

FINAL REPORT

May, 2006

An Interim, Process Evaluation of the Promotion of Women in Education (PWE) program (West Africa)

Jackie Kirk, PhD

Executive Summary

The Promotion of Women in Education (PWE) program is a network of twenty-one teacher organizations in fourteen West African countries (Benin, Burkina Faso, Ivory Coast, Ghana, The Gambia, Guinea-Bissau, Guinea-Conakry, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Sierra Leone and Togo). The program was initiated in 1997, and implemented from 1999, and is supported by three cooperating organizations, the Canadian Teachers' Federation (CTF), Utdanningsforbundet of Norway and Lärarförbundet of Sweden. The Education International (EI) African regional office is responsible, along with the PWE Coordinating Committee, for the program design, monitoring, implementation and evaluation, in consultation with the EI and the participating cooperating organizations.

Although regular internal evaluation meetings had been held during the life of the program, a full, external evaluation had not been undertaken. With a view to reviewing the program, assessing the strengths and weaknesses of the PWE processes and activities, and generating recommendations to ensure that the strengths of the program are further developed and weaknesses addressed, an interim process evaluation of PWE was planned for early 2006.

Although the evaluation was short, and only involved four of the participating countries, the overall results indicate that the program is one of great significance to women teachers involved in teachers' unions in the region, and to the development of the teachers' organizations themselves. It is a program to which there is a high level of interest, engagement and loyalty, not only from women teachers and union members, but also to some extent from General Secretaries (GS) and National Executive members. The evaluation process has generated evidence of impact at a number of different levels: impacts for individual women; impacts for organizational development and broader impacts in relation to government policy, socio-cultural attitudes. However, the work of promoting women in education is not complete and there remains a lot to do, and especially so in a context which is changing and which is producing some new challenges.

The program also has some weaknesses which, if not addressed effectively, will hinder program development and will be barriers to the full realization of the program's potential. Identified weaknesses include an overly ambitious and somewhat confusing program framework (including objectives and expected results), a lack of clear targets, unclear roles, responsibilities and lines of reporting, and communication difficulties across the whole program.

In conclusion, the PWE program is a successful one, and one which has created very real improvements for women teachers and educationalists in the region, as well as for their unions. In order to evolve, to remain pertinent to the different needs of the different member organizations, as well as to model an integrated approach to promoting women's participation and gender equality, it is recommended that the PWE should be more strategically defined as an integrated program of EI, rather than a semi-separate 'project' of EI. In this way, some of the difficulties around defining roles and responsibilities, job descriptions etc will be addressed, and opportunities will be enhanced for integrating gender equality into ongoing capacity building and support for organizational development of the EI affiliated national teachers' organizations. It will also facilitate synergies between the promotion of women in education and different EI programs, such as Child Labour, HIV/AIDS and Discrimination and minority groups. Such a shift will also support linkages between the PWE work in West Africa and the newly created other women's networks in Eastern, Northern and Central Africa.

Such an evolution will require careful management to ensure that ownership is retained by the women teachers and their male teachers of the region. It will also require (and support) a review and redefinition of the functioning of the PWE coordinating body and a sharpening of the program focus through a revision of the key objectives of PWE. These are necessary in order to ensure that the overall potential of the program is realized and that as teachers' organizations in the region continue to develop, and as awareness of women's roles in education, in union activities and in the future development at all levels grow, the program remains pertinent.

Following the outline of the evaluation framework, the evaluation report consists of the following sections: 1: Overview of PWE; 2: PWE Context; 3: Relevance of PWE 4: Impacts of PWE; 5: Efficiency and Organizational Capacity of PWE; 6: PWE Effectiveness; 7: Mini- PWE Case Studies (a: Togo, b: Benin, c: Ghana, d: Gambia) 8: Future Directions and Recommendations. Annexes 1-9 contain additional evaluation process information and the evaluation tools used.

FINAL REPORT

May 2006

An Interim, Process Evaluation of the Promotion of Women in Education (PWE) program (West Africa)

Jackie Kirk, PhD

Section 1: Overview of PWE and the Evaluation

The Promotion of Women in Education (PWE) program is a network of twenty-one teacher organizations in fourteen West African countries (Benin, Burkina Faso, Ivory Coast, Ghana, The Gambia, Guinea-Bissau, Guinea-Conakry, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Sierra Leone and Togo).

Women in West Africa are disproportionately affected by serious issues such as poverty (including the disastrous effects of the Structural Adjustment Programs), political instability, religious and traditional practices, and not least by gender discrimination. Limited gender equality initiatives mean that these issues remain largely unchallenged. Such issues have serious impacts on women's participation in the education sector; women are underrepresented in the teaching profession, with the highest concentration at the primary level and they are underrepresented in teacher organizations, especially in terms of leadership. Women tend to have low levels of education compared to men, and often lack confidence and self-esteem. There are unfortunately few support, training and upgrading programs specifically for women, partly because of the financial difficulties experienced by teacher organizations and by the unions of other education personnel.

In the late 1990s it was felt that there was an urgent need for support West African women teachers and female educational personnel, to promote their advancement and to help to improve this situation. The financial constraints of many national organizations do not allow the implementation of such a project within their own resources. The PWE was then established as a network with the aims of: (a) to promote the role of women in education; (b) to organize and train women leaders and encourage them to gradually take up union leadership positions; and (c) to form a network of women educators at local, regional and national levels. Discussions and planning first began in 1997, but activities began in 1999.

The cooperating organizations funding PWE are the Canadian Teachers' Federation (CTF), Utdanningsforbundet of Norway and Lärarförbundet of Sweden. The Education International (EI) African regional office is responsible, along with the PWE Coordinating Committee, for the program design, monitoring, implementation and evaluation, in consultation with the EI and the participating cooperating organizations.

Objectives of and Expectations for the Evaluation

The purpose of the interim evaluation was to assess the strengths and weaknesses of the PWE processes and activities, and to generate recommendations to ensure that the

strengths of the program are further developed and weaknesses addressed. The evaluation was designed to consider the extent to which the PWE is meeting its objectives, and seek to identify appropriate and relevant strategies to meet the objectives.

In this way the concerns of the cooperating organizations, as expressed during the Brussels November 2005 meeting, could be explored in more detail, and any new procedures, structures or processes identified and initiated in order to address them. At that meeting, communication and reporting, both narrative and financial, were identified as relative weaknesses, and the evaluation was planned to pay particular attention to documenting and analyzing these processes and providing recommendations for their improvement in the future.

The interim evaluation process, led by an external consultant, but with the close involvement of PWE staff and partners, was also designed to facilitate an internal review process. It aimed to build the capacity of the network to monitor its own development and progress towards agreed upon objectives, and to explore new approaches and strategies through which to meet those. As an interim process evaluation this study was also designed in order to inform the design of a more comprehensive evaluation framework for implementation at the end of the project cycle, in order to examine PWE related impacts in more detail and in a larger number of the fourteen West African countries involved.

Furthermore, the lessons learned from the evaluation will be shared with the individuals responsible for the other Women’s Networks linked to EI.

Evaluation Framework

As a critical early step in the evaluation process, an evaluation framework was developed and shared with the PWE staff, cooperating organizations, and participating teachers’ organizations for further input. This framework acted as a tool to define the scope and focus of the study, and the areas for review in the interim process evaluation. The framework is presented below, with the 2 levels (program and national) clearly identified. The framework is then also used to organize the findings into this report.

1. Program Level

The process evaluation considers the overall PWE program and some broad areas (and key questions) for assessment as indicated below:

Review Areas	Key Questions
Context	What are the key contextual challenges and opportunities, needs and priorities and how do they affect the PWE – both regionally and within the specific countries? (How) are these changing during the life of PWE?
Relevance	Do the PWE objectives still make sense? Are they the most relevant to partners in each country context? Are some of a higher priority than others?
Impacts	What outcomes are being produced, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended, positive or negative by the PWE program and by the specific activities of each teacher organization? Particular attention

	<p>will be given to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women's participation and leadership in the activities of participating teacher organizations • Women's participation in academic and professional upgrading and trade union training programs • Policy statements on gender equality and women's empowerment by participating teacher organizations • Research studies on girls' and women's education • Support to national teacher organizations from the national Governments and other national NGOs for their initiatives aimed at the promotion of women teachers and educational workers. • Impact of the PWE network on national gender policy (in education)
<p>Efficiency and Organizational Capacity¹</p>	<p>How economically are resources/inputs converted to results? Particular focus will be given to: Strategic leadership, Structure, Human resources (How effective is the HR structure of the PWE?), Financial management, Infrastructure, Project management, Process management, Inter-organizational linkages. How effectively are results being documented and reported to cooperating organizations? How well are the activities and results being documented and successes disseminated with the potential for replication?</p>
<p>Effectiveness</p>	<p>To what extent are program objectives being realized? To what extent are the PWE activities aligned to achieving the desired ends? Are there other strategies and activities which could better meet the objectives? Are there certain activities/strategies of country partners which could be replicated? Particular focus will be given to stated PWE objectives related to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data collection on specific issues affecting women & girls in education; • Capacity building of women within the unions especially in communication & leadership; • Upgrading of women education personnel; • Information sharing and networking including quality of publications; • Attitudinal changes and reductions in the rate of HIV/AIDS infection. <p>And also to desired process outcomes such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the involvement of stakeholders in the development of project design, implementation, and monitoring and overall workplans; • the extent to which the PWE acts as a forum for discussion, reflection and consultation on issues affecting women and • the integration and institutionalization of PWE values and priorities into the teacher organizations.

¹ Adapted from Universalis's Organizational Assessment Framework.

Future directions	What are the key conclusions, lessons and recommendations concerning the future?
-------------------	--

2. National Level

Simultaneously, the evaluation also looks in more depth at the particular experiences and activities related to PWE in 4 country contexts (Togo, Benin, Ghana, Gambia), and considers how the contextual factors, needs and priorities in each of these are being met. Whilst feeding into the overall evaluation, a mini case study was completed for each of these countries, highlighting specific issues, impacts and challenges as they relate to the overall evaluation framework.

Evaluation Methodology

The methodology for the interim process evaluation combined a) document review b) stakeholder focus group discussions c) face to face interviews with PWE staff and key stakeholders (particularly women teachers) in country d) discussion group/ interviews with EI staff in Lomé and e) email and/or telephone interviews with key staff from cooperating organizations (Canadian Teachers' Federation) (CTF), Utdanningsförbundet of Norway and Lärarförbundet of Sweden) f) evaluation questionnaires to all twenty-one African participating organizations. Preliminary document review and analysis took place prior to travel to West Africa. Although there was considerable email exchange, particularly with CTF prior to departure, in depth dialogue with cooperating organizations took place for the most part after the in-country activities. Correspondence prior to departure helped to identify particular areas of concern and interest, and provided guidance in terms of process (key people to interview, for example).

Background information and documentation on the PWE was provided to the evaluation consultant prior to departure for West Africa, and informed the development of the evaluation framework and methodology. These materials were also analyzed as part of the document review component of the evaluation methodology.

Based on the evaluation framework, an evaluation matrix was developed in which the areas for review, and the key questions were aligned with possible evaluation tools and processes. A subsequent step in the preparation phase was the development of draft evaluation tools including: a) a simple document analysis tool b) focus group discussion protocol c) interview protocols for different stakeholders and d) email/ telephone interview protocols for dialogue with key staff from cooperating organizations e) evaluation questionnaires for secretaries and PWE Contact Persons from participating organizations.

In each of the four national program locations visited, preparations had been made beforehand for meetings with PWE Contact Persons (2 of whom are full time union employees responsible for gender equality and women's wings activities), with representatives from the PWE committee and/or Women's Wing, with members of the national executive (including Secretary Generals). It was also possible to meet with two members of the PWE Coordinating Committee, one of whom is also PWE Contact Person for her organization, and one who is now no longer directly involved with her union's leadership. The number of participants interviewed in each place and at a time differed according to circumstances and timing; PWE staff and the partner teacher

organizations, provided guidance on the best way to proceed. In general in each location, Assibi Napoe (EI Regional Chief Coordinator), with the presence of Sylvie Blewoussi (Temporary PWE Officer), introduced the consultant, the evaluation plan and process and then withdrew in order for the evaluation meetings to be held without the presence of PWE staff.

Finally, the data sets were subjected to ongoing, iterative review and consolidation during the data collection period. At the end they were re-analyzed using a narrative analysis method to map the key themes, ideas and issues back into the evaluation framework and to develop this comprehensive evaluation report.

There are significant limitations of the evaluation; firstly the limited time spent in the region and working with the PWE program and its staff and secondly the limited number of countries visited and so detailed national level data obtained. Although questionnaires were sent to the General Secretaries and the PWE Contact Persons of each participating teachers' organization, no responses have so far been received.

Section 2: PWE Context

Program Design Context

As explained in the overview, the PWE program was initiated in a context of very low levels of women's participation in teachers' organization activities, and especially in the organizations' leadership at the national level in the teachers' unions in West Africa. In the education sector as a whole it was recognized that women make up a large proportion of the teaching profession, especially at the primary levels, but that this is not reflected in the representation of women within educational leadership and administration and at high levels within the sector. As a female General Secretary of FESEN (the federation of Togolese teachers' unions), Assibi Napoe was one of only a small number of women active in leadership in teachers' unions at the time.

There was no comprehensive baseline study conducted, but those involved in the conceptualization, design and initiation of PWE (during 1997 and 1998) were very much engaged in the field, and fed their own perspectives and awareness of the situation into the program design process. According to Assibi Napoe, the barriers to women's participation in unions identified at the time comprised a combination of individual, institutional and societal factors.

Individual factors included low levels of education and professional training (especially in relation to male teachers), low self confidence and self esteem, sense of inferiority

Institutional factors included male dominated unions, 'aggressive' union cultures (including highly competitive elections), working styles which are unfriendly to women, for example evening meetings.

Societal factors included general tendency to assume women's inferior status, husbands' reluctance to allow their wives to be involved in union activities, additional burdens of women's domestic and childcare responsibilities.

Low levels of girls' education across the region were also of concern – and a contributing factor to the low numbers of women teachers, especially in rural areas. A survey was

initiated but the data collected was incomplete and not supported with up-to-date government and other statistics. However, participants' knowledge of the situation on the ground, and in the schools, indicated that girls' education was also an important issue for PWE to address.

Another contextual factor significant to the PWE program was the lack of information and resources on and for women teachers and union activists in the region. This dearth of material and information is then also compounded by the often mentioned lack of a reading culture in the region, and by the perceived lack of interest or commitment of women to read.

A Changing Context

As described below, it is recognized that there has been significant change over time in the context in which the PWE program operates; some of this can be attributed to PWE. There are now women in leadership positions within teachers' unions (for example the large, well structured and well resourced Ghana National Association of Teachers (GNAT) is led by a female General Secretary) and most of the unions have a relatively good representation of women on the national executives. There is little quantitative data available, but there is also concurrence on the increased number of women now in higher level positions within the education sector, for example, as head-teachers and above in the region.

In general, there is heightened awareness of and attention to gender equality in the education sector, and a greater acknowledgement of the importance of women teachers, especially in relation to increasing and sustaining girls' participation in schools. Education for All (EFA) and Millennium Development Goal (MDG) targets which explicitly state gender equality targets for education have raised the profile of gender equality in education at policy levels, and governments have been forced to at least articulate gender equality goals within their development plans (PRSPs for example).

Another contextual factor to consider is the increasing policy commitment of EI to gender over the years in which PWE has been in operation. Although gender equality is considered as a transversal theme in EI, subsequent to the "Policy Declaration on Women in Education and Teachers' Organizations" (1995), there have been a number of policies developed and adopted, particularly "Trafficking in Women, Girls and Boys" (2001) and "Gender and HIV/Aids" (2004).

The evaluation discussions with women teachers and union members, with General Secretaries and with PWE staff also indicated that there are improvements. There was particular recognition of the changed and changing institutional contexts, and of the improved policies and structures and processes within the unions which now attract more women, and make their participation at the highest levels more possible. There are, for example, reserved seats for women in national executives (in GNAT and the Gambia Teachers' Union (GTU), for example) and quotas set (for example 30% in GTU) for women's participation in all union activities, including trainings. Women are also increasingly keen to take on non-traditional offices within the union structures; in some unions at least, although in the past they would have been happy to be treasurers; now there are women secretaries, regional and district chairpersons too.

At the same time, as one interviewee expressed, a new generation of women involved in union activities brings its own challenges; younger women usually have other priorities, especially husbands and family and so it makes it harder to allocate time to union activities. In the Gambia, at least, the earlier group of women 'pioneers' who really made headway on women's issues within the union tended to be older women who already had grown up families and therefore a certain amount of flexibility and more time available.

Another factor which is changing the context in which PWE operates is the increasing reliance, in many countries, on contract teachers. One women headteacher in Benin explained that of her total staff of 20 teachers, 17 are contract teachers and only 3 permanent professionals. In places where the government has had to stop or greatly restrict teacher training and teacher recruitment, then classes are being covered by a growing number of contract teachers who, with limited training and lower levels of education, also tend to lack the same professional commitment to teaching that trained, career teachers might have. Furthermore, seeing their teaching as little different to any other employment, union activities and involvement is of far less interest to the contract teachers. At least one interviewee also bemoaned the lowered professional conduct of contract teachers, suggesting that the risks of sexual violence and exploitation of students in school was exacerbated by the presence of many contract teachers.

And there is still a widespread acknowledgment of continued barriers to women's participation at the higher levels of the education sector as well as within the unions. As the President of the GTU stated, "The trend has started, and we want to continue to step further forward not backwards". An emerging challenge that was mentioned in Benin and in Ghana is that as programs such as PWE are successful and women are being promoted in their schools, then it is harder for them to commit time to union activities and to maintain their previous levels of activity.

There is a tendency, however, to relate these remaining barriers to women's participation to women's own internal attitudes and capacities and to imply that women teachers in the region still lack confidence as well as the necessary skills – especially communication skills – with which to contribute to union activities. These perceptions shape action plans focused on workshops for women on topics such as communication. As one woman PWE Contact Person explained, "The main barriers are within us. Some are not sure of themselves, because of our religious and traditional background, Even if you convince them at meetings [to be involved in union activities/ to stand for positions] then they go home and sit and don't think they can do it and so they stay in themselves." Interestingly, it was a man who mentioned that men within the union may have an interest in perpetuating women's lack of confidence and limited capacities in order to maintain their own superiority.

One national executive member summed up the situation as he sees it: "We should break the barriers of the women themselves –generally our policies don't discriminate against women's education, leadership etc." He then did refer to other inhibiting factors as a continued barrier to women's advancement in education, for example, sexual violence against women teachers - from their husbands who may be jealous of their professional advancement and/or resent time spent away from family. Husbands' perceptions that women's involvement in union activities as indicative of sexual activity was also mentioned by one male executive member as a barrier to women's

involvement. For single mothers the constraints may not be husband-related, but more likely financially and time-related.

