Pfaffe, Joachim. 1995b. Revised outline of objectives and proposal for the facilitation of take-over by the MEC: The finalisation of the Village Schools Project under the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation. Prepared for the Ministry of Education and Culture (MEC).
- Dickens, Patrick. 1992a. *English Ju|'hoan, Ju|'hoan English Dictionary*. Windhoek; Nyae Nyae Development Foundation.
- Dickens, Patrick. 1992b. *Ju|'hoan Grammar*. Windhoek, Nyae Nyae Development Foundation.
- Dickens, Patrick. 2005. *A Concise Grammar of Ju|'hoan with a Ju|'hoan-English glossary and a Subject Index*. Cologne: Rüdiger Köppe Publishers.
- Dieckmann, Ute. 2010. Review Report on Ongoing San Development Initiatives in Namibia. For AECID-ILO Project on Promoting the Implementation of the rights of the San Peoples in Namibia. Legal Assistance Centre, Windhoek.
- Education Management Information Systems (EMIS). 2009. *Education Statistics 2008*. Ministry of Education and Culture, Windhoek.
- Felton, Silke. 2003. Report on preliminary consultations for NAMAS on Proposed project in Tsumkwe District: Multi-Purpose Learning Centre.
- Government of the Republic of Namibia. 2010. Agreement Between Regional Office of the Ministry of Education in Otjozondjupa and NAMAS on the transfer of Responsibilities within the San Education project, Training of BETD INSET teachers in Tsumkwe and support to local TRC and CLDC in Tsumkwe, June.
- Government of the Republic of Namibia. 2010. Regional Office Otjozondjupa and NAMAS. San Education Project Hand Over Process from NAMAS to MoE, February.
- Government of the Republic of Namibia. 2009. Programme Agreement Between the Government of the Republic of Namibia, Ministry of Education and NAMAS, November.
- Government of the Republic of Namibia. 2008. Ministry of Education Annual Report 2007/8.
- Government of the Republic of Namibia. 2007. Ministry of Education Annual Report 2006/7.
- Hays, Jennifer. 2007. *Education, Rights and Survival for the Nyae Nyae Ju|'hoansi: Illuminating Global and Local Discourses*, PhD dissertation, State University of New York, University at Albany.
- Hays, Jennifer. In Press. Educational Rights for Indigenous Communities in Botswana and Namibia. in the *International Journal of Human Rights*, V 15 no 1, 2011.

- Heckler, Melissa. 1992. Oh Place Where we Have Played, Stay Well: An Indigenous Village Learning Environment. Report on 1990 pre-school pilot project. Windhoek: NNDFN.
- Heugh, Kathleen. 2005. Theory and Practice: Language Education Models in Africa. In Association for the Development of Education in Africa. In Alidou et al. *Optimizing Learning and Education in Africa – the Language Factor. A Stock-taking Research on Mother Tongue and Bilingual Education in Sub-Saharan Africa*. Association for the Development of Education in Africa, UNESCO Institute for Education, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit. Working Document for the ADEA Biennial 2006, Libreville, Gabon. 56-84.
- Hopson, Rodney K. & Hays, Jennifer. 2008. Schooling and education for the San (Ju|'hoansi) in Namibia: Between a rock of colonialism and the hard place of globalization. In Hopson, R.K. , Yeakey, C.C., & Boakari, F. (Eds). *Power, Voice and the Public Good: Schooling and Education in Global Societies*. Oxford, Emerald.
- Hopson, Rodney K. 2005. Child protection and survival in southern Africa: Focus on Child welfare policy in Namibia. C.C. Yeakey, T.A. Reed, & J.W. Richardson (Eds.). *Suffer the Little Children: National and International Dimensions of Child Poverty and Policy*. Oxford: Elsevier. 307-334.
- International Labour Organization (ILO). *Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, C169*, 27 June 1989.
- Kann, Ulla. 1991. *Where the Sand is the Book: Education for everyone in the Nyae Nyae area*. Consultancy report for the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation in Namibia (NNDFN) and the Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA).
- Lee, Richard. 2010. Tsumkwe at 50: The 2010 Social Survey of a Namibian Ju/'hoan town. Paper presented at the 2010 Annual Meetings of the American Anthropological Association, New Orleans LA, Nov. 20, 2010.
- Le Roux, Willemien. 1999. *Torn Apart: San Children as Change Agents in a Process of Assimilation*. Windhoek, WIMSA.
- Le Roux, Willemien. 2002. *The Challenges of Change: a tracer study of San preschool children in Botswana*. The Hague: Bernard Van Leer Foundation.
- Letloa Trust. 2005. Minority Education Programme: Towards Equal Access and Educational Empowerment for the San People of Botswana. Proposal Submitted to De Beers.
- Lund, Bernt. 2002. *Mainstreaming Through Affirmative Action*. NAMAS, Windhoek.
- Ministry of Education. 2010. Fifteenth School-Day Statistics. Village Schools. Republic of Namibia.
- Ministry of Basic Education, Sport and Culture. 2000. National Policy Options for Educationally Marginalized Children. Republic of Namibia, Windhoek.
- !Nara Training Centre. 2006. *Halfway Evaluation of the San Education Project in Tsumkwe Otjozondjupa Region*. NAMAS, Windhoek.
- NAMAS. 2010. Annual review to Ministry of Education, 4-5 March.
- NAMAS. 2009. Minutes from Steering Committee Meeting 24 Nov.
- NAMAS. 2009. Minutes from Steering Committee Meeting 16 April.
- NAMAS. 2009. Minutes from Steering Committee Meeting 5 March.
- NAMAS. 2009. Annual report submitted by Jenny B. Møller.
- NAMAS. 2005. San Human Rights and Legal Capacity Building Programme 2003-2005.
- NAMAS. 2003. Consultative Conference on the proposed Multi-purpose Multi-Purpose Learning Centre in Tsumkwe District. Otjiwarongo, 3-4 April.
- NAMAS. 2003. Affirmative Action for San education in Tsumkwe District – An initiative by NAMAS and MBESC, February.

- National Institute for Educational Development (NIED). 2008. *Status Update on the Implementation of the ISC Program for San Teachers at Tsumkwe, September 2007 – August 2008*.
- NORAD. 2005. Department for NGOs Year Report of San Project in Tsumkwe District.
- Office of the Deputy Prime Minister. 2009. The San Development Programme Report 2005/2009. Republic of Namibia, Windhoek.
- Pfaffe, Joachim F. 1995. Educational Psychology and the Psychology of Marginalized Peoples: The Village Schools Project. *School Psychology International* 16:43-58.
- Saugestad, Sidsel. 2001 *The Inconvenient Indigenous: Remote Area Development, Donor Assistance, and the First People of the Kalahari*. Uppsala: Nordic Africa Institute.
- Smith, Andrew B. 2001. Ethnohistory and Archaeology of the Ju/'hoansi Bushmen. African Study Monographs, Supplement 26:15-25.
- Thomas, W. and V. Collier. 1997. *School Effectiveness for Language Minority Students* NCBE Resource Collection Series, No. 9, December.
- Thuto Isago Trust. 2010. Report on survey of children aged between 5 and 16 not in school November 2009 in Gantsi District. Unpublished survey.
- UN General Assembly, *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples*: resolution adopted by the General Assembly, 2 October 2007, A/RES/61/295
- Wiessner, Polly. 2004. Owners of the Future? Calories, Cash, Casualties and Self-Sufficiency in the Nyae Nyae Area Between 1996 and 2003. *Visual Anthropology Review* 19(1-2):149-159.