Girls' education, one of the priority issues for PWE when it was first established is one on which there are also improvements across the region. Again, PWE does not track progress with any statistics, but general indications are that there is increased awareness of the rights of girls to attend school and that there are improvements in girls' access to education. Attention has shifted slightly towards retention and achievement, rather than narrowly focused on enrollment – and there is some indication that PWE interventions have also shifted in focus.

Although it was not brought up by participants in the evaluation as a particular issue for women teachers in the region, the context in which PWE is operating has been changed by the HIV/AIDS pandemic. All education related policy or programs in Africa have to respond to the impact that HIV/AIDS is having on education systems and resource, on teachers and teachers' families, as well as on the role of school for HIV/AIDS affected children. This imperative to address HIV/AIDS is also relevant to PWE, and since the program was first initiated, an additional objective was added specifically related to reducing HIV/AIDS prevalence. Most recently, a workshop was held in Lomé for PWE contact persons to write a new information pamphlet on HIV/AIDS, particularly focused on the gender dimensions of the pandemic. Another pragmatic consideration was also mentioned in relation to taking on the issue of HIV/AIDS, that is that there is often funding available for HIV/AIDS related activities.

Section 3: Relevance of PWE

The evaluation discussions and interviews indicate an overwhelming agreement that, given the context in which it was developed, and general perceptions of the barriers to women's participation in education, the PWE program – as broadly defined and understood - is highly relevant. The focus on trainings for women teachers appears to be particularly relevant where the Ministries and unions are unable to provide quality training and professional development activities for their teachers.

As they are broadly defined within the PWE framework the aims and objectives are seen to be generally addressing issues affecting women teachers within the region. As one of the interviewees in Togo described, “Les objectifs PFE englobent beaucoup de choses qui sont vraiment pertinents”

This ‘match’ between the priorities on the ground and the PWE activities at a regional level has been attributed to the fact that those who were involved in developing the program were very much involved in women's wing and/or gender equality activities within their own country and union contexts and fed in their priorities. Union GSs were also involved in the development of the PWE program, and so were able to ensure that their own realities were reflected. It would seem that there is a 2 way process in operation; the grassroots level experiences and priorities have shaped the broad PWE framework, and then this framework is then further shaped, refined and applied at the national level. As interviewees described, the PWE framework acts as a ‘blueprint’ for national level Women's Wing/PWE activities, and relates well to the national priorities – or the other way round: the national level activities support the PWE framework. As one

Women's Wing (GNAT-LAS) member in Ghana says, "I realized that the PWE action plan is exactly what GNAT gender policy is about. As we work for GNAT-LAS so we are working for PWE."

Although there is a general sense that the program is highly relevant, one external concern is that the PWE program of trainings cannot be very effectively targeted to respond to specific issues in particular contexts. Perhaps because little detailed data is used within the program, and there is little opportunity to collectively highlight the differences and variations across countries (and even within countries) and identify very specific issues on which to focus, there are some missed opportunities to target particular issues and to assess the PWE activity impacts in relation to these. The limited monitoring and evaluation processes used to assess the PWE programs also mean that there is no real 'loop' created around activity implementation, evaluation, and then follow up activity design. Although there may well be others that were not reported in sufficient detail, there were only a small number of very targeted interventions identified by the Women's Wings and committees, for example a project to encourage graduating high school girls to become teachers in the rural areas of the Gambia where there are real shortages of women teachers (although this project is not a PWE supported initiative).

Section 4: PWE Impacts at Different Levels

The overall evaluation results indicate that over the 7 years of its existence, PWE has become a program of considerable significance for women teachers, as well as for the unions in general, and has made a difference in the region. Trainings provided to participating organizations are a key intervention in the PWE program, and since the program began, over 37 regional or sub-regional trainings have been organized, training a total of 1764 women between 1999 and June 2005.

For different reasons, such as the limited data collection and management as well as the merging of PWE- and non-PWE supported activities within the unions, it is virtually impossible to calculate the number of women who have benefited from PWE-supported trainings or other activities at the national level. One estimate provided by PWE at the end of 2004 mentioned 3000 women directly affected by the PWE activities, and a 'best guess' of 5000 women indirectly affected, although it is unclear how these figures are calculated.

Having said this, a rough estimate calculated now could well be 5000 women. Even if, as is described below, the cascade method of further dissemination and training has been problematic, especially in some countries, if each woman trains – or shares this information in some way with - an average of only 10 women, then the number of women reached is over 17000. Although turn-over of women in the unions is a problem it is to be expected that a considerable number of these trainings actually involve the same women. 5000 therefore may be the best estimate that can be made.

What is even more difficult to assess is the actual impact and outcomes of these trainings. There is no baseline data to refer to, no pre- and post-tests for trainings, little follow up from each training, and PWE reports and evaluations generally refer only to numbers of women involved, topics covered etc. The evaluation process has however,

generated considerable qualitative evidence of a high level of impact at three interconnected levels: for individual women, for the organizational development of teachers' organizations and thirdly more generally on government and ministry policy-making, and on societal attitudes towards women in education.

PWE Impacts for Individual Women

There was a broad consensus that the PWE trainings and other activities have increased women's self confidence, enhanced their skills, especially in communication and generally encouraged them to 'get involved', to take on responsibilities within the unions and even to contest seats on national executives, in Women's Wings, at district, regional and national levels.

PWE staff gave anecdotal evidence of the immediate impacts of trainings, in which during the first days, women listened quietly and rarely actively participated, but by the end they were freely and confidently sharing their own ideas, perspectives and opinions:

"When you see that at the beginning they [women participants] come and sit quietly with their head down, and just stand alone in the breaks, and then at the end they are contributing, sharing their ideas and opinions and talking with others...."

A noticeable impact is also reported with regard to how women teachers have – after PWE training – seen possibilities to become principals, and have applied and succeeded in professional exams in different countries.

Women members of the national organizations, who had participated in different trainings, gave testimonies of the ways in which the trainings had a) encouraged and motivated them b) improved their self confidence and belief in their own abilities and c) developed their skills in ways which really made a difference to what they were able to do, and especially what they were then able to do promote other women's participation and empowerment within and through the union.

Women's Wing members in Ghana were particularly articulate about the PWE-supported trainings they attended. These were very timely, happening soon after their election into leadership positions within the GNAT Women's Wing (GNAT-LAS). "The participants were mostly freshly elected leaders and so they are now equipped with skills on how to lobby, mingle with male counterparts, on how to organize their time, manage stress and communication too." One of the women explained the impact for her personally: "Before the workshop I found it very difficult to stand in front of people, but now I am equipped with skills to communicate. I have confidence and I can encourage ladies to be active and come out of their shells". Her colleague agreed, saying "It was a very big thing that happened for me".

In Gambia, one of the women who has been very instrumental in the PWE activities expressed how involvement in PWE has given her "a chance to grow".

Several women interviewed also talked about an enthusiasm for studying and for personal/professional development which had been sparked by the PWE trainings. As one woman who participated in a national training in Ghana described, "It has really helped me – and has encouraged me to go back to school and to read more. Before, I

didn't want to read much, but now I know I have to study." The Deputy Secretary General (DGS) and Administrator from the same union (TEWU) concur that the trainings provided have really made a difference for their female members. TEWU represents school support staff, such as canteen and office workers, rather than teachers, and these women are apparently typically not interested or confident enough to pursue their studies or their professional development. Yet the PWE training, especially the focus on computer skills, has inspired them to try to further develop themselves and particularly to enroll in computer classes.

One Togolese woman who has been involved in PWE activities through the FESEN showed a series of comics for young people that she had written and got published having been inspired by PWE women writers' activities. She had very creatively taken the PWE newsletter, 'Pro-femmes' format and adapted it for a different audience.

As is explained below, the individual skill development that has been facilitated by the PWE trainings then have impacts for organizational development and strengthening. It was recognized by General Secretaries and other national executives that women trained through PWE programs are then able to contribute to the union in a very meaningful way.

Impacts for Organizational Development

PWE-supported skills development for women members has enabled and empowered them to act as agents of gender equality within the unions, to increase women's membership, to develop specific programs for women, and to create internal policy changes which integrate and mainstream gender equality and women's issues within the union. Numbers-wise the potential impact of PWE in terms of strengthening unions and even just the women's wings is considerable; the GNAT (Ghana) alone, for example, has over 150,000 members, including over 90,000 women.

PWE Resource Persons are those women who as members of grassroots teachers' organizations, have been trained by the national PWE Contact Person, and who then convey those learnings and skills to the women within their own groups. PWE Resource Persons are also usually members of the national PWE/ Women's Wing Committee. At one level, it was recognized that the improved capacities of the PWE Resource and Contact Persons enable them to attract new women into the union. In general, these women act as role models to other women, showing them that union activity is possible, empowering and positive for women. More specifically they organize activities, particularly at the grassroots level, such as workshops, discussions, Women's Day celebrations on relevant topics and thereby attract new women to the union. Increased membership strengthens a union, especially in contexts where there are a number of unions vying for the same potential members, even if it does not always translate into the payment of union dues. The President of the GTU (Gambia) talked of a post 1999 "dramatic" increase in women's membership, but stated that it is the increased participation of women in programs which is the most noticeable. This he attributes to the PWE programs, "because the PWE programs encourage them to expose their capacities". Unlike other interviewees, he states that women were not lacking in confidence beforehand, more that they were without opportunities to develop and to show their confidence, through, for example, taking up positions of responsibility within the union.

In the case of Benin, especially, where the unions are less stable and because of their fragmentation, there is competition for membership, then the role of PWE in attracting women was especially important to the executive members.

At another level, the skills developed by women union members and leaders have enabled them to develop programs and activities which have benefited the union as a whole, and helped it to develop. The President of the GTU (Gambia), for example, very clearly articulated how PWE training has enabled the leaders of the Women's Wing to develop an action plan and to successfully plan and implement a number of activities for women. They have started to "innovate, to partner with others and they are now able to sit as a group and formulate plans". One concrete example is the collaboration between the Government's Women's Bureau and the Women's Wing; apparently prior to PWE training and capacity building women teachers would not have been doing advocacy and negotiating in this way with a government department. The contribution of the Women's Wing has also been recognized in an invitation to nominate candidates for the national 'Women in Development' award. As one of the Women's Wing members interviewed in Gambia stated: "If our members are empowered, our Wing is empowered" Also just raising awareness of the Women's Wing here - through PWE programs it has really made the Women's Wing known through the country and has increased participation of the women in the regions."

Women trained in communication, advocacy and lobbying through the PWE program have also been well-prepared and positioned to raise issues relating to internal union policies and to advocate for more women-friendly policies, as well as for budget allocations for specific activities for women. The GNAT (Ghana), for example, has now adopted a gender policy and makes significant financial and other resource commitments to meet the priority issues of the GNAT-LAS membership.

The integration of Women's Wing activities (some directly supported by PWE but others inspired and encouraged by PWE) into the organizational plans and budgets of the national organizations is a significant achievement in terms of gender mainstreaming and of creating sustainable changes in union culture and activity. This has happened in a number of unions –and especially the stronger ones. In FESEN (Togo), for example, the national yearly action plan lays out the gender-related activities – such as a seminar on the menopause – in relation to all other activities. This encourages ownership of the gender-related activities by the membership at large, and also at least some sharing of responsibility for successful programs. At FESEN (Togo) the Women's Wing leaders work together with the executive members responsible for training to develop trainings/ workshops on gender-related topics.

The GNAT's (Ghana) Gender Policy, spearheaded by the union's Gender Focal Person and PWE Contact Person represents a considerable organizational commitment to mainstreaming gender issues and women's priority needs. Work started on the policy in 2002, with country-wide consultations and input into the draft policy which was finally adopted in 2003. This policy has recently been reproduced in a pocket size and printed in many thousands of copies for distribution to the membership. Although clearly not totally attributable to PWE, it is certain that PWE trainings and support gained from being part of the network, have helped to support the leadership of the Gender Focal Person on this initiative.

The allocation of funds to Women's Wing and/or gender related activities is another indicator of impact at the organizational level. This is happening in a small number of the stronger organizations, such as GNAT (Ghana) and GTU (Gambia). It is partly a result of PWE that the GTU has prioritized and allocated funding for a full time desk officer for gender equality and Women's Wing activities and that the GNAT (Ghana) funds the Gender Focal Person position. Although it may not be easy for less stable unions with very limited finances and less international support, larger unions such as GNAT (Ghana) and GTU (Gambia) are able to allocate substantial core funding to women's wing activities; the GTU for example, has increased its allocation from D 30 000 year to D 72 000 (from approx. US \$1,050 to \$2,450

An important point was made by at least 2 interviewees in different countries in relation to the role of PWE in supporting and promoting gender-related advocacy within the unions at the national level; that is that when recommendations are made and issues raised at a regional level (for example at a regional or sub-regional PWE training) to be taken back to the national organization, then they are apparently taken seriously – because they emanate from a regional overview, and also because each organization fears being somewhat left behind if they do not act on them !

Another significant PWE impact articulated by the executive of the GTU (Gambia) is the strengthening of the democratic culture of the union. The General Secretary was proud to explain how the seats that have been reserved for women are now hotly contested. In the past, these seats – at district, regional and national level - were rarely contested and so assigned to the only candidates. In fact he told the story of the national Electoral Commission being asked to oversee the elections for the Women's Wing only a couple of years ago, and they left very disappointed that they had had no work to do! Now, however, the situation is different and there are more and more nominations for the positions. The GTU also runs an annual 'Best Teacher' award -a competition that is open to men and women teachers. In the past the nominations were solely from men, whereas there are now women contesting this award.

Aside from enhanced advocacy on gender issues, one woman teacher and PWE Contact Person in Benin described how the negotiation skills were put to very good use and for the benefit of the whole union. With the recent split in the union and ensuing leadership problems, the Ministry of Education had refused to continue to work with the union. This interviewee, though, was the only woman included on the team which went to visit the Minister to protest this severe penalty, and was able to use what she had learned in PWE trainings – especially, as she described it, "Une souplesse dans la language" – to negotiate on behalf of the union, and to come away with an agreement from the Minister that she would continue to engage with both union leaders.

Beyond the trainings mentioned, the different missions, formal and informal meetings between union executives and the PWE Coordinator, especially in the early days of the program, is also to be reckoned as a factor in the PWE impacts on organizational commitment to women and gender equality. PWE reports from 2001, 2002 and to a lesser extent 2003, detail activities undertaken during missions to participating organizations. It would seem that these visits were important in terms of clarifying PWE objectives and processes, and in advocating for gender mainstreaming within the unions, although without identified objectives for the visits, or follow up reports, and with no systematic data collection process, it is difficult to quantify the results of such missions. Apparently since 2004 there have been no PWE follow up missions, apart

from a March 2005 visit to Benin to try to resolve differences between the different unions and to maintain the multi-union PWE Committee.

Clearly the potential of PWE trained and supported women to make such differences is related to the overall structure and culture of the union, and to its financial and structural stability. Of the countries visited, the teachers' organizations in Ghana and the Gambia are particularly well-established, stable and well-resourced enough to have a number of full time staff, including gender desk officers. Such organizational structures and set ups, as well as the broad experiences and positive attitudes of the male leadership of the unions create a more conducive environment for women to operate and to implement new skills learned during PWE trainings. The contesting of seats by women as well as men described by the GTU executive is also to some extent dependent on an institutional culture that women feel attracted to.

Broader Impacts in Relation to Government Policy, Socio-cultural Attitudes

Although far smaller in number, there were also references made by interviewees as to how the PWE support for women has benefited the girls in their schools and classes: the training encourages women teachers to be confident and to act as role models which in turn influence the girls and encourage them to study hard. Furthermore, the information on topics such as Female Genital Mutilation (FGM) and HIV/AIDS which women teachers access through PWE activities and publications is often also passed on to the students. One executive member was questioned on his statement that yes, PWE had made a vast improvement in girls' education in the country, and asked for more detail on the linkages: wasn't it really the MoE policies which had had a greater impact? He replied that it is the PWE-trained and supported women teachers who enact the MoE policies, and act as role models to the girls at the school level and so who really make a difference!

Although the cause-effect linkage is weaker, and there are other contributing factors, there is some qualitative and anecdotal evidence that the PWE program has at least contributed to significant policy shifts at ministry levels, and created some shifts in societal attitudes toward women and girls in education. This point relates back to the previous two in that it was acknowledged that women teachers trained through PWE programs have gained leadership positions within their unions, and have thus contributed to policy decisions including advocacy points and positions to take up with the ministries. This has led to unions integrating gender equality demands into their overall advocacy platforms, and in some cases achieving or at least contributing to changes in ministry policy to the benefit of women and girls.

In Togo for example, one of the gender related successes of the FESEN has been the advocacy work with the Ministry of Education which has resulted in new policy to reduce the school fees for girls at all levels. This is a policy initiative which clearly cannot be attributed to PWE nor to FESEN alone as it is taking place in a context of increased international attention to gender equality in education, and increased pressure, encouragement and support for governments to make such commitments in order to make progress towards MDG and EFA goals. However, the impact of the FESEN's pressure for this is considered significant.

The GNAT (Ghana) has a particularly strong advocacy agenda and as the Gender Focal Person explained, advocacy is becoming increasingly important: "this year is a year of

advocacy”. At the MoE/ Ghana Education Service level, demands include improved maternity benefit and childcare facilities for women, and especially a review of the ruling that prohibits women from taking their young children to school with them. The Women’s Wing – and in fact the Union as a whole – is advocating for an extensive of maternity leave from 3 months to 6 months and then for school-based child care centres to be established. These are seen as demands with far reaching impact beyond the education sector because if the teachers are successful in achieving their demands then workers in other sectors, particularly government workers will demand similar conditions. The GNAT is working as part of a broad based coalition, attracting intense media attention, and hoping that concessions claimed for women teachers will also be applied for women working in other sectors.

In Gambia, particular attention was given by the interviewees to highlighting the significant impact of the PWE-supported GTU work on the issue of FGM. Although GTU was and is not working alone on this issue, women teachers were actively speaking out against FGM, including to students in their own classes, and were distributing a specially developed brochure on it. In the early days of anti-FGM campaigning and programming this was described as making a significant contribution to the decline in the prevalence of the practice and in increasing awareness of its harmful effects for women and girls; other organizations did not have the same direct and daily contact with girls. As the GS described, “We participated greatly and that has gone a long way”. This being said, it was also recognized that it may be a generation before the influence of women teachers on their students is felt, and they – as parents – choose not to impose the practice on their daughters.

In relation to the Department of State for Education (DSE), the GTU (Gambia) also has made gender related advocacy demands. For example, in relation to school construction, GTU advocated that separate toilets for girls and boys become standard, and this is now accepted. This sort of advocacy is made possible because of the relationship that has been cultivated with the DSE: “We have a great role in the DSE – we are always a key partner in whatever they are doing. We have contributed a lot and serve on education committees” (GTU’s DSG).

Section 5: PWE Efficiency and Organizational Capacity²

This section, describing the efficiency and organizational capacity of PWE, covers a range of issues and is divided into sections on: Program structure and infrastructure, Human resources, Program management, Financial management, Documentation, reporting and dissemination, Inter-organizational linkages. Across these different sections, the program has both strengths and weaknesses. These are described and discussed in each section.

Program Structure and Infrastructure: An Overview

The PWE program was set up as a project of the Education International Africa Regional Bureau. The PWE staff and coordination activities are located within the EI office in Lomé, Togo, and overall responsibility, oversight and signing authority of the program rests with the EI Africa Regional Chief Coordinator. Additional logistical and

² Adapted from Universalis’s Organizational Assessment Framework.

administrative support, including financial management, is provided to PWE by EI staff and infrastructure.

At the time of the evaluation, there were 2 full time PWE staff: a PWE Administrative Assistant, and a temporary PWE Officer. Assibi Napoe, who was involved from the outset of PWE, and who was the first PWE Coordinator (from 1999-2003) remains very involved in the program. In her position as EI Regional Chief Coordinator she is officially overall responsible for the program, but especially in the absence of a full time Coordinator, Assibi is involved in the day to day management and administration of the program as well as in all the strategic decision-making processes.

The PWE strategic decision-making and action planning processes are supported by a Coordinating Committee, currently made up of the EI Chief Coordinator, in addition to three other women, based in three countries (Francophone and Anglophone) participating in the PWE program: Adelle Sock in Gambia, Helena Awurusa in Ghana and Anais Dayamba in Burkina Faso. Although there are no official terms of reference or guidelines for participation, it is understood that this Coordinating Committee officially meets roughly twice a year, and that there is communication in between these by telephone and email. The Coordinating Committee is involved in creating action plans for the year, prioritizing activities, identifying the countries/ organizations selected for financial support and, with the start of semi-separate program of bursaries for women teachers supported by CTF, the selection of bursary candidates.

Each of the participating teachers' organizations has a nominated PWE Contact Person. In unions where there is a dedicated gender focal person on staff it is this person, in others, it is a national executive member responsible for Women's Wing activities. The direct communication with the national organizations however, usually goes between the PWE staff and the GS or DGS; the Contact Persons usually receive information from PWE via their own union leaders.

PWE finances, although tracked separately for internal accounting purposes, are nonetheless integrated into the EI account, and handled through the EI system. A junior finance officer at EI has until very recently been fully responsible for the PWE finances, but because of concerns about the quality of financial management and reporting, he will now be supported and the financial management overseen by the chief financial controller of EI.

Human Resources

At the time of the evaluation the PWE staffing structure was the following:

- Assibi Napoe: Chief Coordinator, EI Africa Region Bureau and therefore overall responsible for the PWE program
- Maguy Sikou: Full time PWE Assistant, since 2002, working on a year on year contract from April to March 31.
- Sylvie Blewoussi: Full-time, temporary PWE Officer since January 16, 2006, working on a 3 month contract
- Wisdom: EI staff finance officer, working as required on PWE finances (alongside other responsibilities)

The PWE Assistant has a job description that was developed when she first started with PWE in 2002, but has not been updated to reflect the current program status nor the tasks she currently performs, especially in the absence of a Coordinator. Since the departure of the previous Coordinator in November 2005, the PWE Assistant has been responsible for all correspondence, report writing, activity preparation and write up, although all documents are passed to the EI Regional Coordinator for approval prior to dissemination. The PWE Officer did not have a written job description, although she articulated her role as supervising PWE in a transitional period.

Interviewees in the different countries raised a number of questions about the PWE staffing procedures, including the recent recruitment of a new PWE Officer; the Coordinating Committee members were surprised to be introduced to her. A report of the Coordinating Committee meeting, held November/ December 2005, indicates that it was agreed that in the absence of a PWE Coordinator, the Coordinating Committee would assist the PWE Assistant; there was apparently no discussion of the hiring of a new Coordinator. The new PWE Officer was hired by the Chief Coordinator as an interim solution to the coordination and management problems being experienced, on a temporary 3 month basis. The EI Chief Coordinator also talked about that this 3 month contract as a trial period in which she would be able to assess the Officer's skills and potential to continue as PWE Coordinator. This contrasts with the procedure undertaken in the recruitment of the previous PWE Coordinator, where a newspaper advertisement was placed, an interview panel struck which included outside participants, and a full recruitment process followed.

Assibi Napoe was the first PWE Coordinator – at first working part-time at the same time as acting as GS for FESEN. When she stepped down from the PWE position to take up her new, current post, a new PWE Coordinator was hired, Émilie Viho. This Coordinator, although hired through an apparently systematic and transparent process of interview and selection committee, is widely considered as not having been the right person for the job. Few missions were made and the rate of PWE activities declined. Despite the recruitment process undertaken there were also concerns raised by interviewees about the selection criteria for PWE staff and the fact that neither the recently hired PWE Officer or the previous PWE Coordinator had extensive experience in gender, education and union activities; it appears that neither have worked with or for women's organizations before. Because of the realities of the region, one of the priorities for PWE staff should also be bilingualism; the current PWE Officer understands and speaks some English, but could not at the moment be considered professionally bilingual.

The fact that PWE is not an integrated EI program means that the PWE staff are hired on a project basis and are not subject to the same conditions of service as EI staff. Complicating things on an everyday basis – and to an extent that is noticeable to the participating organizations - are the various grey areas relating to staff roles and responsibilities, expectations and no clear policies or protocols on communication and decision-making, even at the level of everyday administration; decisions and communications are therefore often delayed. As a founder member and the first PWE Coordinator, Assibi is understandably still very much involved in PWE and through her role as the Chief Coordinator, EI Africa office she also has oversight and overall responsibility. This continued involvement has very positive implications, such as the sustaining of the program memory, sustained personal and organizational relationships, and to a certain extent a linking with other EI programs. However, it also makes for some

difficulties in clarifying where decision-making authority lies, especially as Assibi is often out of the office and is otherwise so occupied with other activities.

Program Management

The EI Chief Coordinator has the highest level of management responsibility for the PWE and makes all major decisions related to the program. These are informed by the Coordinating Committee, which, as mentioned above, meets twice a year to develop strategy and direction for the program. The members of this Committee are not involved in decision-making on a day to day basis, nor are they involved in general management decisions relating to budget, staffing etc

At the time of the evaluation, distribution of program administration and management tasks, and the flow and processing of information and decision-making was quite complicated. Because of her relative newness, the PWE Officer was working very closely with the PWE Assistant, and documents produced were developed by both staff members before being submitted to the EI Chief Coordinator for approval. In the interim between the departure of the previous coordinator and the arrival of the PWE Officer, the PWE Assistant has been drafting all the reports and correspondence, which are then officially vetted by the EI Chief Coordinator before being sent out.

In addition to reports, budgets and external correspondence, most decisions, on for example, workshop dates, preparations etc are also taken by the EI Coordinator. Because the EI Chief Coordinator is so often away from the office – and also away from email and/or cell phone connections, delays can occur whilst the PWE Assistant is waiting for approval or for a decision. This delay in communication was commented on by various interviewees as problematic.

Concerns do exist about the efficiency of the PWE 'secretariat' and the issues raised above and the impacts they have at the different levels were articulated by interviewees in different positions and in different countries. Lack of communication was one weakness that was raised in almost every meeting; both PWE Contact Persons and National Executive members feel that they are kept in the dark about PWE activities, are not involved in decision-making and are not made aware of selection criteria and processes, and only hear about things at the very last minute, and often not through the right channels. It was suggested that decisions might be made at a Coordinating Committee meeting but then the follow up be quite different.

Communication

Communication is an issue that was discussed at length during many of the evaluation interviews. Communication is problematic on a number of different levels: between the cooperating organizations and PWE and between the PWE staff in Lomé and the PWE contact persons and GSs of the participating organizations, as well as between the PWE and the members of the coordinating committee. There are certainly logistical issues related to communication in the region, such as erratic phone connections between certain places, and limited email access for most of the PWE contact persons and many of the GSs too. However, beyond these difficulties, it is a widely felt the communication and the sharing of information across PWE is not happening as it should.

It was stated numerous times during the interviews with the national organizations that information about PWE activities does not reach the right person on time and/ or is not conveyed through the official channels. For example, even for the evaluation, some of the PWE Contact Persons had no or very little advance notice of the visit even though information was supposed to have been sent out well ahead of time. In another instance, information had come to the GS via a different source, and he was offended that he had not been contacted directly. One of the interviewees said that she had arrived for the recent workshop on the HIV/AIDS brochure without having received any information about the content of the meeting; she was frustrated because if she had known she would have brought a lot of relevant materials that she had available. Another interviewee was frustrated that sometimes they will send the same information/ email several times and still the PWE staff will say they do not have it.

On the other hand the PWE staff members also lament the lack of communication they have from the PWE Contact Persons and the committee members. Reports on activities have to be repeatedly requested, and there is rarely any sort of informal communication on activities happening, on challenges, or even any requests for advice or suggestions based on other organizations' experiences. Even though the Coordinating Committee members have been allocated a certain amount of money to cover phone calls and/or internet use to communicate with PWE staff, there is limited response to emails to requests for feedback or sharing of progress, ideas etc.

Communication between PWE and the co-operating organizations is also somewhat difficult, with limited exchange of information, progress or challenges beyond the required reports. Cooperating organizations have, for example, received little information on the Coordinating Committee meetings, the issues discussed and decisions made.

It was also noted that amongst the cooperating organizations, there have been attempts to work together as closely as possible to support, but there has been limited ongoing dialogue and discussion on the PWE project, on the changing perspectives on and of the PWE and on the future perspectives for it.

Planning

PWE Action plans are developed on a yearly basis, drafted by the PWE Coordinator and then reviewed and approved by the Coordinating Committee. These action plans are organized around the PWE objectives, and include the general type of activity to be conducted (for example, general sensitization through the media, eg radio discussion, jingles, drama, handbills and leaflets), the responsible parties, place, period, budget and results (expected). There is little specific detail in these action plans, this is worked out in the annual work-plans. However, some specific expected results are identified in the action plans. These expected results are, as detailed below, problematic because of their vagueness, their immeasurability and in some cases their inappropriateness compared to the scope of the PWE program. However, there is a bigger issue about the logic of the action planning that is of primary concern. Without systematic data collection and tracking of progress made over time, it is difficult to understand where the action plan priorities come from; Coordinating Committee meeting reports do not detail the discussions that were held over the action plans.

At the national level, the action plans submitted are more concrete and more specific in terms of what activities will be carried out. However, again, with little data available to

inform decision-making processes, action planning also appears somewhat random and other national plans available for review are apparently developed on a year on year or two year basis. SNEC (Mali) has developed a detailed 2005-2007 plan clearly inspired by the PWE model, with activities identified within each 7 strategic objectives, some of which are in common with the overall PWE ones. GTU (Gambia) also has a detailed action plan for 2005-6, drafted by the Gender Desk Officer and approved by the Women's Wing and PWE Committees, which includes PWE activities and Women's Wing activities funded from other sources. The plan is organized around a series of activities, some of which fall within the PWE objectives, although most are listed as discrete activities with their own objectives; expected results are not included. GNAT-LAS (Ghana) has however, recently put together a 5 year action plan (2006-2011). Although there is understandably little detail provided in the GNAT-LAS plans and as yet no identified objectives or expected results, they do show expected development over time, and a logical progression from activity to activity over time can be discerned. A yearly action plan for 2005-6 includes far more detail and very specific results (output results, such as '300 teachers sensitized').

Financial Management

As described above, the PWE finances are overseen by the EI Coordinator and managed by a finance officer in the EI office - there is no separate PWE account, although it is tracked separately by the finance department. The EI Coordinator is the signing authority for the project and all funds are transferred through the EI account. Day to day, the PWE Assistant handles petty cash, out of which stationary and other small supplies are purchased, up to a maximum of 20 000 CFA. This petty cash fund is set up with CFA 200 000 and is gradually spent out, with accounting for it being finalized once it is spent out. At that time, the PWE Assistant provides all the receipts to the finance officer who verifies and then organizes another advance of CFA 200 000.

The internal PWE 'account' (within the EI account) is also updated on a monthly basis by the finance officer at the same time as the general EI account. However, the updates are not automatically sent to the PWE staff. The finance officer does not participate in any of the planning meetings, nor is advice sought on budget allocations; this may mean that there are some unnecessary inaccuracies made in budget provisions which can cause problems later; an example was given of the budget line for staff salaries in which, although this should be a predictable cost, the estimate was way off the actual cost.

One of the major difficulties identified by the finance officer (and subsequently by the cooperating organizations), however, is that of getting reports and receipts back from participating unions to whom payments have been made. This has created some problems for PWE in reporting spending to the co-operating organizations for whom it appears that the funds allocated for PWE activities have not been legitimately spent. There have also been difficulties in the transfer of funds from the PWE to other unions, especially the GTU.

Some training has been provided to PWE staff and to representatives of the participating organizations (eg Ougadougou workshop, in July 2005) and the cooperating organizations have recommended that the PWE provides separate schedules showing, by organization, the funds advanced, financial reports provided and acceptable receipts and the outstanding amounts for which financial reports and receipts are still required. This type of tracking system would help to keep track of funds, especially as the number

of organizations has grown and could be verified with the teachers' organizations during missions in the field. It was also recommended that a copy of this schedule should accompany the mid-term and final financial accounting to the cooperating organizations.

Yet improvements are slow to materialize and it would seem that such an accounting system has not been adopted. The organizations which have not complied with the financial management protocols have, however, been told that they will not receive PWE funds in the future (as of November 2005).

Another factor identified in the financial management by one cooperating organization representative is the fact that the cooperating organizations may not have made it very easy for PWE staff to be effective in their financial management and reporting, because they have not been able to clearly lay out their requirements (including the dates by which proposals should be submitted) and have not been able to work as closely with the PWE as they might have wanted, due to time, other commitments and a lack of overall coordinated framework for the cooperating organizations' support.

The fact that the PWE Assistant is not involved in financial issues may also contribute to financial management and reporting difficulties. She is more aware of the organizations' reporting requirements, deadlines etc and is in direct communication with their representatives, whereas the finance officer is not. Furthermore, she is in closer communication with the PWE contact people and even the GSs of the unions and so could be more involved in follow up on bank transfer instructions to ensure that money does leave one account when requested.

At a PWE evaluation meeting in May 2003, the problem on non-submission of receipts from national organizations was discussed, and as the CTF report notes:

“It was agreed that the responsibility of the PWE Coordinator is not complete until the beneficiaries have provided an accounting of the funds with receipts. Reference to these accounting of funds sent to PWE Members will be included in the annual audits.”

Without a Coordinator at the moment, and with the Assistant not directly involved, financial management is one of the areas which suffers and in which recommendations made have not been taken up.

Documentation, Reporting and Dissemination

Reports on PWE activities have been provided to the cooperating organizations on a regular basis. Late reporting has been an issues, but this is improving as most recently reporting requirements from the cooperating organizations have been more effectively harmonized. In the past reports have been prepared by the PWE Coordinator, more recently, reports have been drafted by the PWE Assistant and then reworked by the EI Coordinator before submission. Draft reports may also be circulated to the Coordinating Committee, although this is not systematically done, and they generally do not give input into the reports.

Bi-annual PWE reports tend to list the activities that have been conducted and provide quantitative details such as number of women attending, and some subjective comments regarding the impact of the trainings, yet do not convey the impacts of the trainings, nor

much information on the desired outcomes. The linkages between the national activities detailed and the overall PWE objectives and progress to date is also hard to grasp. Another weakness identified in the reporting is the lack of progression or development from one report to another. Without references back and forth to PWE objectives, past achievements and progress and future targets, the activities described are out of context and no sense of the cumulative effects of the program is conveyed.

Interesting, only the first annual report from 1999 reports on progress against each PWE objective. Subsequent reports do not follow the program framework and report on activities rather than on progress towards goals in the different areas of intervention; this also contributes to difficulties in measuring the results.

There have been attempts from the cooperating organizations to improve the quality of the reporting, for example some specific discussion was held on measuring the results and outcomes of activities was held with the Coordinators of the 3 regional women teachers' networks at a CTF meeting in 2002. Unfortunately, these, and recommendations made at the May 2003 evaluation meeting that the narrative reports should include both qualitative and quantitative indicators (for example number of participants in various activities, examples of changes such as increase in the number of articles for newsletters, increase in participation of women in union activities, increase in number of women who run for elections at all levels of their organizations, etc.) have not been followed. Cooperating organizations recommended including the following information in future narrative reports:

- Accomplishment of objectives (chart listing objectives on the left and comments on their achievement on the right);
- List and description of activities (number of men and women involved, description, comments, positive and negative assessments, evaluative comments from participants, etc);
- Follow-up to previous activities (i.e. outcome -- did the participants carried out the planned follow-up activities on their return back home?);
- Impact (possibly as part of the report conclusion – general statement on changes observed);
- The action plans of the national organizations could be summarized in a chart (key points only), with a list of which of the activities were carried out and brief comments.

These limitations at the regional level also mirror the weaknesses in the reports coming from the PWE Contact Persons – if the reports come at all. It is a constant struggle to obtain full reports on PWE and other Women's Wing activities from the different unions, whether or not money has been provided to support such activities. When they are forthcoming, the reports tend to detail the content of trainings and number of women involved, with little sense of the outcomes and the impacts of the activities, nor where they fit into an overall strategic plan.

It is also important to note that, as with the financial management, there is also self-critique on the part of at least one of the cooperating organizations that there has not been enough interaction with the PWE staff to further develop the quality of the reports, and especially the analytical aspect of the progress being made towards objectives.

PWE Newsletter, 'Pro-Femmes'

When reports are received then they can be included in the PWE newsletter, 'Pro-Femmes'. This newsletter is a bi-annual publication, but is often delayed because of difficulties in obtaining articles, in printing and other delays and difficulties. It is published in French and in English, and at the time of the evaluation the most recent issue was at the printers. The articles for the newsletter may be reviewed by the Coordinating Committee members, although the reality is that there is rarely any feedback from them. The newsletter is intended for distribution through the PWE network, via the PWE Contact Persons and/or GSSs. Women in FESEN (Togo), for example, who are PWE Contact Persons in their own 'syndicats de base' explained that they do take their copies to show the women in their organizations and talk to them about the topics included in it, but having only one copy these women cannot leave it with them to read. In GNAT (Ghana) too, the PWE contact persons enjoy reading their own copy, find it 'educative' and particularly enjoy reading about what is happening in other countries – but again they are not able to effectively share with the other women in their programs. In Ghana a copy is kept in the TEWU library, but it is doubtful that many women will have access to this copy. Although one DGS did say that he found the topics covered in it were very helpful when it comes to writing speeches, it would also seem that the PWE newsletter is not really read by the national executive members.

Although reading material on salient topics is clearly appreciated by women in the region and by some of their male union counterparts, from an external perspective, the quality of the newsletter is rather mixed, and it is difficult to understand the underlying logic of the choice of articles and of the arguments they put forth. Some of the messages provided by the articles may in fact run counter to the overall aims of the PWE.

Some of the unions – or even their Women's Wings – however, have their own newsletters; GNAT-Ladies Society (Ghana), for example, has its own 'Supreme News' which contains detailed reports on activities at the different levels, as well as additional updates on policy issues and relevant articles. This newsletter also includes reports of PWE activities in which GNAT-LAS members have participated. 10 000 copies of the recent edition of this newsletter have been printed to ensure widespread distribution – however, as the Gender Focal person pointed out, with over 90 000 women members of GNAT, they are far from having a copy each. The GTU (Gambia) also publishes a regular newsletter of a high standard, which has wide distribution and which includes reports on women's wing activities – although nothing specific on PWE - prepared by the Gender Desk Officer.

PWE Training Manual

A PWE training manual, "Handbook for Female Union Trainers", was developed in the early days of the program (developed by a team of teachers in 1999 and piloted in subsequent years) with two modules: women and trade union and Women and society. Topics covered include: (Module 1) Women's role in teachers' organizations, leadership, communication, Adults' capacity building and the Rights of female workers and (Module 2) Gender and development, Education and training of girls and women, Reproductive health, Economy and management, Human rights. This manual is comprehensive, contains much basic and important information, and has been used as the key Training of Trainers (TOT) tool for the PWE. The manual has also been distributed to the participating organizations and appears to continue to be of much use. The women in

Benin attested to the fact that the manual continues to inspire them and that they use the format to develop their own additional modules and to conduct trainings on these extra topics. Within FESEN too, the manual has been used as a model to develop further modules and trainings on Reproductive health, HIV/AIDS, Women's Rights, Communication and Finances. Unfortunately, these additional modules developed have not been shared with the PWE office for wider dissemination.

The manual is clearly seen as an important PWE resource that has served and continues to serve the women at the national level well. However, from an external perspective it would seem that each of the topics addressed in the manual would require supplementary materials to convey even a basic level of understanding (for example, the chapter on reproductive health describes body parts but has no diagrams at all).

PWE Information Brochures

Other significant PWE publications include the series of informational pamphlets on a variety of topics of interest/concern to women teachers – both personally and professionally. Topics include breast cancer and menopause as well as violence in schools. These brochures were considered very useful by some of the PWE Contact Persons and women teachers met in the national programs, although again, the limited numbers available mean that very few women actually get to see them. PWE Contact Persons in FESEN (Togo), for example, explained that the menopause brochure in particular has stimulated lots of discussion and was being used as the basis for a March 8th activity.

The GTU (Gambia) had in fact developed brochures of their own on topics such as skin bleaching and FGM and took these to the PWE; these examples were instrumental in encouraging the PWE to develop the series. GTU PWE members were convinced of the value of these brochures – the fact that they are lightweight, easy to read, colourful and easily shared. On the other hand, Contact Persons of the participating organizations in Benin had not received the brochures and did not know anything about them.

Recently, the brochures have mostly been developed through workshops to which PWE Contact Persons have been invited to work together on the content with input from other invited experts. Just prior to the evaluation fieldwork a workshop was held to develop a new brochure on the topic of HIV/AIDS, and the brochure is in the final stages of development before publication. This process of bringing together a group of PWE participants to work collectively to deepen and develop their understandings of a given topic and to write a brochure for the network clearly has advantages in terms of capacity building and ownership; women who have been involved in developing the brochure are more likely to organize workshops or other sensitization activities around it, and to feel confident in talking on the topic themselves. However, there are then issues to be attentive to in relation to the accuracy of the content of the materials, the ways in which the content is conveyed and the overall messages being transmitted.

The other issue is one of repetition and duplication of effort. Because of the limited inter-organizational linkages between PWE and other organizations with potentially shared interests, possibilities for collaborative work on new documents or for the dissemination through PWE of relevant documents already developed by other organization is not exploited. It may be that there are other organizations who have already developed materials on these topics; in fact the HIV/AIDS topic, for example, although clearly of

high importance to PWE, has been covered by a number of different organizations, including the Ghana AIDS commission and it may not have been necessary to use PWE resources to develop a new brochure from scratch.

A basic PWE brochure outlining the program, its objectives and structure was developed but supplies have since been used up. A reprint is scheduled for this year, and will be an important tool for raising the profile of and disseminating basic information on the PWE amongst the membership – and to other organizations.

PWE Research Reports

The research report on trafficking of girls in 2 districts of Togo is the only research study publication to have been finalized by PWE. The report has been translated into English, but only a small number of the report of this study has been printed - and this is done on an 'as-needed' basis, for limited distribution at meetings etc. There has been no systematic dissemination of the report, nor roll out into an advocacy strategy of the findings. When mentioned during the interviews, few of the interviewees had heard of the study – and only one, a member of the Coordination Committee said she had read it. Although FESEN members in Togo did know something about the study, no-one had seen or read it.

Although of some interest, there are some concerns about the quality and relevance of the study and the extent to which it contributes to the overall aims of the PWE. The study focuses directly on 2 districts of Togo and provides no regional perspective on child trafficking and girls' education. Unfortunately, the report document does not give a date, nor provide any context to why PWE would be interested in this issue and how it might use the findings of the study; there is no link made, for example, to the EI policy on 'Trafficking in Women, Girls and Boys' (2001). There is no name or details provided on the lead researcher or any other details. Methodologically too, the study may have benefited from further consultation and discussion with a review group, and especially so to ensure that the study has the widest possible relevance and advocacy potential.

A report of the meeting of the Coordinating Committee held in November/December 2005 indicates that there was discussion of a new research study on "the accomplishment of the PWE project and its impact on women leadership positions within national organizations and their communities" and there was an action point to request the submission of consultants' CVs by December 15th, 2005. However, it would seem that there has been no follow up on this project.

Inter-organizational and Intra-organization Linkages

This is an area in which there is little to report at the regional level, although significant linkages have been established at the national levels by the Women's Wings and the unions in general.

Regionally external linkages remain to be developed, for example with the Forum of Women Educationalists (FAWE), with ADEA (especially the Working Group on the Teaching Profession), with UNESCO BRENDA etc. Such linkages could facilitate a very productive sharing of resource materials, a wider dissemination of PWE activities and their results and potentially fruitful collaborations - particularly advocacy- on issues of shared concern.

At the country level, however, there are interesting linkages happening, and these were particularly expressed by the representatives of the stronger unions in Ghana and the Gambia. As described above, these unions are collaborating with ministries of education, with other sector unions, with other education stakeholders and also with other women's groups. The GNAT (Ghana) is also just completing a large scale collaborative project with the Ghana AIDS Commission which has involved sensitization activities for over 22 000 people, the establishment of a nation and 8 district counseling centres, youth trainings etc. Weaker unions may find it more difficult to establish and sustain linkages and partnerships with other organizations whilst they have so many internal challenges to address, but even so, the FESEN (Togo) and the Benin unions talked about productive collaborative activities, especially around International Women's Day, March 8th. In Benin, the fact that the teachers' unions are part of (different) Centrales which also include other sector unions means that synergies can be found and joint activities undertaken on women's issues across sectors.

PWE is an EI supported project and yet the linkages between the PWE and the other EI programs are weak. The PWE operates in relative isolation from the other EI activities - both country-and union specific capacity building activities, and the more thematic activities, for example on HIV/AIDS, on anti-discrimination and on peace-building. It would seem that opportunities for synergy and mutual progress across the PWE and EI activities are not being fulfilled, partly because of the way in which the PWE is structured, managed and staffed as a separate project.

Section 6: PWE Effectiveness

As highlighted in the previous section on PWE impacts there are some very significant PWE successes to acknowledge. The program has specific strengths in terms of capacity building for women union leaders. The fact that 37 regional and sub-regional trainings have been organized and a total of 1764 women trained in topics such trade unionism, leadership, communication, computer skills etc is an achievement, and it is clear that national level activities supported by PWE funding have also made a difference for women teachers and their unions. However, the program framework itself, as well as limitations in terms of structure and management, means that it's potential to achieve results in the areas identified is limited.

The limitations and the challenges to effectiveness related to the organizational capacity and program management have been described above, and will be discussed below in the Recommendations for future actions. At the same time, there are a number of program structure level limitations and challenges to present and discuss. It is difficult to very concretely assess the effectiveness of the PWE for a number of interconnected reasons: because the goals of the PWE program are expressed so broadly, because where there are targets set, these are confusing, unmeasurable and/ or inappropriate given the scope and focus of the program, and because data is not collected systematically enough to be able to measure progress or impacts in any more than a very general and anecdotal way.

Findings of the evaluation related to the major challenges and limitations of the structure of the PWE program are summarized and discussed below:

1. *Limited understanding of the strategic PWE mission and program amongst union members and executive members particularly*

Although national executive members interviewed all expressed their appreciation of the PWE program, and described various ways in which it had helped women teachers within their membership as well as helping the development of the union itself. However, there was also a noticeably limited understanding of the program as a whole, a tendency to see it as merely a funding mechanism for increasing recruitment of female members or as a mechanism to provide training to encourage women and provide them with the skills they lack. These perspectives tend to be perpetuated in the tone and content of newsletters and reports and may in the long term hinder the effectiveness of a program which has more strategic potential to create sustainable change within union, school and other institutional cultures which are often highly unfriendly to women and girls. Even some of the GSs and DGSs who have attended PWE activities such as trainings and evaluations appeared not to realize the strategic potential of a regional network for women teachers. This may be related to the fact that there are no PWE promotional materials to distribute and that no recent follow up national visits for in depth work with the national executives have been made.

2. *A PWE program framework that is very unclear and difficult to operationalize*

The PWE program has 9 objectives, all but one of which were identified at the outset of the program – the HIV/AIDS-related objective was added later (in 2004). As discussed above, taken broadly and globally these objectives seem to reflect the priority issues in the member countries (at least those visited in the evaluation process). However, in terms of a workable program framework, these objectives are rather confusing; interestingly, even where national Women's Wing members describe how the PWE framework provides a framework for their own activities, their own action plans and reports do not reflect the PWE framework – rather they are referring to the format of the document. Overall, the framework does not seem to function well as a tool for program development as it should, and does not allow for very easy measurement of results against objectives, either in the short or long term. There is considerable overlap between activities identified in the leadership training and those related to the first 'sensitization' objective of "to enhance the awareness of women regarding the development of their own potentials".

Furthermore, the indicators identified for the PWE objectives are also either confusing, unmeasurable and/ or inappropriate for the program. Target percentages have been identified, but it is unclear who the target group is, for example: "60% of women sensitized" is a target for the first objective. These targets have not been made explicit enough to really be able to monitor effectiveness against, neither have relevant and appropriate 'means of verification' been identified.

3. *Limited data and no systematic data collection, monitoring and evaluation processes*

Effectiveness is made so much harder to assess when there is so little systematic data collection, management and analysis. Although GTU (Gambia) did conduct a survey to find out more about the women members' priority needs, in most cases there is no baseline data. Even membership numbers are hard to determine in the less stable unions, in Benin, for example. Without baseline numbers, or detailed insights into the issues being targeted it is impossible to have more than anecdotal evidence of impact, and very difficult to compare the effectiveness of different modes of intervention, for example. Without systematic impact assessment and review of progress towards

targets, the program risks the repetition of a certain number of activities, the impact of which have not been fully evaluated nor lessons learned really identified. There is, for example, no systematic tracking of union progress on gender mainstreaming – and no clear indicators of what is expected beyond budgetary provision for PWE activities.

The book writing workshops, too, for example, may have been very enjoyable and confidence boosting for women participants, but it would appear that there has been no systematic follow up to ascertain exactly how many books have been bought by publishers or MoEs, and then circulated to schools, how many women have continued to write etc. The same activity has been replicated across countries without the insights that could have been gained from a more rigorous evaluation process. It appears that the network does not facilitate a real and critical sharing of lessons learned, different approaches and possibilities from across the countries and national organizations nor does it adequately encourage innovation and experimentation of different approaches.

4. Ineffective attempts to promote data collection and research

Objective 2 of the PWE framework is to collect data on the situation of women and girls and conduct research on specific areas affecting them. This has been promoted through workshops held at the regional/ sub-regional level on research and data collection and has, where follow up has been possible, been translated into efforts by the Women's Wing members to develop questionnaires to establish the number of women members.

It is of concern that efforts have been made and PWE resources allocated to encouraging Women's Wings to develop questionnaires to collect data on women's membership. Although included as an objective within the PWE framework, this is confusing as data collection appears to be more a strategy to achieve PWE aims rather than an objective in itself. Beyond the program framework issues, though, questionnaires are not necessarily the most effective tool for obtaining data on membership, and when data on membership is so difficult to obtain, it makes no sense for efforts to be made in isolation by the Women's Wing to establish the numbers of women members. Rather attention should be given to supporting the national executive to develop tools and establish procedures which will allow them to effectively collect gender-desegregated data on their membership – as is anyway happening in the GNAT (Ghana) (who have a dedicated research officer).

The PWE research and data collection trainings appear to have limited impact; some participants expressed frustration at the limited amount of time they had and their inability to sufficiently master the concepts to follow up once home. Women's Wings who did initiate research have been frustrated by the lack of progress they have been able to make on distributing and collecting in questionnaires.

5. A focus on a series of one-off activities

Linked to the problematic program framework, and the lack of data, is an identified tendency to focus on single activities, rather than identifying the different steps required to achieve progress towards identified targets. The program is not data or results driven, rather operates around a series of activities which are reported on as outputs (eg the number of women trained) but with little attention to the short and long term impacts of the activities nor the progression of activities and follow up required. Evaluations are conducted of the trainings and workshops, but they apparently do not focus on the specific impacts and the extent of the skills gained – they do not include, for example, pre- and post-tests. This activity approach at the regional level is then reflected in the

approach and action plans developed at the national level. One of the PWE Contact Persons, for example, explained that the annual action plan was developed after reviewing the previous year's and transferring those activities which had not yet been completed, rather than doing any analysis of progress made and existing needs.

6. Difficulty in responding to diversity and diversified needs

Although it is recognized that the participating teachers' organizations –and the Women's Wings within them - are at different stages of organizational development (from a gender perspective) this awareness is not fully reflected in the PWE support being provided to the different participating organizations. Financially, there may be prioritization for certain organizations, but technically, the support to each organization remains more or less the same. Although it may be argued that there are always women in need of and desiring basic training, at an organizational level, there are clearly different needs in unions where the Women's Wing is fractured by rifts in the union, has very little funds and all the executive members and position holders continue to teach full-time etc, compared to unions which have dedicated staff, policies and budget allocation. Perhaps because there have been fewer visits made by PWE in the last 2 years it has been harder for PWE to provide any targeted technical and strategic support to the women's wings in order to support gender mainstreaming at whatever point they are at.

7. Very limited results from income generating activities (IGAs) - for a number of different reasons

Objective 4 of the PWE is to contribute to the improvement of the economic and social status of women teachers and female educational workers, and yet it would seem that this has not been very successful. It is partly due to a hesitation in promoting IGA for teachers because of the legal restrictions in some countries on teachers- as civil servants – having additional income generating activities. The cooperating organizations are also reluctant to support IGAs, apparently having had some difficulties in the past. PWE now does not fund the IGAs, but continues to support the participating organizations in providing training on different activities, and maintains the objective within the PWE framework.

The evaluation interviews indicate that women teachers feel the need to supplement their salaries and are keen to learn how to do this. Trainings on different activities such as making batik, pomades, food conservation etc have been organized at the national level, but appear to have little impact a) because the women then lack the capital required to buy enough materials to establish their business b) because the amount of profit obtainable makes it hardly worth it and c) (linked to b) because there is an already saturated market for the goods being made and the quality of what the women teachers can produce is inferior. Although there are some apparently successful initiatives, such as snail rearing in Ghana, neither the factors for success nor the lessons learned have been examined and shared through the PWE network.

8. Difficulties with a cascade model of training trainers/ PWE Contact Persons

The cascade training model that is used by PWE to train women who are then supposed to return to their countries to train others has been described as problematic in a number of contexts, and for different reasons. For example, there are no resources available neither for the trainers to travel to different regions nor for other trainees to be supported (with per diems and transport) to attend a training. Lack of commitment from the union executive to support follow up trainings was also mentioned as an issue. This situation

means that the potential impact of the PWE training is not fully achieved and is especially frustrating for women who know that others have had the opportunity to gain new skills and information and are not sharing them with others, and has also lead to perceptions that the trainers want to maintain the power of that new knowledge and specifically not share it with others.

Section 7: Mini- Case Studies

The following section provides some specific information on 4 different country contexts in which PWE is operating. Rather than in-depth case studies (which would require far longer time and a far more extensive set of interviews in each country), the descriptions can be better described as 'snap shots' of the national level realities, highlighting some of the successes, the strengths and the weaknesses of the PWE as experienced in these contexts.

Togo

Overview

The participating teachers' organization in Togo is the FESEN, the federation of 10 grassroots teachers' organizations across the country, representing all levels of education as well as the different denominational and secular school systems. Each of these unions has a PWE Resource Person, and then there is one overall PWE Contact Person at FESEN, who is the main liaison with the Lomé staff. However, because of the geographical closeness to the EI Africa bureau and the personal connections (Assibi having been GS of a member union and then of FESEN), there are closer connections between the different grassroots PWE Resource Persons with the Lomé base than is the case in the other countries. The 10 women representatives together form the 'Comité Femmes PWE', led by the PWE Contact Person.

PWE funds are managed within the FESEN account rather than separately, and official communication from PWE staff in Lomé is via the FESEN GS. The PWE committee tries to meet on a monthly basis but is usually unable to meet this schedule because of travel difficulties; they will, however, try to get together at the end of other FESEN meetings. At the level of the prefecture there are also women's committees which comprise women representatives from the different FESEN unions; meetings are much easier to arrange at the local level because the transportation challenges as less so than in Lomé or when longer distances have to be covered.

PWE Impacts

One of the interviewees summarized the important role of PWE as a "catalyst", which stimulates women to act, largely because of the linkages with other countries. PWE funds have been used to support training for the PWE resource persons in trainings which covered the following topics: fund raising, IT, communication and leadership. Most recently, FESEN representatives also participated in a sub-regional training on data collection (March 2005 in Lomé). The FESEN PWE Committee has also used the general PWE training manual to develop modules on topics such as reproductive health, women's rights and HIV/AIDS.

There are limited specific PWE/ Women's Wing activities at the local level – but opportunities for women to meet and share their experiences are clearly important for them. This is especially so when the PWE resource persons have attended trainings and have new information and ideas to share with their colleagues.

Overall, FESEN has integrated women's activities into their yearly plan of action apparently for the last 4 years or so, although this year's planning required some prompting by the PWE Contact Person who noticed that the initial plan did not encompass any of the women's committee's activities. Integration of women's activities and concerns into the core FESEN activities was attributed largely to the fact that there are now women directly involved in the FESEN executive, at every level, and these women are actively involved in the decision-making and planning. Another significant factor was the individual impact of Assibi Napoe, who as GS had really pushed hard to integrate women's issues onto the FESEN agenda. Since 1999 there has been a 'Section Genre' headed by an elected official within the national executive, but the number of women occupying other positions has also risen; this year there are 6 women from a total of 18 national executive members.

Core FESEN and member union activities, such as providing training to teachers to prepare them for professional exams are seen to be of particular benefit for women, even though they are open to both men and women. Other more specific activities are then chosen by the executive to include in the action plan, and therefore to receive some financial support from the FESEN budget. This year the focus activity is training on menopause (stimulated by interest in the PWE pamphlet), and the PWE Committee will work with the executive's representatives for training in order to prepare training for men and women members. Budget-wise, there is also some limited support from FESEN to cover the travel costs of PWE Committee members to attend meetings.

There has also been gender-related advocacy with the MoE on the part of FESEN to which PWE training for women was considered a contributing factor. A major achievement (dating from 1999-2000) has been the commitment from the MoE to reduce school fees for girls at every level, and in urban and rural schools (for example, in Grade 1 girls pay 3000 CFA per year whilst boys pay 4000 CFA and at secondary level, girls pay 5500 CFA and boys 8000). FESEN is now lobbying for free tuition for girls.

The relationship between PWE and the promotion of girls' education was further highlighted; PWE resource person - who are all full time teachers – indicated that the trainings they have received enable them to be more confident in class and therefore act as role models for the girls in their schools.

Challenges

Different perspectives on the rationale for women's programs within FESEN, including PWE programs, are evident. The SG and other male executive members articulated how important they were in increasing women's membership and the payment of membership dues. Although this concern about membership dues may be understandable given the history of bad management by the government of union dues taken directly from pay packets, and the need to reestablish trust on the part of the teachers, it may also make it difficult to realize the strategic potential of PWE support.

Other challenges to the promotion of women and the effective implementation of PWE programs articulated by interviewees include:

- Limited number of women can participate in regional and sub-regional trainings
- PWE trainings are too short
- More training is required on effective lobbying
- Funding to cover meeting costs (especially travel) is very limited and women are often covering their own costs
- Difficulties in preparing regular reports to send to PWE
- Funding is required to initiate action-oriented projects such as girls' clubs, centres for girls' education

The data collection training that was attended has had limited impacts because of numerous difficulties in the follow up. Firstly, though, the 3 day training was considered too short to grasp the content. Questionnaires were subsequently developed to try and find out the numbers of women teachers and women teacher union members, but insecurity and limited resources have meant that these have not been distributed.

Income generating activities have also had limited success. Resources are required for women to be able to set up and also support for them to organize themselves into effective cooperatives. As yet, it is only in the regions that the IGAs have continued – not at all in Lomé.

Benin

Overview

The situation in Benin is somewhat complicated as there are 4 teachers' organizations which participate in PWE; the SNEP, SNAP, SYNESTP and SYNAPES. One of the four unions – the SNEP - has been split due to leadership rivalry, and the other three unions are also somewhat fragile – and with limited financial resources. This has inevitably had a negative impact for PWE programming in Benin and more generally for women's positions and for gender equality within the unions.

There has, however, been a PWE Committee which officially unites the GSs and the PWE contact persons from all 4 of the participating unions. Meetings are officially supposed to be held every 3 months, and an action plan developed from the overall PWE action plan, however recently the functioning of the committee has been affected by the troubles within and between the unions. The PWE Committee has organized events in the past, particularly March 8th activities to celebrate International Women's Day. The event held in 2005 was reported as being very successful, although it seems that organizing something similar for 2006 would have been difficult given the increasing tensions between the different groups and between different individuals.

There are 2 PWE contact persons for Benin, who represent different unions, but who appear to be able to work and communicate well together. Their contact with the PWE staff in Lomé, however is not direct – it comes through their GS.

Impacts

Since around 2002/ 3 it is recognized that the PWE trainings have really started to have an impact in that women have been elected in larger numbers to the executives, and women are present within the union leadership.

- SYNESTP has been able to increase the number of women on the executive board to the 30% level recommended by EI.
- One faction of SNEP has 10 women in a national executive of 35 and the other has 13 women in a national executive of 31, with a 2nd VP position which is reserved for women. The second group claims around 2000 paid up members, but 6000 supporters, over half of which are women. SNEP has a women's committee made up of 27 women with a president who sits on the Executive (not as an elected member, but as a representative of the women's committee).
- SYNESTP has 5 women in a national executive of 17
- SYNEMP has its own apparently well organized women's structure – that of the CONAF (Comité Nationale des Femmes), and as the oldest teacher union in Benin, also was the first union to establish such a structure. The union claims to represent about 2/3 of the country's primary school teachers. SYNEMP has a national executive of 25, with 3 women, 2 of whom were openly elected and the third sitting as representative of CONAF and PWE contact person. This CONAF representative is elected as president of CONAF at the 'Congrès de femmes' which precedes the general union congress. CONAF has its own rules and regulations, and yearly plan of action, but exists under the national executive. Activities include IGA, and although they are supported by the union as a whole, there is no budget to allocate.

Overall, however, there is limited integration of women's committee activities into union planning and budgeting. At the local level, the activities, tend to be small scale and more informal; 'Journées de Réflexion', on topics such as sexual harassment, women's rights were described, for example. As mentioned above, though, the focus of attention for larger scale national activities appears to be March 8th. The 2005 event was considered as a very successful activity was held focused on the new 'Code de la Personne', a code of laws which represents a very significant government commitment to women's and children's rights. Over 300 people attended and the event had a very real impact in that it enabled women to see what the union could offer them, and encouraged them to join.

Although the influence in general of the unions on Ministry of Education policy has been weakened because of the rifts, it was still felt that they had been influential in contributing to policy development to promote girls' education. It was also interesting that at the Union Centrale, to which some of the unions belong, the GS stated that the women from the teachers' unions were some of the most active and most involved in the Centrale's women's committee and in developing the Centrale's broader advocacy agenda with the government.

Challenges

In addition to the challenges highlighted above, related to the fragmentation of the unions ("le miettement des forces", as described by one interviewee), interviewees described how PWE activities and more generally gender equality in education and in the unions are negatively affected by the challenges listed below. Also mentioned was

an unfortunate history of limited confidence in Benin's teachers' unions from external cooperating organizations as well as from EI, which continues to make things difficult. An additional issue noticeable from the data, is a tendency for the PWE support to be seen as merely a financial support to the unions, and for the strategic potential of the network not to be recognized. Other issues raised by interviewees include:

- Women have to pay extra dues to belong to the women's committees (this is an additional 1000 CFA per month)
- There is no support to continue IGA beyond the initial trainings and anyway, the revenue from IGA is hardly worth the effort
- Difficulties in following up from the PWE IT training when there is such limited access to computers
- Data collection and IT training was too short to be able to adequately provide training to other women
- Advocacy platform of the unions – which could have been more focused on gender-related demands - has been diffused by the fragmentation of the union and by the MoE's reluctance to deal with them
- Limited awareness of what is happening within PWE because of non-representation on the Coordinating Committee and limited communication from PWE
- The issue of contract teachers is particularly problematic in Benin
- Also the issue of 'enfants placés' - children working in others' homes (sometimes relatives') to try to attend school has not really been addressed
- Sexual harassment - for students and teachers - has not been adequately addressed

The issue of 'restitution' of trainings was also discussed at some length. It was described as very difficult for women resource persons who have received PWE training to organize other trainings for other women to have the benefit of the new information, skills and ideas. There has been, for example, no follow up from PWE trainings for women writers or on data collection. Part of the problem is that the financial resources required to travel and/or for women to come together from across the 12 départements are not available. Others raised the issue of the fact that there is also some personal interest in not sharing information and materials from trainings with other women, and so recommended that the opportunity to participate in trainings should be more fairly distributed. It has been difficult to obtain even brief reports from women who have participated in trainings. One recommendation was for PWE to support more localized trainings and to ensure that in each location as many local women as possible were able to participate.

One positive point to highlight is the fact that the evaluation process acted as an excuse to bring together the women from different unions with a common goal. It also created a time and place for the PWE Committee to discuss the approaching March 8th date and to make some plans for collaborative activities.

Ghana

In Ghana there are two unions participating in PWE – the GNAT (Ghana National Association of Teachers) and the TEWU, (the Teachers' and Educational Workers Union) which is mostly made up of school support staff such as secretaries, librarians,

cooks etc. Because of the different membership profiles coordination between the 2 unions on PWE activities has been difficult, and a joint PWE committee has been difficult to sustain. However, a recent joint activity – although not funded by PWE, rather CTF directly – a training women from both unions in skills such as IT, communication, stress management, etc has proved to be successful. In general, however, the 2 unions receive separate PWE funds.

TEWU is a large union – it has over 40 000 members across the country and although the exact gender breakdown is not available, it is acknowledged that women make up a significant proportion. Within TEWU there is one seat for women reserved on the national executive (Vice Chair), and an additional 6 women at each as Women's Wing representatives. The current national executive of 30 comprises 10 women (the additional 3 women having been elected openly). The structure at the regional and district levels is slightly different, with the Women's Wing President plus 2 representatives sitting on the executive. The Women's Wing was started in 1993 but from the start, as an integrated part of the TEWU program, with some TEWU funding. The reserved Vice Chair position was initiated in 2003. The development of the Women's Wing has been very much supported by a different EI gender equality program that has provided training on gender issues. PWE-supported capacity building for the generally less educated women membership has been particularly appreciated, and particularly so in relation to developing professional skills and attitudes.

GNAT represents over 150,000 teachers across Ghana, and is a well established and stable organization, with considerable assets, resources and staff base. It has a large set of offices in Accra and staffed offices in each province. Women make up about 53% of the membership, and GNAT has its own integrated but separate Ladies Society, GNAT-LAS. The GNAT-LAS is supported by a full time GNAT employee, the national Gender Focal Person, Helena Adunusa, who was hired in 2002. At the same time she also became the PWE Contact Person for GNAT. Interestingly, although the GNAT has a gender desk position from the 1980's it was never filled, apparently because it was seen as a 'dead-end' position with no opportunity for advancement. The Gender Focal Person does not sit on the national executive, but there are currently 16 women of a total of 32. The GNAT President is a woman, and two of the other 4 offices are filled by women. There are also 2 women regional Chairs.

GNAT-LAS, established in 1988, has its own committee with 10 regional coordinators and some district representatives too. This committee meets once or twice a year to review a draft action plan which is prepared in advance by the gender coordinator. This action plan is very similar to the PWE action plan. The Gender Focal Person has been working on the development and adoption of a GNAT gender policy since 2002, and this document is now finally adopted and being widely circulated. GNAT does provide funding for the GNAT-LAS activities (and of course covers the costs of the Focal Person); a budget of 250 million Cedis (over \$US 27,000) was allocated last year, a sum which is apparently good but not enough to do everything that the Gender Focal Person and GNAT-LAS Committee hope to.

Another point to add is that the GNAT Gender Focal Person is also a member of the PWE coordinating committee; she was nominated in 2004. Helena has participated in PWE different meetings, trainings and activities, and also hosted a sub-regional training on data-collection. Communication between the Gender Focal Person (as PWE contact

person and Coordinating Committee member) and the PWE staff in Lomé, is direct and does not pass through the GS.

Impacts

The strength of women's participation in both unions has in various ways been supported by PWE programs and networking. The fact that women are now occupying different offices and not only the traditional treasurer position is particularly significant. Women are also increasingly keen to take on non-traditional offices within the union structures, such as secretary, regional and district chairperson positions too.

Within GNAT and TEWU, PWE trainings have been greatly appreciated. One issue to highlight is the strategic timing of the trainings - planned by the Gender Focal Person/PWE Contact Person to coincide with the election of new GNAT-LAS officers.

The data collection strategy in GNAT also warrants note; as a result of the PWE training, rather than embark on a separate process to collect information on women union members (as has been the approach in other countries) GNAT-LAS developed some questions which have been taken by the new GNAT research officer who is incorporating them into a general questionnaire. The data collected from this exercise should fill gaps in information such as the exact number of women members, the number of women in different positions at all levels and the number of male and female teachers at all levels in the system.

The national advocacy platforms of both TEWU and GNAT have strong gender components. TEWU deals primarily with the Ghana Education Services and has lobbied hard on the issue of maternity leave for employees and is now working in getting early childhood education fully integrated into the system, including crèche facilities for women employees.

GNAT also has a very strong advocacy agenda with the MoE/ GES with clear gender related demands. These include the extension of maternity leave for teachers from 3 months to 6, the stopping of indiscriminate transfer of teachers (the gender dimension of which is that women who take maternity leave, on their return to work are often sent to a different school which may well be far away from their homes), and establishment of childcare facilities at all schools. GNAT also works closely with other organizations, such as FIDA and WILDAF on issues of shared concern (such as maternity leave). The Gender Focal Person is also HIV/AIDS Focal Person and has been involved in a large HIV/AIDS project funded by the Ghana AIDS Commission.

The effectiveness of partnership with other civil society organizations to address gender issues in education is another point to highlight from the Ghana case study. TEWU, for example, has developed linkages with the National Education Coalition Campaign and others which are seen to be very helpful and positive. As described elsewhere, GNAT-LAS has also established considerable links and relationships with civil society and other organizations with shared concerns.

GNAT-LAS also has an internal advocacy agenda; they are lobbying to have 1 reserved VP position for women, with the proviso that the women elected are elected by the GNAT-LAS constituency in women's conferences to precede the general conferences.

Another issue is the demands from GNAT-LAS for childcare facilities for women GNAT employees working either in the Accra office or in any of the 10 regional offices.

Challenges

Although the national executive members were generally supportive of PWE activities and committed to improving gender equality within the union as in the education sector, they were generally not very familiar with the PWE objectives or the details of its work. Having said this, within GNAT especially there was appreciation of the networking potential of PWE. In addition to this and to the challenge of coordinating PWE activities across 2 quite different unions, additional challenges mentioned include:

- Limited copies of the PWE newsletter
- Limited contact with PWE staff for TEWU executive and contact persons
- Restricted number of women who can participate in trainings
- Limited materials for follow up
- AT GNAT, only 1 Gender Focal Person to do a lot of work

Suggestions for PWE development include more follow up contact between PWE staff and the grassroots to encourage the women working at that level and to inform program development. It was also suggested that PWE should take up more advocacy work at the regional level, especially the issue of the 'feminization of teaching' and to counteract concerns that the standards of education fall. Such issues "should not just be Ghana issues but should be for all African women". There should be more sharing of experiences "there may be best practices that we haven't adopted and we may have things they can learn from"

The Gender Focal Person made the interesting comment: "We should learn to eat solid food". By this she meant that although there is still a need for PWE to be there as a support network, the PWE/women's committees should be more independent and find ways of supporting themselves, especially those in the more stable unions where there are resources. She was also speaking to the need for diversified support for unions from PWE.

Other recommendations include initiating more training on professional skills – for principals and senior teachers, for example, and the inclusion of men in trainings.

The Gambia

In Gambia too there is one teachers' union, the Gambia Teachers' Union (GTU) which represents virtually all the country's teachers. The GTU is also a solid and financially stable union, with several paid staff members working in a relatively well-resourced (including computers and internet access) office block in Banjul. The union has established a very successful Credit Union for teachers and is now in the process of opening a teachers' bank. GTU is also a very well trusted and established partner in educational development with the Ministry of Education, enjoying membership of various committees and initiatives, and collaborating with them in, for example, the dissemination of the new Education Policy. The union also benefits from the expertise

and enthusiasm of a relatively young staff (GS and DGS and project officers) who have followed relevant trainings. Since March 2005 GTU has supported a full time position as Gender Desk Officer, Janet Mansal. Janet, along with other GTU staff, benefits from what appears to be an effective and supportive staff management policy, with clear lines of reporting, regular performance appraisals and so on. The Gender Desk Officer supports the implementation of the Women's Wing activities and is the PWE Contact Person.

The GTU constitution lays out a mandatory 30% representation of women on the National Executive Committee (NEC), and a VP position reserved for a woman (this has been in place since 1986). The Chairperson of the Women's Wing also sits on the NEC and of the 7 open seats not less than 3 must be held by women. The GTU constitution also states that in all trainings and similar activities, at least 1/3 of participants must also be women.

The Women's Wing has its own executive committee of 15 members; this is made up of 5 officials (Chair, Vice chair, Treasurer, Secretary and Organizing Secretary) elected at the Women's Wing congress which precedes the main congress, 6 regional representatives elected at their regional levels, in addition to the Gender Desk Officer, the GTU President and GS and the 1st VP (woman). This committee meets 4 times a year. At the regional level the GTU has a three-person structure, with a regional secretary, Women's Wing representative and Credit Union representative working alongside each other. As in Ghana, the Gender Desk Officer prepares a draft action plan for these meetings at which it is reviewed, revised and approved.

Beyond the salary support for the Gender Desk Officer, GTU also makes budgetary allocations for Women's Wing activities, and this has risen over time. It was at 30 000 Dalasi per year but this coming year, the allocation has more than doubled to 72 000 Dalasi (approx US\$2558). Until now these funds have been managed within the GTU account, and handled for the most part by the GTU treasurer. However, at the time of the evaluation visit there had been recent approval of the setting up of a specific bank account for the Women's Wing which the Women's Wing treasurer will manage. There will be 3 signatories, all within the Women's Wing (the Treasurer, Chair and Gender Desk Officer) and none, as was originally proposed, of the NEC.

When it was first established, the Women's Wing leaders conducted a large scale survey of women's priority needs, in order to develop their plans. This first survey was described as very successful, although a subsequent similar attempt was not so fruitful, with fewer responses and less analysis of the feedback to develop any specific plans from it. This last year the Gender Desk Officer has used the PWE framework to develop a Women's Wing plan of action. It is also to note that the Gender Desk Officer is one of the recipients of a PWE administered bursary which is being used to support her following a course on gender at development at the nearby Management Institute. She stated that the course is really helping her with her work, both in understanding complex gender issues and also doing tasks such as action planning.

Until last year one of the PWE Coordinating Committee members, Adelle Sock, was a NEC member, who had been active within the union leadership since the early 1990's and who had been instrumental in the establishment of the GTU Women's Wing. The GTU was one of the founder members of the PWE, and Adelle was part of the initial planning and start up team and was involved in some activities. In 2002 she was asked

to join the Coordinating Committee, replacing a member who had had to leave. Since 2004, when Adelle was voted out of office, she is no longer a NEC member, nor the GTU PWE Contact Person, but stays on the Coordinating Committee.

Impacts

One of the most important impacts of the PWE as highlighted by the interviewees was its support to make the Women's Wing known and to encourage women teachers to become involved: "Through PWE programs it has really made the Women's Wing known through the country and has increased participation of the women in the regions". NEC members also acknowledged the significant role that PWE has played in encouraging and supporting women to participate in the union. As highlighted in the general impacts section, GTU leadership feels that the fact that women are now contesting seats within the Women's Wing is a very positive step forward for the union.

PWE supported activities which were identified as particularly important include the writers' workshops for women, through which women gained skills and confidence in writing simple stories for children to be used in their schools. Although there has been little follow up and selling the books has not been as easy as assumed, it was felt that for individual women teachers it was important for them to develop these skills and also to have reading materials to use in their class. Book launchings were also held to which other NGOs and education partners were invited.

The GTU Women's Wing was a pioneer in the development of informational brochures, developing ones on topics such as skin bleaching and female genital mutilation (FGM) which are considered as particularly important initiatives, with significant impact – as well as inspiring the PWE to develop more.

The issue of FGM is one that several members of the GTU cited as one on which the PWE-supported GTU Women's Wing has had a noticeable and significant impact. The Women's Wing was active on the issue, providing materials such as the brochure to its women teacher members, and through leadership and communication and self esteem training, enabled local women teachers to speak out about the issue, and to communicate on it directly with girls in schools as well as women in the community.

The Women's Wing also organized a very successful HIV/AIDS seminar at which 3 people living with HIV/AIDS came to talk to teachers.

A Women's Wing future project that is not funded by PWE (rather by ActionAID) that is of interest is an initiative to pair up high school girls with women headteachers in rural areas, with the girls going to stay with the headteacher in her village, to learn more about her life as a teacher. The program aims to encourage more girls to commit to teaching in rural areas. Because it is so innovative, and because internationally there is a need for the sharing of 'promising practices' to increase women teacher recruitment in rural areas, it was recommended that this program should be very carefully monitored with baseline and impact assessments planned to it.

Aside from these activities, PWE committee members who had participated in regional and/ or sub-regional trainings expressed the extent to they personally had appreciated the opportunities to gain new skills, all of which they bring back to their work. Also of

great significance to them are the opportunities to network with other women in the region.

In terms of increasing GTU commitment to gender equality, PWE has played an important role in strengthening the Women's Wing which has advocated strongly for a Gender Desk Officer, for adequate internal funding, for a separate account etc. The GTU advocacy agenda has also been shaped by commitment to gender equality, and the Women's Wing is also considered a critical partner in activities and initiatives of the government's Women's Bureau.

Challenges

Specific challenges highlighted during interviews and discussions in Gambia included:

- A general challenge to work in Gambia is that the urban-rural disparities are very great in Gambia - outside of Banjul conditions are very different, and particularly the number of women teachers
- Problems in money transfer from PWE to the GTU account; moneys which were supposed to have been transferred never arrived, meaning that the planned PWE activities could not take place.
- IT training was postponed because the PWE funds did not materialize
- A lack of clarity over roles, reporting, communication and accountability between PWE and the GTU and the Gambia-based Coordinating Committee member. Information was apparently not being appropriately channeled through the Gender Desk Officer who is the PWE contact person for the GTU.
- PWE programs tend to be one-off activities that are funded, require a report but then are not followed up on in any systematic way from PWE and there is no feedback from PWE on how these fit into the bigger picture, nor interest in understanding how they are part of organizational development at the union level.
- As they are relatively new into their positions, the capacity of the new Women's Wing is limited – and although the Gender Desk Officer is keen and is following a relevant course, her own experience is limited
- IGAs have had limited success because of limited funding; there has been little follow up at the local levels.

Recommendations to PWE include supporting more training for women teachers, especially on communication skills, including IT; trainings should be taken to the women in the rural areas where they are most needed. Linkages should also be developed with other women teacher networks, and development of the PWE as a network where there is much more sharing between countries. It was also suggested that PWE should develop and share much more documentation across the network.

Section 8: Future Directions and Recommendations

Whilst, as detailed above, recognizing the significance of the PWE project and the impacts it has and continues to have on women teachers, their unions and even the socio-political contexts in which they live and work, the following recommendations and suggestions are made in the spirit of helping to ensure that the program can be developed to address its weaknesses, to respond to new challenges and to fulfill the potential that it clearly has.

Overall Program

1. *Consider integrating the PWE program into the overall EI program as the driving force for implementing, monitoring gender-related EI policies and resolutions, and for mainstreaming gender equality within EI and its affiliated member organizations.*

It seems paradoxical that as the PWE advocates for national organizations to integrate Women's Wing and gender equality activities into their organizational policy, planning and budgeting, PWE remains a discrete project in relation to EI. Modeling an integrated approach of systematic and focused mainstreaming of women's and gender-related activities and concerns across all EI programs could be a positive example to national organizations. It would also ensure that the synergies between EI organizational development support for each member union and its thematic activities could be fully exploited to promote gender equality and women's roles in the education sector and in unions. For example, the EI Coordinators who provide ongoing technical support to a certain number of countries would also be expected to promote and support the integration of Women's Wing activities and the budget allocation etc as part of general organizational development processes. This approach would support a more systematic mainstreaming of overall PWE objectives into capacity building activities for teacher organizations and their leaders.

Integration of the PWE into the EI program, however, would have to be carefully managed in order to ensure that the program remained one that was relevant to the needs and priorities of West African women teachers and that the sense of ownership of and loyalty to PWE was not lost in the process.

There are of course, resource implications if the PWE is to be run within EI. It would require coordinated and longer term financial commitments from the cooperating organizations than have been made up to now. This would be required to cover the salary and benefits etc of a Coordinator position at the level of other EI Coordinators, as well as for the program activities. A Coordinator for gender mainstreaming – at the level of the other EI coordinators – may also be able to offer some technical support to related thematic programs (for example anti-discrimination, HIV/AIDS). Such a Coordinator would provide strategic oversight and guidance, technical support (both to the other coordinators as well as directly to the national level union members), and would be responsible for enhanced advocacy work and inter-organizational linkages. As the women's networks expand and new networks are established in North and Central Africa, having one central EI Coordinator would also facilitate linkages and sharing of experiences and resources across the different networks and programs. In fact, bearing in mind the development of new women's networks in other regions of Africa, it is difficult to imagine how a different and separate structure for PWE and for West Africa alone could be sustained.

Furthermore, from an administration and management perspective, full integration of PWE activities within EI would mean less 'grey areas' around staff contracts, reporting and accountability etc as all EI protocols would automatically apply.

The proposed shift towards a more integrated EI project and the proposed recruitment of a relatively high level and senior coordinator may also make it possible to shift the focus

of PWE away from single activities to one of diversified activities and strategic advocacy aiming at clear goals.

A similar structure to the current Coordinating Committee structure could still provide an important support and provide grassroots perspectives into to a more integrated program, as an 'Advisory Committee', with whom there is regular consultation on program development (see below for specific recommendations).

2. Review and revise the PWE framework and identify clear, appropriate and measurable indicators.

As described above, the current program framework makes it very difficult to implement a focused, coherent, coordinated and strategic program. A review and revision of the objectives is recommended.

Below is a suggested set of objectives which are more strategically focused at a level of gender mainstreaming, of advocacy and of facilitating strategic processes rather than focusing on direct implementation. It also provides a framework through which diversified support can be provided to unions depending on where they are and where they most need support to further promote gender equality.

- i. To ensure that teachers' organizations a) mainstream gender equality into their policies, action plans and budget allocations, b) reflect the needs and priorities of women teachers and c) ensure that women are engaged at all levels and in all areas of union activity
- ii. To ensure that women teachers – and especially those involved in union activities – have access to information relevant to their general well-being and that of their families, including reproductive health, STDs and HIV/AIDS, sexual violence, gender and development, and that they are encouraged to convey this to their students and fellow teachers
- iii. To build the capacity of new and emerging women leaders at national and regional level to as well as of male union leaders to promote gender equality and women's empowerment in and through union activities
- iv. To support women and men in teachers' organizations in their internal and external advocacy initiatives at regional, national and international levels
- v. To promote the exchange of ideas, information, promising practices, lessons learned between teachers' organizations, especially women's wings, and other education actors, through formal and informal channels
- vi. To support (financially and technically) innovative, action research projects which have the potential for wider replication and/or for supporting advocacy in relation to other objectives

Indicators should be developed for each of the objectives which are as far as possible SMART (Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic and Timely) and from which and yearly (or half yearly) targets (or performance indicators/measures) can be identified.

9. Ensure that the teachers' organizations are aware of and engaged in the PWE program's strategic objectives, and that men are also involved in the different activities

A more integrated approach to gender mainstreaming within the teachers' organizations also implies that the PWE strategic objectives are taken on by the teachers' organizations as a whole, and not only by the Women's Wings. Men also need to be

engaged in developing their organization to be more gender balanced and responsive to women's as well as men's needs, to develop their advocacy agendas etc. Meeting any of the objectives requires men and women to be working together, rather than promoting women-only activities carried out for and among women, but this is especially so for Objective i, as described above. As one of the cooperating organization representatives stated, "Men in the unions need to feel that their power and positions are challenged. Woman's influence in unions will depend on that".

4. Sharpen advocacy efforts across the PWE network

Point iv above, relating to advocacy is an important one, and PWE has an significant role to play in supporting initiatives at national, regional and international levels. This is more likely to be most effective if there are one or two key issues of common concern identified as priority issues across the national organizations, and these kept as focus, with very specific advocacy demands worked out, materials (eg speaking notes, pamphlets, advocacy briefs etc) prepared to be shared through the network. It may be that there are also important alliances to build in relation to these priority advocacy issues, and certainly valuable sharing across the different women's networks. As detailed below, research and data collection activities – as well as pilot projects – should be linked to these priority advocacy issues.

5. Long term planning should take account of this overall framework and short term planning should be done on an iterative basis, according to the progress being made towards identified goals

With a clearer vision and longer term perspective on systematic progress towards clear and attainable goals, action planning can be more effective and less random in both the long and the short term. Monitoring of progress by systematic data collection (see below) is required to feed into action planning processes at the regional level, and this data can also assist PWE to support effective and meaningful action planning at the national level. Taking the GNAT-LAS example, the elaboration of a broad 5 year plan would help to clarify the different steps required to achieve different outcomes, and the logical ordering and progression over time of these steps. On an annual basis, actual results could then be reviewed against the targets to help to refine and add detail to the following year's work-plan.

6. Consider strategies and then activities

This point is a reinforcement of the above focus on encouraging more strategic perspectives on how to make progress towards identified aims. As currently framed, the PWE program is missing a middle layer of 'strategies' between its overall objectives and the specific activities to be supported/ promoted. With a shift in thinking towards strategies it will become more possible to develop activities which are more targeted to specific contexts, and to tighten the currently loose relationship between activities implemented and expected results.

7. Improve data collection and management systems including M&E tools and processes

In order to measure effectiveness in any systematic way, a number of different steps are required, starting out from a revised program framework. From that framework, as suggested above, indicators and specific targets can be identified –at national and/or regional level. In order to assess progress towards these targets, monitoring tools will need to be developed and, with a clear Monitoring and Evaluation plan that identifies tools and processes, and responsibilities for collecting the necessary data regularly and systematically across the participating countries. The data collected then has to be

organized into an ongoing database and then analyzed in order to measure progress and identify future priorities.

There is, as yet, no full set of data on each of the participating teacher organizations. Developing this and establishing a database to regularly update and add to as changes occur (for example, new executive committees are elected) should be prioritized. Very clear expectations should be articulated for national teachers' organizations to operationalize a commitment to gender equality. The development of sample targets for gender responsive teacher organizational development (that is in relation to the proposed Objective i above), as well as sample (self) monitoring tools could be worked on with the Gender Desk of EI and shared internationally with other networks. Following up from this baseline data collection/ consolidation exercise, monitoring of gender mainstreaming within the unions with tracking of progress against the series of identified targets will be streamlined and systematic, and support for specific organizations can be tailored according to particular needs.

Recognizing the challenges of establishing effective monitoring and evaluation systems, indicators and tools, cooperating partners might consider the possibilities for an supporting an M&E internship at EI Regional Bureau – funded through programs such as CIDA and possibly the Norwegian Foreign Affairs Ministry – with such a mandate to work with the staff to develop a sustainable system.

8. Ensure that the PWE is linked into other regional, sub-regional and international movements and initiatives and that activities, their results and the lessons learned are effectively shared with others

As described above, this is seen as being critical to ensuring that synergies are created with other ongoing initiatives to promote gender equality in education, to ensure that efforts are not duplicated (for example in the development of materials) and that lessons learned can be shared and where appropriate replicated. It will also ensure that PWE can learn from initiatives undertaken elsewhere and use the results to inform its strategies and activities. In fact the need to strengthen partnerships with national and international NGOs was one of the recommendations of the PWE Evaluation workshop in Accra in 2001. As several of the interviewees mentioned, the sharing of experiences and the linkages with other similar networks is something which the PWE program should facilitate. As one interviewee stated, “we need to piggy back with others to get the message out”, and possibilities for collaborations with other organizations should be more proactively sought.

9. Consider providing funding for a small number of focused action research projects which can be used to stimulate innovation around the promotion of women and girls in education

As discussed above, there are numerous PWE activities which continue to be recycled into the action plans with little evidence of their effectiveness. There are also some strategies which are being tried – or just talked about - at the national level which warrant attention, and potentially some funding to support, and especially to support a research component which makes it possible to assess impact and potential for transfer. For example, the GTU (Gambia) Women's Wing has funding for a small pilot project which links high school girls with women headteachers in rural areas, and has them spending 2 weeks or so with them in their home and school. It is at the same time a mentoring for the girls as an encouragement to them to consider teaching. The project has some potential and should be closely monitored for effectiveness. A small amount of

additional funding, linked to baseline and impact assessments and reporting, and technical assistance on how to do this could be an effective way of generating new insights, developing new strategies, and for raising the profile of the PWE at national, regional and international levels. Such projects should be very much focused on and tightly connected the objectives of the PWE and especially to the advocacy priorities identified.

Improving the functioning of PWE

The following recommendations are shorter term recommendations focused on organizational capacity and efficiency which interrelate to those above, but which apply equally if the PWE remains a project. Strengthening the organizational capacity and functioning is critical in order to fulfill the short and long term potential of the PWE initiative. The recommendations below complement the earlier recommendations regarding the evolution of the PWE.

1. *Strengthen the support that is provided to PWE by the cooperating organizations through a more coordinated mechanism to improve communication, to regularly share updates, perspectives, any concerns etc.*

Although there have been improvements in the coordination between the cooperating organizations, and especially in the alignment and harmonization of reporting requirements (narrative and financial), with the adoption of a common fiscal year for the program, a common evaluation, and coordinated participation in management meetings, this could still be strengthened in order to provide stronger support to PWE. If regular conference calls between the cooperating organizations' representatives and the PWE staff could be organized (for example on a regular, monthly basis) this could help to keep everyone up to date with the same information and some common ground on which to build follow ups. A more formal 'consortium' arrangement between the organizations may make it more possible to make longer term financial commitments to an evolved, more integrated PWE program.

One of the cooperating organization representatives also suggested that more of a partnership approach should be adopted, rather than a "donor organization" approach, whereby the cooperating organizations are also more explicitly involved in advocacy and work with their own governments and international agencies and use their political experience to strengthen the woman's positions in unions in general to promote the PWE objectives and to support women's advancement in education in Africa. Other ways of contributing include initiating research and studies related to gender and education and by raising gender issues in the different contexts where they are present. Such ideas should be explored in more depth between the cooperating organizations, priorities made according to each organizations' experiences, expertise, niche roles etc

2. *Clarify of the roles and responsibilities of the PWE staff.*

Clarification of the roles and responsibilities of the PWE Assistant, the PWE Coordinator and the EI Chief Coordinator will also be an important step in promoting efficiency and effective use of human resources. Job descriptions should reflect the full scope of tasks to be completed and of expectations and performance objectives. As one interviewee stated, "We need a strong coordinator to move PWE forward". A coordinator who is bilingual, has experience and understanding of the education sector, of trade unionism, sound conceptual understanding of gender and development and women's empowerment and experience of working with women's groups/ projects should be able

to make most everyday decisions and take responsibilities away from the EI Chief Coordinator who already has so many other programs and activities to support. The establishment of clear and agreed upon functioning and communication strategies between staff should also help.

Performance review of program staff should also take place on a regular basis (and in line with EI policies) to ensure that staff have professional feedback on their work and can, if needed, make the necessary adjustments in order to meet expectations.

3. Clarify the terms of reference (TOR), roles and responsibilities of the members of the Coordinating Committee - or as suggested above, 'Advisory Committee'.

This is an important step in enhancing the effectiveness, accountability and transparency of the members of this advisory group, and clearly outlining expectations from both sides. Each committee member should have a very clear set of TOR which outline the responsibilities of the position, who she is accountable to and how (eg reports to her union executive), and the expectations that the PWE has of her, in terms of, for example, communication, participation in meetings, responses to emails. It should be stressed that membership of the committee is a privilege and should not be taken lightly. At the same time, the committee members should also know what they can expect from the PWE staff, for example, a brief bi-weekly phone call and/ or email to update; submission of bi-annual reports for review with 2 weeks notice for input etc. The Advisory Committee members should be nominated by and accountable to their nominating organization, and should be responsible for communication with their GS and National Executive. To respond to concerns about representation on the coordinating committee, membership could be on a rotating basis (possibly on a 2 year basis), in order to maintain transparency, high levels of participation throughout the network and yet to maintain a workably small number of people. In the case of a resignation from the union or from the coordinating committee, a transparent process should be adopted to nominate a successor (from the same organization if this occurs within a reasonable amount of time before the end of the Committee's mandate).

Updates and minutes from the Advisory Committee meetings should also be included as annexes to the regular reports to the cooperating organizations.

4. Clarify the terms of reference (TOR), roles and responsibilities of the PWE Contact Persons

Again, the PWE Contact Persons within each participating organization should have very clear TOR which outline their responsibilities and the expectations of the post. The PWE Contact Person should be nominated by and be accountable to the executive of their organization, and should ensure communication between the PWE and executive. The development of a manual/ guide for PWE Contact Persons including a clear set of roles and responsibilities and expectations and a set of basic materials – for example on how to write a project proposal, a report etc would be very helpful.

5. Develop improved/innovative communication strategies

It is recognized that regular and effective communication is not easy in the West Africa region, because of limited internet access, problematic cell phone connections and very limited individual and organizational resources. However, innovative ways must be sought to address such issues, and efforts made by the PWE staff to improve communication and also to model practices which can be adopted by national

organizations' Contact Persons to keep in touch with their district and local level groups. Although email access remains problematic, and especially so when it is controlled by the GS, opportunities for women to access email are also increasing and at least in some places becoming cheaper. PWE staff should therefore continue to encourage all contact people to open their own personal email accounts and to check them as regularly as possible. In fact, as recommended above, it should be a requirement of the Contact Person to do their very best to check email at least once a week. Liaison and sharing of information with the SG should also be ensured by the PWE Contact Persons, in addition to them receiving regular briefings and updates from the PWE staff.

Good communication is a two way process, and although they may complain about a lack of communication from PWE secretariat, national Contact Persons as well as executive members also have a responsibility to send emails to PWE to ask for updates. However, knowing the time and resource constraints of most Contact Persons, there is a need for the secretariat to make specific efforts to reach out. These efforts should also help to build closer ties, relationships and a stronger sense of belonging that should encourage Contact Persons and others to complement these efforts with those of their own.

Other suggestions include:

- Regular/ scheduled calls (bi-monthly) from PWE staff to each Contact Person just for updates
- SMS messages sent to mobile phones to alert Contact Persons and others to important emails that have been sent and are awaiting reply
- Follow up emails/ phone calls soon after an initial one has been sent
- Taking advantage of people traveling to deliver letters/ materials between PWE staff and national Contact Persons

6. Ensure that financial management systems are tightened and strengthened at all levels, and that the recommendations made for tracking payments to participating organizations are implemented. Budgeting should, as far as possible, be projected over a longer period (for example 2 years)

Although the detailed financial management work has to be done by a finance officer, they should be working closely with the PWE Coordinator and/or Assistant in order to ensure that deadlines are foreseen, and met, that there is close follow up with the participating organizations to obtain the necessary receipts and documentation. Monthly account updates should be conveyed to the PWE staff.

Financial reports to the cooperating organizations should include up to date statements on the disbursements to the participating organizations. The TOR for country visits from the PWE Coordinator should also include verification of financial issues and the collection of outstanding receipts. From the outset it should be made very clear that funds will only be disbursed when there are credible assurances of financial reports and receipts. Furthermore, visits to national organizations should also be seen as an opportunity to help the organizations to establish and/or strengthen the necessary financial management procedures to fulfill the PWE expectations. If PWE can become more of an integrated part of EI programs, information shared and coordination around the TOR for capacity building visits/ workshops from other Coordinators established, then these may also be an opportunity to follow up on financial reporting in relation to gender mainstreaming (PWE) activities.

7. Ensure that PWE reporting is improved, captures the outcomes and impacts of the different activities and is reflective of the cumulative progress towards identified targets. Rather than a list of activities completed, PWE reports should be organized in relation to the objectives laid out in the program framework, and should provide a brief background on what was done and why, the outcomes of the activities (backed up by data rather than just anecdotal) and the next steps foreseen in order to continue to make progress. As suggested by CTF, the activities of the national organizations could be effectively summarized in chart form, and these could also be arranged in relation the overall PWE objectives; they should certainly be included in regular reports. Details of visits to national organizations, including the terms of references, the activities and the outcomes should also be clearly conveyed in reports.

Once a revised program structure is agreed upon, then the cooperating organization could work with the PWE Coordinator to develop a common report template to be used for each report, into which information relating to the indicators for each of the program objectives would have to be expected.

8. Ensure that meetings between PWE staff (especially Coordinator) and national executives are recorded, including the objectives, process, immediate results and action points to follow up on

Although it is difficult to quantify, it would appear that visits and meetings between PWE staff and national executives are significant in terms of internal advocacy for gender mainstreaming. Such visits and meetings should therefore be continued – but with strategic planning in terms of timing, issues to be addressed, follow up expected etc. Such meetings should also be rigorously documented and included in the PWE reports to cooperating organizations and others.

9. Develop promotional materials which clarify the structure and ‘modus operandi’ of PWE

At the moment there is no one document which lays out clearly the PWE structure, objectives, strategies etc either for participating organizations or for external partners, for example Ministries of Education. After a review of the structure and objectives of the program, such a brochure should be prioritized in order to raise the profile of the program. The document – and the content included in it should also be available on the EI Africa bureau website and in time, a special PWE section of the website developed to share additional information/ resources etc between the participating teachers’ organizations as also with other interested agencies and organizations.

10. Review the current content of the PWE manual, collect additional modules developed by national organizations for possible inclusion and make a collection of additional supplementary materials (produced by other organizations) with a view to reprinting and further dissemination.

11. Ensure new publications target specific needs, do not duplicate efforts and are cost effective

As highlighted above, PWE documents have limited circulation. Acknowledging the high costs of printing and mailing of documents, more creative solutions should be found to ensuring that information is shared as effectively as possible. Suggestions include:

- Rather than publishing a full newsletter, provide a small inset/ or just regular information update which can be included within other union newsletters

- Profile a regular 1 or 2 page update which can be emailed to unions and printed out and copied
- Post regular updates on the dedicated section of the EI web-site
- Seek collaboration and co-funding on new information brochures, for example, with FAWE, UNICEF, UNESCO to increase circulation, potential impact and reduce duplication of efforts. Topics suggested by interviewees include: 'Approche genre' and reproductive health.
- Look at ways of saving on printing costs - eg creative use of black and white

Another topic of considerable interest is that of role model women in education who have or still are successful and continue to advocate and act for gender equality. A collection of the life stories of women in education unions who have succeeded and are using their influence to create change for others in and through education could be of widespread interest within the network and beyond. Again, co-funding and creative thinking about cost effective printing would be necessary as would simultaneous publication on the website.

12. Given the obvious importance for women of income generating activities (IGA), PWE should explore facilitating partnerships between individual teachers' organizations and organizations operating in their country which have expertise in this field, such as Oxfam, Women for Women International etc.

Partnership with more experienced and expert organizations would help to ensure that women teachers' IGAs are well thought through, with prior market analysis, quality assurance etc. Paying attention to pilot projects with clear performance indicators, M&E systems and dissemination of results PWE could also facilitate a sharing of 'promising practices' across the partner teachers' organizations. Rather than directly implementing or even supporting related training activities, PWE could serve as an information sharing forum.

13. Ensure that all 'trainings of trainers' have a robust follow-up strategy to ensure greatest impact

This would include, where possible, ensuring that funding is available for the trainers to go out to other areas to provide trainings, doing the necessary advocacy to ensure buy in from unions/ MoEs for the trainers to provide training to others, and also writing the commitment to a certain amount of follow up training into the TOR for the Training of Trainers (TOT) participants. The trainings should all end with action planning activities where the trainees make a draft training plan for implementation when they return home, and against which they and their nominating organization can be held accountable.

**Annex 1: Summary of PWE Trainings to its Member Organizations
(From PWE documents)**

Country	Period	Training	Topics	# of Participants
1999-2000: 4 sub-regional workshops trained 94 women trainers				
Ghana	May 26-30, 2001	Training in written skills		17
Burkina Faso, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Guinea, Niger, Sierra Leone	2001	Training for Resource Persons		300
Togo	2001	Reinforcement of Capacities in school administration, sciences, mathematics and technology (part 1)		35
Total				446
Burkina Faso	May 15-18, 2002	Training on trade unionism	Women and trade unions, communication, leadership, Adult training, human rights and union rights, girls' schooling	41
Togo	May 14-16 2002	Trade unionism	Role of women in the teachers' organizations, communication skills, gender approach, HIV/AIDS	75
Senegal	?13-15	Advanced training: reinforcement of capacities of female union trainers	Leadership, discrimination towards women	25
Togo	Aug 26-30	Advanced training: reinforcement of capacities of female union trainers	Leadership, discrimination towards women, reproductive health, HIV/AIDS	35
Sierra Leone	Nov 11-15, 2002	Advanced training: reinforcement of capacities of female union trainers	Strategies of social mobilization, women and leadership, human and trade union rights, international laws in favour of women, concrete strategies and actions, gender and reproductive	21

			health, HIV/AIDS	
Burkina Faso	July 11-27, 2002	Training on preparation of professional exams	Education systems, contemporary Burkinabe education system, general knowledge, pedagogy of alertness, traditional education and the new form of education, awareness and non-awareness, accountability, the problems of education, women's issues	60
Togo	July 16-Aug 1, 2002	Reinforcement of Capacities in school administration, sciences, mathematics and technology (part 2)		40
Total				527
Mali	Jan 7-11, 2003	Reinforcement of capacities of female union trainers	Role of women in the teachers' organizations, women and communication, gender and development, education and training of women and girls	30
Côte d'Ivoire	June 5-7, 2003	Female trainers' training	Role of women in the teachers' organizations, women and communication, gender and development, adults' training, IGA activities	30
Togo	June 7-16, 2003	Training of grassroots members, reinforcement of capacities of grassroots activists	Trade unionism, federalism, women unionism, trade union finances, gender and education	200
Togo	Aug 18-23, 2003	Sub-regional training of French speaking women in NIT and communication	Conflict management, basic rights to work, advocacy, project management, internet	22
Sierra Leone	Dec 18-13, 2003	Reinforcement of capacities of female union leaders	Women and unionism, function and challenges of SLTU structure, women and leadership: strategies for success, internal and external	22

			relations of SLTU, project planning, adults training, report writing skills, union leaders' science management, techniques of social mobilization, negation and advocacy, role of women in the prevention of HIV/AIDS	
Burkina Faso	July 1-28 Aug, 2003	Advocacy skills		35
Ghana	July 13-26, 2003	Professional training, development of administrative capacities of the non-teaching female workers in education	NIT, time management and administrative skills, documentation and accountancy	38
Total for 2003				377
Senegal	Jan 16-18, 2004	Women unionism	Women unionism, rights of working women, communication	20
Togo	Feb 19-21, 2004	Reinforcement of capacities of women	Unionism, women unionism challenges, union finances, female leadership, gender and development, women and health, STI, HIV/AIDS	92
Benin	March 26-31, 2004	Training of grassroots activists (Contd)	Introduction of PWE, obstacles and prospects for female teachers unionism, union: function, definitions, importance and function, Integration of gender approach in unions	80
Mali	April 9-12, 2004	Reinforcement of capacities of female teachers	Leadership, communication, SNEC: body and authorities	??
Ghana	July 11-24, 2004	Professional training: development of administrative capacities of the non-teaching female workers in education (contd)	NIT, time management and administrative skills, documentation and accountancy, gender and HIV/AIDS	41
Gambia	Dec 15-18, 2004	Reinforcement of capacities of female	Project design, guidance and	37

		teachers	counseling, women trade unionism, gender sensitivity	
Togo	Sept 7-10, 2004	Sub-regional training on data collection skills	Data sources, tools for data collection, observation, questionnaires	30
Total 2004				330
Togo	March 24-26, 2005	Training on data collection skills	Data collection: tools and sources of research, survey questionnaire development, data processing from questionnaires	27
Burkina Faso	April 13-16, 2005	Training in NIT	Introduction to the computer, presentation and introduction of Microsoft Word (creation and modification of a document, input and recording of text, opening and closing of a document, Microsoft Excel, Initiation to the internet	25
Senegal	April 5-7, 2005	Training in NIT	As above	32
Total Jan-June 2005				84
Grand Total				1764

Annex 2: Evaluation Schedule

The table below provides an overview of the evaluation schedule.

DATE	TRAVEL	EVALUATION ACTIVITIES
Jan - Feb		Initial document review Preparation of evaluation framework
Sat Feb 11		Submission of evaluation workplan
Mon Feb 20	Leave Sydney: 1700 Arrive Singapore: 2140 Leave Singapore:2330	
Tues Feb 21	Arrive Paris: 0615 Leave Paris: 1340 Arrive Lomé: 1900	Further review of documentation
Wed Feb 22	Lomé	Séance de travail: Bureau Régional IE Administration PFE Finance PFE Coordinateur IERAF
Thurs Feb 23	Lomé	Séance de travail :Bureau exécutif FESEN Personne contact PEF
Fri Feb 24	Lomé - Cotonou	Séance de travail : Personne contact PFE Bureaux exécutifs nationaux (SNEP, SYNEMP, SYNESTP, SYNAPES) Comité des femmes PFE – Bénin
Sat Feb 25	Evening: Cotonou- Lomé	Information collection contd.
Sun Feb 26	Lomé - Accra	
Mon Feb 27	Accra	Séance de travail : Membre de coordination PFE (Helena AWURUSA) Bureaux exécutifs nationaux (GNAT, TEWU) Comité des femmes PFE – Ghana
Tues Feb 28	Accra – Banjul 14H30 (TU)	
Wed March 1	Banjul	Séance de travail : Membre de comité de coordination PFE (Adelle SOCK) Bureau exécutif national (GTU) Comité des femmes PFE – Gambie
Thurs March 2	Banjul	Information collection contd.
Fri March 3	Banjul - Accra (à 9h00 TU) Accra- Lomé	
Sat March 4	Lomé	Synthèse des travaux avec le bureau régional
Sun March 5	Leave: Lomé: 2325	
Mon March 6	Arrive Paris: 0630 Leave Paris: 2315	

Tues March 7	Arrive Singapore: 1225 Leave Singapore:1840	Review of information collected
Wed March 8	Arrive Sydney: 0620	
March 9-13		Review of data collected Emails to supporting teacher organizations
March 13- Apr 24		Data analysis and writing of draft report
Mon April 24		Submission of draft report
April 24-May 6		Revision of draft report based on feedback
May 6		Submission of final report

Annex 3: Roles and Responsibilities (as defined in Evaluation Workplan)

Individual/ organization	Roles and responsibilities
Jackie Kirk	Evaluation consultant: prepares the evaluation framework, tools, collects data during a 2 week visit to West Africa, also collects data via questionnaires sent to all Africa participating organizations and analyzes data and writes a comprehensive report on it.
Canadian Teachers' Federation	Financial support for the evaluation Contracting procedures for Jackie Kirk and provision of background information and materials Liaison with PWE staff to prepare the evaluation Input to evaluation preparation (framework, tools etc) Input to evaluation through email/telephone interview Feedback on draft evaluation report
Läraryförbundet	Financial support for the evaluation Input to evaluation preparation (framework, tools etc) Input to evaluation through email/telephone interview Feedback on draft evaluation report
Utdanningsförbundet	Financial support for the evaluation Input to evaluation preparation (framework, tools etc) Input to evaluation through email/telephone interview Feedback on draft evaluation report
PWE staff	Logistical arrangements for the evaluation visit to West Africa Input to evaluation preparation (framework, tools etc) Accompanying evaluation consultant on visits from Lomé Preparation and provision of relevant PWE documentation Extensive interviews and discussions on PWE functioning, activities and impacts Feedback on draft evaluation report
EI staff (Lomé)	Input to evaluation preparation (framework, tools etc) Technical support to PWE staff in preparing evaluation visit. Interviews and discussions on PWE functioning, activities and impacts Feedback on draft evaluation report
EI staff (Brussels)	Input to evaluation through email/telephone interview Feedback on draft evaluation report
PWE focal points in member organizations being visited (Togo, Benin, Ghana and Gambia)	Input to evaluation preparation (framework, tools etc) Preparation and provision of relevant PWE documentation Preparation for evaluation visit (ie convening interviews and discussions) Extensive interviews and discussions on PWE functioning, activities and impacts Feedback on draft evaluation report

Annex 4:

An Interim Process Evaluation of PWE

Data Collection: Feb-March, 2006

Draft Interview Protocol for Women Teacher participants in PWE activities

1. Introductions
 - Who I am and what I am doing
 - Objectives and methods of the process evaluation
 - Any initial questions?
2. Can you start by telling me about your experience as a teacher
 - a) How long have you been teaching and at what level?
 - b) What is your position/ responsibilities in the school?
3. Can you tell me about your involvement with the teacher organization?
 - a) How long have you been involved in the teacher organization?
 - b) Do you have any particular role/ responsibilities within the organization?
 - c) Does the organization have any gender policy/ women's action plan?
 - d) Are you part of the women's committee/wing?
4. Can you explain how the women's committee/wing works?
 - a) Is there funding from the organization?
 - b) Does it have regular/ separate meetings?
 - c) Is the leadership connected to the central leadership etc
 - d) Do you have linkages with any other orgs/NGOs eg FAWE?
 - e) In your opinion, what are the strengths and weaknesses of the separate women's wing?
5. What sort of national gender equality/ women's wing/PWE activities have you been involved in and are you involved in on a regular basis?
 - a) How does the PWE support/encourage such activities?
 - b) Do you think those activities have made a difference you and/or for the other women involved personally and/ or professionally? If so, how/ in what ways?
 - c) Do you think that those activities have had broader impacts? For example on the teachers' org? the MoE policy? Girls' education?

6. What sort of sub-regional/ regional PWE activities has your org been supporting?
- How exactly does your org/ the women's wing support/encourage such activities?
 - Do you think those activities have made a difference for you and/or the other women involved personally and/ or professionally? If so, how/ in what ways?
 - Do you think that those activities have had broader impacts? For example on the teachers' org? the MoE policy? Girls' education?
7. How much do you know about the overall PWE program? Are you familiar with the objectives and activities? The range of activities in different countries, for example? If so, how?
- a) Have you read any of the PWE documents/ brochures? If so, what did you think of them?
 - b) Have you contributed to any PWE documents at all – eg newsletters? activity reports?
8. Can you tell me about how the national PWE activities you were involved in were organized and implemented?
- a) How were the activities chosen/prioritized? Were you involved at all in the design and planning, budgeting etc?
 - b) Were there specific objectives and targets laid out?
 - c) Who facilitated/implemented/led the activity?
 - d) Did you complete – or contribute to – any report on that/ those activity/ies?
 - e) Have you seen any reports of those activities – for example in the teacher organization's publication? In MoE documents?
 - f) Were you satisfied with the way the activities were organized/ managed? Do you have any recommendations to make for another time?
9. Can you tell me about how the regional/sub-regional PWE activities you were involved in were organized and implemented?
- a) Do you know how the activities were chosen/prioritized? Were you involved at all in the design and planning, budgeting etc?
 - b) Were you aware of specific objectives and targets laid out?
 - c) Who facilitated/implemented/led the activity?
 - d) Did you complete – or contribute to – any report on that/ those activity/ies?

- e) Have you seen any reports of those activities – for example in the teacher organization’s publication? In MoE documents?
- f) How was the application (or other process) managed? Who was your contact person? Did you have all the information you needed? Were deadlines and timelines met?
- g) Were you satisfied with the way the activities were organized/ managed? Do you have any recommendations to make for another time?

10. What do you think are the major issues which have to be addressed to promote women teachers and gender equality in (your country)? What are the main constraints for women teachers?

11. The issue of girls’ education is one which has been identified as one that needs to be addressed by the PWE. What do you think about this? In what way might the PWE have an impact ? Any suggestions?

12. The issue of HIV/AIDS has also been identified as one to address. Do you feel that the PWE has had an effect on your understanding of HIV/AIDS? On the knowledge and attitudes of others – teachers? Students? Education authorities ?

13. And what about gender equality issues and the participation of women in the teacher organization itself? Do you think the PWE is making any difference? In what ways? (Participation of women in meetings? Women in leadership positions? Addressing of gender equality issues/ activities? Internal policy statements regarding gender equality?

14. Do you think the PWE has had any influence on MoE and other education partners on gender equality issues? If so, how? If not, why not?

15. What do think are the particular strengths and potential of the PWE (as compared to other organizations/ networks/ initiatives?

16. Do you think there are other important gender equality and women’s and girls’ empowerment issues in education that should be addressed?

16. What sort of actions do you think should/ could be taken to address these:

- By the MoE and its partners?
- What about the teacher organization? What sort of actions can it take?
- By the PWE? Do you think there are specific activities the PWE should support to promote women teachers and gender equality in education?

18. Do you have any other recommendations/ comments to share regarding the PWE in particular or gender equality issues in education - either within the teacher organization or (your country) in general? As I explained, this is a process, interim evaluation, so suggestions and anything we can learn will be used to make improvements in the program.

Thank you for your time !

Annex 5:

An Interim Process Evaluation of PWE

Data Collection: Feb-March, 2006

Draft Interview/ Discussion Protocol for Representatives of Teacher Organizations

1. Introductions
 - Who I am and what I am doing
 - Objectives and methods of the process evaluation
 - Any initial questions?
2. Can you tell me about your involvement with the teacher organization?
 - a) How long have you been involved in the teacher organization?
 - b) What is your specific role/ responsibilities within the organization?
 - c) What is gender breakdown of membership?
 - d) Are there women in leadership positions? If so, which?
 - e) Does the organization have any gender policy/ women's action plan?
 - f) Does it have a women's committee/wing at all?
 - g) Are there other gender equality initiatives?
3. Can you explain how the women's committee/wing works and how it connects with the rest of the organization?
 - a) Is there funding from the organization?
 - b) Does it have regular/ separate meetings?
 - c) Is the leadership connected to the central leadership etc
 - d) Does it have linkages with any other orgs/NGOs eg FAWE?
 - e) In your opinion, what are the strengths and weaknesses of the separate women's wing?
7. What sort of national activities (if any) has your organization supported for women/ related to gender equality recently?
 - a) How does the PWE support/encourage such activities?
 - b) Do you think those activities have made a difference for the women involved personally and/ or professionally? If so, how/ in what ways?
 - c) Do you think that those activities have had broader impacts? For example on the teachers' org? the MoE policy? Girls' education?

8. What sort of sub-regional/ regional PWE activities has your org been supporting?
- How exactly does your org support/encourage such activities?
 - Do you think those activities have made a difference for the women involved personally and/ or professionally? If so, how/ in what ways?
 - Do you think that those activities have had broader impacts? For example on the teachers' org? the MoE policy? Girls' education?

6. How much do you know about the overall PWE program? Are you familiar with the objectives and activities? The range of activities in different countries, for example? If so, how?

- a) Have you read any of the PWE documents/ brochures? If so, what did you think of them?
- b) Are any of the PWE documents distributed through the organization at all – eg newsletters? activity reports?

7. Can you tell me about how the national gender equality activities you were involved in were organized and implemented?

- a) How were the activities chosen/prioritized? Were you involved at all in the design and planning, budgeting etc?
- b) Were there specific objectives and targets laid out?
- c) Who facilitated/implemented/led the activity?
- d) Did you complete – or contribute to – any report on that/ those activity/ies?
- e) Have you seen any reports of those activities – for example in the teacher organization's publication? In MoE documents?
- f) Were you satisfied with the way the activities were organized/ managed? Do you have any recommendations to make for another time?

8. Can you tell me about how the regional/sub-regional PWE activities your org was involved in were organized and implemented?

- a) Do you know how the activities were chosen/prioritized? Were you involved at all in the design and planning, budgeting etc?
- b) Were you aware of specific objectives and targets laid out?
- c) Who facilitated/implemented/led the activity?
- d) Did you complete – or contribute to – any report on that/ those activity/ies?

- e) Have you seen any reports of those activities – for example in the teacher organization’s publication? In MoE documents?
- f) How was the application (or other process) managed? Who was your contact person? Did you have all the information you needed? Were deadlines and timelines met?
- g) Were you satisfied with the way the activities were organized/ managed? Do you have any recommendations to make for another time?

9. What do you think are the major issues which have to be addressed to promote women teachers and gender equality in (your country)? What are the main constraints for women teachers?

10. The issue of girls’ education is one which has been identified as one that needs to be addressed by the PWE. What do you think about this? In what way might the PWE have an impact ? Any suggestions?

11. The issue of HIV/AIDS has also been identified as one to address. Do you feel that the PWE has had an effect on your understanding of HIV/AIDS? On the knowledge and attitudes of others – teachers? Students? Education authorities ?

12. And what about gender equality issues and the participation of women in the teacher organization itself? Do you think the PWE is making any difference? In what ways? (Participation of women in meetings? Women in leadership positions? Addressing of gender equality issues/ activities? Internal policy statements regarding gender equality?

13. Do you think the PWE has had any influence on MoE and other education partners on gender equality issues? If so, how? If not, why not?

14. What do think are the particular strengths and potential of the PWE (as compared to other organizations/ networks/ initiatives?)

15. Do you think there are other important gender equality and women’s and girls’ empowerment issues in education that should be addressed?

16. What sort of actions do you think should/ could be taken to address these:

- By the MoE and its partners?
- What about the teacher organization? What sort of actions can it take?
- By the PWE? Do you think there are specific activities the PWE should support to promote women teachers and gender equality in education?

17. Do you have any other recommendations/ comments to share regarding the PWE in particular or gender equality issues in education - either within the teacher organization or (your country) in general? As I explained, this is a process, interim evaluation, so suggestions and anything we can learn will be used to make improvements in the program.

Thank you for your time !

Annex 6:

Questionnaire for the SG or designated National Executive Member

Your name: _____ (M/F – please indicate)

Your position in the organization: _____

Length of service in this position: _____

1. Your Organization

Please provide the most up to date and accurate statistics you have:

1a) Membership : M: F: Total:

1b) Total number of current national executive members: _____

1c) Total number of women members of the current executive: _____

1d) Do you have a women’s wing (or similar) within your organization?

Yes/ No

1e) Do you have a gender equality (or similar) policy or an action plan on women’s participation within your organization? If so please attach a copy to this questionnaire.

Yes/No Date:

1f) Can you highlight any gender related elements of your general union/organization constitution? (for example, reserved seats for women)

2. Overall PWE program

2a) How familiar with the overall PWE objectives and the range of PWE activities?

Very familiar Somewhat familiar Not at all familiar

2b) How relevant are PWE program priority areas in your country? Please tick the box which you think most appropriate: very relevant/ somewhat relevant/ not really relevant:

	Very relevant	Some-what relevant	Not really relevant
Sensitization of women teachers on their potentials			
Data collection on issues affecting women and girls in education			
Participation of women teachers in union activities and leadership			
Improving social and economic situation of women teachers			
Professional and academic upgrading of women teachers			
Networking and communication skills			
Integrating PWE activities into national organizations action plans			
Addressing impact of HIV/AIDS			

2c) Are there other priority issues for women teachers in your country that are **not** reflected in the PWE objectives. If so, please describe:

2d) What sort of actions should be taken to address these?

3. National PWE Activities

3a) From your perspective, what, if any, have been the impacts of the recent activities organized by your women’s wing/ PWE committee? Please be as precise as possible when completing the table below (and include any negative impacts you might have noticed) and give concrete examples. If you have more than 2 activities to describe, please copy the table onto additional sheets and complete.

Activity 1

Activity Description	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants and their families	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women’s roles and positions within it	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to gender equality and women’s position in society in general	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to government policy – especially education policy	
Any additional comments	

Activity 2.

Activity Description	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants and their families	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women’s roles and positions within it	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to gender equality and women’s position in society in general	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to government policy – especially education policy	
Any additional comments	

3b) Have reports of the national PWE activities been included in your organization’s publications? In any other national publications or documents?

3c) Were you satisfied with the way recent activities were planned, organized and managed?

Yes, very

Somewhat

Not at all

(Please explain below)

3d) Do you have any recommendations to make for future national level PWE activities

- On the planning and organization of activities?

- On the content/type of the activity?

4. Regional and sub-regional PWE Activities

4a) Please list the PWE regional or sub-regional activities your members have participated in recently and any impacts you have noticed of these?

Activity 1

Activity	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women's roles and positions within it	
Any additional comments	

Activity 2

Activity	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women's roles and positions within it	
Any additional comments	

4b) Have reports of the Regional and Sub-regional PWE activities been included in your teacher organization's publications? In any other national publications/documents?

4c) Were you satisfied with the way recent activities were planned/organized/ managed?

Yes, very Somewhat Not at all

(Please explain below)

4d) Outside of the specific PWE activities, such as trainings and funding for national activities, does your organization benefit from being involved in the regional PWE program? In what ways?

4e) Do you have any recommendations to make for future regional and sub-regional activities?

- On the planning and organization of activities:

- On the content/ type of the activities:

5. PWE Coordination and communication

5a) How often are you in contact with the PWE Lomé office?

At least once a week Once a month Only for activities Very rarely

- By what means? (email, telephone, mail?)
- On what sort of issues is most of your communication?

5b) Have you received copies of PWE materials such as the newsletter, pamphlets, copies of the research study? If so, do you have any comments to make on these?

5c) Are you satisfied with the quantity and quality of the communication with the PWE office? Yes, very Somewhat Not at all

- Do you have suggestions for improvements?

5d) Do you find the financial and accounting procedures for PWE activities to be efficient? Yes, very Somewhat Not at all

- Do you have suggestions for improvements?

6. Overall Recommendations/ Suggestions

6a) Please use the space below and over the page to make any other suggestions and recommendations on the PWE program in general, and on strategies it could further develop to promote women teachers and to effectively impact on the governments' policies and programs on gender equality?

*Thank you for taking the time to complete this questionnaire. Please add any other thoughts/ comments/ suggestions on the back of the paper and return by March 25th to:
Magui Sikou at: Magui.Sikou@ei-africa.org.*

*If you would like to contact the evaluation consultant directly, email Jackie Kirk at:
jackie.kirk@mail.mcgill.ca*

Annex 7:

Questionnaire for National PWE Contact Persons

Your name: _____ Your Organization: _____

Your position in the organization: _____

Length of service in this position: _____

1. Organizational structure for women’s participation

1a) Do you have a women’s wing (or similar) within your organization? Yes/No

If so, please provide some details, for example:

When was it formed? What is the structure (at national, district and local levels?)

How often does it meet? In general, what activities does it do? How many women are active within the women’s wing?

2. Overall PWE program

2a) How familiar with the overall PWE objectives and the range of PWE activities?

Very familiar Somewhat familiar Not at all familiar

2b) How relevant are PWE program priority areas in your country? Please tick the box which you think most appropriate: very relevant, somewhat relevant, not really relevant.

	Very relevant	Some-what relevant	Not really relevant
Sensitization of women teachers on their potentials			
Data collection on issues affecting women and girls in education			
Participation of women teachers in union activities and leadership			
Improving social and economic situation of women teachers			
Professional and academic upgrading of women teachers			
Networking and communication skills			
Integrating PWE activities into national organizations action plans			
Addressing impact of HIV/AIDS			

2c) Are there other priority issues for women teachers in your country that are **not** reflected in the PWE objectives. If so, please describe:

2d) What sort of actions should be taken to address these?

3. National PWE Activities

What national PWE activities have you and your colleagues organized most recently (in the last year) and from your perspective, what, if any, have been the impacts of the

different activities? Please be as precise as possible when completing the table below (and include any negative impacts you might have noticed).
If you have more than 2 activities, please copy the table onto additional sheets and complete.

Activity 1 Description	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants and their families	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women's roles and positions within it	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to gender equality and women's position in society in general	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to government policy – especially education policy	
Any additional comments	

Activity 2 Description	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants and their families	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women's roles and positions within it	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to gender equality and women's position in society in general	
Any noticeable impacts on or contributions to government policy – especially education policy	
Any additional comments	

2b) Which **one** recent national activity has been the most important and most successful or effective - and why?

2c) Which **one** recent national activity has been the least important or least effective – and why?

2d) Do you have any suggestions for how your national level PWE might more effectively impact on the promotion of women and girls in education?

3. National PWE activity planning and organization

3a) How are the national PWE activities initiated, selected and prioritized? Who is involved in these decisions?

3b) (For trainings especially) How are the participants chosen?

3c) Is there an evaluation mechanism/process after each activity? If so, please describe

3d) Have reports been made on each of the activities? If so, where have the reports been disseminated?

3e) Have reports of the national PWE activities been included in your organization's publications? In any other national publications or documents?

3f) Were you satisfied with the way recent activities were planned/organized/ managed?

Yes, very Somewhat Not at all Please explain below:

3g) Do you have any recommendations for planning and organization of future activities?

4. Regional and sub-regional PWE Activities

4a) Please list the PWE regional or sub-regional activities that you and/or your members have participated in recently and any impacts you have noticed of these?

Activity 1	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women's roles and positions within it	
Any additional comments	

Activity 2	
Any noticeable impacts for women participants	
Any noticeable impacts for your organization and women's roles and positions within it	
Any additional comments	

4b) Of the different recent PWE-regional or sub-regional activities, which **one** activity do you think has been the most important and most successful or effective- and why?

4c) Do you have any recommendations to make for future regional and sub-regional activities?

4d) Outside of the specific activities such as trainings and seminars, do you and your organization benefit from contact with the women's groups of other teachers' organizations through the PWE? In what ways?

5. Regional and Sub-regional Activity Planning and Organization

5a) Are you or members of your organizations involved at all in initiating, selecting or planning the Regional and Sub-regional PWE activities? If so, how?

5b) (For trainings especially) How are the participants from your organization chosen?

5c) Have reports been made by participants on these activities? If so, where have the reports been disseminated?

5d) Have reports of the Regional and Sub-regional PWE activities been included in your teacher organization's publications? In any other national publications or documents?

5e) Were you satisfied with the way recent activities were planned/organized/ managed?

Yes, very Somewhat Not at all

(Please explain below)

5f) Do you have any recommendations for future regional and sub-regional activities?

- On the planning and organization of activities?

- On the content/ type of the activities?

6. PWE Coordination and Communication

6a) How often are you in contact with the PWE Lomé office?

At least once a week Once a month Only for activities Very rarely

- By what means? (email, telephone, mail?)
- On what sort of issues is most of your communication?

6b) Have you received copies of PWE materials such as newsletters, pamphlets, copies of the research study? If so, do you have any comments to make on these?

6c) Are you satisfied with the quantity and quality of the communication with the PWE office? Yes, very Somewhat Not at all

- Do you have suggestions for improvements?

6d) Do you find the financial and accounting procedures for PWE activities to be efficient? Yes, very Somewhat Not at all

- Do you have suggestions for improvements?

7. Overall Recommendations/ Suggestions

7a) Please use the space below and over the page to make any other suggestions and recommendations on the PWE program in general, and on strategies it could further develop to promote women teachers and to effectively impact on the governments' policies and programs on gender equality?

Thank you for taking the time to complete this questionnaire. Please add any other thoughts/ comments/ suggestions on the back of the paper and return by March 25th to:

Magui Sikou at: Magui.Sikou@ei-africa.org.

If you would like to contact the evaluation consultant directly, email Jackie Kirk at:

jackie.kirk@mail.mcgill.ca

Annex 8:

**An Interim Process Evaluation of PWE (February-May 2006)
Questions for Representatives of Cooperating Organizations**

General Background and Context

1. How long have you and/or your organization been involved with PWE?
2. What is your particular role in the relationship with PWE and what are your main activities in this role?
3. What do you see as the major issues facing women in teaching unions and women in education sector generally in the countries of the PWE program? Do you see these changing over time?
4. Given these, do you feel that the PWE objectives are relevant? Are they relevant to each country context? Are some of a higher priority than others? Are there some emerging issues which have not been addressed by PWE?
5. Overall, what do you see as the key strengths of PWE ?

PWE Impacts and Effectiveness

1. What – if any- impacts of the PWE program are you aware of? Either generally across all the countries, or in any particular countries?
2. Are you aware of any negative impacts of the program at all?
3. To what extent do you think the PWE program objectives are being realized? Are there other strategies and activities which could better meet the objectives?

PWE Efficiency and Capacity

Can you comment on your experience and understanding of how efficient the PWE program is in achieving results? For example:

How strategic and effective is the PWE program leadership in Lomé?

How effective is the HR structure of the PWE team (ie a coordinator based in Lomé, with assistant, who reports to EI Regional Coordinator)?

How effective is the program structure as currently organized (ie ad hoc Coordinating committee which meets to define direction and advise the PWE staff, with contact persons for each participating teachers' organization)

How effective are the PWE financial management processes?

How effective are other PWE project management processes (eg proposal development, reporting)?

How effective do you see PWE in developing linkages with other relevant organizations?

How well coordinated and efficient is the support from the cooperating organizations to PWE?

PWE Recommendations

Overall, what – if any -do you see as the critical weaknesses of PWE ?

What –if any- recommendations do you have to make? a) related to the content of the PWE program and activities and b) related to PWE management and implementation processes?

Do you have any further thoughts/ suggestions regarding the future of PWE?

Annex 9:**Stakeholders Consulted during the Evaluation**

TOGO	
PWE Staff	
Assibi Napoe	Chief Coordinator, EI Africa Region Bureau
Maguy Sikou	PWE Assistant
Sylvie Blewoussi	Temporary PWE Officer
Wisdom	Wisdom: EI staff finance officer
FESEN	
Boyode Essotina	GS, FESEN
15 Executive members	Also representing different grassroots unions
Samah, Tinka	PWE Contact Person, FESEN
10 PWE Resource Persons	Also representing different grassroots unions
BENIN	
Marcelle Agbo	PWE Contact Person (SYNESTP/R)
Therese Dagba	PWE Contact Person (SNEP Benin)
13 PWE Resource persons	Representing the different teachers' unions
Gaston Azoua	GS, Confederation Syndicale des Travailleurs du Bénin
SNEP (wing 1)	Executive members
SNEP (wing 2)	Executive members
SNESTP	Executive members
SYNEMP	Executive members
GHANA	
Comfort Juayibin	PWE Contact Person, TEWU
Mohammed Bogobiri	Dep GS, TEWU
Kofi Ahiabli	Admin Officer, TEWU
Mariam Cobblah	PWE Resource Person, Regional Coordinator, GNAT-LAS
Lydia Fuah	PWE Resource Person, District Coordinator, GNAT-LAS
Helena Adunusa	Gender Focal Person, GNAT; PWE Contact Person; Member, PWE Coordinating Committee
John Nyoagbe	Dep GS, GNAT
GAMBIA	
Adelle Sock	Member, PWE Coordinating Committee (Former GTU PWE Contact Person)
Janet Mansal	Gender Desk Officer, GTU; PWE Contact Person
Baboucarr Jeng	GS, GTU
Essa Sowe	Dep GS, GTU
GTU Women's Wing Executive members	Secretary, Treasurer, former chair, Vice chair and Chair
GTU NEC members	President, Treasurer, 1 st VP, Org.Sec.
COOPERATING ORGANIZATIONS	
Nicole Pattenau	Program Officer, International Programs, Canadian Teachers' Federation
Barbara MacDonald	Director, International Programs Canadian Teachers'

	Federation
Margareta Axell	International Secretary, International Unit, Lärarförbundet (Swedish Teachers' Union)
Ingrid Convery	Utdanningsforbundet (Norway)
Lajla Blom	Utdanningsforbundet (Norway)